

Central Lancashire Online Knowledge (CLOK)

Title	An integrative review exploring the experiences of service users carrying a diagnosis of personality disorder and student mental health nurses and the time they share together
Type	Article
URL	https://clock.uclan.ac.uk/id/eprint/35498/
DOI	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2020.104659
Date	2020
Citation	Jones, Emma, Wright, Karen Margaret and Mckeown, Michael (2020) An integrative review exploring the experiences of service users carrying a diagnosis of personality disorder and student mental health nurses and the time they share together. Nurse Education Today. p. 104659. ISSN 0260-6917
Creators	Jones, Emma, Wright, Karen Margaret and Mckeown, Michael

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2020.104659>

For information about Research at UCLan please go to <http://www.uclan.ac.uk/research/>

All outputs in CLOK are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including Copyright law. Copyright, IPR and Moral Rights for the works on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <http://clock.uclan.ac.uk/policies/>

Table 5

Key papers table

The key papers table gives details of the key papers found in the integrative review.

Authors	Year	Title	Place	Study type	Sample	Main findings
Aiyegbusi and Kelly	2015	'This is the pain I feel!' Projection and emotional pain in the nurse–patient relationship with people diagnosed with personality disorders in forensic and specialist personality disorder services: findings from a mixed methods study	UK	Mixed methodology- Delphi study and qualitative study	12 nurses Delphi 13 nurse interviews 12 service users in focus groups	This paper discusses one of its themes; Pain: processing or passing on (from a wider mixed methods study), which describes highly painful emotional phenomena arising primarily from service users trauma impacting on interpersonal transactions, including the nurse-service user relationship. They conclude that training should be accessed by practitioners to build resilience and increase awareness of attachment processes to enhance nurses' understanding of the service user.
Bacha, Hanley and Winter	2020	'Like a human being, I was an equal, I wasn't just a patient': Service users' perspectives on their experiences of relationships with staff in mental health services	UK	Interpretative phenomenology	8 service users	The participants in this study struggled to find relationships that they experienced as therapeutic in the mental health system. They conclude that mental health services should be more focused upon care, rather than control. Relationships between service users and mental health practitioners can encourage recovery if they are consistent, safe, trusting, provide protective power and mirror a positive sense of self.
Borg and Kristiansen	2004	Recovery-oriented professionals: helping relationships in mental health services	Norway	Qualitative	15 service users	Article from a larger study. It found that practitioners who were recovery-orientated had courage to work with peoples' complexities by using their professional skills and collaborative working. The participants valued practitioners who conveyed hope, shared power, were available when needed, were open regarding diversity and willing to stretch boundaries.

Bowen and Mason	2012	Forensic and non-forensic psychiatric nursing skills and competencies for psychopathic and personality disordered patients	UK	Survey	990 secure, 500 non-secure nurses	The skills identified by secure nurses to work with people in secure settings were; being firm, setting limited and defining boundaries. For non-secure nurses they were: being non-judgemental, listening skills and good risk assessment. Showing more prioritisation for active management from secure nurses rather than the development of positive skills to build relationships from non-secure nurses, which indicates a differing approach, possibly due to the environment. This research concludes with the need for training that supports the development of engagement skills, communication skills and an ability to use reflection in action as a means of providing therapeutic care.
Bressington, Stewart, Beer and MacInnes	2011	Levels of service user satisfaction in secure settings: A survey of the association between perceived social climate, perceived therapeutic relationship and satisfaction with forensic services	UK	Cross-sectional survey design	44 service users	The service users who responded were satisfied with the secure service. Their rehabilitation and safety were viewed positively. Better perceptions of social climate correlated with satisfaction and perceptions of the therapeutic relationship with practitioners. Service users' experience of the therapeutic relationship and social climate of the unit indicated a higher level of satisfaction.
Cleary and Edwards	1999	'Something always comes up': Nurse-patient interaction in an acute psychiatric setting	Australia	Qualitative	10 nurses, 10 service users	The four themes from the service user interviews were; nurses' attributes, role perceptions, clinical care, and time. Key areas that were highlighted included the environment and how this can impact on the time nurses spend with service users. This could be with regards to how busy the environment was and how busy the nurses were, which influenced how much time they could spend interacting with service users. They conclude by stating that rather than being reactive, nurses need to be organised so that they are not just responding to something coming up.
Eldal Natvik, Veseth, Davidson, Skjolberg, Gytri and Moltu	2019	Being recognised as a whole person: A qualitative study of inpatient experience in mental health	Norway	Interpretative phenomenological analysis	14 service users	A key finding was the importance for the service users of being recognised as a person; having an identity. The nurse-service user relationship was fundamental to this recognition and ultimately in fostering recovery. Nurses need to prioritise interpersonal interactions and relationships over task-oriented duties and balance closeness and distance. They highlight service users' experiences provide rich and unique learning

						opportunities for nurses, enabling them to further understand and reflect on their interactions.
Evans, Murray, Jellicoe-Jones and Smith	2012	Support staffs' experiences of relationship formation and development in secure mental health services	UK	Interpretative phenomenological analysis	10 unqualified support practitioners	The three themes were; developing relationships, seeing the person and managing risk, and maintaining boundaries. They conclude that practitioners need to be mindful of how they interact with service users and the factors that can impact on their style of interaction such as attachment style.
Horberg, Sjogren and Dahlberg	2012	To be strategically struggling against resignation: The lived experience of being cared for in forensic psychiatric care	Sweden	Phenomenology	11 service users	They found, that for service users, secure service care can be 'non-caring' with only moments of 'good care,' and to adapt to demands of practitioners, service users develop strategies to gain privileges. They found that service users were lacking meaningful relationships and longed to be discharged from services. They reported that being cared for entailed struggling against an overwhelming sense of resignation.
Jenkins and Coffey	2002	Compelled to interact: Forensic community mental health nurses' and service users' relationships	UK	Mixed method	57 nurses	They discuss the importance of the therapeutic relationship in often complex situations and how education and preparation of practitioners should include the value of this relationship.
Johansson and Martensson	2019	Ways of strategies to knowing the patient described by nursing students	Sweden	Qualitative content analysis	10 students (adult)	The results show that the nursing students prepared themselves to meet with service users the first time by reading journals, asking other practitioners for information and research. They also consider how to behave and to be present in their encounters to create a good relationship, which can only be done by spending time together. The students discussed being open-minded while listening to the service user to get to know the person.
Jones and Wright	2015	"They're really PD today": An exploration of mental health nursing students' perceptions of developing a therapeutic relationship with patients with a diagnosis of antisocial personality disorder	UK	Qualitative	Two focus groups 7:3 students	They found four key themes: diagnosis, safety, engagement, and environmental influences. Both groups of students (secure and non-secure placements) commented on looking beyond the diagnosis and seeing the person. The student nurses cited other practitioners in their placement areas as hugely influential in terms of the development of their perceptions of service users with antisocial personality disorder and how to relate to them.
Ketola and Stein	2013	Psychiatric clinical course strengthens the student-patient relationships of	US	Survey	67 students	They found that during the students' placements, they developed listening, communication and self-reflection skills which resulted in the development of empathy for the service

		baccalaureate nursing students				users they were working with. The students stated that their time with service users had changed them. They reported growing, both professionally and personally, from their relationships with service users.
Kurtz and Turner	2007	An exploratory study of the needs of staff who care for offenders with a diagnosis of personality disorder	UK	Qualitative	13 multi-disciplinary practitioners	They found that particularly in secure settings the skills and needs of practitioners are important in order for them to manage their own countertransference to be able to support service users and indeed build relationships with them. Good multidisciplinary working and group supervision, utilising a reflective approach, were highlighted as factors to assist practitioners in coping with working in secure services and feelings of vulnerability that the participants reported.
Langley and Klopfer	2005	Trust as a foundation for the therapeutic intervention for patients with borderline personality disorder	South Africa	Qualitative (grounded theory)	6 service users, 10 practitioners	The article focuses on the first theme of trust, which was identified by both service users and practitioners as crucial for the establishment and maintenance of the therapeutic relationship. Trust was highlighted by every service user as a foundation for any relationship, and the practitioners described trust as an anchor to maintain a relationship.
Long, Knight, Bradley and Thomas	2012	Effective therapeutic milieus in secure services for women: The service user perspective	UK	Qualitative participatory research	Two focus groups with service users	The themes identified included; interpersonal relationships, treatment programming, service user empowerment, the ward as a place of safety and hope for the future. The service users in this study highlighted the importance of hope, active engagement in treatment and developing a sense of self-worth as integral to an effective treatment milieu.
Looi, Savenstedt and Engstrom	2016	"Easy but not simple": Nursing students' descriptions of the process of care in a psychiatric context	Sweden	Journal analysis	14 student journals	They found three themes; trusting the trusting relationship, voicing unspoken needs, and balancing the dynamics of doing and being. They concluded that providing nursing care based on trusting relationships is not a demanding task, but it takes place in a complex environment that has a tendency to make easy things complicated.
Lord, Priest and McGowan	2016	Therapeutic engagement in medium-secure care: An interpretative phenomenological analysis of service users' experiences	UK	Interpretative phenomenological analysis	10 service users	The authors conclude that the social climate of the environment is important in building trusting relationships. Offering choice to service users, being direct and open can prevent service users from feeling excluded and more likely to be willing to develop trusting relationships.
MacInnes, Courtney,	2014	A cross sectional survey examining the association	UK	Cross-sectional survey	77 service users	Practitioners need to be available and accessible while having good listening and information giving skills. It is important to

Flanagan, Bressington and Beer		between therapeutic relationships and service user satisfaction in forensic mental health settings				have both positive therapeutic relationships and service user satisfaction in secure settings. Showing interest, honesty and care are important for service users.
McAllister and McCrae	2017	The therapeutic role of mental health nurses in psychiatric intensive care: A mixed-methods investigation in an inner-city mental health service	UK	Mixed-methods	Observations 234 practitioners, 309 service user activities, interviews with 4 practitioners, 6 service users	Although both service users and nurses in this study wanted more therapeutic contact, nurses wanted longer time to spend in individual sessions, service users preferred brief but more frequent interaction with nurses. Organisational constraints and lack of definition and practice of therapeutic engagement were deemed problematic. They conclude that there should be more emphasis on therapeutic engagement in nurse education, ward management and clinical supervision.
Mollerhoj and Os Stolan	2018	'First and foremost a human being ...': user perspectives on mental health services from 50 mentally disordered offenders	Denmark	Qualitative	50 service users	It was important for the service users that nurses acted with respect and empathy in their interactions, that the communication between nurses and service users was responsive, decision making was shared and a variety of activities were offered. A poignant finding when the service users were asked what it was like to be a secure service user, responding; <i>'despite severe mental illness, social marginalisation as well as various criminal records they are still, first and foremost, human beings. However, they often feel dehumanized and monstrous'</i> .
Mukumbang and Adejumo	2014	Patients' experiences of being nursed by student nurses at a teaching hospital	South Africa	Phenomenology	10 service users	Three main themes arose from their thematic analysis: methods of identification of the student nurses by the service users and positive and negative perceptions of student nurses. Negative perceptions arose from poor experiences of interacting with students. The service users felt this was due to the student's lack of experience of using communication skills.
Muller and Poggenpoel	1996	Patients' internal world experience of interacting with psychiatric nurses	South Africa	Phenomenology	13 service users	They found that nurse-service user interaction promoted good mental health in the service users. The results emphasise the importance of a facilitative nurse- service user interaction to assist the service user in the promotion, maintenance, and restoration of mental health.
Oostvogels, Bongers and Willems	2018	The role of emotion regulation, coping, self-reflection and insight in staff interaction with	Netherlands	Cross-sectional design	76 secure practitioners	They found that practitioners who cope with difficult situations by getting upset, blaming themselves or fantasising about solutions (emotion-focused coping style) needed more support, encouragement and back-up (support-seeking behaviour) from

		patients with a diagnosis of personality disorder in forensic settings				service users. Practitioners who better understand their own thoughts, feelings and behaviour (insight) needed less support from service users. Insight, emotion-focused coping and emotional regulation of practitioners influence the quality of care of service users with a diagnosis of personality disorder in secure settings.
Rask and Brunt	2006	Verbal and social interactions in Swedish forensic psychiatric nursing care as perceived by the patients and nurses	Sweden	Quantitative-survey	20 service users, 87 nurses	There were significant differences between service users' and nurses' perceptions about the frequency of all the different groups of interactions, but greater agreement as to the importance. In general, the service users perceived that the interactions occurred less frequently than the nurses.
Reavey, Brown, Kanyeredzi, McGrath and Tucker	2019	Agents and spectres: Life-space on a medium secure forensic psychiatric unit	UK	Qualitative-visual study	Interviews with 20 service users	They conclude that by increasing a greater sense of physical movement and liberty there can be improvements in the therapeutic landscape, and thus reversal of any effects of narrowing service users' sense of agency. Environments and activities in these environments should be designed based on mapping of relations and service users' experiences.
Salzmann-Erikson, Rydlo and Wiklund Gustin	2016	Getting to know the person behind the illness: The significance of interacting with patients hospitalised in forensic psychiatric settings	Sweden	Qualitative	5 nurses	Nursing needs to focus on care and taking time to see the service users as individuals. Including developing trust from daily activities promoting recovery, rather than stereotypical policing and custodial roles.
Schafer and Peternelj-Taylor	2003	Therapeutic relationships and boundary maintenance: The perspective of forensic patients enrolled in a treatment program for violent offenders	Canada	Qualitative	12 service users	The development of relationships is a complex process. The participants discussed time in a multidimensional way, being a measure of their value to practitioners and how they used it to assert themselves in the unit. They conclude that if the relationship is the heart of nursing then nurses need to understand the complexity of relationships from the perspective of their service users.
Scheick	2011	Developing self-aware mindfulness to manage countertransference in the nurse-client relationship: An evaluation and developmental study	America	Mixed methodology	15 students	They conclude that is important to develop self-awareness using mindfulness to manage countertransference when working in mental health services. This is especially important as nurses and students bring their own world in to interactions with service users.

Shattell, Andes and Thomas	2008	How patients and nurses experience the acute care psychiatric environment	USA	Phenomenology	10 service users, 9 nurses	The study themes were contextualized by time, which was a source of stress to both groups: for service users there was boredom, and for nurses, pressure and chaos. Nurses felt caged-in by the nursing station, and service users felt caged-in by the locked doors of the unit. The findings from this US study do not support the existence of the therapeutic milieu as described in the literature. Although the nurse-service user relationship was yearned for by nurses, it was nearly absent from service users' descriptions. The caring experienced by service users was mainly derived from interactions with other service users.
Shattell, Starr and Thomas	2007	'Take my hand, help me out': Mental health service recipients' experience of the therapeutic relationship.	USA	Phenomenology	20 service users	They found that it was important for practitioners to take the time to get to know the service users as a whole person so they could relate to them and support them in finding solutions. They concluded that building therapeutic relationships with people with mental health problems requires in-depth personal knowledge, which is acquired only with time, understanding, and skill. It was important for practitioners to know the whole person, rather than knowing the person only as a service user.
Walsh	1999	Shared humanity and the psychiatric nurse-patient encounter	Australia	Phenomenology discussion paper	7 nurses	The main theme Walsh discusses is 'shared humanity'; where just being with people, sharing common ground and being human should be at the forefront of any nurse and service user encounter.
Yildiz	2019	What do nursing students tell us about their communication with people with mental illness? A qualitative study	Turkey	Qualitative-Content analysis	26 student nurses	They conclude that students' use effective therapeutic communication strategies with service users and are conscious about providing a therapeutic environment, despite encountering many communication barriers with individuals with mental health problems. Students need to receive supervisory support in their practice.

Discussion and literature review papers

Authors	Year	Title	Place	Study type	Main findings
Cameron, Kapur and Campbell	2005	Releasing the therapeutic potential of the psychiatric nurse: A human relations perspective of the nurse-patient relationship	UK	Discussion paper	They discuss that despite nurses being the largest profession, caring on an everyday basis for services and being in a pivotal position to establish valuable therapeutic relationships, a disproportionate amount of their time is taken up by administration, impacting negatively on the time they spend talking to service users.
Chandley	2000	Time and confinement: Towards a common sense of socio-temporality in a special hospital	UK	Discussion paper	Time can be isolating and the environment of a secure hospital is very much a unique environment where time is experienced differently than outside of the service. This is due to the routines imposed and lack of control the service users have of their time. The time practitioners spend with service users can be seen as a commodity, which can be used and abused.
Cleary, Hunt, Horsfall and Deacon	2012	Nurse-patient interaction in acute adult inpatient mental health units: A review and synthesis of qualitative studies	Australia	Qualitative analysis and review	This paper explores the nurse-service user interaction in adult acute inpatient units. They found six themes: 1) sophisticated communication; 2) subtle discriminations; 3) managing security parameters; 4) ordinary communication; 5) reliance on colleagues; and 6) personal characteristics. They conclude that nurse communication involves interpersonal approaches that require specifically complex and developed personal skills in often challenging and chaotic settings.
Gildberg, Elverdam and Hounsgaard	2010	Forensic psychiatric nursing: A literature review and thematic analysis of staff-patient interaction	Denmark	Literature review	The two themes identified were; paternalistic and behaviour-changing care, and relational and personal quality-dependent care. They conclude that despite care being expressed as personal qualities in a relationship aspect, secure nursing care focuses on relationship security and comes from a custodial perspective rather than a caring one.