

Exploring university English language teachers' understanding of
their continuing professional development: a narrative inquiry into the
Pakistani context.

Shamim Aijaz

MED University of Central Lancashire, Preston

MA English literature Shah Abdul Latif University, Sindh, Pakistan

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Psychology and Humanities University of Central Lancashire

September 2023

Student declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted for the award of any degree elsewhere.

Exploring university English teachers' understanding of their CPD: a narrative inquiry into the Pakistani context

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to explore Pakistani higher education (HE) English teachers' understanding of continuous professional development (CPD). Professional development (PD) is provided through either campus support or elsewhere for formal and informal activities, such as studying for a teacher training qualification, achieving skills, establishing a community of practice (CoP), and in-service CPD. There are issues such as the CPD policy, effective and ineffective CPD, and follow up measures and evaluation. These issues are likely to be connected to the English teachers' understanding of CPD and its proper utilisation to help them become motivated faculty members.

The study adopted a social constructivist approach. Participants were public/private university English teachers with 15 years of teaching experience. The data was obtained through interviews and analysis of participants' profiles. Narrative inquiry (NI) was used as a framework to understand the participants' awareness of their need for CPD, the level of support of their department, the affordances and barriers to their CPD, and the essential features which characterise their early and later years of the teaching.

The findings show that the English teachers have a clear understanding of their personal development. However, English teachers say there is a need to focus on the Higher Education Commission (HEC) and institutional support for creating ongoing and mandatory CPD that positively impacts students. Participants also indicate challenges in the form of scarcity of CPD resources, policy gaps, lack of executive efforts and a non-collaborative environment. In the

context of affordances, language teaching is considered an asset and source of social prestige. However, the institutional role in CPD is so explicit for participants that they did not mention it as an influencing factor. Furthermore, the results indicate that participants successfully applied a range of skills acquired through CPD courses, even though they had not initially intended to enrol in any such courses. The skills included being reflective, student-centred, and balancing teaching and students' learning. It is expected that the study will raise implications for stakeholders to consider more accessible CPD experiences.

Table of Contents

Student declaration.....	i
Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	xii
Chapter One: Introduction	1
Chapter overview	1
1. Background of the study	1
1.1 Significance of my study	3
1.2 Rationale for the study	4
1.3 Theoretical framework.....	8
1.4 Research questions.....	9
1.5 Personal reflection as a researcher	10
1.6 Organising this study	12
Chapter Two: Context of the study.....	13
Chapter overview	13
2. Section 1: The wider context of the study	13
2.1 Educational institutions in Pakistan	13
2.1.1 English-medium elite schools and institutions	14
2.1.2 Non-elite private schools	15
2.1.3 Vernacular-medium schools	16
2.1.4 Madrasah schools or non-formal institutions.....	16
2.1.5 Other language learning institutions	17
2.2 Status of the English language in Pakistan.....	18
2.2.1 Language profile and language controversy in Pakistan	19
2.2.2 Implementation policy of English	22
2.2.3 Instrumental and integrative reasons for learning English language	22
2.3 TESOL in Pakistan	23
2.3.1 Teacher-centred classes.....	24
2.3.2 Lack of innovative environment	24
2.3.3 A class scenario – the way a teacher teaches	25
2.3.4 Learners’ anxiety in classes.....	27
2.3.5 Passive learning environment in HE.....	28
2.3.6 The language classroom and challenges.....	28
2.3.7 Qualifications and motivation of teachers.....	29
2.3.8 Issues in TESOL teaching in Pakistan.....	30
2.3.9 The details of English language provision.....	32

2.3.10 Teaching content of universities.....	33
2.4 Promotional and recruitment policy in Pakistan.....	34
2.4.1 Teaching policy in Pakistan.....	36
2.5 Section 2: Focused context of the study.....	37
2.5.1 Teacher training in Pakistan.....	38
2.5.2 CPD policy and the nature of projects in Pakistan: a brief overview.....	39
2.5.2.1 External apprenticeship model or foreign projects.....	39
2.5.2.2 CPD projects: impact and durability.....	41
2.5.2.3 Institutional support and CPD.....	42
2.5.2.4 HEC efforts for TESOL.....	44
2.5.2.6 Indigenous scholarship/degree programme.....	48
2.5.2.7 Continuous professional development (CPD) courses.....	48
2.5.2.8 International resource person training (IRP).....	49
2.5.2.9 Conferences and seminars.....	50
2.5.2.10 Research journals and funding.....	50
2.5.2.11 Funding for research projects.....	50
2.5.2.12 Self-access centres (SACs).....	51
2.6 Challenges for the HEC in implementing the CPD programme.....	51
2.6.1 Remote areas and resource persons.....	51
2.6.2 English teachers' lack of motivation.....	52
2.6.3 Impact of ELTR and HEC record.....	52
2.6.4 Lack of evaluation and monitoring.....	52
2.6.5 Scrutiny and English teachers' background.....	53
2.6.6 Similar training for college and university teachers.....	53
2.6.7 Infrastructure of training centres.....	54
2.6.8 In-depth analysis of the ELTR project.....	54
2.7 Summary of the chapter.....	56
Chapter Three: Literature review.....	58
Chapter overview.....	58
3.1 Introduction.....	58
3.2 State of career guidance in Pakistan.....	58
3.2.1 Increased awareness and implementation of career counselling services.....	59
3.2.2 Effective assessment tools tailored to the Pakistani context.....	59
3.2.3 Enhancing career counselling in HE.....	60
3.2.4 Tailoring counselling services to students' needs and expectations.....	60
3.2.5 Career counselling and language instruction in Pakistan.....	60

3.3 English language education and PD challenges in Pakistan	61
3.3.1 The contradiction of policy and practice	62
3.3.2 Quality and standards of achievements	63
3.3.3 A conflict between local and global needs	63
3.4 Evaluation of pre- or in-service teacher-education	64
3.5 Defining CPD.....	66
3.5.1 Traditional concepts of training and development	69
3.5.2 The transformative effect of experiential learning in CPD programmes.....	72
3.5.3 The impact of CPD on English teachers	73
3.5.4 Different approaches to CPD	74
3.5.4.1 Possibilities of CPD approaches	76
3.5.4.2 Formal and informal CPD approaches	78
3.5.4.6 Research as a form of CPD	85
3.5.4.7 Professional learning communities.....	87
3.6. Elements required for the success of CPD.....	90
3.6.1 Effective and ineffective CPD programmes and activities	90
3.6.2 Rigorous, connected and continuing practice	92
3.6.3 Teaching and learning content	92
3.7. Factors affecting the pursuit of CPD	93
3.7.1 Social factors	93
3.7.2 Institutional expectations	94
3.7.3 Context and culture related factors.....	95
3.8 Some considerations for teacher-educators	96
3.9 Research on teachers’ experiences of CPD	98
3.9.1 Quality of university teachers.....	99
3.9.2 English language teachers’ perceptions of continuous professional development	100
3.9.3 Popular CPD activities	100
3.9.4 Factors impacting CPD	103
3.10 Ways to improve CPD effectiveness as suggested in the literature.....	105
3.11 Summary of the chapter	108
Chapter Four: The research design and methodology	109
Introduction.....	109
4.1. Background.....	110
4.2. Research questions.....	113
4.3 Qualitative inquiry	114
4.3.1. Quantitative and qualitative research	114

4.3.2	Ontology and epistemology of the study.....	116
4.3.3	Interpretivism and constructivism	117
4.4	Narrative inquiry	119
4.4.1	Narrative inquiry in educational research	119
4.4.2	Definition of narrative inquiry	120
4.4.3	Narrative analysis and analysis of narrative concepts	121
4.4.4	Dimensions of narrative inquiry.....	122
	<i>First focus: Temporality</i>	122
	<i>Second focus: Sociality</i>	122
	<i>Third focus: Place</i>	123
4.4.5	My aim and narrative inquiry.....	123
4.4.6	Narrative inquiry for continuous professional development	126
4.5	Theoretical underpinnings: an overview of Vygotsky’s socio-cultural theory.....	126
4.6	My role as researcher	129
4.7	Research design	130
4.7.1	Research methods	131
4.7.1.1	<i>Virtual interviewing process</i>	131
4.7.1.2	<i>English teachers’ profiles as data resource</i>	140
4.7.1.3	<i>Reflective journal - a significant tool of researcher’s development</i>	142
4.8	Research sites: Universities.....	145
4.8.1	<i>Universities and participants’ selection process</i>	150
4.9	Pilot study	151
4.9.1	The notion of information power and sampling in the project	152
4.9.2	Issues overcome in the pilot study	154
4.10	Main study participants, sampling and amendments	156
4.10.1	Element of bias in snowball sampling.....	158
4.11	Quality of the research: trustworthiness	158
4.12	Ethics in the study	161
4.13	Chapter summary	164
	Chapter Five: Data organisation and analysis.....	165
	Introduction.....	165
5.1	Content and thematic analysis	165
5.2	Stages in the data analysis process - data organisation.....	166
5.2.1.	Initiating the data analysis procedure	166
5.2.2	Reading the raw data	167
5.3	Dewey’s notion of experience	168

5.4 Dimensions of narrative inquiry	169
5.5 Coding process.....	170
5.5.1 Coding approaches.....	170
5.5.2 Looking for patterns.....	170
5.5.3 Coding and categorising patterns	171
5.5.4 Use of software.....	172
5.6 English teachers' profiles: analysis process.....	175
5.7 Chapter summary	177
Chapter Six: Findings and discussions	178
.....	178
Chapter overview	178
Biographical narratives of individual participants.....	178
Introduction.....	191
6.1 Presentation of outcomes	191
6.2 Participants' awareness of the research process	192
6.3 Inclusion of strategic quotes	192
RQ1. How do the participants understand CPD and their needs for professional development?	193
6.4 Promotional and recruitment policy drawn from this research	195
6.5 Participants' perception of CPD	195
6.5.1 CPD: bridging the gap for quality teaching	196
6.5.2 CPD as lifelong learning and self-directed activity	196
6.6 Participants' awareness of CPD opportunities.....	198
6.6.1 Awareness of pedagogic courses and their need or impact on ELT	198
6.6.1.1 Awareness of changing professional demand	199
6.7 Participants' CPD approaches, practices and popular CPD activities	202
6.7.1 PhD as HEC directed academic activity: Other-directed CPD, PD.....	202
6.7.2 Participants' self-directed CPD activities	207
6.7.2.1 Professional learning through work	208
6.7.2.2 Learning through collaboration and membership of communities of practice or professional learning communities	209
6.7.2.3 Learning through attending CPD events	211
6.7.2.4 CPD through presenting at conferences	215
6.7.2.5 Learning through writing for the field of language teaching and classroom research ..	218
RESEARCH QUESTION TWO.....	222
RQ.2) How do specific environmental factors	222
6.8 Social support.....	222

6.8.1 <i>Parents (home environment & father’s profession)</i>	223
6.8.2 <i>Spouse as supporters for professional growth</i>	225
6.9 Institutional support	227
6.9.1 Location of institution for further studies	228
6.9.2 <i>Public and private institutions</i>	231
RESEARCH QUESTION THREE.....	235
RQ.3) What are the affordances or barriers to the development of teachers’ independent... 235	
6.10 Affordances for CPD	236
6.10.1. <i>Social status as extrinsic motivation for CPD</i>	237
6.10.2 <i>Promotional incentives and monetary benefits</i>	240
6.10.3 <i>Teacher autonomy as an affordance</i>	241
6.10.4 <i>Freedom to develop course content</i>	242
6.11 Barriers for CPD	243
6.11.1 Factors impacting CPD	244
6.11.1.1 <i>Absence of CPD activities as a barrier to CPD</i>	246
6.11.1.2 <i>Promotion policy as a barrier to CPD</i>	247
6.11.1.3 <i>Department permission as a barrier for CPD</i>	249
6.11.1.4 <i>Irrelevant CPD activities as barrier to continuous growth</i>	250
RESEARCH QUESTION FOUR	252
Q.4. What significant characteristics do the selected participants exhibit as English teachers	252
6.12 Participants as novice English teachers	253
6.12.1 Attitude towards language teaching.....	254
6.12.1.1 <i>Goal-oriented nature of participants</i>	254
6.12.1.2 <i>Attitude towards training</i>	256
6.12.1.3 <i>Limited field knowledge</i>	257
6.12.1.4 <i>Self-confidence</i>	258
6.12.2 Traditional teaching methods.....	260
6.12.2.1 <i>Teaching content</i>	261
6.12.3 Classroom approach and attitude towards learners.....	263
6.12.3.1 <i>Indifferent attitude towards students</i>	264
6.12.3.2 <i>Lack of awareness of diverse learning styles</i>	267
6.12.3.3 <i>Absence of teacher responsibility for student learning</i>	268
6.13 Participants as experienced English teachers.....	271
6.13.1 Knowledgeable person	272
6.13.2 Participants as effective teachers	276

6.13.3 Participants as field researchers	281
6.13.4 Participants as supervisors.....	284
6.13.5 Participants as course developers/resource persons and critics.....	286
6.14 Findings and Narrative Inquiry	289
6.15 Summary unveiling the journey	290
6.16 Summary of the chapter	291
Chapter Seven: Conclusions, recommendations and implications	294
Chapter overview	294
7.1 Key concepts which emerged from my thesis	294
7.2.1 Teacher identity and agency	294
7.2.2 Unbalanced professional growth.....	295
7.2.3 Blurred institutional and HEC policies.....	296
7.2.4 Impact of CPD.....	297
7.2.5 An emergent CPD culture in Pakistan	297
7.2.6 Conclusion.....	298
7.3 Recommendations.....	300
7.4 Implications of my study	301
7.5 Personal development	303
7.5.1 Insights and aspirations	304
7.5.2 My current research project and future research inspiration	305
7.6 Some guidelines	306
7.7 Chapter summary	307
References.....	308
Appendices.....	344
Appendix 1 Consent form	344
Appendix 2 Information sheet for participants Chapter Four.....	346
Appendix 3 Interview questions Chapter Four.....	348
Appendix 4 Sample interview transcript Chapter Four	353
Appendix 5: Individual Participants' Profiles	355
Participant Ali.....	355
Participant Bilal	357
Participant Ahmed	359
Participant Zain	362
Participant Usman.....	364
Participant Imran	366
Participant Abdullah.....	368

Participant Noureen.....	370
Participant Farooq.....	372
Participant Muhammad	373

Acknowledgements

At many points during my doctoral research degree studies, I have wondered what I would write in this space, to thank all those who have helped me over the last four years. Yet now that I come to write my acknowledgements, I do not feel that the words I write here can do justice to the sense of gratitude I would like to convey.

First and foremost, thank you Allah you kept me going through this long and challenging period of my life. Thank you for supporting me to emerge from this unending ocean of knowledge and uncertainties. Second, my thanks are due to my supervisors, Dr Tania Horak, Dr Sharon McCulloch and Dr Josie Leonard, not only for their insightful advice but also for their continuous support and guidance through the research process. Without Dr Tania Horak's unending support, patience and tireless encouragement, I could not have completed writing this thesis. In addition, my deep respect and appreciation go to my participants from various Pakistani universities, who shared their valuable professional experiences and provided me with a treasury of rich data. Lastly, I would like to thank my husband, Dr Rasa Muhammad who always supported me in multiple ways: financially, morally and with valuable advice. Additionally, I thank my family, my mother and siblings who always remain at my back to support me in this vigorous process of research. It would also be unjust not to thank my brother-in-law, Dr Muhammad Ramzan, who took time to support me in the provision of participants; and Carol Bennett who proofread my thesis in a short period of time.

My heartfelt thanks to all.

List of Tables

Table 1 Main languages of Pakistan and approximate number of speakers	20
Table 2 English language degree provisions in various universities (University of Sindh, 2023).	32
Table 3 Promotional and recruitment policy in Pakistan.....	35
Table 4 CPD activities and training	46
Table 5 CPD activities adopted from observation and the literature.	77
Table 6 Classification of self-directed activities.....	80
Table 7 Categorisation of other-directed activities	83
Table 8 Transcription process in this study.	134
Table 9 Details about Participants n = 13	157
Table 10 Example of codes.....	173
Table 11 Examples of categories	174
Table 12 Categories related to participants' CPD understanding.....	194
Table 13 Requirements for promotion and recruitment.....	195
Table 14 List of self-directed CPD activities.....	207
Table 15 Influencing environmental factors for English teachers.	222
Table 16 Affordance and barriers for CPD	236
Table 17 Participants' attributes	253
Table 18 Participants as experienced English teachers.....	271

List of abbreviation used in this study

Continuing Professional Development	CPD
Professional Development	PD
Certificate in English Language Teaching to Adults	CELTA
National education policy	NEP
English Language Teachers Reforms project	ELTR
Society of Pakistan English Language Teachers	SPELT
Community of Practice	CoP
Professional Learning Communities	PLCs
Teaching English as Foreign Language	TEFL
English as Foreign Language	EFL
Second Language Acquisition	SLA
Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages	TESOL
Higher Education Institutions	HEIs
Self-access centres	SACs
Learning Innovation Development	LID
Higher Education Commission	HEC
Higher Education	HE
English Language Teaching	ELT
English for Academic Purposes	EAP
English for Specific Purposes	ESP
International Association of Teachers of English as a Foreign Language	IATEFL
International English Language Testing System	IELTS
Language Teachers Education	LTE
Initial Teacher Education	ITE
Virtual interviewing process	VIP

Chapter One: Introduction

After this extensive period of doctoral study, I have come to believe that one's creativity and genuine innovative research skills tend to flourish and develop even more after obtaining the degree. The process of pursuing a doctorate has a way of both suppressing and nurturing one's abilities, ultimately leading to personal growth and enhanced research capabilities.

Chapter overview

This chapter will begin by providing background information about the study, followed by an exploration of its significance. Subsequently, I will outline the rationale behind this investigation, the theoretical framework, and list the research questions that guide this exploration. Additionally, I will share my personal reflections as the researcher conducting this study. Finally, this chapter will conclude by presenting an overview of the organisation of the entire thesis, chapter by chapter.

1. Background of the study

This research study **was** carried out in a country that has multifaceted background in English language education. This section presents some glimpses of that backdrop and four key elements. Firstly, it examines the positioning of English as both a language of development and an official language amidst resistance from local languages and certain religious groups. Secondly, it delves into the context of English as a medium of instruction (EMI) in higher education (HE), where the practical approach often involves code-switching and code-mixing (the use of English and home or local languages). Thirdly, it highlights the paucity of resources dedicated to teacher development. Lastly, it scrutinises the teacher development policy, which prioritises academic degrees over the pedagogical aspects of language teaching and continuing professional development (CPD).

The adoption of English as a catalyst for development has led to its widespread learning in private and public institutions. The latter may lack the quality of education provided by more exclusive private schools, creating a societal divide. This split in educational access has fostered different levels of excellence among teachers, resulting in diverse backgrounds of teachers in HE.

An essential consideration is the conceptualisation of English as not merely an academic subject of study, but as a skill encompassing listening, speaking, reading, and writing. This distinction is crucial in understanding how it is taught and learned effectively.

Despite its elevated status, English language use encounters resistance from some local people and specific religious groups, who associate it with non-Muslims. This resistance hampers language proficiency acquisition, acting as a barrier to its widespread acceptance.

Higher Educational Institutions (HEIs) mandate EMI. However, due to the prevalence of local languages and under-resourced public schools, many educators lack high proficiency levels, resulting in the use of code-switching and code-mixing as teaching strategies.

The scarcity of resources dedicated to teacher development is a pivotal aspect of English language education in Pakistan. A structured system for CPD is largely absent; English Language Teachers (English teachers) lack consistent institutional guidance and specific training throughout their professional journey. Furthermore, the teacher development policy accentuates academic degrees for career advancement and monetary incentives, reducing the pedagogical importance of language teaching and CPD (Bayram & Canaran, 2018). Pedagogical training and participation in academic events are not duly recognised, except for a limited emphasis on publications and doctoral degrees (Shamim, 2018). Furthermore, private institutions have different practices regarding CPD compared to their counterparts in the public sector (Nawab, 2017).

Collectively, the interplay of these aforementioned elements forms the foundation for this study's exploration into English teachers' comprehension, achievements, and behaviours with regard to CPD.

1.1 Significance of my study

This research carries significant implications for the CPD of English teachers in Pakistani universities. By exploring their understanding of CPD, identifying challenges, and developing guidelines, this study aims to enhance the quality and effectiveness of CPD activities. The findings have the potential to inform policymakers, university administrations, and resource persons in designing and implementing more targeted and impactful CPD initiatives. Ultimately, the study aims to contribute to the professional growth and instructional practices of English teachers, thereby improving the quality of ELT in Pakistan.

The primary focus of this study is on English teachers at various stages of their professional journey. Regardless of their position on this continuum, this research provides contemporary evidence from the research process that can be helpful to them. Policymakers can also benefit by gaining insights into English teachers' understanding of CPD, which can inform their policy development. Furthermore, experts in the field of English language teaching (ELT) may find reinforcement of their existing practices from the presented outcomes, while readers may encounter new insights about CPD in ELT that can be adapted to their specific circumstances. The significance of this research extends to resource persons who review the study's findings, even though some outcomes may already be familiar to them. Additionally, new trainers in the field of ELT in the Pakistani context can find ideas, guidelines, recommendations, and concepts that can guide their approach to this important scholarly role. For developers of CPD activities in higher education institutions (HEIs) in Pakistan, it provides rich ideas to explore with pedagogic courses and training programs. The examples portrayed in the research illustrate the

activities that occur throughout the CPD journey and shed light on the roles of participants, the learning environment, and the institutions' culture.

The experiences of teaching and learning within CPD also suggest that this research can be helpful for students and teachers in master's level English language/literature courses. As part of their degree, students are required to understand career planning for the future, and the findings, discussions, conclusions, and recommendations in this thesis directly apply to them. Although their degree program may be shorter in length than the entire CPD process, it is essential for them to demonstrate familiarity with and the ability to plan for serious CPD to enhance their career prospects.

Finally, this research holds relevance for CPD in ELT sectors beyond HE due to its generic nature. The focus lies not only in specific contextual training but also in the CPD process and its impact, making it applicable to various sectors.

1.2 Rationale for the study

My interest in exploring the subject of CPD in Pakistani universities stems from the recognition of the crucial role that English teachers play in the professional growth of their students and the overall development of the country. In a country where English is regarded as a language of development, ensuring the CPD of English teachers is significant. My interest has been shaped by my extensive experience working in HE and FE in Pakistan. Through this experience, I have recognised the significant role that CPD can play in enhancing the skills and knowledge of teachers employed in these institutions.

I am also familiar with the influence of various factors, including institutional policies, promotion opportunities, and the teachers' own motivation, which impact their engagement in CPD activities. Unfortunately, some teachers appear demotivated and reluctant to fully utilise their observations and classroom experiences for CPD purposes. My concern arises, in part,

from the Higher Education Commission (HEC) providing institutions with CPD frameworks, which outline the expectations for teacher involvement in professional development (PD).

However, the current institutional CPD provisions may not always align with the specific needs and varying experience of individual language teachers. This disparity can affect how experienced teachers choose to develop themselves, the types of opportunities they seek, and whether they opt for in-house or external development avenues.

My interest in exploring the CPD of English teachers employed in Pakistani universities is also driven by my previous teaching experience. As a cooperative teacher in a local university, I had the opportunity to teach various courses at the bachelor's and master's levels, including English for Academic Purposes (EAP), functional English, and communicative English courses. During this time, I had the chance to observe the communication skills of undergraduate students and engage in personal interactions with fellow teachers within the same university. These interactions provided valuable insights into the varying levels of English language competence among learners and the unique needs and interests of both teachers and students, particularly in relation to their levels of motivation.

Research shows a scarcity of CPD opportunities in Pakistani universities (Raza & Coombe, 2022). I will delve into these opportunities in detail in chapter Two. However, it is worth noting that several CPD activities take place outside the institutions, and interestingly, many experienced teachers working in universities actively participate in these external CPD initiatives. In fact, based on my experiences of working in a university, I observed a general disregard for pedagogic CPD activities within the institution. Instead, there seemed to be a preference among teachers for non-institutional CPD in pursuing PhD degrees.

It appears that the lack of uptake of development opportunities offered by institutions is partially influenced by the way teachers perceive HEC policies. Since pedagogic courses do not hold any monetary or promotional incentives, teachers often feel unmotivated to pursue

them. On the other hand, they show high motivation towards obtaining a PhD and engaging in scholarly publications, as these activities are linked to promotional and monetary incentives. This suggests that teachers believe they can contribute to teacher development within their institution through their doctorate degrees and publications, but they may lack sufficient motivation to pursue pedagogic courses. Consequently, this could be a contributing factor as to why they show either disinterest or prioritise other CPD opportunities over pedagogic courses.

This intrigued me and sparked my curiosity to explore the underlying reasons. With this in mind, the aims of my study were to gain an understanding of teachers' CPD experiences and their perspectives on CPD. Additionally, I aimed to investigate the development choices that experienced teachers typically make and the motivations behind those choices. Importantly, I was eager to amplify their voices regarding the contributions they believe they can or already have made towards CPD, both within institutional settings and through external avenues. Furthermore, I sought to uncover how teachers perceive CPD within their employment contexts and identify ways to enhance CPD to benefit both experienced and less experienced teachers equally.

My specific interest in exploring CPD is driven by multiple factors. Firstly, the majority of English teachers working in Pakistani universities are tasked with teaching in graduate and postgraduate programmes. It is noteworthy that these English teachers are typically Pakistani themselves, having graduated from Pakistani universities. However, it is common for many of them to pursue their doctoral studies in European countries. In general, these English teachers have limited international exposure and often secure their first job positions in universities without prior work experience. Despite this, they actively contribute to enhancing the development of ELT within their respective institutions. Furthermore, while a significant amount of research on English language development is conducted by experienced teachers

from Pakistani universities, research focused on their own professional development (PD) remains an unexplored area.

In Pakistan, existing research into ELT and learning predominantly focuses on the challenges and issues related to CPD in schools. There is limited research and literature available on the CPD experiences of English teachers in Pakistani universities, resulting in a lack of insight into the development of mid- to late-career teachers in these institutions.

Therefore, the purpose of my study is to conduct an in-depth investigation into the phenomenon of CPD from the perspective of English teachers employed in Pakistani universities. By exploring their experiences and perspectives, I aim to develop a better understanding of how they can be effectively supported in their CPD efforts, both within their institutions and externally. To do this, I need to understand both the grassroots, bottom-up and teacher driven CPD and centralised and institutionally driven, top-down CPD decisions taken during the National Education Policy 2017-2025 (Zia et al., 2023).

It is important to note that these two approaches are not mutually exclusive, and a balanced approach can often result in the best results. In effective CPD programmes, there needs to be a combination of top-down and bottom-up initiatives that can address broader organisational goals and provide opportunities to English teachers to grow. This balance helps to create a more holistic and responsive PD environment for the English teachers. Additionally, it is crucial to understand the experiences of successful English teachers who navigate a system with such unclear policies. Examining the perspectives of academically and professionally successful English teachers sheds light on how intended policies, resource allocations, and opportunities are perceived and utilised by teachers who excel in their CPD. This approach draws attention to the disengagement process that exists within the system, as successful English teachers continue their development despite the lack of clear policies. By highlighting what these English teachers find most helpful in their ongoing professional growth, we can

challenge existing institutional policies and foster conversations on English teachers' needs and effective practices.

Understanding English teachers' CPD experiences in Pakistani universities can provide valuable insights to policymakers. By considering the accounts of English teachers, policymakers can better comprehend the phenomenon of CPD and reassess whether their existing knowledge aligns with the context of language teacher education. Additionally, policymakers can become more aware of what they do not know about English teachers' teaching and learning, particularly regarding students' diverse backgrounds and English teachers' varying competency levels.

Furthermore, focusing on English teachers' CPD perceptions sheds light on the experiences teachers encounter during their transition from novice to expert. Examining these perceptions creates an opportunity to investigate issues of disparity and how opportunities for success are manifested in teachers' lives during their journey from being novices to becoming experts.

1.3 Theoretical framework

The theoretical framework of this study is rooted in a constructivist perspective on learning (Wertsch & Sohmer, 1995), derived from Vygotsky's socio-cultural theory of human development described in his work 'Thoughts and Mind' (2012) and Vygotsky's and Cole's *Mind in Society* (1978). Vygotsky's theory offers a profound understanding of teaching and learning that recognises the complex interplay between social and cultural contexts in shaping the experiences of modern learners (Burke et al., 2005).

Within this framework, the exploration of self-reflection and motivation among faculty members becomes crucial in understanding how their personal beliefs are connected to their professional growth. This study seeks to investigate how academics perceive and engage with CPD, examining how it contributes to their personal and professional identity construction. Moreover, the aim of my PhD project is to identify the central characteristics that underpin the

practice of CPD for English teachers and develop a comprehensive definition and methodological framework to inform teaching and learning practices in university settings.

By adopting this theoretical framework, the study intends to capture the perspectives of English teachers regarding their CPD experiences during their transition from novices to experts in university contexts. Through an exploration of academics' experiences, this research aims to generate valuable knowledge about teaching and learning dynamics (Mårtensson et al., 2011). Recognising the significance of subjective comparisons, this study emphasises the importance of sharing and comparing individual narratives to enhance the validity and meaningfulness of the findings (März et al., 2016). By encouraging faculty members to share their experiences, this research not only provides insights into their identities (Riessman, 2008) but also sheds light on the institutional attitude towards CPD opportunities and PD. Ultimately, the data obtained from this study can contribute to the improvement of professional practices and inform educational policies within English departments.

1.4 Research questions

After considering the importance of the English language as the language of development in Pakistan, which ultimately heightens the significance of ELT and learning and recognising the scarcity of research in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL), CPD, and HE in the context of Pakistan, I formulated the rationale for this research. It is further informed by concerns related to the blurred policy of the HEC and HEIs regarding CPD for English teachers and their recruitment requirements. I will now outline the research questions.

1. How do the participants understand CPD and their need for PD?
2. How do specific environmental factors within and outside ELT in Pakistani universities contribute to the professional growth of the participants?

3. What are the most significant factors contributing or hindering the development of independent academic professional knowledge/growth?
4. What are the significant aspects characterising the early and later years of English teachers' profession?

Additionally, this study aims to align with the theoretical framework, Vygotsky's theory (1978). It examines how teaching and learning influenced by personal beliefs and the interplay of social and cultural factors are connected to English teachers' PD.

1.5 Personal reflection as a researcher

In qualitative research, the role of the researcher goes beyond merely involving participants; it entails active participation in social interactions that form the basis of data collection. Consequently, reflexivity becomes crucial in the research process. Reflexivity refers to a process of self-examination, where the researcher reflects on their engagement and communication with participants, the judgments they make, and subsequent analysis. Reflective research diaries are invaluable tools for fostering reflexivity in qualitative research. Additionally, transcribing interview recordings plays a crucial role as it allows researchers to distance themselves from the interview and their role within it.

As a qualitative narrative researcher, I acknowledge a significant difference in my knowledge and role as a researcher at the initial stage of the research process compared to its later stages. Initially, my knowledge was limited, and my role as a researcher was not fully realised. However, as the study progressed, I felt a growing sense of responsibility to present the data transparently and authentically, providing a clear rationale behind every decision made. I must acknowledge that my understanding of the data at the earlier stages was far more limited compared to later.

Connelly and Clandinin (1990) emphasise the importance of considering the communication relations between narrative researchers and participants, along with the ethical dilemmas that

arise from these relations. Therefore, it is essential for researchers to explicitly report on the nature of these communication relations and how they unfold during the collection and analysis of participants' stories, including how researchers reshape and represent these narratives. This call for visible researcher reflexivity (Mann & Webb, 2022) aligns with Barkhuisen and Consoli's (2021) invitation for narrative researchers to make stronger efforts in sharing and illustrating their methodological journeys, including their ethical commitment to research participants.

One of the challenges in this research project relates to my personal experience and knowledge in the discipline and knowing when to suspend or utilise it. While my subject knowledge proved useful in communicating with participants, it also posed a potential interference. From the outset, I was transparent about my background but emphasised my role as a student-researcher rather than a teacher with professional experience. As the research progressed, a closer and more confident relationship was established with the data, and participants expressed value in my role as a sympathetic 'outsider' with knowledge of their discipline.

Reflecting on the data and my own research has been valuable in addressing my role within this study. Although this research project undoubtedly influenced the participants, it is important to note that it is not a comparative study, and any impact I had on them was carefully contained and negotiated to ensure it did not compromise the internal validity of the data.

It is crucial for researchers to reflect on their performance as it allows for the extension of thinking and the acquisition of new insights from the research experience. Additionally, it is important to acknowledge that the researcher's voice and its idiosyncratic impacts on participants and their stories contribute to the richness of insights and meanings surrounding the phenomena under investigation (Kayi-Aydar, 2021).

In terms of benefits, this research process has contributed to my professional growth as both a teacher and a researcher. Valuable insights gained from the participants have led to an evolution

in my thinking about CPD. I now have a better understanding of how English teachers perceive CPD programmes and their roles within the classroom. I am more aware of the numerous obstacles university teachers must overcome to achieve success, and the responsibility they must assume to initiate their own development processes.

1.6 Organising this study

After this **introductory** chapter, the subsequent chapters of the thesis provide a structured approach to presenting the research. Chapter Two offers a comprehensive background of the contextual setting in which the investigation took place. In chapter three, a review of the literature and the conceptual framework that guided the research is presented. Chapter four outlines the detailed research design and methodology that influenced the study. Moving forward, chapter five focuses on the data organisation and analysis. In chapter six, the findings and discussions are presented. Finally, chapter seven serves as the concluding section of the thesis, summarising the key findings and offering recommendations and implications derived from the research for the CPD of English teachers within the given context. Furthermore, it highlights avenues for future research in the subject.

Chapter Two: Context of the study

Chapter overview

This chapter presents the background of the study that aims to explain the necessity for exploring English teachers' understanding of CPD in Pakistani universities. The first section presents a broad context based on some important aspects of the exploration, starting from educational institutions in Pakistan to teaching policy in TESOL. The second section focuses on the specific elements related to the phenomenon under study, including the teacher training efforts currently organised by the HEC and their impact on English teachers.

2. Section 1: The wider context of the study

This section starts with a discussion on educational institutions in Pakistan that will give an overview of the educational system, the significance of the English language, and the class system. Next, I present a brief overview of how TESOL is approached in the country, including teaching methods and content in teacher training courses, as well as the qualifications of English teachers. This discussion emphasises the importance of pedagogical credentials. Then I discuss the recruitment and promotion policy, which lacks inclusion of pedagogic courses, in order to provide insight into English teachers' motivation and understanding of CPD. Finally, I address the teaching policy and highlight the nature of the required CPD activities.

2.1 Educational institutions in Pakistan

This section outlines the types of educational institutions that reflect the different social and educational strata within Pakistan. Educational institutions in Pakistan at all levels can be divided into two types: private and public. Privately funded institutions are typically small, while government-funded public institutions tend to be larger. Additionally, both types of

institutions are subdivided into five divisions, which will be elaborated on in the following section.

The public sector in Pakistan has traditionally been the dominant force in education. However, in recent years, the private sector has also grown in significance, with many families opting to send their children to private institutions due to their perceived higher quality of education. One area of particular focus within the educational landscape in Pakistan is TESOL that involves the use of a range of teaching methods, training programmes, and formal ELT qualifications.

The quality of education in the private and public sector can vary widely and there is ongoing discussion about the relative benefits of each. Additionally, the division of institutions into private and public has implications for issues such as affordability and equal access to education. The purpose of discussing these institutions in detail is twofold: firstly, to obtain a clear scenario of education in Pakistan, and secondly, to inform the reader about English teachers' educational backgrounds and the challenges they and their students face. By examining the following institutions, I can provide a better understanding of the broader issues that impact the quality of education in general and ELT, in particular:

1. English-medium elite schools and institutions
2. Non-elite private schools
3. Vernacular-medium schools
4. Madrasah
5. ELT institutions; and
6. Other ELT institutions

2.1.1 English-medium elite schools and institutions

English and Urdu were designated as official languages of Pakistan at independence however, it was not until it's a complete corpus planning of Urdu was achieved that it became the main

official language of Pakistan. However, there is nevertheless a widespread desire for English language proficiency, particularly evident in urban areas, though gradually this desire for competency in English language as a currency for a successful life has penetrated everywhere. Therefore, the influence of English and EMI is accepted widely (Manan, 2021; Rahman, 2020) particularly in HEIs, which offer education in English.

As a result, elite English-medium schools and institutions have emerged, which typically charge high fees for an education that is considered superior to that of other schools. These schools, controlled by the military, offer education in English across all subjects (Awan, 2022; Shamim, 2011). State-run elite public institutions such as cadet schools, public schools, colleges and HEIs, also provide high quality education in English at lower fees and their outcomes are comparable to those of elite schools. Both types of institutions make a great contribution in terms of quality of education.

Research by Rehman (2020) reports that the students who are the products of EMI schools either join multinational firms and achieve global positions or work in fashionable NGOs and multinational banks. Moreover, individuals who participate in civilian competitive exams also outperform their peers who have been educated in vernacular languages.

However, Shamim (2011) and Awan (2022) suggest that the high fees charged by elite schools and institutions means that access to quality education in English is a benefit exclusive to those who are affluent and/or influential. This notion of affordability creates a division between those who have and those who do not.

2.1.2 Non-elite private schools

Besides the prestigious private institutions, there is an increase in other private schools across the country that promote themselves as English schools. However, a significant portion of these schools merely carry the label. Despite the curriculum being intended to be taught in English, it is common for educators in these schools to lack proper training and not hail from English-

medium educational backgrounds (Manan, 2021). In the case of English-medium schools catering to the lower and middle socioeconomic classes, teachers frequently use code-switching.

Due to a growing population and the financial constraints faced by different governments, which result in reduced spending on education, private schools are expanding throughout the country. These schools have proved beneficial in many ways as they provide better education due to their accountability to parents who keep in regular contact with teachers and school administrations. Such schools also reduce the gender gap in education as they are mainly co-educational (Manan et al., 2016).

2.1.3 Vernacular-medium schools

Education in all public schools in Pakistan is imparted in provincial languages, such as Sindhi, Punjabi, Pushto, Balochi and Seraiki, according to the location of the students, and Urdu is used as the national language. However, in 2006, the government made English language a compulsory subject from primary to secondary school. Prior to 2006, English was taught from middle school only (class six, around 10-11 years). However, there was very little use of English in the classroom in public schools and almost none outside. English has been approached as a collection of various topics to memorise (Nawab, 2012; Shamim, 2014). Many of these students who received their education in such environments, study in HEIs where they find it challenging to cope as classes are predominantly conducted in English despite the absence of English language prerequisites for university admission.

2.1.4 Madrasah schools or non-formal institutions

This section explains the importance of madrasahs and their way of teaching that impedes the influence of modern languages and directly or indirectly impacts people's perception regarding the English language. According to the recent census, there are more than 40,000 madrasahs in Pakistan and the number of students is approximately two million (Ahmad et al., 2022) out of

a population of 231 million. These schools impart the traditional Islamic perspective to students of all ages through instruction in Arabic and Urdu. Modern languages and global educational demands are completely ignored in these premises and ELT has always been resisted (Rahman, 2020), due to the fact these Madrasah have their own prescribed curriculum. However, in 2006, the government introduced EMI alongside the above-mentioned languages. Even so, in these madrasahs, English is symbolised as anti-Islamic and viewed as a language of non-Muslims. The religious scholars of these schools have consistently resisted the government's attempts to introduce EMI (Rahman, 2020). Nonetheless, these madrasahs' importance can be seen through their status as degree awarding institutions, and their degrees hold the same significance as those granted by other boards.

2.1.5 Other language learning institutions

This section presents details about various English language centres found in Pakistan, which often set standards and guidelines for English language education. They design and deliver training programmes, workshops, and courses aimed at enhancing the pedagogical skills of English teachers. By exploring the understanding of CPD among university English teachers, who tend to receive training from these institutions, this research project can shed light on how ELT practices are impacted.

Private coaching and tuition centres, which teach short courses of English language to students of all age groups, are included in this category. These centres ensure small class numbers, and their teachers are responsible for designing the syllabus, which is usually based on a combination of popular English language textbooks, such as Oxford and Cambridge series that are available to buy locally.

The British Council was the first of this kind of language centre: a foreign international organisation whose aim has been to raise educational opportunities and the standards of English language in Pakistan since its independence in 1947. The Pakistan American Cultural Centre

(PACC) is another organisation that promotes English in the country. Next, I aim to provide an outline of the status of English language in the country.

2.2 Status of the English language in Pakistan

This section will present an overview of the position of the English language in Pakistani society. My main aim is to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD and the essential role that English language plays and how that role reinforces the importance of English teachers. Pakistan is an immensely complicated multilingual country, wherein English serves as an official language and medium of instruction. Urdu is the national language, and many provincial languages serve as markers of identity, historical and cultural significance, as well as indigenous individuality. Given this scenario, the majority of Pakistan's population is either bilingual or linguistically diverse (Rahman, 2020).

The exploration of English language teachers' PD in Pakistani universities is crucially situated within the country's intricate socio-economic and historical fabric. Since the colonial era, English has wielded significant influence as the language of governance, education, and commerce, a legacy persisting post-independence, particularly within elite spheres (Umrani & Bughio, 2017). However, this linguistic dominance is starkly contrasted by its unequal distribution, with private and elite institutions primarily adopting English as Medium of Instructions (EMI), leaving public schools, which cater to the majority, lagging behind. Such disparities highlight the discordance between institutional policies and societal realities, thwarting efforts towards economic progress.

Thus, in Pakistan's quest for deeper integration into the global economy, English proficiency emerges as a prerequisite for lucrative employment opportunities, notably in sectors like IT, finance, and services (Rahman, 2020). Yet, the urban-rural dichotomy and linguistic variances amplify disparities in English proficiency across regions, with urban locales enjoying better access to English-medium education and exposure through media and technology (Rahman,

2020). These discrepancies lay bare systemic flaws within the education system and broader socio-economic structures, perpetuating socio-economic disparities.

Moreover, societal perceptions contribute to the perceived importance of English proficiency, affording fluent speakers advantages in education, employment, and social spheres (Abbas & Bidin, 2022). This emphasis further entrenches inequalities, hindering inclusivity for those deprived of quality English education. Additionally, the digital era's ubiquity has further amplified the dominance of English, potentially marginalising indigenous languages and cultural expressions, thereby eroding linguistic diversity (Abbas & Bidin, 2022).

In the context of Pakistan's societal advancement, English assumes a dual role: as a catalyst for economic development and as a vehicle for social exclusion. While English proficiency opens doors to global opportunities and economic prosperity, its unequal distribution exacerbates social disparities, undermining societal cohesion. Thus, addressing these challenges necessitates a holistic approach, encompassing improved access to quality education, promotion of linguistic diversity, and equitable opportunities for all segments of society. This examination of English language teachers' PD in Pakistani universities aims to illuminate these multifaceted dynamics and contribute to informed strategies for enhancing English language education and fostering inclusive development.

2.2.1 Language profile and language controversy in Pakistan

To understand the resistance that English language faces, it is imperative to understand the diversity of the language scenario of Pakistan. Of the almost 77 languages spoken in the country, 65 are indigenous and 12 are non-indigenous (Rahman, 2020).

Table 1 Main languages of Pakistan and approximate number of speakers

The main languages of Pakistan and approximate percentage of speakers	
Punjabi speakers	80 million
Pushto speakers	30 million
Sindhi speakers	30 million
Seraiki speakers	29 million
Urdu	15 million
Balochi speakers	7 million

(Ashraf, 2016)

Despite being spoken as the first language of only 15 million of the total population, Urdu has been given the rank of national language of Pakistan, which causes resentment for other local language speakers. The dominance of the official languages has led to a trend where people are gradually losing their first language as they learn and use English and Urdu more (Ashraf, 2016; Khan & Abdullah, 2019; Rahman, 2020). Indeed, despite the 77 languages used by people in Pakistan, only two have official status, Urdu and English (Abbas & Bidin, 2022). As a result, educational policy towards the other languages is severely depreciating as current educational policies prioritise English and Urdu, leaving out regional non-dominant languages in education (Manan, 2021). However, these regional languages are dynamic and ever-changing due to the multilingual and plurilingual nature of the country and are therefore constantly being restructured.

The language controversy has been prevailing in Pakistan since 1947 and the dominance of one language over another is an integral part of that controversy. It continues everywhere to pose problems and English language has been suffering resistance even though it is seen as neutral in comparison to Urdu and regional languages (Abbas & Bidin, 2022).

After giving a brief overview of the language profile of the country it is time to present a more lucid picture of the importance of English language. Since independence in 1947, English has been associated with urban centres and people of high-social class. As a result, it has been recognised as the language of prominence and supremacy (Rahman, 2020; Shamim, 2011). As previously mentioned, it is the language of private prestigious institutions and the cadet colleges. The fact that English has been associated with urban centres implies that those who do not have access to English may feel marginalised and lack opportunities. The association of English with power and dominance also suggests that those who are not proficient in English may have limited access to certain social circles. The fact that prestigious institutions and cadet colleges are under the indirect command of the armed forces, could have implications for the development of a diverse and inclusive educational system that recognises different languages and cultures.

In short, one can say that English language in Pakistani society is a powerful tool for shaping social structures and determining access to opportunities. This highlights the complex reciprocity between language, power and social identity in Pakistan. However, there is general agreement that English is vital for Pakistan's development and future. In a survey carried out by the Society of Pakistan English Language Teachers (SPELT) to determine the educational level at which English ought to be implemented in schools, more than 70% of participants suggested that it should be started from as early as possible, whereas the remaining 30% suggested that English should be introduced in schools at the age of eight years (SPELT 1986 as cited in Hussain & Farid, 2013).

Besides the position of EMI and emphasis on starting to teach it as early as possible, in recent years, due to neoliberalism English has been treated as an asset. Recent research by Haidar, Malik and Khattak (2022) into people's perception of English has reported that apart from using it only as an interaction tool, it holds the status of a product, and speakers are given social

respect. People invest in English which subsequently pays in the access to esteemed professions; hence, English is viewed as an asset.

2.2.2 Implementation policy of English

Despite English being an official language and its adoption as a tool to attain global relevance, there are various issues that have affected the implementation and application policy of English in Pakistan, including religious extremists and religious scholars' reluctance to accept its importance, as already stated in section 2.2.4. However, despite this, English language is still widely considered as an instrument for a bright future and progress (Haidar et al., 2022). Another impediment to the implementation of policy is inappropriate infrastructure, such as classrooms with deficient resources that pose major challenges for English teachers to effectively communicate a second language curriculum (Jadoon et al., 2020). In addition, teachers' insufficient awareness of the curriculum has also impeded TESOL.

2.2.3 Instrumental and integrative reasons for learning English language

Motivation is believed as an essential component in the success of any task. It is an integral element that has an effective role in any learning process, particularly in acquiring a new language (Abdullaev, 2021). The primary crucial variables contributing to the popularity and importance of English as a lingua franca in Pakistan are instrumental - for HE and career prospects (Khalid, 2016; Islam et al., 2020; Manan, 2021). Therefore, apart from EMI in HEIs, growth can also be seen in the establishment of private institutions, offering ESOL to attract large numbers of students.

Besides the academic development, the adoption of English language is seen by some as essential for Pakistani traditional society. Rahman (2020) believes that English language exposure can counteract the prevalent religious extremism in the country. As a global language, it can link a person to democratic and liberal-humanist values. Therefore, it is accepted that

English is an important tool kit for the accelerated development of Pakistan and needs to be seen from those perspectives (Haidar et al., 2022; Rahman, 2020).

After describing the instrumental and integrative reasons behind learning English language in Pakistan, the following section will not only describe English teachers' practice but will also present a realistic picture of the field: the few opportunities for teacher training, classroom conditions, limited pedagogies, and English teachers' teaching styles in various sectors.

2.3 TESOL in Pakistan

The importance of presenting an overview of ELT in Pakistan is directly related to the aim of my study to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD, and this section will underpin the idea of why this is worth exploring.

ELT in Pakistan cannot be comprehended without understanding the backdrop of where it occurs. Teachers play an essential role, yet many English teachers in HE in Pakistan with postgraduate degrees in English literature lack pedagogic qualifications and appropriate support in their ELT and lack experience and training in the use of innovative professional teaching methods, and often show an unmotivated attitude to reading current research in foreign language learning and pedagogy (Awan, 2022; Jadoon et al., 2020).

Furthermore, outdated teaching strategies are still prevalent in the mainstream English language classes with a frequent use of the mother tongue as an unwritten tool of teaching (Imran & Wyatt, 2015; Zaidi, 2023). These authors carried out research into perceptions of ELT practitioners and pointed out that the participants reported using the grammar translation method (GTM) due to lack of awareness of modern language techniques or methods, such as communicative language teaching and content and language integrated learning (CLIL). However, teachers who happened to be knowledgeable in these newer teaching methodologies could not implement them due to varied reasons, such as large classes, unsupportive behaviour of management or scarcity of sources (Alhassan et al., 2021; Kasi, 2010). These challenges in

ELT demonstrate the importance of exploring the understanding of English teachers regarding CPD to provide valuable insights into their professional needs and the challenges they face.

2.3.1 Teacher-centred classes

The lack of interactive classrooms shows that there is a need for English teachers to have a better understanding of TESOL and appropriate infrastructure. A comprehensive understanding of TESOL encompasses familiarity with communicative language teaching (CLT) approaches, which emphasise interactions between learners and teachers as the primary goal of language learning and teaching (Hien, 2021). Currently, interactions and discussions among peers are scarce in many government institutions (Awan, 2022). However, the implementation of interactive teaching methods, such as those promoted by CLT, requires English teachers to have adequate training and development, which is currently lacking in Pakistan (Jadoon et al., 2020).

Furthermore, first language acquisition (FLA) and second language acquisition (SLA) contexts have specific requirements; FLA pertains to the natural process of acquiring one's native language, typically through immersion in an environment where the language is spoken, SLA refers to the process of learning a new language as a second language (L2) or additional language, which often occurs outside of a native language environment, and involves the explicit learning of linguistic and communicative skills beyond one's first language (Islam, 2013). These distinct learning environments necessitate different approaches to language learning and teaching. Therefore, it is essential to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD to identify gaps and develop strategies to improve PD in universities.

2.3.2 Lack of innovative environment

The TESOL environment, does not have an innovative and practical curriculum. As mentioned above, in government institutions, English is often taught through the GTM (Rahman, 2020) , in which teachers explain grammar rules rather than focus on English as a practical skill, and

only two skills are considered as the focus of everyday teaching activity: reading and writing. Therefore, no attention is paid to listening and less attention is given to encouraging interaction. Additionally, vocabulary is imparted through the practice of translating word meanings into the native language (Jadoon et al., 2020; Shamim, 2011). As a result, rote-learning is the only way of education rather than practicing language in a context to build a creative repertoire of words. This situation emphasises the need for an exploration that can highlight the reasons behind the persistence of such practices and could provide some suggestions for how these issues might be addressed.

2.3.3 A class scenario – the way a teacher teaches

After discussing the lack of innovative curricula in English as a foreign language (EFL) class, here I will describe the classroom environment to illustrate how English is taught in the context of Pakistani HE. Shamim (2011) reports a class scenario where a teacher asks students to open a specific page and follows a series of events for teaching an hour-long English lesson. For the entire class time, students sit passively unless they are mentioned by name to read specific parts of the chapter or unit for the rest of the class to listen; and apparently, students are listening and copying everything written on the board mechanically. Similar research (Jadoon et al., 2020; Nawab, 2012; Shamim, 2011; Shamim, 2014) reports the same process of teaching from various classes in different areas of the country.

However, other research by Shamim (2008), supported by other recent research (Jadoon et al., 2020) illustrates how English language is taught in some classes in Pakistan. One teacher reports her teaching:

If I want to teach articles, I make a table to explain different kinds of articles. I also use a table to teach tenses. In this way they understand better. It's like math. For example, I teach present tense through brackets. I make them [students] draw these even in their

copies.... Then they do exercises - 10 to 12 sentences in class: then more sentences are given to do at home (in Shamim, 2008, p.240)

Despite this being quite a useful way to present articles, there are few opportunities for oral practice, interaction and feedback from students.

In relation to TESOL teaching and learning in Pakistan, the interaction of English and Urdu has been studied in TESOL classrooms. Raza et al., (2021) Shamim (2008) and Jadoon et al., (2020) conducted studies using an observation technique developed in Canada, to examine different types of schools, including private and public, urban and rural divisions, as well as primary and higher secondary levels in Pakistan. The findings showed that transfer of knowledge occurs in the same manner across various settings and no classes were student centred. Furthermore, informal English was not part of the class content. Teachers would devote class time to delivering lectures and writing on the board. In vernacular Urdu medium schools, teachers frequently engaged in code-switching, while in other schools, teachers employed English. These findings suggest a lack of emphasis on everyday English, a lack of awareness among teachers regarding interactive classes, and a reliance on traditional teaching methods.

As discussed above, in a traditional Pakistani school context, the teacher reads aloud the passages from textbooks, which are on formal topics such as essays on national heroes and human traits. Then, students follow their teacher. In many schools, students are directed to read passages one by one and interpret as they read. At the end of the reading, students do exercises given at the end of the lesson. The exercises are based on grammatical items, such as tenses and comprehension. Teachers record the answers to the questions on the board for students to answer in their notebooks and memorise for examinations. Even long passages and essays are memorised to reproduce in examinations. This kind of teaching leaves a narrow space for students' creativity.

2.3.4 Learners' anxiety in classes

After reviewing the ELT research and presenting a picture of EFL teaching, here I will discuss how students feel in EFL classes. Foreign language anxiety has been recognised as an important factor in influencing classroom learning among students (Bhatti & Memon, 2016; Rani et al., 2022; Samad et al., 2021). Learning EFL has always been challenging for students in Pakistan due to the aforementioned factors, such as inadequate teacher training, limited access to resources, and socio-economic barriers. As a result, the majority of students struggle with speaking English in the classroom and may perceive their inability to do so as a failure, resulting in stress, nervousness, and fear of negative evaluation (Usman et al., 2023).

Furthermore, the teacher-centric approach in Pakistani classrooms may also impede students' learning opportunities. Teachers may not feel comfortable to involve students in any discussion as they fear losing class control (Usman et al., 2023); as a result, students may not receive enough practice with interactive language use. This lack of practice can increase foreign language anxiety and further hinder students' language learning. Additionally, the emphasis on book-centred learning and rote memorisation can limit students' creativity and critical thinking skills, as they are not encouraged to engage with the language in a more practical way.

To address these challenges and improve students' learning outcomes, there is a need for more student-centric and interactive teaching approaches and classrooms. Language teachers should be provided with ongoing PD and resources to support their practice, such as authentic material, access to technology and opportunities for collaboration with peers. Furthermore, language support programmes and resources should be made more widely available to students to help them develop their language skills and reduce their anxiety. Ultimately, it is crucial to recognise the diverse linguistic and cultural background of students and teachers with fewer resources to create an inclusive, productive learning environment that values their individual selves.

2.3.5 Passive learning environment in HE

Teaching English is not very different in private and public secondary schools and in universities; classes are generally not learner-centred, and teachers spend most of the class time delivering presentations and elaborating various lesson related material rather than allowing group interactions among students (Shamim, 2018). It is the general perception of teachers that group discussions impede learning. Students also view the teacher as an authority; as a result, student prioritise listening over asking questions. This passive and isolated learning environment might pose challenges to students' academic progress in HE. When learning English in this type of environment, students rarely develop proficient speaking skills and tend to rely more on cramming. In addition, composition is also reliant on content memorisation rather than students composing creatively on their own (Manan, 2021; Shamim, 2008).

2.3.6 The language classroom and challenges

English language learning and teaching prepares individuals to participate in the global world of science, technology, HE, and international communication. Unfortunately, Pakistan is still far away from the achievements that have often been planned (National Education Policy, 2009; (Shah, et al., 2019). In spite of studying compulsory English in school and college, students may not be able to speak English easily and successfully. The absence of creativity in curricula and teaching, coupled with a lack of critical thinking among teachers and authenticity in content, significantly impact students' skills (Irfan & Pashby, 2020). Research by Akram et al. (2020) and Jadoon et al. (2020) aimed to explore the challenges and to present solutions to improve English learning and teaching in Pakistan. It reveals that students and teachers face various obstacles that hinder them in the acquisition of English. The problems include weak ELT awareness, scarcity of resources, large classes, and lengthy outdated courses. Appropriate teaching and learning resources and continuous support for teachers and students are suggested as important solutions for the above-mentioned problems. Additionally, Jadoon et al. (2020)

find little variation in terms of challenges and problems faced by English teachers and students across the country.

2.3.7 Qualifications and motivation of teachers

Research by Nawab (2012) and Akram (2017) reveals a line of demarcation between the qualifications and motivation of English teachers in the private and public educational system in Pakistan. In the public sector, the majority of teachers come from a public vernacular background, with their first language as the medium of learning, and lack basic degrees in the relevant field or pedagogic training. Furthermore, many public-school teachers are not motivated

motivated to teach English and only do so because of the administrative requirement to do so. Conversely, teachers in private English-medium schools are self-motivated and eager to teach English.

To address the lack of motivation among English teachers in public schools, Nawab (2012) and Akram (2017) recommend a system for in-service training and improving exam systems and policies for recruiting teachers. Furthermore, the study suggests that English teachers should acquire innovative teaching skills to create effective and applicable methods for teaching English within their classrooms. Without the proper qualifications, attempting to teach can prove to be a challenging effort, highlighting the importance of CPD.

According to Awan (2022), the recruitment of English teachers in Pakistan is challenging as it does not require academic or professional credentials in the field of ELT. This process of recruitment has significant implications as it results in a lack of pedagogical training and failure to apply language theories, models and practices, which ultimately undermines their potential to teach English. It is concerning that individuals with only a qualification in English literature can become English teachers or teacher-trainers. Additionally, there is no evidence to suggest

that individuals with higher language proficiency are necessarily capable language teachers (Faez et al., 2021).

Teacher's effective communicative skills are essential to transfer knowledge, provide clear instructions, create a conducive learning environment, and enhance the quality of their profession. Sahito and Vaisanen (2018) identify the importance of language proficiency for teachers at the HE level, as it is one of the primary factors that can increase job satisfaction and ultimately provides benefits for students as end-users. However, it is worth noting that the background of English teachers as learners in public schools may have an impact on their teaching in HE.

It is clear that the qualifications and motivations of English teachers in Pakistan's public and private educational systems are quite different and the recruitment process for English teachers fails to prioritise relevant qualifications and pedagogical training. Additionally, it is also clear that strong communication skills, including language proficiency, are crucial for teachers to excel in their profession and provide high-quality instruction. By recognising and identifying the importance of these all elements, we can work towards improving the quality of ELT and learning in the HE setting while exploring English teachers' understanding of CPD.

2.3.8 Issues in TESOL teaching in Pakistan

Acquiring a second language revolves around the acquisition of skills. In the context of ELT in Pakistan, Akram (2017) finds social, academic and administrative issues on the top of the list which make providing a conducive learning and teaching environment a difficult task. School and university administration sets guidelines, provides training and is responsible for upgrading teaching staff. In this reference to policy setting and crafting courses for diverse students' needs, the author suggests that most language programmes have unclear objectives and English teachers are not trained in pedagogy, as previously stated. Therefore, English teachers find it difficult to improve their teaching skills. For instance, due to the absence of

precise criteria within the curricular objectives for introductory, intermediate, and advanced courses, both teachers and students are unable to work collaboratively towards attaining the intended educational goals (Abbas, et al., 2021; Akram, 2017).

Another issue in language teaching in Pakistan is inadequate teaching strategies. Research delineates that listening opportunities facilitate successful acquisition of a second language (Amanov, 2023; Nagendra, 2014). However, a noticeable divide exists between research evidence and what actually happens in language classrooms, and this distinction is prevalent in most cases in Pakistan (Imran & Wyatt, 2015). Current research suggests a division of ELT curricula into two categories, practice and theory, to integrate the four components of the language. Additionally, Yasmine (2021) emphasises the establishment of language labs to improve the attractiveness of educational institutions by ensuring English teachers and learners' active participation in the teaching and learning process. Nevertheless, language laboratories are still rare in many public institutions in Pakistan. Moreover, valuable language learning resources such as language audios and videos which are proven to be effective for language learning, remain scarce (Yasmin, 2021).

In today's world, English is consistently used as a source of communication at national or international level among all speakers of various languages and the adoption of appropriate teaching methods are promoted. Jadoon et al. (2020) and Soomro et al. (2016) investigated contemporary pedagogical techniques used for ELT and learning and to introduce ESOL/EFL best practices. The findings revealed that teachers were still utilising traditional outdated teaching practices. Teachers also faced problems in the application of new techniques due to large classes though they had a willingness to employ modern teaching methods. The majority of current teaching strategies do not create an effective learning environment and even fail to engage learners as activities are monotonous. Therefore, the research not only reveals issues in

TESOL teaching in the Pakistani context but also suggests stakeholders consider modern approaches suitable for large and multilevel classes and provide ongoing support for teachers.

2.3.9 The details of English language provision

The degree provision in several universities in Pakistan encompasses a range of programmes focused on English language, linguistics, and literature, providing to the diverse needs of students interested in language-related fields. In addition to core courses presented in Table 2, specialised tracks such as Business English and subjects taught through EMI are available, catering to students interested in fields that require English proficiency in professional and academic settings. The degree provision also includes standardised test preparation courses, equipping students with the necessary skills and strategies to excel in internationally recognised language proficiency exams such as IELTS,¹ PTE,² and TOEFL.³

Table 2 English language degree provisions in various universities (University of Sindh, 2023).

Degree Programme	Skills Based Courses	Certificates
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BS⁴ English Language & Literature/TESOL 4-year • MS English Linguistics (2 Years) • MA Linguistics/ Language (2 years) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Functional English • Communication Skills/Writing Skills/Presentation Skills • Technical/Scientific Writing • Business English 	Language
		EMI
		Business English
		Standardised Test Prep
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • IELTS • PTE • TOEFL

¹ International English Language Testing System

² Pearson Test of English

³ Test of English as a Foreign Language

⁴ Bachelor of Science

2.3.10 Teaching content of universities

In terms of content, before 2005, *Wren and Martin's High School Grammar and Composition*, published prior to the independence of Pakistan in New Delhi, was taught in many universities. As the majority of Pakistani English teachers have been taught using the same book during their time at university as students, I include here some information about this book as it will help the reader to comprehend the standards of language teaching in the country, particularly at the research sites (universities approached for this research study).

In 1935, Wren and Martin wrote an English grammar book series for the children of British officials working in India prior to the independence of Pakistan. The same book was later implemented in Indian schools in 1940. As mentioned, a series of these books are still in use at most Pakistani institutions. According to Kapur (2021), Wren and Martin's material is mainly based on *The Manual of English Grammar and Composition*. The grammatical concepts are well explained. However, these books are no longer useful due to their outdated content and since the new consideration about practical/functional English has been raised (Mishra, Prashant, 2010; Mishra, Punya & Koehler, 2006). Nevertheless, in 2008, the latest version of this book was published. A number of excerpts are extracted from English literature from 14th to 20th century writers. This shows an outdated trend of ELT and learning with no practical applicability.

Another trend of ELT at Pakistani institutions is teaching various modules of degrees through old poems, plays and novels. The compulsory English course was revised in 2004 and the teaching plans were made more language-focused than literature-focused (Channa, et al., 2019; Channa, 2017). The compulsory nature of courses in universities was changed and as mentioned, various skills courses such as Business English and functional English were added. As English teachers did not possess pedagogic training, many initially refused to follow the language teaching policy. Instead, they focused on teaching literature (Channa, 2017). Briefly, in TESOL in Pakistan, there are issues regarding teacher training, an outdated curriculum,

inappropriate teaching methods, the passive environment of EFL classes, and learners' anxiety, despite the research literature being full of recommendations to improve and update policy, curriculum, teaching methods and training for English teachers (Akram & Yang, 2021; Awan, 2022; Channa, 2017; Rahman, 2020). After describing the scenario of TESOL in Pakistan, I will present the recruitment and promotion policy related to the profession and discuss how it paves a way for the present research study.

2.4 Promotional and recruitment policy in Pakistan

This section discusses the recruitment policy in HE in Pakistan, which outlines specific degree requirements, a required number of research papers, and years of experiences for various academic appointments or promotion (HEC Recruitment Rules, 2009 cited in Shah et al., 2019). This promotional and recruitment policy serves as the foundation for my argument to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD. However, as can be seen, there is no requirement for completing a pedagogic course or qualification. Through this exploration, I aim to highlight the motivating factors of English teachers beyond the requirements emphasised in the policy. The National Quality Assurance Committee of Higher Education, under the category of Policy Clarification Letters/Guidelines/Recommendations (Khushik & Diemer, 2018; Shah, et al., 2019), provides a list of minimum criteria for Humanities and Social Sciences departments' promotion and recruitment. This list is presented in the following table.

Table 3 Promotional and recruitment policy in Pakistan.

Requirements	Post
Lecturer	
Minimum Qualification	First Class MS/MPhil degree awarded after 18 years of education in the relevant field from HEC recognised institution with no 3 rd division in the academic career. Condition of no 3 rd division shall not be applicable in lecturer recruitment if the candidate holds a higher degree such as a PhD.
Experience	N/A
Number of Publications	N/A
Assistant Professor	
Minimum Qualification	PhD from HEC recognised university in relevant field
Experience	No experience required
Number of Publications	N/A
Associate Professor	
Minimum Qualification	PhD from HEC recognised university in relevant field.
Experience	10-years teaching/research experience in an HEC recognised university OR 5-years post-PhD teaching/research experience in an HEC recognised university.
Number of Publications	The applicant must have 10 research published works with four publications in the last five years.
Professor	
Minimum Qualification	PhD from HEC recognised university in relevant field.
Experience	15-years teaching/research experience in an HEC recognised university

	OR 10-years post-PhD teaching/research experience in an HEC recognised university.
Number of Publications	The applicant must have 15 research published works with five publications in the last five years.

The importance of improving teacher training has been emphasised by most educational policies and government plans, particularly in the context of ELT. Professional and qualified teachers are seen as vital agents for the progress and development of the country. The Pakistan government initiatives have focused on aligning the quality of language teaching with effective teacher education, as outlined in the Education Sector Reforms (ESR) (Haidar et al., 2022). However, surprisingly, against this backdrop, universities still recruit teachers without any pedagogical qualification or degree as indicated in 2.4, Table 3 ‘Promotional and Recruitment Policy in Pakistan’. They recruit graduates with an MPhil degree without requiring any specific pedagogic qualification. This goes against the norms and policies of Pakistan’s national teacher training regulations. This emphasises the need to see the motivating factors behind English teachers' choice to study for higher degrees. Additionally, by exploring English teachers’ perception of CPD, we can determine their existing qualifications, desired qualifications, and the underlying reasons for pursuing them. After presenting the teacher recruitment policy in universities, the following section presents a brief outline of ELT teaching policy and the non-mandatory nature of CPD in HEIs in Pakistan.

2.4.1 Teaching policy in Pakistan

In this section, I will discuss the teaching policy in Pakistani universities and the ease of obtaining a teaching position at a university with only a basic degree in an English-related field and an MPhil degree. Research conducted by Muhammad et al. (2023) reveals that there is no

uniform policy regarding teaching at a national or provincial level in these universities. In addition, there is no systematic mechanism for training university teaching staff, as noted by Aslam (2011), who attributes this to the lack of proper and organised human resource departments within these HEIs. Consequently, there is no systematic, effective body for the PD of staff. However, it is worth noting that the HEC developed the Learning Innovation Division (LID) in 2003, which provides in-service faculty CPD. While it has arranged short and long-term courses for HEI teaching staff since 2003, none of these courses are required to obtain a university teaching position (Muhammad et al., 2023).

The LID has several main objectives, including aligning university teachers' competencies within their subject areas, enabling teachers to acquire skills, knowledge and instructional methods for effective teaching, and equipping HEIs and teaching faculty with the latest equipment, tools, discipline-specific skills and pedagogy of teaching (HEC, 2017; Shah et al., 2019). Despite identifying these needs and emphasising the essentials of faculty development in its annual reports, the participation of university teaching staff in CPD is still not mandatory. The following section will present the context of the study alongside some related information about the phenomenon under exploration that begins with a brief overview of how teachers are trained in Pakistan.

2.5 Section 2: Focused context of the study

In the first section of this chapter, I discussed the division of educational institutions, the status of ELT, recruitment and promotion policies, and the teaching policy of TESOL in Pakistan. I will now provide an overview of teacher training in Pakistan and the nature of CPD projects that aim to address the challenges faced by English teachers. I will also examine the effectiveness of these CPD policies and their impact on English teachers, highlighting the significance of English language proficiency and the role of English teachers in the current scenario. Additionally, I will present a detailed account of the HEC's current in-house CPD

opportunities under the English Language Teachers Reforms (ELTR) project, which sheds light on the current state of CPD in TESOL. Finally, I will analyse the current approach to CPD and identify gaps, which will support my decision to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD.

2.5.1 Teacher training in Pakistan

Improving students' standards through teacher training is essential for imparting quality education in Pakistan. The country has more than 200 institutions for teacher training, as well as approximately 300 resource centres for teachers (Iftikhar, Sidra et al., 2022). Private teacher training institutions also exist and providing teaching certificates upon completion of training. Annually, over 40,000 teachers receive education through these public and private institutions (Siddiqui et al., 2021). However, recent reviews of the National Educational Policy indicate that these teacher training programmes do not receive adequate assessment of their quality (Siddiqui et al., 2021). As a result, teachers who have completed these programmes often lack understanding of instructional methodology and content.

Several reasons are behind the criticism these training programmes have faced. Firstly, according to Iftikhar et al. (2022) trainees often lack hands-on experience and struggle to apply what they have learned. Secondly, at the end of each course, trainees have to pass an exam which makes them focus more on memorising information rather than gaining a deeper understanding of the content. As a result, they may struggle to apply what they have learned in their teaching practice. Thirdly, there is no requirement for an ELT degree or any specific qualification for becoming a teacher trainer; generally, teacher educators possess a master's degree in literature instead of ELT. This lack of specialised training can result in trainers lacking the necessary knowledge and skills to effectively train teachers in TESOL.

In Pakistan, both the provincial government and the HEC are responsible for organising CPD or teacher training opportunities for teachers. The HEC has played a key role in improving ELT

and learning in the country by initiating ELTR programmes, which aim to provide specialised training for English teachers across Pakistan (National Curriculum Document, 2002; National Education Policy, 2009; (Khushik & Diemer, 2018; Shah et al., 2019). In the following sections, I will provide a more detailed overview of the training opportunities available for English teachers in Pakistan.

2.5.2 CPD policy and the nature of projects in Pakistan: a brief overview

The HEC was established in September 2002 as a statutory body with the mandate to spearhead educational reform initiatives and transform Pakistan from an agricultural country to a knowledge-based economy (Iftikhar et al., 2022). Among its major functions, the HEC oversees, funds, regulates, and accredits the HEIs throughout the country. Prior to the establishment of the HEC, the University Grants Commission (UGC) was responsible for organising PD projects for the country's educators. These projects included a range of activities, including CPD programmes. In the following section, I will describe these projects in more detail and provide a specific example of a CPD programme that was organised under the UGC.

2.5.2.1 External apprenticeship model or foreign projects

In Pakistan, PD in HE, and particularly in TESOL was traditionally reliant on imported practices, theories and projects, rather than a customised approach designed to meet the local specific domestic and cultural context (Iftikhar et al., 2022; Muhammad et al., 2023). This approach has led to frequent use of apprenticeship models and foreign projects for CPD for English teachers, as evident in numerous scenarios (Fazal et al., 2019; Sahito & Vaisanen, 2018). However, with the establishment of the current form of HEC, there has been a slight shift towards a more locally driven approach to CPD activities. This shift has resulted in a greater emphasis on research and collaboration within the country, to identify and address the specific needs of the HE system and English teachers.

A Canadian teaching and learning enhancement workshop (TLEW) conducted in 2016-2017, was evaluated in a Pakistani university, providing evidence of the apprenticeship nature of CPD projects (Rodrigues et al., 2019). The TLEW aimed to enhance teaching practices and foster a reflective approach among HE faculty members. Rodrigues et al. (2019) discussed its initiation, implementation and institutionalisation, and found that while it provided some essential elements for development, it also highlighted the need for such workshops to become a fundamental component for all teaching staff at Pakistani universities. The empirical evidence collected from the workshop indicated that receiving peer feedback and having a community of practice (CoP) (Wenger, 1990 as cited in Putri & Damayanti, 2023) were vital for planning teaching and supporting students' needs. Additionally, the findings emphasised the need for new strategies and the establishment of a CoP to help teachers recognise the importance of collaboration, peer-feedback, and reflection in teaching practice. While the TLEW project was beneficial in its target and outcomes, the temporary nature and reliance on non-native theories limited the full support of English teachers. English teachers require ongoing support and collaboration, which is unlikely to occur due to the imported nature of these workshops. Briefly, the traditional reliance on imported theories and projects in staff growth training in Pakistan, particularly in TESOL, has resulted in a frequent use of apprenticeship models and non-native projects for English teachers' CPD. However, there has been a shift towards a more locally driven approach to staff growth training with the establishment of the current form of the HEC, emphasising research and collaboration within the country. Moving forward, it is essential for CPD programmes to be customised according to the national curriculum to meet the specific local and cultural needs of the country, with a focus on peer-feedback, collaboration, and reflection in teaching practice.

2.5.2.2 CPD projects: impact and durability

Professional development for English teachers is an indispensable continuous and career long process. However, sustaining teacher CPD programmes in developing countries like Pakistan is often challenging due to various factors such as lack of support, funding or limited access to resources (Shamim, 2011). As a result, the impact of such projects may be short-lived and not have a lasting effect on the overall development of English teachers' skills.

Best practice in teaching and learning English may differ for different parts of the world depending on the local context, and the success and longevity of English language CPD projects are closely linked to the PD of university teachers. For instance, back in the late twentieth century, a five-year long British CPD project aimed at enhancing English language skills through setting up a language lab centre was initiated in Pakistan (Shamim, 2011). The project funding included staff and counterpart development through training courses in the UK, provision of resources such as books and equipment, and development of learning materials, and a self-access centres (SACs) in a separate building. Initial success was reported in some studies (Iftikhar et al., 2022; Shamim, 2008). However, a few years after the end of the project the centre was in a state of neglect and deprivation.

The situation highlights two issues. First, developmental programmes were not incorporated into the organisational governance mechanisms of the university, and hence, the programme lacked support from relevant authorities soon after the donor agency left. Second, a lack of ownership for these projects is evident from the higher administration of the institution.

A significant conclusion which can be drawn from this analysis is that sustainable strategies need to be adopted in the development of such projects for their impactful continuation. In addition, progression plans focusing on proficiency building, learning materials and resources are essential, but sustainable strategies such as continuous improvement in organisational budgets should also be integrated to ensure the sustainability of language programmes.

2.5.2.3 Institutional support and CPD

Research by Sahito and Vaisanen (2018), Al-Asmari, (2016) and Shamim (2011) focuses on the relationship between the external CPD projects and institutional ownership that can facilitate the teachers' interest and their development. The role of English teachers in this process of development is also viewed as critical. However, these studies have found that such projects often lack institutional support and experts' guidance, leading to a lack of a CoP, thus hindering long-term success. The use of local models and tailored modelling (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017), which is a significant component of effective career growth, is also missing from non-native projects, as they do not utilise local curriculum models. In Pakistan, several localised ELT models have been developed to address the unique linguistic and educational needs of students, ensuring contextual relevance and cultural appropriateness. The National Curriculum for English Language (NCEL) is designed to cater specifically to Pakistani students, emphasising the integration of local cultural references and linguistic nuances. Its primary goal is to develop proficiency in English while maintaining respect for Pakistan's national languages and cultural heritage. Key features of NCEL include a focus on communicative competence, critical thinking, and real-world applications of English.

Similarly, the Beaconhouse School System, one of Pakistan's largest private school networks, has developed its own English language curriculum. This curriculum is not available in public educational settings. However, this localised model could be incorporated into public institutions to reduce inequalities and reinforce inclusivity, as it aligns with international standards while being tailored to the local context. The goal is to achieve high levels of English proficiency among students through a balanced approach that includes both local content and international best practices. Notable features of the Beaconhouse curriculum include the integration of global and local literature, project-based learning, and a strong emphasis on both oral and written communication skills.

The Aga Khan University's Institute for Educational Development (AKU-IED) has also made significant contributions to localised ELT models in Pakistan. AKU-IED focuses on improving the quality of ELT through evidence-based practices and localised professional development programmes. Its goals include enhancing teacher training and curriculum development, utilising local contexts and examples in teaching materials. These efforts are aimed at addressing the specific needs of Pakistani learners and teachers, ensuring that English language education is both effective and relevant to the local environment.

In addition, institutions need to involve themselves with teachers' long-term continuous support for development and use of practice feedback and assessment to organise customised programmes. However, this is often impractical due to the absence of institutional support and the presence of external development programmes that work only for a specific time (Al Asmari, 2016; Sahito & Vaisanen, 2018; Shamim, 2011).

To address these challenges, institutions should provide support through the development of learning communities (Putri & Damayanti, 2023) and reflective discussions (Gallagher, 2014) to create a positive learning environment that motivates teachers to proceed with their developmental activities and display curiosity towards new knowledge. English teachers also need help with formulating their future progress and planning that are consistent with their practice, and institutions should involve themselves with teachers' quests for CPD opportunities (Putri & Damayanti, 2023) by promoting CPD facilities. Studies by Sahito and Vaisanen (2018), Fazal et al. (2019) and Shamim (2008) recommend university administrations provide better campus based CPD facilities. Research by Guan (2018) examined a CPD course for English teachers that advocated a more interactive teaching and learning style in which English teachers could develop practical skills because of collaboration and teamwork which demand more of a house-based style of learning rather than following external guidelines.

Having presented a scenario of how the foreign projects were analysed in research, I will present the current HEC CPD projects that will add more clarity to my own reasons for exploring English teachers' understanding of CPD. In the following section, I will provide more information about academic degrees and CPD opportunities available for English teachers and the challenges and pitfalls of these.

2.5.2.4 HEC efforts for TESOL

I have already discussed the statutory mandate of the HEC as the responsible body for a range of tasks related to HE in Pakistan. Besides its legal responsibilities, it is responsible for forming HE policies and ensuring quality assurance to meet the international educational standards for teacher training such as those found in the UK and USA. One of the core responsibilities is developing new HEIs and improving existing ones across the country. The HEC also provides high quality developmental opportunities to teachers in tertiary level education. Teachers from all over the country can receive training in designated HEC training centres either in the regional offices or main office in the capital city or in their own institutions (HEC, 2020; Zia et al., 2023). The HEC emphasises the importance of CPD opportunities for teaching staff to upgrade their teaching, learning and research skills. According to the 2020-2021 HEC report, qualified and trained faculty members play a vital role in creating a learner-centred culture that supports students' learning through practice specific teaching methods (Zia et al., 2023). By promoting the development of a trained faculty, the HEC can help establish a supportive learning environment that benefits both teachers and students.

I have already described the LID in teaching policy in section 2.5.2.4, so here, I will present it as a division of training. The HEC established the LID in order to provide in-service CPD for HE teaching faculty and administrators across the country, and research. Zuber-Skerritt (2013) noted a dire need for training, as pre-service training or any certification is not required at the time of induction for university teaching, and in-service training opportunities are not offered.

Initially, it was highly challenging for the LID to provide training to more than 17,000 university educators in one step. So, it initiated facilitation in two phases: the HEIs Faculty Programme on university premises and the HEIs Management Programme that involves inviting teachers for training at the LID, Islamabad. Participation was optional (Zia et al., 2023). This is the general overview of the HEC's efforts for raising the quality of teaching among university stakeholders, that is, by training English teachers and administration. The HEIs faculty programme was further divided into various categories, but for the purpose of this discussion on English teachers' understanding of CPD I will focus on the ELTR.

The first phase of the ELTR project started in 2004 and was completed in five years and offered short-duration and extended-duration programmes to English teachers across the country, working in the form of a national committee for reforming ELT, formulating policies, and executing them. The project aimed to transform and set criteria for ELT degrees in universities and affiliated institutions and to create ample transformation in ELT, learning and research in HEIs all over the country (HEC, 2020; Zia et al., 2023).

The project was divided into short-duration and extended-duration programmes, and under the umbrella of ELTR, various activities and training were introduced. Additionally, the project provided funding for launching the aforementioned SACs in public universities through the Computer Assisted Language Learning (CALL) subcommittee. Furthermore, in the same phase, various long-term fellowships were given to public university staff, and the ELTR project reviewed facilities provided to English teachers.

Table 4 CPD activities and training

ELTR	Scholarships for master's & PhDs
	CPD courses 1-4 weeks
	Funding for research journals
	IRPT (international resource person training)
	Funding for research projects
	SAC (self-access centre; internet facilities)
	Conferences & seminars

The government project aimed to develop the socioeconomic markers of the country and contribute to enhancing HE and scholarly learning, as outlined later in the National Educational Policy of 2009. By improving ELT and learning, students in HEIs would be equipped with employable skills for the job market. Given the disparity in the quality of learning environments between public and private sector HEIs, the HEC sought to eliminate this gap by raising the quality of teachers in public universities. This would produce students with good communicative skills, enabling them to compete on the world level and contribute to the country's economic growth. This is based on the assumption that students with strong English language skills are likely to have more study and employment opportunities, which could ultimately contribute to transforming Pakistan's socio-economic indicators.

The ELTR project has been lauded for its in-service PD of English teachers by Coleman (2010). However, research has brought to light the mismatch in ELTR training courses as English teachers not able to practically utilise training mainly owing to the lack of resources at their workplaces (Siddiqui et al., 2021; Yasmin et al., 2019). These studies emphasised the need for a practical mechanism for the follow-up of the English teachers, provision of facilities for implementation of the training, and a merit or need-based selection of English teachers.

Rehman et al. (2023) argue that the second phase of the project may be a hopeful opportunity to revive the declining level of language teaching and proficiency of English teachers in HE.

To gain insight into English teachers' understanding of their CPD, it is important to investigate their perception of the gaps identified in the ELTR training project and their suggestions for improving the effectiveness of the training. Additionally, it would be valuable to explore the extent to which English teachers are aware of and engage in other CPD opportunities outside of this specific project.

The CPD courses that were planned in the first phase of the project are listed in the HEC's Annual Report of 2010-2011, however, the Testing and Assessment subcommittee did not execute any training or course in the years of 2004-05 and 2007-08. Likewise, the Curriculum and Material Development subcommittee did not organise any training for two years during the five years of Phase 1.

According to Malik (2014), the CPD fellowship programme – which refers to a financial award or funding opportunity given to support an individual's academic progression or PD – had a target of approximately 300 teachers, but only 208 teachers took advantage of the opportunity. In contrast, the CPD courses had a fixed target of 1100, but only 990 English teachers received training. Choudhry (2011) proposes that the inclination to pursue CPD courses was stronger compared to the CPD fellowship programme, primarily because the courses lasted only for a week. This is especially important for experienced professionals who already have several degrees. Choudhry (2011), notes that English teachers face significant workload pressure, which can make it challenging for them to participate in training. Therefore, the length of the training programme needs to be considered to ensure that it is feasible for English teachers to attend.

The second phase of the ELTR project started with the aim to train more than 1400 teachers. The HEC website and research by Malik (2014) presents a glimpse of the project's planned activities in the following list:

- Master's in applied linguistics, TEFL, ELT, TESL (teaching English as a second language)
- Postgraduate diploma in TEFL, ELT, TESL
- Funding for national/international conferences/seminars on ELT
- Providing international resource persons for training

As the HEC aimed to enhance the quality of both teaching and learning in the TESOL domain of HE, the second phase was part of these efforts, which aimed to provide funding for various CPD activities. The activities implemented during this phase have had a significant impact on the PD of English teachers, as noted by some studies (e.g., Khattak et al., 2011; Iftikhar et al., 2022).

2.5.2.6 Indigenous scholarship/degree programme

As part of the ELTR programme, 150 scholarships were awarded to English teachers for various degrees, such as MSc, MA in applied linguistics and diplomas in teaching. However, only 129 teachers received the diploma due to insufficient nominations, lack of awareness, and a disinterested attitude among English teachers. While the diploma was mainly pursued to receive a degree, it also helped English teachers to develop professionally. However, some critics of such pedagogic degree programmes argue that participants tend to focus on obtaining high grades rather than developing the knowledge and skills for teaching that are provided in the diploma (Awan, 2022; Chaudary, 2011; Iftikhar et al., 2022).

2.5.2.7 Continuous professional development (CPD) courses

During this phase, 12-15 types of CPD training courses were offered, providing a total of 240 opportunities for teachers, with participation from approximately 208 teachers. The training

programmes expanded to include more comprehensive pedagogical techniques, interactive methods, and the use of technology in teaching. This part of the CPD programme was divided into short courses of one week and one month duration. These courses, sponsored by the ELTR Project and hosted by universities and colleges, focused on contemporary English teaching trends and practices. The core aim was the professional development of in-service teaching faculty at public sector HEIs. The CPD courses are offered in the following areas:

- Computer Assisted Language Learning (CALL)
- Testing & Evaluation
- Research Methodology and Skills
- Andragogical/Pedagogical Skills (Teaching Practicum, Communication Skills)
- Open and Customised Programmes in language related areas (EAP, ESP, ESL, ELT)

2.5.2.8 International resource person training (IRP)

Under this ELTR project provision, experts from foreign countries were invited as resource persons, aiming to enable teachers to gain insights from their innovative teaching methods and expertise. The training sessions were organised successfully with trainers from Australia, the USA, UK, UAE and Canada (HEC, 2016) and English teachers were required to spend 100 hours at the site of training to be able to conduct CPD workshops at their own institutions. Another condition to fulfil for attending this workshop was submission of a ‘No Objection Certificate’(NOC) duly signed by the college principal, head of the department or nominated authority (HEC policy as cited in Zia et al., 2023). However, English teachers face challenges in engaging in CPD activities due to their workload and the difficulty of obtaining NOCs; as a result, efforts to develop local resource persons have only been partially successful (Chaudary, 2011)

2.5.2.9 Conferences and seminars

Funding was provided for both national and international events as part of this CPD activity. According to a report by the HEC in 2015 (Zaidi et al., 2020), the fixed target for conferences was achieved, and their impact was appreciated by attendees and presenters. Furthermore, research has demonstrated that these events, including conferences and seminars, not only assist English teachers in aligning themselves with national and international standards (Dilshad et al., 2019; Iftikhar et al., 2022) but also aid them in fulfilling the criteria and expectations of their respective field.

2.5.2.10 Research journals and funding

The aim of this CPD funding was to encourage research and promote the publication of research journals in the field of ELT. The goal was to disseminate information through research publishing to teachers and other researchers. However, the fixed target of starting five new journals was not achieved; only three journals were established. Therefore, the achievement rate was not as high as expected. According to Chaudhary's research (2011), since Pakistan's research culture is not yet widespread, it is necessary to promote scholarly research in the field of ELT.

2.5.2.11 Funding for research projects

The ELTR project's funding for research created a provision for funding for ELT scholars in Pakistan. However, it achieved less success than anticipated. The reason for this was the strict criteria that researchers had to follow to be awarded a grant. As outlined by the HEC (2016), applicants must hold a full-time faculty position at a public university and a PhD degree, as the funding was directed towards public university employees with the necessary qualifications. The ELTR project should revisit their funding requirements to expand eligibility criteria, allowing for more researchers outside of public universities to apply. This can lead to more diverse and innovative research in ELT and learning.

2.5.2.12 Self-access centres (SACs)

This part of the ELTR project was aimed at providing technological support and internet facilities to government HEIs, with the goal of creating SACs in English departments. The target was achieved successfully, with SACs gradually being established in public universities, providing English teachers with the tools and resources necessary to conduct and publish their research. According to the HEC (2016) this new facility helped English teachers stay informed about the most recent research and field developments, which in turn allowed them to produce more relevant and reflective research.

During the implementation of the second phase of the ELTR project, four universities were equipped with digital SACs that provided teachers and students with computer and internet facilities. However, SACs could also be set up in a simpler way, such as in a classroom with dictionaries and books with exercises. Therefore, it was recommended that project management consider providing these low-cost SACs in all institutions to assist language teaching and learning (Saeed et al., 2021).

After providing a brief introduction to the HEC's current project, which aims to improve ELT and learning in Pakistan, I will now outline the challenges it faced when implementing the project.

2.6 Challenges for the HEC in implementing the CPD programme

English teachers' training was challenging as the target to train a large body of English teachers was laborious and was only partially successful due to the following reasons.

2.6.1 Remote areas and resource persons

Inviting a large number of English teachers to regional offices or the capital city was not feasible, neither for HEC nor for English teachers because the majority of teachers were from remote areas of the country, and they could not attend central offices for a long period of time.

2.6.2 English teachers' lack of motivation

According to Shamim (2011) and Nawab (2012), it appears that many English teachers in Pakistan may not consider in-service education and training (INSET) important or a critical element of CPD once they are employed. This has been a significant challenge for the HEC. The unmotivated and/or indifferent attitude of some English teachers towards training could make it difficult for trainers to impart skills and knowledge effectively. To address this issue, the ELTR programme development officer has proposed that promotions of English teachers should be made conditional on INSET, and monetary benefits could be used as another incentive (Shamim, 2014). Unfortunately, it is a common misconception among some teachers in Pakistan that they do not need CPD once they secure a job, and they can continue to work in the same way.

2.6.3 Impact of ELTR and HEC record

In the early years of the ELTR project, in 2008, a well-known field researcher named Shamim F., undertook a study. The goal was to assess how the project was influencing English teachers and their teaching approaches. She aimed to determine whether English teachers were employing their learning in their classroom practices or not. Sadly, she faced difficulties in locating any data concerning the initial years of the ELTR project. In her study, Shamim (2008) suggests that the management did not keep any record of the extent to which the project impacted the English teachers and their students. Instead, the number of trainees and courses held were deemed more important than any other element. As a result, annual reports from the HEC only show the number of training sessions provided each year, but their impact has not been made visible in most cases.

2.6.4 Lack of evaluation and monitoring

During the implementation of the ELTR project, there were serious challenges with the lack of supervision and assessment policies. The HEC did not supervise and assess the English

teachers who attended courses or received training, and as a result, it was not clear whether English teachers incorporated the knowledge, and skills gained from the courses in their classrooms. Additionally, English teachers were only asked for feedback once they had finished their courses, and what they consequently did in their practice was unknown. Consequently, the real impact of CPD courses on teachers, and ultimately on students, was not visible.

2.6.5 Scrutiny and English teachers' background

The HEC encountered several challenges, and one of these involved carefully examining the backgrounds of English teachers who were taking part in the ELTR project training. A range of participants belonging to diverse educational and social backgrounds were participating in this training. It was crucial for trainers to be aware of the previous qualifications of the trainees to modify the training according to the participants' level, education and context of teaching. However, no needs analysis activity was conducted before commencing training, and the information related to English teachers' background was not shared with the trainers. As a result, the training was not aligned with the needs, skills and pedagogy required for ELT (Shamim, 2008).

2.6.6 Similar training for college and university teachers

Colleges and universities differ in their resources and facilities. However, the HEC arranged training for college and university teachers together. Despite the difference in resources and facilities (SACs were only provided to universities), the same training approach was adopted for both types of public institutions. College and university teachers are also different in their research skills and integration of technology, as many public colleges in Pakistan lack internet and computer facilities, and most college teachers do not have any experience of research. This dissimilarity made it difficult for a trainer to introduce any higher-level research information and pedagogy related to the use of technology, for example. Therefore, it was a challenge for

the training team (Shamim, 2008; Zaidi et al., 2020). In addition, there were other differences between universities and colleges in terms of their environments, examination systems, curricula, and learning needs. For instance, universities follow the semester system, while colleges follow an annual examination system through divisional boards. In light of the above-mentioned differences, the uniform training system was not a suitable option for colleges and universities.

2.6.7 Infrastructure of training centres

The HEC encountered a fundamental challenge of inadequate facilities or infrastructure during the ELTR project. In some centres, the resource person and participants had to manage without the required tools and instruments like electricity, internet, computers and multimedia. This undermined the morale of trainers and trainees. The poor infrastructure was observed as a hindrance in training and CPD (Bhatti & Memon, 2016).

In the following section, I will delve deeper into some more aspects of the current project that will shed light on the quality of CPD in supporting English teachers. By engaging in this discussion, I aim to provide a deeper insight into the factors that contribute to effective CPD and identify strategies for enhancing its impact.

2.6.8 In-depth analysis of the ELTR project

Monitoring teachers is an essential aspect of evaluating and improving their performance. A comprehensive analysis of the ELTR project, the HEC annual reports and research (Awan, 2022; Zaidi et al., 2020; Zia et al., 2023) demonstrates some problems and limitations in the ELTR project as well as recommendations for addressing them. Some of the key limitations identified include the lack of participants' accountability for incorporating newly acquired skills, as well as the need for more effective monitoring and evaluation mechanism. To address these issues, Chaudhary (2011), recommends that monitoring should be carried out through regular visits of the project teams, class observations and by the related department data

analysis – analysing student achievement data. By suggesting these strategies, Chaudhary demonstrates the limited impact of the ELTR project.

Research maintains a central position in education, as it encourages curiosity, motivation and enthusiasm for the profession (Soomro et al., 2016) and provides solutions for educational problems. However, there is a disparity in the resources available to university teachers and college teachers. While university teachers receive funds and physical resources for research, college teachers are excluded from such facilities. Consequently, the majority of college English teachers are limited to being classroom practitioners, while some university English teachers are able to engage in research activity (Soomro et al., 2016).

As previously mentioned, internet facilities are not available in all educational institutions of Pakistan, which means that CALL is not feasible for many, despite the use of computers and CALL being highly valued by the language teaching community for enhancing language learning and teaching in every area of the curriculum (Ashraf, 2016; Saeed et al., 2021). Additionally, the integration of technology in the acquisition of language and skills production is considered highly valuable in the modern learning domain. According to Zaidi et al. (2020) the most impactful and noteworthy training requirements for college and university English teachers during their service and teaching include strategies for assessment, communication skills, classroom management, and the integration of technology within the learning environment. In the project, no special consideration was paid to developing these essential skills. Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) and Poskitt (2005) proposed an implicit action plan with an appropriate timeframe for planning an effective professional programme, involving:

- Evaluation
- Need analysis
- Implicit intended outcomes
- Clear understanding of environment
- Comprehension of continuity of PD

It is easily observed from the ELTR project that it is missing three important elements like an institutional requirement assessment, assessment, and understanding of the ongoing nature of PD.

2.7 Summary of the chapter

This chapter focused on the context surrounding English language education in Pakistan, specifically examining institutions imparting education, the status of English language and resistance it encounters, various policies, issues in TESOL teaching, promotion and teaching policy, degree awarded by universities, programmes to train teachers, and the difficulties in CPD for English teachers.

Furthermore, the chapter begins by discussing the presence of both private and public institutions in Pakistan, highlighting the different levels of education offered in the country. It also addresses the importance of English language competency for individuals and mentions the resistance faced by regional languages against English as a means of communication.

Additionally, the implementation policy regarding English language education is examined, revealing a gap between the idealised position of the language and its actual state in society.

The study focuses on TESOL in Pakistan and the complexities of the teaching and learning environment.

Furthermore, the chapter provides detailed information on English teachers, including their recruitment, teaching methods and qualifications, and some of the universities in ELT which offer various degrees including standardised test preparation.

In addition to standardised test preparation, teacher training programmes are also discussed, and their current status in the country is analysed, providing a rationale for understanding the complicated backdrop that influences English teachers' decisions. The study aims to inform readers about the motivation and factors influencing English teachers' choices in pursuing CPD opportunities.

The chapter identifies challenges associated with CPD attainment among English teachers, illustrating gaps that arise due to varying levels of motivation. Despite this, the significance of CPD and the provision of opportunities for PD are highlighted within the context of English language education in Pakistan. To conclude, this chapter provides a comprehensive overview of the contextual factors shaping English language education in Pakistan. It examines various aspects, including educational institutions, language policies, CPD, and challenges faced by English teachers, offering valuable insights for understanding the complex landscape of ELT in the country.

Chapter Three: Literature review

Chapter overview

This chapter is concerned with providing the background information to the field of language teaching which this study focuses on, namely English teachers in Pakistani universities and their understanding of CPD. The chapter starts with discussing the scarcity of career guidance and provides some information about English as the language of progress in Pakistan. It outlines English teachers' CPD in Pakistani HE and the key factors which affect this field at the present time; the chapter also aims to review the scholarly literature that has been written on distinctive aspects of CPD and English teachers and to categorise common topics investigated by field experts. I will also discuss what research communicates about the impact of CPD on learning and teaching to establish the necessity for working on this important issue of English teachers' understanding of CPD; what can be achieved through English teachers' understanding of CPD research; and how far these findings can be useful for developing some CPD guidelines.

3.1 Introduction

With greater access to global educational trends in recent years, the need to employ ever-greater skills in teaching quality has arisen. Over the years, educators and researchers have embarked on a journey to explore the concept of teacher PD, examining its role in the classroom while simultaneously developing their own professional skills. I sought to research the understanding of English teachers' CPD, their professional attitudes, and perceptions of CPD based on their experiences in their teaching roles and professional lives.

3.2 State of career guidance in Pakistan

In this section, I present some literature to review the current state of career counselling in Pakistan, focusing on knowledge and awareness among individuals, assessment practices,

perspectives of individuals and career service providers, interpersonal factors affecting career exploration, and the state of career counselling in HE. The section concludes by suggesting that the current state of Pakistan's education system may pose challenges related to career decision-making and that exploring English teachers' CPD understanding can be justified in this context. The presented literature has been organised into the following themes.

3.2.1 Increased awareness and implementation of career counselling services

Career counselling may play a decisive role in guiding individuals and providing them with the necessary knowledge and support to make informed career choices. Yaqoob et al. (2017) examine the level of career counselling knowledge among individuals in Pakistan and highlight the importance of career guidance in facilitating informed career decisions, and discuss the need for increased awareness and implementation of career counselling services. These authors emphasise the need for heightened awareness and greater implementation of career counselling services in the country. By providing access to career guidance, individuals can receive valuable support in navigating the complex world of career choices and making well-informed decisions that align with their aspirations, aptitude and skills. The research contributes to my decision to explore English teachers' understanding and perceptions of CPD, considering the scarcity of the career guidance; and advocates the establishment of effective career counselling services in Pakistan.

3.2.2 Effective assessment tools tailored to the Pakistani context

To identify individuals' distinctive characteristics for lifetime success and career choices it is essential to have assessment strategies that can assist career counsellors. Abidi and Malik (2020) focus on these and provide an overview of the contemporary scenario of career assessment in Pakistan which discusses the challenges and opportunities associated with career assessment methods and highlights the need for effective assessment tools tailored to the Pakistani context.

3.2.3 Enhancing career counselling in HE

Zahid et al. (2020) examine the current practices and future options for career counselling in Pakistani universities and consider global as well as local influences as significant contexts to comprehend the way the career development guidance in HE in Pakistan takes place.

The imbalance between skill supply and demand raises important considerations for shaping career guidance and driving broader reforms within HE. The common career guidance culture in Pakistan is outdated policy-wise, and recent theories, policy and resources have identified it needs to be rebuilt. This outdated and traditional way of career guidance suggests a gap of support for students and also indicates a scarcity of national oversight into how professionals decide their career. The study also discusses the challenges faced by career counsellors in HE settings and suggests strategies to improve career guidance and counselling services for students pursuing HE.

3.2.4 Tailoring counselling services to students' needs and expectations

A study by Keshf and Khanum (2022) presents the perspectives of both students and career service providers on career guidance and counselling services in Pakistan and explores the effectiveness of existing services, identifies gaps and challenges, and suggests recommendations to develop the quality and accessibility of career counselling services.

In addition, Kayani et al. (2022) explore the interpersonal factors influencing career exploration among adolescents in Pakistan. This study examines the role of family, peers and teachers in shaping students' career choices and provides insights into the importance of interpersonal support in career development.

3.2.5 Career counselling and language instruction in Pakistan

The literature reviewed in this section highlights the research emphasis on various facets of career counselling in Pakistan. These facets encompass the levels of knowledge and awareness among individuals regarding career opportunities, the assessment practices utilised in career

counselling, the viewpoints of individuals seeking counselling and career providers offering guidance, the influence of interpersonal factors on career exploration, and the present status of career counselling within HEIs.

This literature highlights the demanding need for heightened awareness, refined assessment practices, improved career counselling services, and robust interpersonal support to effectively facilitate career exploration and decision-making among individuals in Pakistan. For professionals engaged in the foreign language teaching field, which heavily relies on innovative and continually evolving teaching methods, the lack of comprehensive career guidance resources can impede their access to guidance, motivation, and support. This correlation resonates with the scope of my study, as English teachers' comprehension of CPD could potentially be influenced by an absence of prior career guidance resources. After discussing the current scarcity and challenges faced by Pakistani adolescents in career guidance, the subsequent section focuses on the treatment and use of English in Pakistan and highlights the significance of this research topic.

3.3 English language education and PD challenges in Pakistan

English is often seen as a sign of a bright future in Pakistan. However, limited access to quality educational resources and inadequate training can impact English teachers' PD and ultimately, English language development in the country. Understanding the role of English language and its local and global influences is crucial for understanding the PD of English teachers in Pakistani universities and what this entails. However, it is important to introduce some important elements for example, the position of English language as an official and academic language, and the effects that it has on different aspects of everyday life. Shamim (2011) identified three main issues that affect this: the quality of teaching, the conflict between national and global demands, and the language segregated policy that Pakistan experiences.

These issues can create challenges for learners and teachers and highlight the need for PD to improve English language education in Pakistan.

3.3.1 The contradiction of policy and practice

In Pakistan, there is a common belief that English medium education is synonymous with a high-quality education, which has led to the proliferation of private EMI schools (Ahmed & Rao, 2012; Fareed et al., 2018). The 2009 Education Policy of the Pakistani government recommended teaching English from early grade as a subject, but this decision was made without proper viability assessment or a well-thought-out and coherent deployment strategy (Coleman, 2010). As a result, there have been several challenges in implementing the policy, including a lack of adequate resources, such as trained teachers and suitable curriculum material.

Coleman (2010) highlights the absence of clarity regarding different elements of the policy and fundamental contradictions within the policy documents. To illustrate, the policy's instruction to utilise English for all subjects' clashes with prior assertions that institutions can opt for any language as their instructional medium (Coleman, 2010). This lack of coherence and clarity in the policy implementation has resulted in several challenges for both teachers and students, including difficulty in adjusting to the sudden shift to EMI, which can impact the quality of education being delivered.

Furthermore, as pointed out by Awan (2022), despite the compulsory introduction of EMI in HE in 1947, there seems to have been challenges in ensuring its consistent and widespread implementation as intended by national education policies. This has led to a state of language apartheid where those with an English medium educational background are considered as superior to those with another instructed educational background, exacerbating social class differences (Shamim, 2011). The lack of comprehensive planning and implementation in promoting EMI has resulted in systemic issues and inequities in Pakistan's education system.

3.3.2 Quality and standards of achievements

In 2009, Pakistan developed the National Professional Standards for Teachers, which emphasised the importance of the quality of teacher training, education and teachers' professional growth (Nasreen & Mirza, 2012). Moreover, in 2004, the HEC launched the aforementioned language-based project ELTR, where specific standards were set for TESOL. The above steps for improving ELT standards and quality show the government's inclination to bring some significant reforms to teacher education. However, there has been no systematic measure of the impact and effectiveness of the above programmes. Nasreen and Mirza (2012) recommended a need to devise a methodology to monitor the productivity of these programmes regularly.

Significantly, there is an increasing discrepancy between the unclear language policy and the practical application of learning and TESOL practices in Pakistan. Consequently, a scenario has arisen wherein most graduates from public-sector institutions lack proficient English literacy skills upon entering the job market, and this applies similarly to teachers as well (Nawab, 2017).

3.3.3 A conflict between local and global needs

Language is a symbol of identity and an instrument for presenting indigenous beliefs and principles. The privilege to learn and study one's native language is currently regarded as an essential human entitlement (Rovira, 2008; Skutnabb-Kangas, 2006). Nonetheless, there is an urgent requirement to establish a connection with the global cultural landscape, particularly evident within the younger generation. Pakistani universities are also encountering the challenge of generating a globally accepted educational quality and position, predominantly through EMI, even though most people use their local languages in their everyday contexts. Similarly, English is used as a language of official documentation whereas local languages are used as the main source of verbal interaction in the workplace. The challenge lies in striking a

balance between the selection of the language of instruction in education and the demands of individual, societal, and national development.

I have presented a brief overview of English as the language of development and the sign of a bright future in Pakistan, alongside discussing the contradiction between policy and practice in regard to ELT quality, standards and achievements, and a conflicting situation between local and global needs of the individual. In the subsequent section, I will discuss pre-service and in-service teacher education in Pakistan.

3.4 Evaluation of pre- or in-service teacher-education

In the context of CPD in Pakistan, pre-service training of language teachers is essential for the development of teaching competence and the construction of their teacher identities (Siddiqui, et al., 2011). Educational programmes hold vital importance in this context, and evaluating these programmes, reviewing what challenges they highlight and what research around teacher education suggests can help, not only to identify issues in teacher education but to obtain the ways to tackle such issues. While such programmes are not typically recommended for university-level teaching, they do provide an initial understanding of the teaching profession. Research by Fatima and Naseer Ud Din (2010) evaluated the MA Education Programme in postgraduate teacher training institutions in Pakistan which grant postgraduate degrees such as Master of Education (MA/M.Ed.), Master of Philosophy (M.Phil.) and Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the domain of education to uplift the professions and speed up the PD of teachers. The study found that the teachers in the MA programme utilised a variety of teaching strategies based on the intended learning aims, material and learners' needs.

However, the study also recommended changes in criteria for admission, research work, framework and length of the degree, and incentives for this educational programme. The findings suggest that teacher education programmes in Pakistan suffer from a lack of motivation among teachers and administrative challenges. Furthermore, they highlight the need

for ongoing evaluation and improvement of such programmes to ensure that they are effectively preparing teachers for the demands of their profession and promoting their CPD. The evaluation of the programme underscores the importance of understanding the challenges and opportunities of CPD, particularly with regards to teacher education.

Obviously, teacher education has experienced significant growth since 1947, with an increase in the number of training institutions, yet, despite the attention given to it in terms of educational policies, the fragmented implementation of measures has resulted in limited success (Dayan et al., 2018; Tahira et al., 2020).

In this context, INSET strategies have been commonly implemented to meet the changing demands of modern education. However, little evaluation has been done on how teachers implement the ideas and strategies acquired through such training. A case study by Nawab (2017) was conducted and revealed that while in-service courses positively impact trainee teachers' attitude and professional practices, structural and cultural barriers hinder the implementation process. These barriers include the hierarchical structure of institutions, heavy workload, lack of resources, insufficient support from management and absence of collaboration.

Moreover, novice teachers, who bring preconceived beliefs about teaching and learning from pre-service training, often face challenges during their transition to actual classroom practices. A study by Dayan et al. (2018) focused on exploring the experiences and challenges of novice teachers during this transition period, such as implementing student-centred pedagogies in large classes, addressing individual differences among students, dealing with non-cooperative colleagues, managing parental interference and coping with a heavy workload. The study also outlines the strategies employed by novice teachers, which include efforts to establish rapport with students, implement innovative lesson plans, and adapt to the institutional culture.

To address these issues and improve teacher education, comprehensive measures are recommended in the literature (Dayan et al., 2018; Nawab, 2017; Tahira et al., 2020). These include establishing partnerships between training and educational institutions, providing needs-based INSET, offering initial training to new teachers, and equipping trainees with skills to navigate structural and cultural challenges in educational institutions. Ongoing support and encouragement from colleagues, resource persons, and management are also crucial to sustain the implementation of strategies learned during training.

Briefly, teacher education in Pakistan is a vital component of the educational system to train teachers for their profession, but its implementation and quality improvement face challenges. Strategies such as INSET can have a positive impact on teachers, but barriers hinder their implementation. Novice teachers encounter various challenges during their transition to classroom teaching, and coping strategies can help them navigate. By incorporating a discussion on pre-service teacher training, I can offer a comprehensive perspective on English teachers' understanding of CPD, providing valuable insights into their possible initial training and its impact on their PD. This discussion also may shed light on pre-service needs of English teachers.

After reviewing some literature on the evaluation of teacher training programmes and the challenges faced by new teachers, the subsequent section will focus more deeply on the definition of CPD. Additionally, it will discuss the difference between PD and CPD, as well as dig into various related issues in order to provide a clear understanding of it and its significance in the ongoing growth and learning of English teachers.

3.5 Defining CPD

As Maggiolo (2020) argues, there is no unified definition of CPD, and the literature often provides a variety of interpretations or descriptions. These include CPD being seen as a continuous learning process from initial training to retirement (Khan & Ahmed, 2015; Powell

et al., 2003); INSET activities for initial development; and work-related support strategies that complement teachers' teaching knowledge and competence (Qaisra & Haider, 2023). It can encompass individual or employee development (Bayram & Canaran, 2018) or be considered as teacher development aimed at enhancing professionalism and advancing teachers' careers (Giraldo, 2014). Nonetheless, these descriptions hold significance in influencing the way educators perceive or comprehend CPD.

In this thesis, the term CPD is employed in a broader sense, referring to the ongoing development of ELT practitioners in Pakistani universities. According to Hustler (2003) and Maggiolo (2004), CPD refers to all tasks that enhance teachers' knowledge, skills, expertise, and other personal and professional attributes during their career. CPD is often described as human resource development, faculty development, career development, and lifetime learning (Mann & Webb, 2022) and used interchangeably with the term PD. My participants mainly refer to their professional learning as either PD, academic development, or professional growth, with the sense that their learning is continuous, aligning with the Western global concept of CPD. That is why I used this term to refer to all types of professional learning in this thesis.

Hustler (2003) and Mann and Webb (2022) make a distinction between PD and CPD, with the latter being identified as pertaining to teachers' personal development, while PD is seen as connected to one's career and has a narrower, more pragmatic, and more functional orientation. CPD involves aspects of values and morals that influence professional decision-making awareness. From my perspective, CPD encompasses all activities aimed at enhancing teachers' competence, skills, and knowledge in the field. It encompasses a range of PD initiatives designed to support educators in their continuous professional progress and improvement in teaching within the context of Pakistani universities.

According to Mann (2005), the term 'professional development' is not sufficient to capture the ongoing and rigorous learning that is necessary for teachers to improve students' learning

outcomes. A more appropriate term is ‘professional learning’, which is an ongoing process focused on improving teaching practices and student learning. Day (1999) describes professional learning as encompassing all learning experiences, both intentional or unintentional, that benefit the professional community, or institution and contribute to educational quality in the classroom. Professional learning is a process that involves individual and collaborative review, renewal and extension of professional commitment to teaching as a moral purpose (Day, 1999). Through professional learning, teachers acquire and develop core knowledge and social/emotional skills necessary for effective professional thinking, planning and practice at every stage of their professional lives (Adams & Mann, 2021; Mann, 2005; Mann & Webb, 2022).

According to my personal understanding of CPD based on my research and reflection, the concept is clearer when we view it in terms of the range of tasks and wide variety of activities, both formal and informal, that teachers engage in throughout their career to enhance their professional knowledge, skills and practices. These activities can include attending workshops, conferences and courses, engaging in research, reading articles to clarify confusion, participating in mentoring or coaching and collaborating with colleagues. The primary objective of CPD is to elevate teachers' classroom performance and increase the academic accomplishments of learners (Hustler, 2003; Mann & Webb, 2022).

Effective CPD programmes involve active engagement of teachers in learning activities that are similar to those used with their students, and that inspire them to create their own learning communities (Adams & Mann, 2021). Any specific activity that contributes to teacher development, either directly or indirectly, can be considered CPD. Furthermore, globally, universities are increasingly viewed as centres of learning which support teachers in sharing their professional skills and teaching practices in an organised manner (Adams & Mann, 2021; Day, 1999).

According to Mann and Webb (2022), exploring the effectiveness of teachers' professional learning programmes is crucial. These programmes can enhance quality teaching, improve students' learning outcomes, and foster personal and professional growth for educators. However, in the past, CPD activities followed a traditional model that relied heavily on one-shot events held offsite (Mann & Webb, 2022). Unfortunately, these events often failed to meet the needs and expectations of teachers. Teachers were passive receivers of knowledge, and the content did not align with their teaching practices. Furthermore, there was no consideration of their individual needs (Adams & Mann, 2021; Mann, 2005; Mann & Webb, 2022).

According to Khan and Abdullah (2019) and as emphasised by Mann and Webb (2022), PD activities are increasingly centred around the teacher, with the content tailored to their teaching practices. For example, activities such as study and book clubs, colleague coaching, on-site collaboration among teachers, research including professional dialogues among teachers, and emphasis on collective responsibility for students' learning all contribute to this focus on teacher-centred PD.

In the next section, I will discuss the traditional concept of training and development, which will serve as a foundation for exploring English teachers' understanding of CPD.

3.5.1 Traditional concepts of training and development

Broadly, language teacher education (LTE) is understood as encompassing two primary aims: training and development. Training is considered a facet of formal Initial Teacher Education (ITE), focusing on preparing teachers for their initial full-time teaching responsibilities (Khan & Abdullah, 2019). This training requires imparting foundational ideas and principles (Freeman, 1989), introducing language educators to models, methods, and strategies, and familiarising them with prevalent language teaching concepts (Mann & Webb, 2022). Training

is generally seen as a task directed by external influences, following a top-down approach that is predefined, planned, and time-limited (Khan & Abdullah, 2019).

Conversely, development has traditionally been associated with INSET occurring later in a teacher's career. Since ITE cannot comprehensively cover the evolving and fast-paced educational landscape (Khan & Abdullah, 2019), the need for on-the-job follow-up assistance through in-service CPD events focusing on practical training based on classroom requirements becomes apparent. The concept of development thus acknowledges competence in foundational skills and knowledge acquired through ITE. It is perceived as an ongoing process, either entirely or partially tailored, adaptable, grassroots-driven, and not confined to specific professional duties (Khan & Abdullah, 2019; Richards, 1990). Additionally, development is acknowledged for its enduring goal of enriching teachers' understanding of both their profession and themselves (Freeman 1989) throughout their careers.

The distinction between training and development emerged due to the excessive emphasis on training within ITE, as a response. This has led to views of training as lacking in developmental aspects and concentrating solely on the need to “instil habits or skills” (Edge, 2003: 7), potentially leading teachers to overly depend on rote learning and face challenges in adjusting to shifts in their teaching environment. As a result, the term teacher preparation has gained widespread acceptance, enabling a broader acknowledgment that education, training, and development can all be integral components of ITE.

Today, in Pakistan, the community's perception of education and teaching is constantly evolving and transforming. This evolution is influenced by teachers' experiences, cultures, and the evolving dynamics where teachers might now have international exposure, global connections, and diverse work settings (Raza & Coombe, 2022; Warsi & Khurshid, 2022). Consequently, this shift has led to a heightened comprehension within language teaching about the essentiality of both development and training. As Banks et al. (2019) state, education assists

in determining actions, while training ensures the consistent, effective, and efficient execution of those actions. When combined, these two elements empower language educators to make informed decisions concerning different approaches, activities, and methods, and to proficiently put those decisions into practice.

However, the concept of teacher development is intricate and expected to differ based on the teacher's professional and social environment. For example, as Mann (2005) highlights, in the United States, teacher development is commonly perceived as an endeavour wherein a knowledgeable resource person imparts information through a process of transmission to teachers. On the other hand, the European perspective on teacher development leans towards envisioning teachers as autonomous problem-solving professionals who assume accountability for their personal and professional advancement (Richards, 1990). Integral to this notion is a prevalent belief that teachers should play a decisive role in leading their own PD (Mann & Webb, 2022; Stuart & Thurlow, 2000).

The fact that teacher development is a complex and self-directed process, includes formal and informal training/learning methods, and occurs in stages for many years (Raza & Coombe, 2022; Warsi & Khurshid, 2022). So, whether the learning process is short or long, prior or continuous, extroverted or introspective, training and development are all part of a teacher's overall continuum of progress. This is particularly important in the context of this study where English teachers from Pakistani universities are engaged in a learning process that is evident in their profiles. It is important to know whether these extended and short period training activities are organisation-led or self-directed as this knowledge can help individuals and organisations better understand the nature and effectiveness of training. If the training is self-directed, meaning that the learner has control over the pace and content of the learning, it can lead to greater motivation and engagement with the material. On the other hand, institutional-directed training, where the institution dictates the content and structure of the training, may

be more efficient in terms of meeting specific institutional goals. By understanding the nature of initiatives, individuals and organisations can make more informed decisions about which type of training is most appropriate for their needs and goals.

Likewise, career development is not a technical toolkit: it needs a distinctive understanding of the aim of teaching, a paradigm change from a dominant pedagogy to a successful teaching/learning approach. Traditional assumptions need to be challenged and theory, personal views and position need to be emphasised. This has the potential to offer educators experiential and practice-oriented learning chances that stimulate them to challenge prevailing paradigm assumptions. The body of literature (Al Asmari, 2016; Borg, 2015; Qaisra & Haider, 2023) concerning CPD indicates that such activities enable teachers to interact with the subjective and necessity-driven aspects of essential learning, opening avenues for fresh perspectives within the realm of education.

Language teacher education encompasses training and development goals. Training is associated with ITE and focuses on basic concepts and techniques, while development is linked to INSET and provides ongoing support, based on classroom needs. The perception of teaching in Pakistan by the public is gradually shifting as a result of teachers' exposure and experiences on a global scale. This evolution is prompting a realisation of the essential requirement for both training and development in the field. Teacher development is a multi-faceted process that involves other-directed and self-directed learning and understanding of the nature of training initiatives can inform decisions about their effectiveness and appropriateness. In the upcoming section, I will discuss the significant impact of experiential learning in CPD programmes. This discussion will serve as a groundwork for exploring the objectives and aims of CPD for English teachers.

3.5.2 The transformative effect of experiential learning in CPD programmes

Results derived from empirical studies have consistently demonstrated that participation in CPD programmes featuring experiential and applied learning prompts a paradigm change among teachers in terms of instructional strategies (Al Asmari, 2016; Borg, 2015; Qaisra & Haider, 2023). These educators establish a connection with the learning experience through their training (Borg, 2015; Nash, 2012; Qaisra & Haider, 2023) and learn to effectively channel their own competence and identity to foster their identities as English teachers (Zafar et al., 2022). Additionally, numerous studies (Al Asmari, 2016; Richards & Rodgers, 2014; Zafar et al., 2022) indicate that teachers' professional journeys become evident in the comments and narratives they craft about their learning encounters, showcasing the resulting personal transformations they undergo. Thus, whether enrolling in a brief or extended programme, experienced individuals acquire heightened occupational skills, subsequently enhancing their personal knowledge and social competencies.

3.5.3 The impact of CPD on English teachers

CPD programmes have been shown to have the potential to produce a productive impact on teachers' PD, although the extent of their effectiveness may vary depending on individual factors and contextual variables. The assessment of CPD should be focused on what teachers learn, how they apply what they have learnt and the impact on students' learning. Measuring the impact of CPD involves collaboration between teachers and leadership staff involved in performance management and mentoring.

Lee's (2011) study in the context of TESOL provided evidence of the positive impact of CPD on teachers' philosophies, linguistic and cultural competencies, and pedagogical skills in the classroom, leading to increased confidence in their roles. However, some of the research reminds us that many teachers perceive CPD to be irrelevant to their needs and that we still know relatively little about its overall impact (Adams & Mann, 2021).

Previous literature (Al Asmari, 2016; Borg, 2015; Qaisra & Haider, 2023) suggests that highly qualified and experienced English teachers demonstrate more improvement in their pedagogical behaviour, organisational skills, and lesson planning compared to novice teachers after attending such training. There is also a significant correlation between performance and PD, including meeting diverse needs of students. In addition, CPD may have potential to improve assessment strategies and time management skills. Lee's (2011) study found that student-centred teaching approaches became more visible in teachers after professional training, fostering a belief in teamwork and collaboration. Thus, CPD is seen as a learning activity that challenges teachers to think creatively and critically, both as learners and educators (Lee, 2011). Collaboration among university English teachers is encouraged, contributing to positive CPD outcomes (Guan, 2018).

After presenting the impact of CPD on various skills of English teachers, the following section will outline approaches to CPD that can contribute to a successful teaching profession.

3.5.4 Different approaches to CPD

The terms CPD and INSET are frequently employed interchangeably (Craft, 2002). The latter can be delineated as all activities for in-service education and training that qualified educators partake in to enhance their professional competence and skills for more effective teaching (Richards, 1990), presumes that teachers involved in it possess foundational teaching knowledge and have acquired rudimentary teaching skills during their initial training (Farrell, 2008). Furthermore, INSET acquaint teachers with a range of available options aimed at enhancing their current teaching practices (Richards & Farrell, 2005).

INSET is commonly constructed as a series of structured, formal, and time-limited in-service learning activities (Day, 1999). These activities are typically designed in a top-down manner to bridge the gap between teachers' current skill and knowledge levels and the proficiency expected of their role within the educational system (Richards, 1990). Often viewed as a swift

and cost-effective means of enhancing teachers' skills while on the job (Freeman, 1989), INSET essentially encompasses facets of both training and development. The spectrum of INSET activities can include those that are accredited or non-accredited, setting them apart from the less structured in-service training and developmental efforts that teachers also partake in (Day, 1999).

Broadly, CPD encompasses both structured and formal opportunities, which are akin to INSET activities often mandated by external bodies (e.g., institutions where teachers work) and facilitated by individuals like resource persons or teacher-educators (Powell et al., 2003). Furthermore, CPD encompasses more informal prospects, which might be initiated by individual teachers or groups within the same institution or locality. These informal activities can be ongoing and self-commenced. Regardless of whether the process is predominantly training-oriented or not, CPD is expected to foster improvements in teachers' awareness, competence, and practice. Consequently, it contributes to elevating their professional standing by enhancing teachers' expertise (Khan, 2011).

The concept of offering short- or extended-term INSET for practicing teachers implies the integration of training within the development programme (Mann & Walsh, 2017). This integration aims to prepare educators for their current responsibilities (Mann & Webb, 2022) or to cultivate skills, behaviours, and strategies specified externally (institutionally) (Richards, 1990), which can subsequently enable teachers to promptly apply the acquired strategies in their classrooms (Guskey & Huberman, 1995). However, as articulated by Stuart and Thurlow (2000), teacher development represents an ongoing continuum of learning spanning an individual's entire career in education. Within an educational institution, teachers find themselves situated at various points along this continuum. Initial years of learning typically focus on cultivating a comprehension of teaching practice, followed by subsequent phases of introspection and discourse. These later stages facilitate the continual acquisition of fresh

insights and skill enhancement. This underlines the significance of a comprehensive CPD program, which can adopt the various approaches or forms explained in this section to cater to teachers' distinct individual or contextual requirements.

In the next section, I will examine the different CPD approaches. By exploring these possibilities, we will gain insight into the nature and sources of CPD activities. This exploration will shed light on the motivation and level of autonomy of English teachers within their work setting.

3.5.4.1 Possibilities of CPD approaches

In practice, as mentioned earlier, CPD encompasses a variety of options along the training and development spectrum. These options can include formal training approaches or a mix of formal and informal methods, either self-directed or involving collaboration with others (as discussed in the previous section). The range of possibilities is influenced by the available resources and support in different contexts.

The categorisation of a CPD activity as formal or informal, as well as self-directed or other-directed, depends on the context and the nature of the activity itself. In Table 5 below, I have provided a classification of some common CPD activities. It is important to note that many can fall into different classifications simultaneously. For example, certain activities may have elements of both formal and informal or other-directed or self-directed aspects. This variability arises from differences in structure and approach, whereby an activity considered structured CPD in one institution may be viewed as informal in another. In such cases, individual English teachers have the autonomy to pursue these activities based on their personal learning needs.

Table 5 CPD activities adopted from observation and the literature.

Other-directed		Self-directed	
Formal	Informal	Formal	Informal
Colleague coaching			
Colleague observation			
Collaborative teaching			
Critical incident examination			
Mentoring			
Case study analysis			
Exploratory research / action research			
Acquiring a new language			
Attending / presenting at conferences & workshops			
Membership of communities of practice (CoP) (Wenger, 2004)			
Writing articles for publication			
Teacher portfolios			
Blogging			Critical/informal/professional conversations
Informal discussions	Shadowing in the workplace		Critical reading
Teaching journal writing			Critical friends
			Self-monitoring
			Self-study through distance learning

3.5.4.2 Formal and informal CPD approaches

In a broader context, CPD activities that institutions advocate or expect, and those organised within the employing institution, can be classified as formal activities. These are typically included in individual faculty members' workplace evaluations and are primarily aligned with their university's or local education authority's faculty improvement objectives, such as those outlined by the HEC (Raza et al., 2022).

In contrast, informal CPD activities may not necessarily align with institutional expectations or the performance evaluations of individual faculty members. These efforts might be initiated independently, guided by others, or collaborative in nature. They could be organised within the institution or externally. Such activities can unfold spontaneously and are not invariably structured formally. They often remain unrecognised within the formal CPD framework of the work environment. This particular aspect sparks discussions within the TESOL community, which places significant emphasis on CPD as a key element of career advancement (Raza et al., 2022).

Formal and informal CPD events can be further categorised as self-directed (personal/individual) or other-directed (collaborative and institutional). For a more detailed breakdown of CPD activities, refer to Tables 6 and 7. As such, the complexity of CPD becomes apparent through the divisions and combinations of events/activities that constitute the realm of teacher growth.

Self-directed CPD

Mann and Webb (2022) argue that self-initiated self-growth plays a pivotal role in shaping language teacher development by showcasing a readiness to assume primary responsibility for one's personal development journey. While self-directed development bears immense significance for individual teacher growth, it is also crucial for educators to consider their employment context, which may have distinct teacher development priorities and requisites

(Al Asmari, 2016). Thus, the interconnected phases of CPD formal, informal, self-initiated, and other-directed hold equal importance as they collectively support the varied CPD demands of teachers throughout their teaching.

The importance of self-initiated CPD lies primarily in the concept that professionalism involves not only identifying but also actively striving to meet personal and organisational CPD demands and needs. Equally, CPD's significance for institutions stems from the perspective that those offering CPD opportunities and even partial funding are perceived as fostering professionalism. However, the nature of CPD activities pursued by teachers is subject to geographical, cultural, and institutional influences, as well as career stages and available opportunities, intertwined with the local CPD ethos (Raza et al., 2022) .

Among experienced teachers within a specific institution or department, differences in career stages correspond to varying developmental requirements. In this context, self-directed learning empowers educators to shoulder the responsibility of setting developmental objectives, overseeing and regulating their learning process (Richards & Farrell, 2005). This self-management is pivotal for fostering and retaining an active, significant, teacher development process. Self-initiated learning encompasses personal knowledge construction, leveraging personal experiences as a foundation and stimulus for development. It also involves scrutinising personal teaching practice to address instructional concerns. Moreover, it entails self-evaluation, encompassing critical reflection, analysis, and the formulation and accomplishment of both short- and extended-term targets.

This self-initiated learning can manifest in informal or formal settings, spanning individual endeavours, one-on-one collaborations with colleagues, or group efforts involving co-workers within or outside the workplace. I have classified these in the table below for reference.

Table 6 Classification of self-directed activities

Self-initiated CPD activities	
Individual	Institutional groups
Reading	Peer coaching
Portfolios	Guidance/Mentoring
Self-evaluation and monitoring	Colleague observation
Membership of professional community	Rotation/job shadowing
Teaching journal writing	Acquiring a new language
Remote learning /self-study	Informal conversations
	Achieving an academic degree
Action/exploratory research	
Publishing articles for ELT publications	
Case analysis/critical incident	
Membership of professional communities	
Presenting at workshops & conferences	
Attending workshops & conferences	

CPD activities encompass diverse categories, including informal and formal approaches, as well as self-directed and other-directed pathways, depending on whether they are pursued individually or collaboratively in groups, and whether they are driven by workplace requirements or personal initiative. Formal CPD involves structured PD activities organised and conducted by educational institutions or regulatory bodies. In contrast, informal CPD refers to self-directed and spontaneous PD activities driven by an individual's personal interest, needs and experiences. This could also encompass online learning, where learners interact minimally with university staff throughout their study duration. For instance, many universities offer a

variety of online courses as part of their CPD offerings. Activities such as pursuing academic degrees, compiling teaching portfolios, membership of professional learning communities (PLCs) and attending and presenting at structured workshops can be self-initiated or driven by institutional requirements (Raza et al., 2022). Regardless of their formality, these activities typically involve collaboration with others. For examples, managers might mandate teaching portfolios as part of staff appraisals and offer guidelines for portfolio content; formal degree programmes may include lectures or educational tutorials provided by university teachers; and PLCs involve collaborative learning within the teaching community. Even when educators participate in and deliver seminars and workshops, they are involved in ongoing interactions with the present audience.

Self-directed CPD activities include self-assessment, journaling about teaching experiences, maintaining teacher files and portfolios, as well as engaging in activities like research analysis and observation. These endeavours are built upon the premise that gaining a deeper understanding of one's professional strengths and areas for improvement requires the systematic collection of objective information about teaching practices. This information then forms the basis for making decisions about potential adjustments (Richards & Farrell, 2005), or whether the current approach should be retained. Consequently, a foundational element of self-directed CPD involves reflecting upon documented comments and actions, which work as a catalyst for discussion, introspection, or assessment (Richards & Farrell, 2005).

In Pakistan, there is a greater prevalence of self-initiated efforts like delivering presentations at professional gatherings, contributing to journals, and pursuing formal degrees when compared to individual undertakings like self-monitoring. It is noteworthy that both pursuing formal degrees and contributing to journals align with institutional expectations in Pakistan, thus containing elements of both self-initiated and other-directed initiatives. Furthermore, the

act of writing for journals frequently involves collaborative efforts with other teachers of the department or university who share common interests.

Hence, although personally undertaken self-directed CPD events/activities are regarded as a stress-free means for educators to grasp their teaching approaches (Richards & Rodgers, 2014), pinpoint areas for enhancement, or uphold the quality of their work, continuous learning and evaluation of their practices present challenges when pursued in isolation (Freeman, 1989). Accomplishing these goals necessitates collaboration with colleagues or individuals who share similar interests. This collaboration goes beyond understanding one's individual experiences and viewpoints; it also involves enriching these through interactions with others. These collaborative efforts yield social gatherings that not only foster discussions about current knowledge but also foster the creation of fresh insights within a socially cooperative professional environment.

Other-directed CPD

In the aspect where collaborative efforts in CPD yield collective individual learning, this practice can also be termed as other-directed. Such collaborative efforts align with the overarching institutional objectives by fostering interaction among teachers to exchange skills, share experiences, and address common challenges. (Refer to Table 7, below for other-directed CPD activities).

However, the establishment of a cooperative culture within a university necessitates providing teachers with opportunities to engage in collaborative activities that share objectives and responsibilities (Richards & Rodgers, 2014). This demands meticulous planning and continuous oversight because, in contrast to self-directed learning, collaborative learning goals are often determined by institutional or contextual requisites (Adams & Mann, 2021).

In Pakistani institutions, efforts are made to cultivate a culture of cooperation through the organisation of regular non-mandatory one-day or one-week-long workshops and seminars for

faculty members (Ayesha, 2022). To promote collaboration, these CPD events are typically held either on-site at universities or off-site in other universities or main cities of Pakistan. However, these initiatives often lack sufficient publicity, which leads to lack of attendance among the faculty. Consequently, faculty members are increasingly opting to participate in external events, generally organised online, rather than engaging in institutional CPD opportunities.

Table 7 Categorisation of other-directed activities

Other-directed CPD activities	
In groups	Institutional
Blogging	Targeted conversations
Casual discussions	Teacher portfolios
Participating in virtual conversations	
Teaching journal writing	
Case analysis/ critical incident	
Mentoring	
Peer observation	
Action research	
Writing articles for field publications	
Peer observation	
Membership of professional communities	
Presenting/attending workshops & conferences	
Attending workshops & conferences	

Several of these activities, like colleague observation/coaching, guidance and mentoring, and collaborative teaching, adopt a one-on-one strategy between teachers. This approach is

designed to aid the growth of either one or both educators engaged in the development. Conversely, other collaborative efforts such as research on professional issues, focused discussions, and participation in PLCs, involve multiple people, either in a structured or informal manner (Adams & Mann, 2021).

Provided they are devoid of evaluative aspects and remain detached from performance assessment, collaborative/other-directed CPD events/activities offer teachers a platform to engage in interaction, contemplate their teaching methods, receive feedback, address concerns, exchange insights, and leverage expertise, ultimately fostering self-awareness (Richards & Rodgers, 2014). Involvement in such activities facilitates the cultivation of trust among teachers, enabling them to offer mutual support and draw from each other's experiences.

On the contrary, when CPD becomes intertwined with performance evaluation within institutional expectations, the effectiveness of such activities for actual teacher development becomes a topic of debate (Mann, 2005; Mann & Webb, 2022).

However, specific CPD undertakings, like compiling teaching portfolios or participating in targeted discussions on targeted learning and teaching concerns, are mandated by HEIs where faculty are employed. This is exemplified by certain public universities in Pakistan (Raza & Coombe, 2022), where CPD transitions into an institution-directed activity tied to performance evaluation. Likewise, activities including colleagues' observation, coaching, and mentoring, collaborative teaching, and research-related initiatives might also be institutionally directed on occasion, driven by the prevailing environment or institutional considerations. For instance, in Pakistan, composing papers for the field publications constitutes an institutional requirement in some academic settings.

On the flip side, upholding membership in professional associations, attending or presenting at events organised by these associations, and engaging in informal conversations are neither expected nor factored into the evaluations of many HEIs in Pakistan (Raza et al., 2022). These

activities are not considered as evidence of teachers' developmental involvement in the year-end performance assessments. This issue often triggers discussions among educators within this context.

Consequently, collaborative efforts are perceived as affording a framework for post-training follow-up, thereby facilitating the development of communities of teachers committed to the ongoing exploration of their profession. These communities foster a shared comprehension that is essential for collectively researching into knowledge, competence and skills (Richards & Rodgers, 2014). Ultimately, it is the institution that reaps the rewards, bolstering the expertise and solidarity of its educators and offering specialised training for specific tasks, thus reducing the necessity for INSET (Richards & Farrell, 2005).

3.5.4.6 Research as a form of CPD

Research serves as another avenue of development that warrants mention here. Teacher-conducted research within their own classrooms, as highlighted by Campbell et al. (2004), is not a novel concept. In certain educational institutions globally, teachers are expected to research their practices for informed decisions, a requirement that holds true for promotions in Pakistan (Chapter Two, section 2.4). Aligned with the reflective/contemplative practitioner model (Richards et al., 1994), teacher research can take on various forms: individual, in group, formal, or informal. It is labelled differently, encompassing terms such as exploring classrooms (Hopkins, 2014), researching teacher (Freeman, 1998), action research (Richards & Farrell, 2005), exploratory research (Stake, 2010; Yin, 1994), and NI (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). Action research involves teachers investigating their own situations with the aim of solving classroom challenges, refining their practice, or enriching their professional insight (Hopkins, 2014). Exploratory research, on the other hand, is suggested when action research is not feasible; it seeks to understand classroom phenomena rather than directly addressing practical classroom issues. Narrative inquiry (NI) involves reflective writing and verbal exchanges

(Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) and enables teachers to shape their professional identities through exploring emotional responses to teaching and interactions with colleagues.

Terminology aside, the research undertaken by teachers within their institutions is characterised by self-reflection and encompasses succession of minor explorations directed at evaluating, enhancing, developing, and honing professional methods. Researching one's profession or practice often triggers mindfulness, self-monitoring, and self-assessment, which, as Roberts (2016) proposes, can be the foundation for lasting change.

Besides their formal or informal aspects, whether self-initiated or collaborative, CPD activities can also be categorised as institution-based (conducted on-site or in-house) or external (held off-site) as mentioned by Day (1999). Institution-led CPD involves courses tailored to the specific needs of teachers within the institution, aligned with the goals of local education authorities (e.g., the Pakistan HEC). Depending on the objective, this could encompass action research, peer-mentoring, workplace observation, collaborative teaching, or shared planning. External advisors may be involved, yet institutions often tap into both external and internal expertise. In the case of Pakistani universities, internal educators are assisted to present or organise in-house workshops (Raza et al., 2022).

Formal external CPD may be organised at locations other than the teachers' workplace, such as regional offices, teachers' centres, universities, or through online methods. This could encompass extensive courses (certificates, diplomas, bachelor's and master's degrees, offered in person or through distance learning) spanning from hours to several years, or shorter courses including workshops sessions. In Pakistan, external events are primarily coordinated by the HEC and the British Council (refer to chapter Two for more details).

In contrast, informal CPD activities, like spontaneous discussions, are rarely observed in Pakistani universities (Awan, 2022). However, journal writing remains prevalent, both during and outside work, driven by institutional expectations and promotion aspirations (Raza &

Coombe, 2022). Reflection, a fundamental aspect of any CPD endeavour, can occur individually or in solitude through private practices. This reflective approach contributes to the collective construction of professional knowledge.

In the gradual progression to embracing the concept of social knowledge building, CoP or PLCs have gained prominence (Richards & Farrell, 2005; Wenger, 2004). These teacher development groups are more expansive than the interactive units described earlier in this section and operate on the premise that group work is often more effective than individual efforts.

3.5.4.7 Professional learning communities

In language teaching, a PLC (Darling-Hammond, 1990; Richards & Farrell, 2005; Rosenholtz, 1989; Senge, 1990) refers to a group of individuals who share a common learning vision and collaborate within and beyond their immediate community to explore their teaching methods, learn from one another, and develop improved approaches for enhancing the learning of all participants (Liu & Yin, 2023; Zhang et al., 2023). This collaboration is effective because members have similar goals and aims, leading to shared learning through mutual activities and experiences (Muhit, 2013). According to Toole and Louis (2002) the objective of establishing PLCs is to promote continuous, reflective, collaborative learning. This involves sharing and critically examining practices with a focus on growth and performance improvement.

Teachers' professional learning literature refers to various types of PLC such as CoP (Kitchen, 2022), learning groups (Sergiovanni, 1993), educator networks (Senge, 1990), discourse cohorts/communities (Rosenholtz, 1989), and active learning groups/communities (Hoban, 2005). While these terms have subtle distinctions, they all emphasise the importance of social connections/interactions among group members and a shared commitment to a common goal. Sustainability within PLCs is perceived as achievable through shared purposes, goals, and needs, ongoing engagement, acknowledgment of achievements, and documenting past

contributions (Chen, 2022). These traits enhance cohesion among group members and reinforce the professionalism of teaching. Participation in PLCs is voluntary act and is based on shared interests, effective communication, trust, and mutual understanding (Hoban, 2005; O'Dowd & Dooly, 2022). Within educational institutions, teachers may create communities to discuss objectives, concerns, and cooperate on curricula development, colleagues' coaching, observation, collaborative teaching, and action research. This approach encourages educators to view themselves as part of a professional community rather than isolated individuals; all working collectively to enhance student learning (O'Dowd & Dooly, 2022). Expanding beyond institutional boundaries, PLCs serve as networking platforms that unite teachers dealing with common learning challenges stemming from global societal, technological, and economic changes.

The internet has played a significant role in creating international virtual communities that support teacher learning. While these virtual learning communities demand substantial time, commitment, and effort, they transcend temporal and geographical constraints. This enables members to engage with individuals from anywhere, at any time, fostering a culture of learning enriched with greater interaction and facilitation. I have personally experienced how online discussion allows teachers to personally reflect on a topic, exchange their insights through a virtual platform, and capture valuable perspectives from their unique contexts, which might differ from those of other members/teachers. The interaction of various personal, social, and contextual factors within these communities holds the promise of enduring learning (Amabile et al., 2001; Awadelkarim, 2023; Tai & Omar, 2023).

In Pakistan, teachers also have the opportunity to engage with online communities worldwide, which plays a crucial role in their informal PD. These communities offer essential peer support, fostering collaborative learning by facilitating the exchange of ideas, insights, and newfound knowledge to enhance each other's learning (Mariam et al., 2023; Tai & Omar, 2023).

Alongside virtual CoPs, SPELT holds a prominent position as a physical learning community in Pakistan. It provides a space for PD, facilitating conversations, debates, and active participation among its members. Within these communities, there are also special interest groups (SIGs) that focus on specific teaching areas, including ESP, literature, research, teacher development, integration of technology in instructions, and, more recently, administration and oversight in language teaching (Mariam et al., 2023).

These communities offer substantial assistance in creating social connections through encouraging informal discussions about valued teaching practices (Tai & Omar, 2023). Nevertheless, the nature of all PD and how it is approached, structured, or implemented differs across locations due to its ties to social, contextual, and cultural elements. The relationship of these elements influences the manifestation of CPD activities, which can vary across different contexts. CPD in Pakistan, for example, may differ in appearance from CPD in other countries or locations. Growing within communities involves both a social activity and a personal inclination, as teachers bring their own experiences and create new identities through shared meanings and relationships with others (O'Dowd & Dooly, 2022). Teacher development in communities differs from the social constructivist perspective, as it emphasises both individual and community growth. It recognises that individuals develop as members of a community, which shapes their opportunities for development (Macià & García, 2016). On the other hand, a social constructivist perspective focuses on individual development through collaborative interactions with others, and it emphasises the importance of social interactions, shared knowledge construction and learning from others. As a result, personal growth within communities is shaped by the community's dynamics and guidelines, thereby playing a role in the continuous advancement of both the community itself and its members. This significantly influences teachers' developmental journeys, their interpretations of effective CPD, and their decisions regarding engagement in available opportunities or other options. This concept of

context-driven teacher development within external and institutional communities, as well as the smaller groups that teachers form, has been the focus of my thesis in comprehending teachers' CPD.

3.6. Elements required for the success of CPD

Numerous researchers have emphasised the significance of participants' motivation within CPD initiatives. For instance, Sinclair (2008) discovered that robust motivation and enthusiasm among teachers led to enhanced dedication to their profession. Similarly, Lee (2011) highlighted the considerable impact of teachers' involvement in decision-making processes on the success of a programme. Wei et al. (2009) argued for the necessity of initiating a CPD programme with a comprehensive needs assessment. Both Lee and Grant advocated for teachers' active participation in the programme's design. From this, it can be inferred that involvement in shaping their CPD is particularly crucial for English teachers since they have previously encountered limitations on their influence in training programmes due to the influence of foreign projects and the involvement of external resource personnel (Al Asmari, 2016). Additionally, aside from considering teachers' expertise and professionalism, there should be a focus on ensuring appropriate levels of challenge and support in their CPD activities.

Thus, the discussion highlights that English teachers' motivation, their active involvement in designing CPD programmes, ensuring alignment between English teachers' needs and CPD initiatives, and promoting collaboration among English teachers are crucial elements for the success of CPD. Additionally, it underscores the significance of considering and incorporating English teachers' perspectives in shaping CPD approaches.

3.6.1 Effective and ineffective CPD programmes and activities

Across the globe, including Pakistan, there has been a noticeable rise in the demand for English teachers' PD to deal with the complex skills and students' needs in the 21st century

(Awadelkarim, 2023; Nooruddin & Bhamani, 2019). Development of innovative forms of instructional methods are necessary to develop students' abilities, such as a deep mastery on higher level content, transferable skills and self-direction (Awadelkarim, 2023; Nooruddin & Bhamani, 2019). As a result, effective CPD opportunities are crucial to help English teachers refine their knowledge delivery methods required to teach these skills. However, many PD initiatives have appeared ineffective in bringing about changes in English teachers' teaching practices and learners' performance. It is understood that teachers' classroom practices are influenced by their professional beliefs (Mann, 2005). These beliefs shape teachers' decisions and actions in the classrooms. Through CPD, teachers are exposed to new ideas and recent developments in their profession. Therefore, it is essential to ensure positive CPD experiences for teachers, as this increases the likelihood that they will continue to learn and implement innovative teaching approaches in their classrooms (Mann & Webb, 2022).

CPD research identifies effective and ineffective PD activities. The effectiveness is evaluated based on two factors: teachers' attitude towards CPD activities and the quality of activities themselves. Numerous studies (Jussim & Eccles, 1992; Sims & Fletcher-Wood, 2021; Tai & Omar, 2023; Van Veen et al., 2012) in the field of CPD have consistently highlighted the importance of strong coordination between developmental activities, English teachers' individual needs, and the overall success of the developmental programmes. Scholars have emphasised that effective CPD activities should be tailored to professionals' specific circumstance and expectations (Lee, 2011; Sims & Fletcher-Wood, 2021; Van Veen et al., 2012). Rahman et al. (2015) conducted a study on scaffolding in CPD for aspiring trainees, arguing that effective professional knowledge can be developed through a collaborative discussion process between the trainer and the trainee, taking into account their shared conversations and expectations.

In the upcoming section, I will outline some principles that the literature recommends policy makers take into account when designing policies and programmes for CPD.

3.6.2 Rigorous, connected and continuing practice

At present, similar to previous years, a significant portion of teachers' CPD programmes in Pakistan tend to be characterised by fragmented training sessions that typically span multiple days and cover diverse and disconnected topics (Raza et al., 2022). For example, assessment, emotional intelligence, digital learning and computer assisted instructions. Additionally, due to such short duration, detached practice training sessions do not provide opportunities to get concrete knowledge of content, produce it and implement it in the real classroom. As a result, they do not provide opportunities to reflect on the outcomes. Numerous researchers have come to the consensus that thoughtful CPD, which allocates substantial time for English teachers to apply their knowledge in planning and implementation, holds a greater potential for impacting teaching and learning practices, resulting in enhanced student learning outcomes (Day, 1999; Rahman, et al., 2015; Warsi & Khurshid, 2022). Thus, to develop English teachers' skills and knowledge and to advance students' skills it is vital that CPD policy should be based on practice connected training sessions, refrain from the episodic nature of CPD, and focus on material which facilitates English teachers' implementation of knowledge in teaching.

3.6.3 Teaching and learning content

Scholars hold the perspective that CPD programmes designed to address everyday challenges in content delivery have a more profound impact compared to those focusing on detached subject matter and educational theories that lack context (Garet et al., 2001; Ur, 2012). Research also notes that English teachers highly value CPD initiatives that emphasise practicality, enhance their grasp of academic content, and mirror their day-to-day classroom activities enabling English teachers to implement these strategies within their professional environments (Garet et al., 2001). In Pakistan, CPD programmes frequently centre on

traditional educational theories, which often struggle to establish relevance to English teachers' everyday teaching practices (Ilyas & Zamir, 2020). Similarly, there is an assumption that English teachers can establish a connection between educational theories and their teaching practices, and consequently structure their teaching approaches around these theories. However, English teachers need solutions, relevance and development in their students' learning through their teaching. Therefore, it is imperative that CPD programmes give direction on teaching and learning of related material.

3.7. Factors affecting the pursuit of CPD

The options for CPD that teachers can select are influenced by societal norms placed on educators, the demands set forth by local, institutional, and global educational bodies, the cultural environment in which teachers operate, and consequently, their individual beliefs and principles.

3.7.1 Social factors

Teaching is a public profession and intensely influenced by social values and expectations (Richardson & Placier, 2001). Therefore, it is crucial for teachers to consistently seek appropriate methods to enhance their teaching and facilitate students' learning, as this constitutes PD. By embracing innovative techniques to navigate multifaceted changes (Mann & Webb, 2022), educators are expected to consistently meet exceptional professional standards and enhance the quality of their students' performance in their respective professional environments. For example, in Pakistani universities where English is approached as a second language and new language methodologies are introduced, teachers are constantly required to adapt to the evolving language landscape in which they work. As a result, they are actively involved in both formal institutional-directed CPD learning and informal self-initiated activities. It is important to note that while CPD can be pursued independently of an institution,

it tends to be more effective when supported and recognised by the institution (Mann & Webb, 2022).

3.7.2 Institutional expectations

In the past, PD in Pakistan was voluntary for teachers with career aspirations. However, today, there is pressure for teachers to pursue specific development programmes, driven by both promotional incentives and the desire to improve teaching quality (Faisal et al., 2019). This shift has far-reaching implications, affecting teachers, learners, institutions, and society at large. The choice of CPD has a notable impact on institutionalisation, where teachers must adhere to an institution's requirements. This differs from Pakistani universities, which focus CPD primarily on achieving promotion rather than holistic learning (Faisal et al., 2019).

Pakistani universities see specific CPD degree programmes as vital to meet global and institutional standards in language teaching, aligning with two decades of educational review and development in the country (Aziz et al., 2020). The HEC is introducing initiatives for teacher development, including funding, training, support, and promotions in language teaching (Aziz et al., 2020).

Incorporating CPD into an institution demonstrates how English teachers engage meaningfully with their teaching contexts, leading to changes in both their practices and beliefs, especially when considering cultural influences (Tai & Omar, 2023). This CPD process is formal, as institutions actively endorse, organise, deliver, and expect participation. Conversely, CPD that is informal, self-directed, and lacks institutional backing is still advantageous for individual English teachers and their institutions, even if it is not officially acknowledged as formal CPD. While CPD can exist independently of an organisation, its effectiveness is often heightened when supported and recognised by the employing institution (Adams & Mann, 2021).

3.7.3 Context and culture related factors

The formation of teacher education programmes is a complex interplay of global factors and local conditions. Amidst this diversity, shared objectives and cross-cultural exchange give rise to common patterns (Tai & Omar, 2023). In less industrialised nations, such as Pakistan, external influences like colonial legacies or international aid significantly shape teacher development, particularly in domains like ELT. It is worth noting that experienced Western teachers have often been instrumental in organising CPD initiatives within Pakistan (Faisal et al., 2019).

Within these varied contexts, the professional growth and learning of English teachers are intrinsically linked to their immediate environment. The organisational ecosystem, including support from administrators and colleagues, plays a pivotal role in their PD. The availability of resources and funding is intimately connected to the socio-economic landscape and the value attributed to CPD. In supportive settings, teachers become self-directed learners, using their professional experiences to progressively refine their skills (Mann & Webb, 2022).

However, the mere act of isolating teachers from their practical environments poses a risk. Such detachment limits the potential for situated learning activities like reflection, inquiry, and action research. Conversely, those engaging in distance education while remaining within their context can bridge theory and practice, contributing to a more comprehensive understanding (Mann & Webb, 2022). The classroom, as a dynamic platform, fosters experimentation, innovation, and enduring growth in both educators and learners, preserving a vibrant teaching practice (Meyer & Turner, 2002; Samad et al., 2021).

All learning takes place within a teacher's professional context, firmly embedded in a collectively shared culture of learning. This culture, encompassing physical surroundings, interactions, affiliations, and even teacher beliefs, is moulded by broader societal norms (Mann & Webb, 2022). A deeper understanding of these educational cultures provides insight into

English teachers' varied approaches to CPD and career progression, encompassing models from applied science to reflective practice (Aziz et al., 2020).

The interplay between institutional and teacher development cultures is intricate and influenced by the broader societal fabric (Muhammad et al., 2023). Cultural factors shaping academic systems impact educators' values and choices. Organisational cultures significantly shape teachers' CPD needs and decisions, echoing the broader cultural milieu (Mann & Webb, 2022). In essence, the realisation of CPD and the choices made are the outcomes of a complex interweaving of stakeholder expectations, institutional requisites, and governmental mandates. Individual teachers' aspirations, contextual demands, available opportunities, and economic factors all converge to shape their CPD journey. The interplay of personal beliefs and values within the socio-cultural, institutional, and community contexts significantly influences decision-making and the spectrum of available opportunities (Mann & Webb, 2022).

This intricate web of factors underscores the dynamic nature of CPD, highlighting its resonance with various contextual dimensions and individual motivations. In summary, the realisation of CPD and the choices made are shaped by stakeholder expectations, institutional requisites, and government authorities' mandates. Individual teachers' aspirations, contextual demands, available opportunities, and economic factors all converge to determine the trajectory of CPD. The interplay of personal beliefs and values within socio-cultural, institutional, and community contexts significantly impacts decision-making and the array of available opportunities (Adams & Mann, 2021).

3.8 Some considerations for teacher-educators

In Asian countries, a prevalent challenge lies in the scarcity of research contextualised to educational CPD programmes. This often results in CPD initiatives relying heavily on Western research, theories, and contexts. Researchers have revealed that CPD events/programmes tend to be more beneficial when participants are actively engaged in shaping and presenting

programmes that cater to their specific needs (Al Asmari, 2016; Hattie, 2008). A needs analysis approach is deemed beneficial for enabling teachers to gain maximum advantages from professional training (Hayes, 2019; Sokel, 2019). Teacher-based scaffolding (TBS) (Rahman et al., 2015), an ongoing teacher training research model, centres on teachers' needs and involvement. This model encourages teachers to reflect on their strengths and weaknesses, fostering the selection of strategies to address shortcomings.

Recognising the interplay of theory and practice in education, teacher educators must appreciate their reciprocal relationship, both positively influencing teachers and their instructional methods (Adams & Mann, 2021; Mann, 2005; Mann & Webb, 2022). Consequently, CPD could incorporate theoretical input that directly addresses identified needs, integrating explicit activities enabling teachers to discuss theoretical foundations. This well-rounded approach may fuse theory and practice, facilitating the planning and implementation of teaching concepts. Additionally, it may encompass follow-up sessions for reflective consideration. Collaboration and active participation are supported by close coordination between teacher educators and participants.

The process can also include systematic classroom observations, aiding teacher educators in monitoring progress throughout the CPD journey. Aligning CPD objectives and activities with institutional policies reinforces consistency. Encouraging a culture of experimentation within institutions permits teachers to trial novel teaching approaches in their classrooms. Discussion groups play a vital role, providing an avenue for teachers to exchange ideas while offering ongoing support and follow-up (Raza & Coombe, 2022).

Research by Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) and Sims and Fletcher-Wood (2021) found some widely shared characteristics of effective CPD programmes, such as provision of coaching and expert support, opportunities for reflection, sustained duration, role related contexts, use of

models of effective practices, collaboration, content focused activities and the use of adult learning theory incorporating active learning.

3.9 Research on teachers' experiences of CPD

As previously highlighted in preceding chapters, there exists a notable gap in research concerning the CPD experiences of English teachers in HE and their PD in the context of Pakistan. In this section, I investigate the recent teacher development research findings, which primarily revolve around teachers' perspectives on PD, the prevalent CPD activities, and overarching issues linked with PD. Additionally, I also examine recommendations put forth by various researchers to enhance and ensure the sustainability of CPD within educational institutions. Moreover, the common methodology employed to investigate teachers' perceptions and experiences is also explored in detail.

The available CPD literature in Pakistani context shows that there is not much research on PD, and the existing research mostly focuses on describing teaching philosophies, course content, and teachers' experiences (Tan et al., 2023; Awan, 2022). The limited amount of empirical research can be seen as a justification for my argument that the exploration of English teachers' learning culture within PD has been relatively underrepresented in academic studies. Furthermore, the research conducted by Garner and Bedford (2021) supports my viewpoint. There is minimal evidence of a research-driven connection between teachers' qualifications and their actual teaching practices. In Pakistan, particularly, the emphasis on qualifications for teaching English is lacking (Awan, 2022; Shamim, 2011). Therefore, English teachers tend to depend on attempting approaches and observing if that worked (sometimes this persistence remains even when no strategy proves effective) (Awan, 2022). Until English teachers begin considering CPD as a subject of study and adopt a more evidence-driven approach towards CPD activities, progress in improving language teaching skills will remain limited. Making English teachers' practices explicit by portraying their understanding of CPD experiences can

provide platforms that could be evaluated, assessed and applied in the professional lives of other English teachers (Holloway et al., 2018). Aligning experience-based evidence with research supported practice could enhance English teachers' understanding of CPD. By sharing their experiences throughout their careers, English teachers can accumulate a collection of successful teaching methods that could lead to innovative techniques.

3.9.1 Quality of university teachers

To gain a comprehensive insight into the perception of CPD among university English teachers, it is essential to delve into their relationship with and inclination towards this concept. The educational landscape in Pakistan features a well-established HE system comprising both public and private universities. With a total of 170 universities distributed across the private and government sectors, the system caters to a student population of approximately 1.3 million (Zia et al., 2023). This educational framework has witnessed substantial growth, evident in its ongoing expansion (Qaisra & Haider, 2023), which offers a unique chance to assess the role and effect of CPD initiatives in the evolving Pakistani HE scenario.

In the context of Pakistan's educational and socio-economic milieu, the role of university teachers holds immense significance. They are entrusted with the responsibility of nurturing graduates equipped with critical, communicative, and analytical skills that align with societal and professional demands. Despite this pivotal role, there exist considerable criticisms concerning the quality of language teaching within HEIs and its relevance to employability skills. Research findings point out weak connections between university PD programmes and their practical outcomes (Siddiqui et al., 2021). Additionally, Mariam et al. (2023) highlighted a mismatch between the skills fostered through HE PD programmes and the actual needs of teachers in terms of both level and nature. Aziz et al. (2020) further emphasised the inadequacy of teaching and research skills imparted through these programmes, thereby impeding teachers' professional success.

Over the past two decades, the Pakistani government has acknowledged the pivotal role of teacher education quality in enhancing ELT within HE and student performance. However, as mentioned earlier, a significant proportion of university teachers fail to meet these standards, particularly those working in rural and remote areas (Nawab, 2017).

3.9.2 English language teachers' perceptions of continuous professional development

Existing research suggests that English teachers' understanding of CPD can be classified into different categories: the development of skills and subject knowledge (Warsi & Khurshid, 2022), critical thinking, collaborative problem-solving skills, and a reflective approach (Elhussain & Khoja, 2020). Interestingly, there appears to be a discrepancy between the CPD activities deemed significant by teachers and those valued by institutions. Notably, institutions where teachers are employed may not fully recognise or acknowledge the value of learning opportunities that arise from everyday practice as CPD (Helate et al., 2022). This discrepancy often shapes the prevailing trends in CPD activities pursued by English teachers. Based on the findings of a study by Khan and Abdullah (2019), personal satisfaction is the reason English teachers engage in CPD. In addition, English language competency increases job satisfaction. Further to the reasons for CPD, some of the literature on PD (Ali & Rasheed, 2021; Fazal et al., 2019; Shah et al., 2020) indicates female English teachers' strong inclination for CPD in contrast to their male counterparts. One prominent factor behind this trend could be the societal notion that teaching is a more fitting profession for women when contrasted with other fields. Moreover, Pakistani women in the workforce are motivated to achieve independence and validate their capabilities in their careers. In a broader context, PD has demonstrated its efficacy in enhancing teachers' skill development (Awadelkarim, 2023).

3.9.3 Popular CPD activities

Recent research exploring the favoured CPD activities among English teachers highlights a prevailing inclination towards engaging in INSET programmes organised by their institutions.

These programmes can take the form of internal CPD offerings conducted in-house or external CPD opportunities facilitated off-site or in the institution itself (Helate et al., 2022). Typical instances of such activities encompass attending conferences, seminars, short courses, online events and workshops. Additionally, English teachers demonstrate a preference for CPD involvement through pursuits like reading professional literature, subscribing to field journals, enrolling in online courses, and maintaining membership of professional groups (Zhang et al., 2023). These findings indicate the diverse avenues English teachers seek to enhance their PD, emphasising the importance of access to various learning opportunities and resources within and beyond their institutions.

It is intriguing to note that numerous studies underscore a rising interest among teachers to partake in informal and more social/interactive learning within their work environments. These communal initiatives, grounded in professional communities, encompass learning derived from on-the-job experiences and engagement in reflective practice (Zhang et al., 2023). Collaborative reflective discussion comes to the fore through activities like writing and discussing self-reports (Zhang et al., 2023), participation in study groups (Lee, 2011), or embarking on collaborative teacher research (Borg, 2015). The digital realm is not left untouched, and English teachers have significant interest in online networking (Poon, 2013). The essence of these collaborative endeavours, as highlighted in these studies, lies in affording practitioners the platform to exchange experiences with peers and colleagues (Poon, 2013). Through professional dialogues, teachers collectively introspect on their professional experiences, cultivate awareness, and consequently make their individual professional learning journeys transparent to themselves, culminating in transformative change (Al Asmari, 2016). However, the feasibility of collaborative activities appears contingent upon the presence of a supportive professional culture that encourages professional discourse among teachers (Prestridge & Main, 2018). Generally, teachers are found to engage in CPD facilitated by their

workplaces due to personal development aspirations and often to rejuvenate themselves during the mid-stages of their careers (Prestridge & Main, 2018). Practical considerations also come into play, including the availability of financial support for offered CPD opportunities (Prestridge & Main, 2018), seeking relief from established professional routines, and factors such as convenient timing, dates, and course/event duration. Additionally, the knowledge of the seminar or workshop facilitator's identity influences decisions to participate (Awadelkarim, 2023).

Moreover, there is an evident inclination towards accredited INSET courses driven by teachers' personal interest (Khan & Abdullah, 2019). Financial incentives and the prospect of enhancing personal status through CPD, along with the prospect of intellectual stimulation, are also cited as motivating factors (Khan & Abdullah, 2019).

Among the various practices discussed in the CPD literature, experiential learning and learner-centred approaches take centre stage, closely trailed by language teaching materials development and workshops (Bayram & Canaran, 2018). The portrayal of CPD in the literature goes beyond being a mere tool for mastering teaching skills or acquiring knowledge from a course. Instead, it emerges as a determinant that necessitates active participation and collaboration in learning activities (Bayram & Canaran, 2018). As such, CPD is predominantly presented as a vehicle for delivering practical and profession-based development opportunities for English teachers.

Even within the constraints of relatively brief academic terms, CPD opportunities should introduce teachers to the intricacies of planning and executing training by involving them directly in tasks like generating, analysing, and interpreting opportunities. This engagement aims to equip them with skills, competence, and, most importantly, a tangible sense of involvement in the activity itself (Bayram & Canaran, 2018; Salifu & Agbenyega, 2016).

3.9.4 Factors impacting CPD

Research conducted on the CPD experiences of English teachers extensively explores the challenges they encounter in pursuing their personal PD (Aziz et al., 2020). Among these challenges, the issue of standardised CPD programmes offered by institutions comes into focus. This standardised approach is examined and criticised on the grounds that it fails to cater to the individual development needs of teachers. While it aims to leverage the collective capacity of the entire staff to enhance student achievement (Mann & Webb, 2022), standardised CPD overlooks the distinctive development requirements of each teacher. This is due to its top-down compulsory nature for the career development of permanent teachers (Khan & Abdullah, 2019), and its failure to acknowledge the current knowledge, practices, and needs of teachers (Mann, 2005; Mann & Walsh, 2017). Mann and Webb (2022) aptly describe standardised CPD as a 'one size fits all' model, which can foster negative perceptions among teachers regarding CPD. Guided by educational specialists, standardised CPD events/activities are crafted in accordance with externally established criteria, often influenced by education ministers or governing bodies. These criteria are then implemented through institution-wide development plans and performance targets for teachers (Mann & Webb, 2022). However, as teachers embark on CPD programmes, they bring along their current experiences, practices, viewpoints, insights, and concerns about the intricate nature of their profession (Al Asmari, 2016). Considering this diversity in experiences, it can be contended that teachers' individual needs are likely to differ (Mann & Webb, 2022).

As a result, standardised CPD can become overly prescriptive, limiting teachers' autonomy to tailor their development according to their unique requirements (Bates & Morgan, 2018). Additionally, this approach fails to effectively tap into teachers' wealth of experiences as valuable resources that could enrich the learning process for all participants (Mann, 2005; Mann & Webb, 2022).

Recent studies consistently highlight various challenges faced by teachers in their pursuit of CPD. These challenges include a lack of autonomy, frequently noted lack of time for CPD outside of working hours (Nawab, 2017; Tahira et al., 2020), insufficient resources, including inadequate funding (Shamim, 2018), overwhelming workloads, unfavourable working conditions at institutions, or absence of accessible CPD offerings (Shamim, 2018). Generally, these factors create a tension between the distinct needs of individual teachers, the broader professional setting requirements, and the institutional demands (Shamim, 2018).

Consequently, this tension often leads to a perception among teachers, as highlighted in research by Asmari (2016) and Bates and Morgan (2018), that their voices go unheard, and their specific development needs are not adequately considered in the planning of their CPD activities. As various researchers suggest, such conflicts of individual teachers and their institutions can foster an environment that is not beneficial for effective learning (Awan, 2022; Gravani & John, 2005; Raza & Coombe, 2022). This, in turn, can impact teacher dedication and inspiration. A study by Yuan et al. (2022), delving into the life stories of teachers, reveals that market-driven and managerial approaches in education influence the cultivation of a performance-oriented culture, thereby significantly emphasising the importance of CPD.

Research places strong emphasis on teacher-centred approaches in CPD, with scholars like Akram et al. (2020), Bayram and Canaran (2018), Grant (1986) and Bates and Morgan (2018) advocating for alignment with teachers' specific contexts. Addressing teachers' content knowledge (CK) has been a recurring goal, exemplified by Rahman et al.'s (2015) study. This research assessed CPD programmes aimed at enhancing teachers' CK, particularly in ELT. Rahman et al. (2015) examined a CPD initiative designed to elevate English teachers' CK. The study employed different PD models, common in developing countries, across three experimental groups. While all models led to improved ELT, the TBS model emerged as the most effective and encompasses two phases: orientation and induction. The orientation phase

involves identifying teachers' needs through a needs analysis, while the induction phase encourages self-confidence, motivation and self-reliance. Facilitators guide focus group discussions, addressing challenges participants face.

The TBS model also incorporates assessment and feedback. Participants return to focus groups if their progress is not substantial, iterating until mastery is achieved. This step-by-step CPD approach underscores the significance of needs analysis, ongoing support, professional discussions, and a teacher-centred training model. It also highlights challenges faced by English teachers in resource-constrained environments, hindering their professional growth. This study prompts further research into English teachers' CPD and underscores the broader importance of teacher training.

This discussion underscores the necessity of meticulous needs analysis when crafting CPD programmes. Organisers and educators must conduct thorough assessments before implementing CPD initiatives for English teachers. It also reinforces the importance of acknowledging English teachers' beliefs about CPD and their aspirations, shaping effective language teaching practices.

3.10 Ways to improve CPD effectiveness as suggested in the literature

Collaborative learning approaches are frequently highlighted as a central recommendation in recent studies on teachers' CPD experiences. These studies emphasise the importance of allocating adequate resources, ensuring the connection of learning programmes to the teaching context, and creating opportunities for practicing new learning within the context. Additionally, allocating sufficient time for reflection through professional dialogues is stressed (Aziz et al., 2020; Elhussain & Khoja, 2020; Kitchen, 2022).

Institutions are urged to establish a meaningful environment conducive to workplace learning and development. This requires recognising that teachers have distinct professional backgrounds and diverse learning needs (Kitchen, 2022). Iqbal et al. (2023) and Shankar (2023)

propose granting teachers' autonomy and choice in selecting CPD activities, fostering collaboration, open communication, critical thinking, and analysis. Such an approach broadens the range of references for self-assessment and increases motivation for both self-directed and institution mandated CPD (Iqbal et al., 2023; Shankar, 2023).

Successful CPD within institutions is associated with specific leadership factors, as outlined by Iqbal et al. (2023). These factors include a shared belief in the purpose of CPD, supportive institution policies for novel teaching techniques, and an environment that fosters innovation and experimentation. Giving teachers space and time to share ideas, manageable workloads, and sufficient resources also contributes to an enabling institutional environment. Building such an environment involves cultivating a unique institutional culture that caters to the specific context (Iqbal et al., 2023).

Shankar (2023) advocates for granting teachers the chance to engage in reflection and decision-making regarding their own CPD. This approach not only acknowledges them as knowledge creators but also empowers them to have a say in their development planning. This process also acts as a form of needs analysis for teacher educators. As supported by Hoban (2005), involving teachers in decision-making enhances their commitment, as evident in studies by Gravani and John (2005) and Shankar (2023).

Creating a conducive environment for collaborative learning, as proposed by researchers, involves establishing interpersonal networks and teacher learning communities that prioritise the progress and growth of community members (Amponsah et al., 2023; Tai & Omar, 2023). Strong, supportive communities within teacher education programmes, as highlighted by Tai and Omar (2023) and Manan et al. (2023), offer safe spaces for examining tensions. Kitchen (2022) emphasises how such processes within CoPs foster mutual respect and dedicated time among members. Institutionalising collaborative mechanisms within work communities, as recommended by Amponsah et al. (2023), provides structured support within institutions.

To seamlessly integrate collaborative CPD into institutional plans, policies and practices must cultivate a culture of trust within educational institutions and the wider community, as proposed by Godinez Martinez (2022). These policies should empower teachers by giving them control over and opportunities to formulate relevant CPD plans (Godínez Martínez, 2022). Only then, as per Amponsah et al. (2023), can CPD effectively drive practice change and address the interconnectedness among individual practitioners, institutions, and the broader system, directly or indirectly influenced by CPD outcomes.

In a nutshell, Siddiqui et al. (2021) and Shankar (2023) provide a comprehensive perspective for more effective teacher education and CPD. They argue that well-structured pedagogical and administrative training programmes can enhance teachers' performance, subsequently improving education quality. Both pre- and in-service CPD programmes are recommended to enhance faculty's knowledge, skills, and abilities, ultimately boosting their academic, pedagogical, and administrative capabilities. This improvement in performance contributes to an overall enhancement in educational quality, addressing emerging issues and challenges within the HE system.

In conclusion, the desire for reassurance regarding the quality of CPD is evident, as observed by Godinez Martinez (2022) and Shankar (2023). Teachers seek validation through accreditation of the training programmes and internal evaluation system. To address this concern, institutions can take a proactive approach. Godinez Martinez (2022) and Shankar (2023) recommend institutions invest in offering accredited CPD programmes. Furthermore, institutions should consider providing financial incentives, formal recognition, and opportunities for promotion to teachers who effectively accomplished and successfully apply the knowledge gained from CPD programmes (Al Asmari, 2016). This holistic approach not only ensures the quality of CPD but also acknowledges and rewards the dedication of educators to continuous professional growth.

3.11 Summary of the chapter

This chapter aimed to clarify the distinction between CPD and PD by drawing on existing scholarly work. Following this, I elaborated on various traditional viewpoints regarding training and development, as well as the diverse formal and informal approaches to professional learning found in scholarly studies. A brief overview of potential CPD strategies was also provided. The chapter concludes with an exploration of the institutional, societal, cultural, and contextual factors that influence CPD, followed by insights from current research into teachers' CPD perspectives.

In brief, the review of the literature indicates that the CPD process in Pakistan is complex in many ways. The definition and personal perception of CPD, and its impact on various stakeholders, and the importance of English language and its treatment in practice are difficult issues to be solved if practice-oriented research is carried out. It also shows the need for specific guidelines of CPD to cope with CPD issues. In the next chapter I present the methodology adopted in this project.

In summary, the literature review indicates the complexity of the CPD process in Pakistan. Challenges include defining and perceiving CPD, understanding its impact on stakeholders, and addressing ELT practices. These issues highlight the importance of practice-oriented research and the need for specific CPD guidelines. The next chapter outlines the methodology employed in this study.

Chapter Four: The research design and methodology

Introduction

The aims of the current study are to explore Pakistani university English teachers' understanding of their CPD through NI into the context. To fulfil these aims this chapter is designed to provide a rationale behind the research design of the current study. It is organised into eight sections, each addressing specific aspects related to the research design. In the first section, before describing any methodological stance, I present a brief backdrop of Pakistan, its language policy and importance of English teachers and English as the language of development. This section aims to refresh earlier information for better comprehension of the chapter and to contextualise the research questions. The second section explains why a qualitative-narrative approach is used in this study. It includes a discussion of the theoretical underpinnings supporting this approach and clarifies my role as a researcher within the study. The third section outlines the overall structure and methodology of the research design, highlighting the specific research methods used including the data collection process, virtual interviewing, documents as data resources and reflective journals as data collection tools. This section also delves into the justification for utilising specific methods of research. In the fourth section, I discuss the pilot study conducted as part of the research. This includes insights into its purpose, the sampling process, and any issues encountered during the piloting stage and how they were overcome. Section five focuses on describing the research sites, sampling methods, and participants involved in the main study. It also elucidates how the research sites were chosen and the criteria utilised for participants. The sixth section describes an overview of the main study, detailing any amendments made to the participant recruitment process. It further explains the sampling methods employed and provides a rationale for these choices. In section seven, I present specific details about the quality of the research and the measures taken

to maintain it throughout the study. This includes considerations of data validity, reliability and generalisability. The final section discusses the trustworthiness of the research findings. It elaborates on the steps taken to ensure credibility, dependability and transferability of the research outcomes.

In brief, this chapter aims to provide a comprehensive account of the informed decisions made in the research design of this study. It considers research issues, personal inclinations and various investigative approaches to establish a solid foundation for the study's methodology.

4.1. Background

In the multicultural society of Pakistan, English was maintained as an official language after independence in 1947. Initially, Urdu was also declared as the national and official language but due to the lack of material (corpus planning)⁵ it only had the status of an official language (Zaidi, 2023). This policy of treating English as the main language of correspondence created many divisions in Pakistani society because those who speak English are more privileged. As a result, it has been used and taught as a foreign language (EFL), a second Language (ESL), for Academic Purpose (EAP), and as a lingua-franca.

Pakistan is a federation of various provinces with different languages in each one. Like other multilingual countries, Pakistan has also evolved a language policy which has a three-language structure with a distinct major communication role played by each language. These roles are identified in research (Gul & Channa, 2022; Haidar et al., 2022; Tahseen et al., 2022). First, as mother tongue languages of the same group or community (e.g., Sindhi, Punjabi, Pushto, Balochi). Second, for communication with people out of the group (e.g., the national language, Urdu) and third, communication in official correspondence, academia and the workplace

⁵ In sociolinguistics, corpus planning is a deliberate effort to engineer changes in the structure of a language to influence the function and create standard forms.

(English). Therefore, every Pakistani as a member of a multilingual society and, to contribute to every field of life, is obliged to acquire the necessary skills in their home language, Urdu and English. It is the responsibility of the educational system to provide the required competency to every individual.

After establishing English as an official language in 1947, the people running the government were trained to do their work in English. Therefore, it was inevitable for the maintenance of the system to learn English. Additionally, it was not difficult to convince the population regarding the usefulness of the language. English was already established at that time and was ready to play its crucial role in the structures of power, dominance, achievement and as a sign of competency.

On the other hand, Urdu was declared as the language of education as early as 1948. However, as there was a lack of corpus planning for HE material, Urdu was restricted to secondary education (Zaidi, 2023). In addition to the Urdu medium schools, some English medium schools were allowed to continue for an effective educational system. Thus, two systems appeared. Urdu medium schools use Urdu as the primary language of instruction, while English medium schools use English. This diversity reflects an effort to accommodate different language preferences in the educational system.

The debate or controversy around these two languages remains alive today and the number of English medium schools, colleges and universities has increased with investment from the private sector. Due to the costs, the gap in the class system has widened and created various competency levels among individuals. Research by Usman et al. (2023) and Rehman (2020) shows a great deal of discrimination between Urdu medium and English medium students in relation to job opportunities and attitudes of the employers. Employers clearly display a bias in favour of English medium students. The motivation and inclination towards English learning and education is preferred over all other languages as a compulsory subject and a medium of

instruction. As a result, this inclination for English learning has created great opportunities for ELT (Raza & Coombe, 2022). However, in the HE sectors, due to various educational, social, cultural and teacher training issues (Awan, 2022), graduates from public and private universities exhibit completely different levels of confidence, competence and skills.

Noticing the essential role of English language, the responsibility of the educational system increased for the maintenance of an effective status of English. In 1990, the government tried to justify its sincerity with regard to English language by introducing it as a compulsory subject in primary schools, thus, providing the poor the same opportunity that was available to the privileged classes (Fareed et al., 2018). However, the success of such policies has been questioned. The lack of trained teachers was one of the major reasons for this. Thus, the implementation of the policy and results achieved are doubtful.

Further, ELT also has the more prominent status in the country owing to its role in the society, and the country's colonial legacy (Raza & Coombe, 2022). Compared to other Asian countries, as English is an official language, the boundaries between EFL and ESL are blurred, and methods of teaching are often outdated. The majority of educational institutions are still using only the GTM (Gul & Channa, 2022). Moreover, in English departments, English language is taught through literature only. In 2004, the government initiated the hiring of international organisations such as the British Council for delivering CPD training in Pakistan. However, these organisations delivered material that was not appropriate for the local cultural context (Rahman, 2020), therefore, they have had little impact on classroom practices (Akram, et al., 2020). Research also shows no or little organisational support for English teachers' CPD (Gul & Channa, 2022; Haidar et al., 2022; Tahseen et al., 2022). These studies have shown that CPD is carried out in a way that rarely meets the needs of teachers.

More importantly the instructional methods follow top-down approaches. Content and the pedagogy of CPD training is imposed by the HEC rather than designed by English teachers

(Khan & Abdullah, 2019). One of the important features of top-down CPD training is the one-shot sessions or small series of workshops or training sessions; and the focus of such training is only to introduce English teachers to theoretical knowledge and CPD training, material. In addition, the methods are ready-made and not tailored according to the contextual demands, unlike the transactional dissemination model of knowledge which is a true reflection of teaching, learning and beliefs in the developed world (Raza & Coombe, 2022).

Additionally, like most classroom pedagogies in developing countries, Pakistani ESL teaching is driven by the notion of teacher-centredness (Raza & Coombe, 2022). Expectations from teachers are that they bring about change in student learning outcomes by providing a healthy learning environment where learning can occur even if this is not actually the case. Moreover, due to the non-egalitarian nature of society, classroom practices are teacher-centred (Rahman, 2020).

By presenting this whole scenario I aim to show the complex nature of social, cultural, educational, political, and psychological ingredients of ELT and learning in Pakistan which impact every learning/teaching situations, training, policy and implementation.

Due to the above-mentioned elements and impediments, this study aims to explore English teachers' understanding of their CPD. Given the decision to investigate this question with English teachers in four university English departments, in terms of how they comprehend their CPD, how it can enable them in sense-making, and how it constructs their identity, the project aims to identify the central characteristics that underpin the practice of English teachers' CPD and develop a methodological set of guidelines to inform learning and teaching in the universities.

4.2. Research questions

There were four research questions that this study addressed:

5. How do the participants understand CPD and their need for professional development?
6. How do specific environmental factors in ELT in Pakistani universities contribute to the professional growth of the participants?
7. What are the most significant factors contributing to or deterring the development of independent academic professional knowledge/growth?
8. What are the significant aspects characterising the early and later years of these English teachers' professions?

4.3 Qualitative inquiry

In this section, I begin by defining qualitative research and comparing it to quantitative research. Then, I set out my ontological and epistemological position. Finally, I discuss the interpretive approach and how this relates to the present study.

According to Denzin and Lincoln (1995) qualitative research has a multimethod focus that involves an interpretive approach to the phenomenon under study. This approach aligns with my study in a sense that my focus is understanding English teachers' CPD. Being multi-focused, qualitative research is a process of inquiry that seeks an in-depth understanding of social phenomena within their natural setting. In my project, it focuses on why CPD is important to English teachers and relies on their direct experiences as meaning-making agents in their professional lives (Glesne, 2016). Additionally, this type of research is a form of social action that focuses on the way people interpret and make sense of their experiences to understand the social reality of the individual. It makes use of interviews, diaries, journals, classroom observations and immersion, and open-ended questions (Smythe & Giddings, 2007).

4.3.1. Quantitative and qualitative research

Portraying quantitative and qualitative stances as opposite to one another is perhaps not very accurate (King et al., 2018) as the increased use of mixed methods clearly suggests the

importance of both approaches. However, there are some broad ways in which qualitative differ from quantitative approaches. In this section I will introduce some terms needed to understand, at least at a basic level, to justify my choice of qualitative research.

Quantitative research supports a realist ontology, and qualitative research has its roots more in critical realist and relativist approaches (Creswell & Poth, 2016; Creswell & Poth, 2017; Glesne, 2016). Theory and philosophical understanding influence what we believe is known or can be known and such beliefs and understanding then impact the way we gather and make sense of information. For example, if someone believes that genetic inheritance controls human behaviour, they will not choose to use qualitative research to explore the phenomenon. In contrast, if someone wants to see a social and interactive explanation of behaviour then qualitative research would align with their ontological position. Thus, research is connected and our ontological position and beliefs impact upon what we think of as knowledge (Swain & King, 2022).

The above discussion reveals the difference between the two research approaches and the decision to use one or the other. It is the assumptions underlying the research that distinguish one choice from the other, although in terms of practical use of these approaches the boundary is permeable, particularly in reference to specific methods. Quantitative research mainly involves positivist and post-positivist assumptions. In contrast, qualitative research exclusively rests around assumptions about interpretation and human activity. In this research, I was interested in English teachers' understanding of CPD, not in the prediction about CPD and how to control any element of the study.

In other words, within qualitative research, it can be assumed that reality is not something that is separate from the human experience. Instead, reality is constructed through repeated social discourses (in this case, interviews). Further, since qualitative research is not grounded in a positivist framework, it was not the aim of this study to seek an ultimate truth; rather, the

purpose was to discover meaning as described from the perspective of the participants (Smythe & Giddings, 2007). Put another way, in qualitative research, it can be assumed that there are multiple ways of constructing truth and reality. Such ways do not have to be ascribed with labels of right or wrong.

Briefly, the approach adopted in this study rests on my aim to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD, the level of information sought, the source of information, and the direct experiences of English teachers as meaning making agents in their lives.

4.3.2 Ontology and epistemology of the study

Having initiated my study with the aim of understanding English teachers' perceptions about the phenomenon of CPD and their related experiences, I assumed that the nature of reality (ontology) is subjective and that multiple realities exist. Based on personal experiences, individuals may interpret different subjective meanings of reality even in relation to the same phenomenon of CPD. From an ontological perspective, my investigation is thus aimed at understanding and interpreting how English teachers within a particular context make sense of CPD.

Epistemology explores the relationship between the inquirer and the knower. The aim of this research requires a subjective epistemology where, as a researcher and a respondent, I can create an understanding of the phenomenon under study. Cocreated understanding implies a kind of interaction between the researcher and participants through interviewing, and this is the interactive nature of epistemology (Guba & Lincoln, 1994).

According to Glesne (2016) meaning and knowledge is socially constructed in that it arises out of interactions between individuals and their world (epistemology) hence, I assumed that it is only through interacting with participants that I would be able to uncover their understanding about their CPD experiences. Some social constructivists (Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Neuman & Blundo, 2000; Ryan & Schwandt, 2002) concur that individuals' understandings of the world

in which they live, and work are subjective, varied, multiple and are formed through interactions with others in the same context. The emphasis in my study is thus on English teachers' views of the phenomenon of CPD, the processes of interaction among them and the specific contexts in which participants live and work (Lewis, 2015) .

My approach involves seeing the CPD phenomenon through the eyes of participants and then placing this understanding **within** my own theoretical framework of the phenomenon of CPD. Finally, I reconsider the participants' perspective with the goal of trying to define, unravel, reveal, or explain the world. My understanding, I acknowledge, is likely to be biased by my own world view. However, I attempt to review the data critically and as objectively as possible with the aim of following information that emerges through participants' accounts and without being influenced by my own prejudices.

I thus expect to “interpret phenomenon in terms of the meanings participants bring to them” (Denzin & Lincoln, 1995:2), and consequently require a research approach that will allow me to do this. In the following sections, I will first explain the paradigms of interpretivism and constructivism, and then explain the choice of my study paradigm.

4.3.3 Interpretivism and constructivism

In this NI exploring the understanding of CPD among English language teachers in Pakistani universities, the theoretical underpinnings of constructivism, interpretivism, and socio-cultural theory play pivotal roles in shaping both the research design and data analysis. Constructivism, particularly, serves as a guiding theory, emphasising that individuals construct their own knowledge and understanding of the world through experiences and reflection. This philosophy resonates deeply with the objectives of this study, as it seeks to uncover how English teachers perceive and engage with CPD within their professional contexts (Coe et al. (2021; Omodan, 2022).

Throughout the research process, the principles of constructivism were operationalised, facilitating an environment where participants were encouraged to reflect on their experiences and articulate their perspectives on CPD. This was evident in the co-construction of interview narratives, where the interaction between researcher and participant served as a catalyst for meaning making. Apart from the initial interview, the subsequent sessions became collaborative endeavours, wherein the unique experiences and insights of the participants were foregrounded, aligning with the constructivist notion of knowledge acquisition through immersion in content (Glesne, 2016).

Furthermore, the interpretivist lens adopted in this study acknowledges the subjective nature of reality and emphasises the importance of understanding individuals' lived experiences within their specific socio-cultural contexts. By adopting an interpretive approach, the research delves deep into the subjective interpretations and meanings that English teachers attribute to their CPD experiences. Through this lens, the study seeks to unravel the complexities inherent in how individuals navigate and make sense of their PD journeys (Swain & King, 2022).

Epistemologically, this research embraces the notion of multiple truths and realities, recognizing that each participant brings forth a unique perspective shaped by their personal histories, contexts, and negotiations of experiences. By situating the study within the interpretivist and constructivist paradigms, the aim is not to capture a singular truth but rather to understand the diverse ways in which English teachers conceptualize and engage with CPD (Denzin & Lincoln, 1995).

Methodologically, the research design aligns closely with the principles of NI, wherein the focus is on listening, interpreting, and retelling participants' accounts in a meaningful manner. Through NI, the study aims to unravel the intricacies of how English teachers perceive their CPD needs, identify affordances and barriers, and undergo professional transformation. Each

narrative is treated as a rich source of data, offering insights into the contextualized realities of CPD (Lewis, 2015; Denzin & Lincoln, 1995), within the Pakistani university context.

To ensure rigor and trustworthiness, methodological safeguards such as transparency of methods and triangulation techniques are employed. Multiple data sources, including interviews and documents, are triangulated to enhance the credibility and validity of the findings (Denzin & Lincoln, 1995). Further questions related to the quality of research are addressed in section 4.11.

While the context-driven nature of the study limits the generalisability of the findings to other contexts, the rich insights garnered provide valuable contributions to the understanding of CPD practices among English language teachers in Pakistani universities. By embracing the interdependence of epistemology, ontology, methodology, and methods, this research endeavours to offer a nuanced understanding of how English teachers construct meaning around their CPD experiences within their socio-cultural contexts.

4.4 Narrative inquiry

In this section, I present an overview of how NI has been adopted and treated in education, the definition of NI, Narrative analysis and analysis of narrative, dimensions of NI and my aim and NI for PD.

4.4.1 Narrative inquiry in educational research

In this section I present a brief overview of how NI has been adopted and treated in education. Though it was not a new concept, Connelly and Clandinin were the pioneers who introduced NI in the educational research field in 1990. Dewey's (1938) notion that life is education (as cited in Muhit, 2013) was the basis of their conceptualisation of NI. They were interested in lived experiences of life and the way experiences are lived. Prior to Connelly and Clandinin's work in 1990, the concept of NI had been approached in various ways. For instance, MacIntyre's (1981) idea of narrative unity (as cited in Gallagher, 2014), Mitchell's narratology

(1981), (as cited in Bialostosky, 1989), the understanding of narrative analysis by Polkinghorne (1988), and literary notions of narrative by Coles (1989) have all contributed to the diverse perspectives on NI. Connelly and Clandinin (1990) developed their idea based on all these notions, and they conceptualised NI as a method and a phenomenon. Connelly and Clandinin established NI's importance in educational research as a method that brings together imaginary ideas related to human life as educational experiences.

4.4.2 Definition of narrative inquiry

To explore the complexities of NI as a research methodology for this study, it is imperative to offer a definition of this term; NI is not simply another in a cadre of qualitative research strategies; researchers often use words in their analysis process, and they collect and construct stories about their participants. But there are some markings that distinguish narrative researchers or their methods. The common feature is that they study a story, narrative or a series of events. They usually assume that the story or narrative is one of the fundamental units of human experience. But what counts as the story or narrative, is the type of stories they select to explore, or the variety of methods they use for exploration. Within the boundaries of a narrative research framework, researchers utilise several research strategies, methods and approaches (Lieblich et al., 1998).

The focus in NI is varied; some researchers (Mendieta, 2013) use concepts from narrative such as characterisation, theme, plotline, role and other literary terms to analyse and make sense of experience. Others employ a sociolinguistic analytic framework to analyse data as journal notes and interviews and develop a general sense of narrative as learning or everyday experience in a culture (Josselson, 1996; Polanyi, 1995). Some researchers treat narrative as fundamental to cognition (Schank, 1990). Others may explore the impact of specific narratives on experience or may codify data into numbers and use numeric values or they may analyse the factors involved during storytelling events as a determiner of subject matter of interest (Pasupathi,

2003). Ultimately, narrative researchers' main aim is to investigate human experience and present it in a meaningful way for learning and development.

Narrative researchers utilise narrative in one way or another in their exploration and embrace narrative as both the method and phenomenon to study. Thus, NI begins in the narration of lived and told experience. The chosen method and the inquiry always have experiential starting points that are informed by the literature intertwined in the methodology and understanding of experiences with which the researcher began (Clandinin & Huber, 2002). In essence, NI is a reconstruction of a person's experience in relationship to the social setting (Clandinin & Huber, 2002).

After presenting the definition of NI, I will present the debates around NI that will help to clarify my focus and method.

4.4.3 Narrative analysis and analysis of narrative concepts

Polkinghorne (1995) distinguishes between narrative analysis and analysis of narrative. In one form of analysis, data are collected and organised to create a narrative with a unified plot, as a form of explanation of the phenomenon under study. In the second form of the analysis, data are collected from participants and analysed for common elements, such as metaphors, phrase, and pattern to identify the concepts and general themes. Following Polkinghorne (1995), the analysis of narratives refers to research in which stories are used as data, typically involving conventional thematic or content analysis. The rigorous analysis reveals stories, but narrative analysis presents the experiences in the form of coherent ones.

There are multiple ways of engaging in narrative analysis and interpretation. Narrative researchers (Clandinin & Huber, 2002; Pasupathi, 2003; Polkinghorne, 1995) recommend every researcher to treat the question of analysis and interpretation within their specific field and with careful attention to context.

As a result, narrative has different forms; some is focused on content of gathered data and others on meaning of what the content of the data reveals. I focused on both as I viewed narratives as a window onto a reality of the participants and analysed them to drive responses to my research questions (Polkinghorne, 1995).

4.4.4 Dimensions of narrative inquiry

In this section, I will define the three dimensions of NI that will aid in understanding the analysis of narratives and clarify the focus of the study.

Clandinin's (2006) notions of three dimensions were identified as temporality, sociality and place. These are check points for any researcher in NI, or dimensions that direct the researcher's attention in conducting NI. They constitute a kind of conceptual framework for any NI which Connelly and Clandinin (1990) and Clandinin (2006) suggested should be explored to understand places, events and people in a continuous process.

First focus: Temporality

"Events under study are in temporal transition" (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990: 479), that is, every human and any event have a past, present and a future and it is essential to understand it as a continuous process. In terms of this research, the continuous process involves how English teachers narrate their experiences in a transition form when they reveal their CPD development.

Second focus: Sociality

In NI, the researcher focuses on personal and social conditions (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). Personal conditions mean researching the participants' and researcher's feelings, hopes, reactions and moral temperament. Social conditions refer to the research participants' and researcher's attention to the environment, forces and factors in terms of surroundings, people and individuals' context, for example, when participants speak about a CPD course or degree, how they react or what motivates them to achieve that qualification. Another example is whether they mention any influencing force including environment, people or institutions when

they narrate any experience. These personal and social conditions equally need to be focused on by the researcher when analysing data.

One more dimension of this focus of sociality is the relationship between a participant and researcher (Watt, 2007)) and it is significant in NI due to the presence of participants. In the case of NI, the researcher is in a research relationship with a participant's life, and they cannot distance themselves from this.

Third focus: Place

Again, referring to Connelly and Clandinin (1990), the notion of place means a specific consolidated, physical boundary of place where an inquiry event takes place. Following these researchers, we can infer that the key component of this dimension is recognising that every event takes place somewhere. Due to transition, the place may change, and a researcher needs to think mindfully about the changing impact of each place on a participant's experience. In my research, I have recognised how my participants expressed their feelings regarding different institutions and environments.

Along with the above mentioned three dimensions of NI there are three significant trends in this kind of inquiry when it was initiated in educational research: emphasis on teacher reflection; the researcher needs to be attentive to what teachers know, the way they think and take classroom decisions; and sharing such stories empower these teachers. NI is primarily interested in meanings/learning and reduces data into a set of core narratives which are generalisable and grounded in the research participants' journeys, in this case, their understanding of CPD. Hence, it empowers those voices that are unheard and can facilitate exploration of educational research problems by analysing individual stories, since NI produces a connected truth.

4.4.5 My aim and narrative inquiry

In educational research, a narrative study is used to explore the experiences of an individual, therefore, it was most suitable for this study because it allowed the PD and the learning process as experienced by English teachers, to be explored. According to Golombek and Johnson (2021), this NI approach can support researchers, learners and teachers as practitioners of teaching and learning.

Adopting NI in this study was in line with my goal and outcomes to construct a perspective of an event conveyed in the form of participants' accounts. It resonated with the aim of this study as the purpose of NI is to reveal the meaning of the individuals' experiences, not fragmented truths, that is, incomplete and disconnected events. Although Dewey's (1938) perspective on the nature of experience has been endorsed (Muhit, 2013; Golombek & Johnson, 2021), it is essential to critically engage with this viewpoint. Dewey's notion of experience as a continuous series of connected situations invites scrutiny, prompting an exploration of its implications and potential limitations within the context of contemporary discussions and evolving educational paradigms. Additionally, my aim in this study was two-fold: to explore English teachers' understanding of their CPD experiences and present that data in a meaningful manner that could empower me to give guidelines for English teachers in Pakistani universities. I pre-determined the structure of the narrative with the aim of organising the fragmented data into some orderly unified, coherent outcomes.

Besides looking for a perspective of an event and connected experiences mentioned above, another reason why I chose NI was that the literature related to my topic of inquiry suggests a scarcity of research in the CPD of English teachers. Telling their stories, based on their significant experience and exposure to various realities of the profession would reveal much more than my visualisation. Therefore, I planned to have more flexibility in the conversation by asking 'What is your story?', so they could express everything in a chronological order that they felt appropriate to the CPD understanding.

In addition to the above-mentioned objectives of my research and their relevance to the utilisation of NI, my research questions also directed my focus towards NI. This was driven by my aim to examine English teachers' understanding of CPD, including their understanding of CPD needs, the influence of the institution's environment on participants' professional growth, their recognition of supportive or hindering factors for CPD, and the notable aspects distinguishing their early and later years in the profession. For example, Clandinin and Connelly (1990) define narrative study as a way humans view and interpret the world. According to Creswell (2012), by providing insights into a phenomenon, NI enables a researcher to obtain data for personal experiences in actual settings with specific insights. That is the focus of this study to explore experiences of individuals in their setting.

In my study, the argument for the use of NI came out of a view that humans, in this case, English teachers, individually or as the part of society, lead storied lives (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). When they interpret their past, people shape their lives by stories of who they and others are. Narrative is simply a doorway through which a person enters the world of experience and by which their experiences are interpreted and made meaningful personally. Therefore, NI is a way to study experience as a story and a way of thinking about an experience.

Research by Warwick et al. (2021) and Watt (2007) also points out the importance of the researcher's engagement and positionality (for further information on positionality see section 4.7) that is associated with the need to illustrate the research journey and representation of data. During data analysis, the steps and decision taken needs to be unveiled either by presenting outcomes in story form or traditional themes. Additionally, narrative researchers need to be more transparent about their understanding of the notion of story and for the quality of research and data analysis. Warwick et al. (2021) and Watt (2007) suggest a culture of methodological transparency and reflexivity.

Briefly, my aims and reasons behind choosing NI were to present a connected experience, a perspective of an event, fill the literature gaps, find answers for my research questions, obtain specific insights of participants' CPD experiences in their setting and engage myself as a researcher.

4.4.6 Narrative inquiry for continuous professional development

Many researchers (Mizzy, 2022; Salter & Rhodes, 2018; Wijaya & Kuswando, 2018) in the field of education use the narrative approach as it may provide a connected and consolidated picture of CPD. Social researchers have shown an increasing interest in individuals and group narratives or stories to explore philosophical, social and historical underpinnings of individuals' stories or the narrative turn (Polkinghorne, 1995). In the context of storytelling a narrative turn refers to a significant shift or change in the direction of a story. This turn often serves to create and generate interest and challenge assumptions. I situate the discussion within the narrative turn in qualitative research while drawing on experiences of conducting a narrative study.

Connelly and Clandinin (1990) argue that the research purpose and questions should be the driving force for selecting a NI. If NI is chosen, it is because such an analytic framework best fits the goal of informing the inquiry. Since it is described by Connelly and Clandinin (1990) as a mindful integration of individual conversations into meaningful statements, it makes it suitable for this study. The use of NI offers the opportunity to focus the participants on their CPD, leading to the interpretation of their experiences to shed light on how it has played a role in their lives. Briefly, using NI is recommended in CPD exploration.

4.5 Theoretical underpinnings: an overview of Vygotsky's socio-cultural theory

This section provides a framework to see how the research participants' mental functioning and their beliefs are tied to their surroundings and how those surroundings impact them in their CPD journeys.

According to Vygotsky (1978), human development or human consciousness is fundamentally a mediated mental activity. Lantolf and Pavlenko (1995) point out, this is the basic assumption of socio-cultural theory. Vygotsky (1978) argues that mediation is the key element to comprehend how human mental functioning is tied to cultural, institutional and historical settings, since these places provide the cultural tools that are learnt by individuals for this functioning. In this approach, the mediational means are the carriers of socio-cultural common practices and knowledge. This assertion about the relationship of human development and human consciousness aligns with the methodological framework of this study of conducting interviews since it demands subjective accounts.

Numerous studies (Dogan & Kirkgoz, 2022; Elhussain & Khoja, 2020; Gursoy et al., 2022) have employed Vygotsky's (1978) socio-cultural theory as a framework for examining learning and teaching processes, aiming to explore how personal beliefs are shaped by environmental influences. This study also uses Vygotsky's (1978) socio-cultural theory as the framework to understand the learning and teaching process of English teachers. Arguing that English teachers' perception is vital for CPD, because their perception and expectations can foster or discourage their CPD; it also corroborates with interviews as a research method where the researcher and participant may discuss the English teachers' perceptions of their development.

The most salient concept of socio-cultural theory is that learning has its basis in the interaction of people with their environment (Lier, 1998). Applying this concept to English teachers' understanding of CPD, socio-cultural theory created a space for highlighting the perceptions of English teachers who had been through CPD experiences. Using Vygotsky's (1978) theory, English teachers' situated perceptions of their experience of CPD in Pakistani universities could reveal both their personal motivation, the role of the environment and their possible transformation.

Socio-cultural theory makes room for multiple forms of motivations for learning and interacting as experienced by the ELT population. Therefore, in this study I examined how the motivation for learning and English teachers' interaction have formed successful English teachers in Pakistan. Such an understanding of motivation of learning and progression allowed a mapping of perspectives of the participants with structural components of CPD policy, available opportunities, and English teachers' mindsets. Since socio-cultural theory assists us to comprehend the social, cultural and historical aspects of a phenomenon, it offers a lens to understand the different perspectives of CPD (Lier, 1998). In this context, it helps us understand the experiences of English teachers who, while being part of the promotional incentive initiative, successfully completed CPD courses.

According to Vygotsky, development occurs as a transformation of personal capacities intertwined with socio-culturally constructed interactional means. This transformation or internalisation results in an external operation (Lier, 1998). For example, when an English teacher considers any CPD activity or programme according to its socio-cultural influence, they execute it externally. Using this principle in CPD understanding, Wertsch and Sohmer (1995) explain how the nature of CPD might encourage English teachers to act, assuming that the stance is mirrored in their intra-mental functioning as external operations are internalised. For example, if the CPD policy is to develop activities and use them to engender new thinking, English teachers may treat utterances as thinking devices and take an active position.

Likewise, Buehl and Beck (2014) examined the role of teachers' understanding of their own personal principles in their learning and activities. Their observations and data showed that the teachers' practice of various approaches was influenced by their own personal theories and experiences. Some contextual factors, such as environment related issues, also contributed to their understanding of their profession. Using this theory as a framework may help to uncover the motivation of English teachers and their possible influencing environments.

4.6 My role as researcher

Engaging in this qualitative research endeavour, I found myself navigating the complex dynamics of insider and outsider perspectives. As a Pakistani national rooted in Khairpur Mirs, in the Sindh province of Pakistan, I possess an intimate familiarity with the local context, which proved invaluable during my extensive interviews. Drawing from my experiences within the country, I was able to interpret interview data with a depth that comes from genuine understanding.

However, despite my insider status in the broader social and ELT community of southeastern Pakistan, I remained an outsider to the specific research sites where I had not worked. This duality of insider and outsider perspectives allowed me to offer a balanced and transparent viewpoint to my research.

Delving into the heart of this project, I realised that being an insider in social research is far more intricate than meets the eye. Patnaik (2013) and Sciarra (1999) shed light on this complexity, emphasising the importance of social proximity in understanding the nuances of ELT and CPD culture in Pakistan. Through interviewing within my own cultural community, I gained insights that might have eluded an outsider, deepening my awareness of the field.

Yet, amidst the richness of this insider perspective, I could not overlook the challenges posed by my outsider status within the specific research sites. Establishing rapport with participants and gaining access proved to be a hurdle, especially in earning their trust and accessing the nuanced experiences that shape their professional journeys.

Acknowledging the significance of my positionality – both as an insider and an outsider – was paramount in shaping the trajectory of my research. While it brought depth and authenticity to my findings, it also underscored the inherent limitations and obstacles that coloured my interactions with participants. Through reflection and adaptation, I strived to navigate these complexities and assemble meaningful insights into the phenomenon under study.

To maintain an unbiased response to the obtained knowledge, I utilised a specific method of interviews (Wengraf, 2001). The details of this method, the virtual interview, will be described in Section 4.7.1.1. By implementing the virtual interview method, I aimed to reduce geographical constraints and facilitate participation of English teachers from diverse locations, thus ensuring a broader representation of their experiences in the study.

Clandinin and Connelly (1990) emphasised the importance of the researcher's role in NI. According to their perspective, NI serves as a means of understanding individuals' experiences, and it involves a collaboration between the researcher and participant within a specific timeframe, in a specific place or location, and through social interaction with an environment or culture.

Reflecting on Watt's insights (2007) regarding the importance of approaching data collection with an open mind, and that neutrality in research is a myth, I realised the significance of my role. Despite my familiarity with the culture under study, I must acknowledge that there are facets I may not fully comprehend. This requires balancing my insider status with vigilance against assumptions that could distort my findings. I must recognise my biases and strive for awareness. My role as a researcher is to embrace the nuances of insider epistemology and strive for a deeper understanding of the phenomenon I study.

4.7 Research design

The research design serves as a framework that guides the inquiry process; it includes participant selection, data collection, data management, analysis, data representation, ethical considerations, and trustworthiness. Each procedure is defined and described in relation to its application in this study (Safron & Richards, 2023). The research design outlines chosen methods and their alignment with the research questions and objectives. It specifies participants selection procedures, data collection tools, and data management strategies.

Furthermore, the research design addresses the analysis approach, ethical considerations and measures taken to ensure trustworthiness. It encompasses techniques such as qualitative or quantitative analysis, ethical guidelines adherence and steps to enhance credibility and reliability. Put simply, the research design provides a concise framework for the entire research process, encompassing various procedures and considerations to achieve the study's objectives.

4.7.1 Research methods

My research study requires qualitative instruments that would explore in-depth the perspectives of English teachers' understanding about their CPD, the kind they engage in, their justifications for choosing certain kinds of CPD, and their prospective contributions within their context.

The data collection began in Autumn 2020 and ended in Autumn 2021. Applying multiple data-gathering techniques enabled me to triangulate my findings, outcomes and increase the credibility of my research (Safron & Richards, 2023). I made interviews as my primary data collection method and made profiles as a reservoir for those viewpoints. I collected data first through participants' profiles and later through virtual interviews. The profiles were contained on their qualifications, research, and contribution through providing training, supervision, and teaching. An additional data source included journal notes (Section 4.7.1.3).

Analysis of participants' profiles assisted me as a researcher to interpret and give voice and meaning to information provided and provided additional context for other contributions as well as their teaching contribution. The participants' profiles are records of their gradual development and achievements, and they provide material to explore participants' thoughts and perceptions.

4.7.1.1 Virtual interviewing process

In this section, I describe the interviews and virtual interviewing process (VIP) and then describe how I adapted the traditional interview process to the VIP (Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Jones & Abdelfattah, 2020).

According to Brinkmann and Kvale (2015), interviewing is one of the most common and powerful ways to understand fellow humans' lives and elicit information. There are three types of commonly designed interviews in qualitative research: structured interviews, semi-structured interviews and unstructured or conversational interviews (Brinkmann & Kvale, 2015). Structured interviews are those for which the researcher prepares the interview questions before it takes place, and the questions generally remain the same throughout the interview. Semi-structured interviews are more flexible, in which the interviewer begins the interview with a set of pre-determined questions but may add to or replace questions based on the flow of the interview and information presented during the process. Unstructured or conversational interviews occur when researchers create questions as the interview takes place without any pre-determined set of questions, generally much like a conversation (Brinkmann & Kvale, 2015; Carruthers, 1990). In this study, a semi-structured format was utilised because it was more flexible. I began the interview with a set of pre-determined questions and added to or replaced questions based on the flow of the interview and information shared by the participant. For interview questions and prompts see Appendix 3.

Watt (2007) advocates for a partnership between the researcher and respondents to create a narrative interview that adds value to the outcomes. Since this is an NI study, responses that led to developing a story were the desired outcome. Therefore, flexibility in conducting interviews in qualitative research is a key requirement. The interviewer must be able to respond to emerging and potential issues during the interviews to explore the topic and its participants' perspective of the topic under investigation. Since I was planning to obtain information about the reality of CPD for English teachers as a consolidated truth as that was the main aim of the narrative, the traditional interview schedule with predetermined and fixed questions were not completely suitable (Charmaz & Belgrave, 2012). Hence, I used an interview guide that outlined the main topics I wanted to explore but was flexible regarding the organisation of the

interview parts and phrasing questions and the order in which they were asked in specific parts. The details of the interview parts and questions are presented in the sections titled: *Multiple interview design* and *Interview format*.

This type of interview organisation and questions allowed the participants and researcher to lead and balance the interaction between unanticipated and anticipated information (Charmaz & Belgrave, 2012). The precise interview format in this study was heavily dependent upon the research aim and methodological traditions of qualitative research and NI.

Hence, I initiated data collection with the intent of conducting face-to-face interviews to obtain the opportunity to visit research locations and gauge the culture of the setting. However, the coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic compelled online interviewing in the 2020-2021 cycle. Therefore, online meetings replaced the traditional face-to-face interviews due to travel restrictions and government guidelines.

Although online interviews have been performed in the past, limited data have been published about VIP in the COVID-19 era. Many studies (Charmaz & Belgrave, 2012; Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Janghorban et al., 2014; Jones & Abdelfattah, 2020) show participants' overall virtual interview experience as satisfying. An important feature of virtual invitations for scheduling an interview is that responses are often less in number than invitations sent via emails.

Transcribing data for conducting multiple interviews.

Qualitative research aims to deepen the understanding of complexity and meaning of any phenomenon under study. Many studies collect recorded data in the audio or video form, for example, and these are usually transcribed into written form for closer and detailed study. The process of transcribing any data seems a straightforward technical task. In fact, it involves judgments about what level of detail to choose, such as omitting non-verbal dimensions of interactions, data interpretation, for example, distinguishing 'I don't, no' from 'I don't know',

and data representation such as ‘gonna’ as ‘going to’ (Stuckey, 2014). Taking care of these differences and criteria helped in transcribing the data. Representation of data into text format is an interpretive process which is therefore the first step in analysing data. Thus, it needs to be carefully dealt with. The most important advantage of transcribing data is that one gets to know the data in detail and analysis begins as one starts transcribing the recorded data. I have included fillers such as participants’ repeated use of expressions like ‘you know’ because, it shows their insistence, hesitation or validation from the researcher due to their shared background.

Table 8 Transcription process in this study.

The Transcription Process		
Anonymity of Participants	Punctuation	Not included
Participant Ali, Bilal, Ahmed, Zain, Usman, Imran, Abdullah, Noureen, Farooq & Muhammad	Use of non-standard text format. Absence of punctuation and capitalisation except nouns.	Repeated non-verbal signs. Use of same word multiple times

In general, to avoid any fake impression of coherence, as the interviews are the verbal expressions of the participants, I have not used a standard format of text, punctuation, or upper case to indicate sentences (a sample of transcripts of the interviews can be found in Appendix 4). However, there were moments where participants either showed strong confidence or satisfaction through their tone of voice, and that impression was noted in transcripts and in the reflective journal; such reflective comments played an essential role in developing participants’ accounts into more meaningful findings. Therefore, such notes will be discussed in the chapter six Findings and discussions of the thesis.

While transcribing the interviews, I made sure to promptly record my thoughts in a reflective journal right after listening to the participants. For example, if they expressed concerns about the diversity of students in terms of ability and competence, I wondered how they approached that issue. Did they take any specific step or actions or mention it in subsequent interviews? This thought process helped me to establish a clear connection among the different data sources.

Multiple interview design

Interview based qualitative studies are often based on more than one interview, particularly when a researcher focuses on more depth of discussion and deeper engagement of participants. Wengraf (2001) has criticised single interviews as producing shallow data about a phenomenon and participants. In this study, to elicit quality data, the interviews were conducted in three parts with each participant, which could only be possible through repeated contact with them. Regarding the practical approach of conducting multiple interviews to obtain in-depth knowledge, Wengraf (2001) suggests an important step is to allocate some time at the beginning of the second or subsequent interviews to recap the main points from the previous ones. The key idea I recall was to treat all three interviews as a cohesive data tool, considering how they are sequenced and connected to each other (Wengraf, 2001). Alternatively, subsequent interviews were designed on the previous one (s) and probed and approached from a different angle and depth. This approach required some preliminary analysis immediately after each interview to design and develop the focus of the subsequent one (Wengraf, 2001). For example, the second interview was designed based on the first interview, while the third interview took on a more conversational tone (Wengraf, 2001) that allowed deviation from standardised interviewing. In the conversational interview, I asked participants if they understood a question or word and phrase and provided an unscripted explanation to clarify the meaning. Employing a conversational interviewing technique enhanced the accuracy of

responses as it addressed the points in earlier interviews that required further explanation (Wengraf, 2001).

As these interviews were conducted for research purposes and to utilise the collected data for further learning about English teachers' understanding of CPD, they were recorded and every participant at the time of interview was told about the recording device that was placed near the computer, so they were aware of the recording process.

Interview time and zone

Research by Swain and King (2022) suggest the researcher should have a courteous and flexible attitude for arranging the date and time of the interview; I asked my participants and confirmed about the date and time through emails. All interviews were held at the time specified by the interviewees according to Pakistan standard time. As the time zone differs from the United Kingdom, I always conducted interviews early in the morning at 05:00 UK time.

Determining interview locations

Since the interviews were conducted virtually, participants took the initiative to carefully select interview areas in their homes in order to minimise potential distractions. They mentioned this strategy of careful selection during the interviews. However, it should be noted that I could occasionally hear children's voices in the background. Nonetheless, this did not pose any significant inconvenience to the flow of the conversation.

Interview procedure

On the day of each interview, to establish a good rapport with every participant, I greeted them in my mother tongue, Sindhi, as we share the same ethnicity. Formerly, each participant was introduced to the research topic, interview procedure, withdrawal policy, anonymity, privacy, and why they were chosen. Every participant was given a choice for any language that they wanted to adopt for the interview (Urdu/Sindhi/English) and all chose English.

Interview format

The initial interviews with each participant lasted approximately 30-40 minutes, during which they were given the opportunity to share their professional journey without any interruption from the researcher. The participants utilised this opportunity to express their ideas and draw upon their reference frames regarding their CPD (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990).

One of the participants, Bilal, was not comfortable with this part of the interview as he said that he was not very proactive in conversation. However, he did respond to a question-and-answer format. Research by Swain and King (2022) recommends changing the interview style if needed. Since the aim of qualitative research is to uncover participants' accounts of aspects of their experiences, rather than to collect answers to specific questions, I adopted an open-ended question-based session, where I initiated responses by asking questions related to how he started his profession, his experiences of each stage, research purpose and many more. The session was prepared in light of how all participants responded to this part of the interview. I focused my questions and limited interview time on getting insights and information about his motivation, beliefs, practices, professional expertise and CPD. The interview with this participant was not divided into three parts but based only on one part (55 minutes long).

The insights I gained in the process of carrying out my first interviews informed my subsequent ones, for example, I noted probing questions that worked particularly well or recognised the aspects of participants' lives I had overlooked initially. I remained aware of the way I was posing the questions and how I was getting the response. This awareness of the development helped me to avoid any changes which might distort the data analysis. For all participants the guiding interview questions were intentionally developed as open-ended ones to elicit thoughtful connected responses (See Appendix 3).

According to Wengraf (2001), a follow-up interview is an effective tool when researchers have straightforward questions that need more clarification. During the first interview transcription

and then analysis process, notes of significant events were taken to develop questions for the second interview about events or issues that required further elaboration. An additional half-hour follow-up, second interview was conducted with a two- and three-day gap with each participant for clarification and verification of statements given in the first interview. Since I had analysed the first interview of each participant before conducting the second interview, we were able to unpack more than just an explanation of any specific point, and, in our new interaction, the participant took the opportunity to illustrate their ideas in much more detail. Several questions were asked as points of discussion to help guide the interview. Participants were also asked about their motivation behind doing any specific degree or course in their second interview.

To ensure the authenticity, credibility and trustworthiness of the accounts provided by study participants, I adopted a probing strategy to support their articulation of previous narratives and congruence in the second round of the interviews, that enabled me to understand points that appeared to contradict what had been said in the first round. Examples of these types of probing questions that I put to them were: Could you say more about that or give me more details? Could you give me one or two examples of that? Could you clarify what you mean by that? Could you help me understand what you mean here? Earlier, you said X, and now you appear to be saying something different; could you help me to understand how these ideas relate together?

As this research was carried out in Pakistani universities with English teachers the narrative accounts were centred on key personal and critical events in specific contexts of time and place considered by each one as influential for their experiences of academic career progression. Within the common core questions' structure, I ensured there was a story-telling space wherein participants could narrate what was personal and essential to them.

A few days later, a third follow-up interview lasting approximately half an hour was conducted, with a specific focus on exploring the affordances and discouraging factors in CPD to gather additional information and insights from the participants. This part of the interview began with open-ended questions aimed at eliciting reflective and thoughtful responses. As the conversation progressed, it transitioned into a more conversational style, where various topics were discussed in-depth. For example, participants engaged in discussions regarding the barriers and affordances of CPD, the teaching profession, and ELT, often intertwining these topics interchangeably.

At the end, all participants were asked if they wanted to add anything, as an attempt to check that no topics had been overlooked by the researcher. The participants had an opportunity to include any additional information they deemed relevant (Wengraf, 2001). Most of the participants reported that they had already discussed everything extensively. However, one participant, Abdullah, took this opportunity to acknowledge the significant support he received from his wife in his career, CPD and profession.

Advantages and limitations of virtual interviews.

Virtual interviews have been identified as beneficial in some ways such as due to their improved cost effectiveness and ease of scheduling (Garden et al., 2021). Researchers (e.g., Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Garden et al., 2021; Janghorban et al., 2014) that have utilised online methods of interviewing report that it is now valued and celebrated as a suitable research method and may be more time efficient in reducing travel time, even though it may also be more time consuming due to technological arrangements or faults. Some studies (Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Garden et al., 2021) also delineated disadvantages, such as the researcher's inability to visit research sites and interact personally with participants.

However, there is a divergence of opinions over the validity of these types of interviews. For example, Jowett et al. (2011) indicate a lack of reflexivity surrounding online interviewing.

While Jones and Abdelfattah (2020) argue that online interviews are not the first choice in comparison to the standard face-to-face interviews. Because face-to-face interviews may provide a more detailed insight into a participant's personality and the ability to control interactions to ask complex questions, it implies they are problem free. In the same way that the discussion of the difference between quantitative and qualitative research always ends at the point being addressed in terms of what quantitative research fails to offer (Bell & Bryman, 2007), online research tools are often criticised by focusing on what they lack. This notion of lack rather ignores the pitfalls that are associated with face-to-face interaction as much as online interactions and the different possibilities offered by each tool.

Several studies (e.g., Bell & Bryman, 2007; Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Janghorban et al., 2014; Jones & Abdelfattah, 2020) have employed Skype as a medium of online interaction. On Skype, interviews can be conducted via audio, video and an instant messaging feature, which allows for more clarification of the topic under study. Initially I planned to use Skype video calls. Skype interviewing benefited researchers during COVID-19, but it also introduced some pitfalls. According to research by Garden et al. (2021) technical difficulties can impact the interaction and impressions. In my study, only the audio facility was used due to weak internet signals. Additionally, these kinds of interviews have fewer sources of direct observation of the culture and form of relationship between participants and their surroundings (Garden et al., 2021). Further, the same research also indicates the occurrence of scheduling challenges on account of different time zones, which I also faced.

4.7.1.2 English teachers' profiles as data resource

In qualitative research, data production is different from data collection (Bowen, 2009). In this context, research participants actively create data during the interview by deciding what to say, what to leave out, and how they want to represent themselves (Bowen, 2009). This introduces the challenge of two selves in qualitative and narrative research: the projected self, which

people present to the world based upon how they want to be perceived, and the real self, which is who they really are (Bowen, 2009).

Research on personality theories (Jin, 2009; Ogilvie, 1987) has explored the real self and ideal/projected self, highlighting their distinct and contrasting qualities. This notion of distinct self-understanding suggests that the participant's self-view can shape their internal subjective responses, which means that self-concept can act as the guiding cornerstone for careful and intentional experiential design. Consequently, it becomes essential to incorporate additional data sources to compare responses and capture the participants' perspectives (Bowen, 2009).

In these circumstances, the utilisation of different data sources is recommended as it allows for the identification of consistent patterns among sources, which can help to form relationships among all data and participants' accounts (Bowen, 2009). To obtain information about English teachers, the researcher accessed their profiles from various sites, including their university, ResearchGate, Google Scholar, LinkedIn platforms and websites (Appendix 5).

By combining document analysis with interviews, a rich understanding of the English teachers was achieved. Collecting information regarding English teachers' academic/pedagogic qualifications and publications added a significant layer of data and provided insights into their personal backgrounds. These documents facilitated a comparison between English teachers' achieved degrees, research interests and motivation (Bowen, 2009). According to Morgan (2022) documents may corroborate interview data or refute them, thereby providing evidence that can either support or challenge participants' narratives.

In this study, investigating participants' achievements aimed to understand their motivations, the impact of specific degrees, publications and changes experienced. The information presented under this heading was discussed with the participants during the interview process, serving as a developmental step in the main study's data collection (Bowen, 2009).

Moreover, the information obtained from documents suggested additional questions to explore in the interviews, such as English teachers' motivation behind pursuing specific degrees or publishing articles (Morgan, 2022). This approach allowed for a comprehensive examination of participants' motivations and the influences they attributed to their academic and research experiences.

Advantages and limitations of document analysis

In reference to other qualitative research methods, document analysis has advantages as well as limitations. The advantage is that documents are a less time-consuming type of analysis and require data selection instead of much data collection. According to Morgan (2022) document collection and selection is only limited by one's imagination and diligence. Document analysis as an additional data source can counter the concerns related to researcher's bias that are inherent in social research (Yin, 1994), since documents are straightforward, nonreactive, and unaffected by the research process.

At the same time document analysis is not always advantageous and has several limitations also. For example, documents may contain insufficient details as they are produced independently without any research agenda. As a result, they cannot be utilised as a single source of research (although there are exceptions).

In an organisational or academic context, the available documents are often influenced by specific policies and with the producers' agenda (Yin, 1994). For example, English teachers' curriculum vitae (CVs) may have been produced for a specific audience. While these points can be considered potential flaws in document analysis, they do not significantly outweigh the advantages and efficiency of documents as a secondary source of data.

4.7.1.3 Reflective journal - a significant tool of researcher's development

I kept a running record of memos and other anecdotal notes during the research process. They supported my impressions that I recorded at various stages of data collection since they played

the role of a source of reflection. A reflective journal is a technique to put down anything that comes to mind to better understand the data collection and research process. In this research, the reflective entries provided an opportunity to explore the complexity of different participants' accounts, identify the individuality of English teachers and analyse the significant elements in the data. Watt (2007) emphasised the importance of recording hunches and thoughts that come about as data are reviewed and analysed to serve as a record for initial data analysis. It also offered the opportunity to perform critical self-evaluation by extending the understanding of how my position, interest and understanding as a researcher can affect the research process. Furthermore, the utilisation and content of a reflective journal often pose a perplexing aspect, as research shows unexpected outcomes of using reflective journals in teaching and learning (Uline et al., 2004). Initially, during the pilot study, its usage was rather limited, encompassing only a few thoughts and queries pertaining to participants and their contributions. However, throughout the main study process, I experienced a noticeable shift in its purpose and functionality.

Uline et al. (2004) defines reflective journals as jotting down notes regarding the research process as transparent detailed information of events and the initial reflections of researcher on those events. These notes were jotted down to take account of the overall context in which communication occurred, such as how participants speak about any concept, what interests them more, their verbal or non-verbal reactions towards CPD in general and any other emergent issues relevant to the study.

A significant insight that I gained during my study was the versatility of the reflective journal as a multipurpose tool. It served not only as a repository for capturing all the thoughts related to the participants, but also provided multidimensional support throughout the research process. Initially, I recorded anything in my journal, for example:

I am very happy I am going to start my PS data collection tomorrow as I received consent from a participant and its very early morning time for [the] interview, its nearly 6AM, I am super excited and nervous as well.

Another significant aspect utilising the journal as a data tool became apparent when I began journaling my thoughts on the research process itself. My reflection during the research process centred around three key questions after each activity: What went well? What could have gone better or went wrong? And what would I do different next time? Engaging in this self-questioning activity not only facilitated adjustments to my research process but also provided additional context for data collection and analysis. An excerpt from my early journal entries exemplifies this:

I completed the first session today, which took 45 minutes. I have the second session with the same participant tomorrow. The second session will last almost 30 minutes, and my main focus will be addressing any unclear points. Three days later, I will have a third session with the same participant. Additionally, I have a third session planned with the same participant after three days.

Another excerpt from the journal:

The third session was a bit longer than the previous ones. In these sessions, I gathered responses about the barriers and benefits of CPD. The data I collected is quite extensive and relevant. The relevance comes from the fact that the participant has more than 15 years of experience in their profession. When discussing CPD barriers and benefits, their responses provided a broad perspective on professional issues.

This serves as a prime example of reflection on action, where journal writing empowered me to make confident decisions. As a result of this experience, I started considering the same set of criteria for my participants, realising that it could yield valuable insights which may have

significant implications for my study. This newfound understanding instilled confidence in my research process and further highlighted the importance of journaling.

Self-questioning played a central role in the research journal (Bolton, 2010). For example, during the data analysis phase, I found myself pondering the following questions:

How do participants narrate their journey? Means: are they proud of that? Did they describe any connectedness of experiences?... Do they contextualise their thoughts into their research?

These self-directed inquiries served as guiding principles, enabling a thorough examination of the data and promoting a comprehensive analysis.

While transcribing the interviews, I made it a practice to document my thoughts in the reflective journal immediately after listening to each participant. For example, when participants expressed concerns about student diversity, I would ponder questions such as: *How do they tackle that? Do they research? Do they work on that issue or say anything in their interview later, or if yes, what did they say?* Such a thought chain helped me to create a clear connection among data sources.

The above-mentioned sequence of self-questioning played a vital role in supporting me to identify patterns within the data. To maintain a focused approach, I adopted a structured format for my reflective journal. I created separate sections dedicated to each participant, allowing me to record and organise significant points related to their experiences and perspectives. Furthermore, my reflective journal served as a valuable memory aid, capturing not only what I thought but also the underlying reasons behind my thoughts. This approach enabled me to revisit and review my reflections, ensuring a thorough and comprehensive analysis.

4.8 Research sites: Universities

The research focused on English teachers at universities in the Sindh province of Pakistan who were involved in teaching graduate, Master's, MPhil, and PhD programmes. Prior to discussing

these research sites and research participants, it is imperative to highlight some information about Pakistan as a whole, as it will add clarity and understanding for the readers.

Pakistan, a federation comprised of four provinces – Punjab, Sindh, Baluchistan, and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) – offers a diverse landscape reflecting varied levels of development and educational standards. Understanding these provinces provides crucial context to grasp Pakistan's current educational and developmental conditions.

Punjab stands out as the most populous and developed province in Pakistan, boasting over half of the country's total population. Renowned for its fertile agricultural lands and robust industrial sector, Punjab significantly drives the national economy. The province also boasts a relatively higher literacy rate compared to other regions, underpinned by both traditional and modern education systems. Lahore, its capital, serves as a bustling cultural and educational centre, hosting prestigious universities and research institutions.

Sindh, where this research was carried out, situated in the southern part of Pakistan, ranks as the second-most populous province, characterised by its diverse cultural heritage and economic significance. Karachi, its provincial capital and Pakistan's largest city, serves as a major economic hub, housing the Karachi Stock Exchange and functioning as the main seaport. While Sindh has witnessed progress in education and development, particularly in urban areas, rural regions encounter hurdles in accessing quality education and basic infrastructure.

Moving to the northwest of Pakistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) is recognized for its rugged terrain, rich history, and distinct cultural identity. Recent years have seen substantial progress in development, marked by infrastructure projects and enhanced access to education and healthcare services. However, challenges such as militancy and displacement persist, especially in areas formerly designated as the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA), now integrated into KPK.

Baluchistan, the largest province in terms of land area but the least populous, confronts unique challenges stemming from its sparse population, harsh climate, and vast distances. Despite its abundance in natural resources like natural gas and minerals, Baluchistan lags behind in development compared to other provinces. Education remains a significant challenge, particularly in remote rural areas where schools are scarce and qualified teachers are in short supply. Nevertheless, concerted efforts are underway to bridge these disparities and foster inclusive development across the province.

In summary, each province in Pakistan presents its own set of characteristics and challenges. Yet, ongoing endeavours seek to foster equitable development and enhance educational access and opportunities for all citizens, irrespective of their geographical location.

Language holds significant power in shaping societal dynamics, with Punjab and Sindh presenting distinct yet interconnected narratives. In Punjab, the power dynamics of language are multifaceted. Abbas (1993) examines the role of English language in shaping the socio-political landscape during the Afghan war era, advocating for alternative education approaches rooted in indigenous traditions to counteract linguistic imperialism. Nevertheless, the education system in Punjab which plays a pivotal role in national development, emphasises the significance of English from primary to higher secondary levels. Mehboob's (2017) perspective on English as a global language underscores its potential for attracting investment, highlighting its dominance in educational settings and its broader socio-economic implications. However, educator perspectives reveal nuanced motivations for language learning, with calls for language planning reforms to foster balanced development and positive attitudes towards indigenous languages.

Sindhi grapples with its own set of linguistic challenges, particularly in rural areas, where dominance of English and Urdu over regional languages like Sindhi persists. Despite this, Sindhi language maintains a strong presence in education and cultural domains, reflecting the

community's commitment to preserving its linguistic heritage. However, broader language policies tend to favour dominant languages over indigenous ones, perpetuating marginalization and hindering efforts towards linguistic diversity.

Motivational factors in Sindh differ, with extrinsic motivations driving English language learning efforts among undergraduate students, while cultural preservation remains a key aspect of language motivation. Challenges in implementing remedial English courses at the university level underscore the need for improved support structures and resource allocation. Furthermore, language choice plays a significant role in shaping individual identities, serving as a marker of social belonging and cultural identity.

In brief, both Punjab and Sindh navigate complex linguistic landscapes characterized by power dynamics and sociocultural tensions. While Punjab emphasises the role of English in national development, Sindh prioritises the preservation of indigenous languages like Sindhi. Motivational factors for language learning differ between the two regions, reflecting their unique cultural and socio-economic contexts. Ultimately, both regions acknowledge the need for language policy reforms to promote linguistic diversity and inclusivity, paving the way for more equitable educational practices.

The studies conducted in KPK shed light on the challenges and opportunities inherent in English language education in the region. Gul and Sabih-UI-Hassan's (2022) research focuses on the obstacles faced by secondary-level students in speaking English in KPK's district Kohat, revealing social, psychological, and cultural factors hindering English proficiency. Similarly, Rehman et al.'s (2014) study scrutinises the English textbooks used at the secondary level in KPK, emphasising the need for significant revisions to align educational materials with student needs.

Despite challenges, attitudes towards English language learning in KPK remain positive, as evidenced by Ali et al. (2020), who explore the attitudes of students towards English language

learning. Additionally, Jadoon (2020) delves into the challenges encountered by newly inducted teachers in implementing the revised English curriculum in KPK, highlighting the importance of addressing resource deficiencies and providing adequate training to enhance curriculum implementation.

Moreover, Manan et al.'s (2016) examination of the socioeconomic dynamics of English medium schooling in Pakistan underscores the need for equitable access to quality language instruction across all societal strata in KPK. Collectively, these studies offer valuable insights into the multifaceted challenges and opportunities inherent in English language education in the region, contributing to a more nuanced understanding of language learning dynamics and informing policy interventions in the educational sphere.

On the other hand, in Baluchistan, the implementation of English language education faces numerous challenges. Khanum and Siddiqui (2018) identify issues such as limited teaching time, shortage of qualified teachers, and traditional teaching methods as hindrances to the success of English language education policies. Furthermore, disparities in access to quality English education highlight the need for strategies to improve the teaching-learning environment in the region (Khanda et al., 2021).

Attitudes towards ELT approaches among students play a crucial role in the success of language education initiatives in Baluchistan. Muhammad (2016) found favourable attitudes towards CLT, suggesting the need for policymakers to align pedagogical approaches with student preferences. Additionally, linguistic diversity poses challenges for English language teachers in Baluchistan, highlighting the importance of teacher training and curriculum reform to address the needs of multilingual learners (Rasheed et al., 2017).

Furthermore, while English language education holds promise for enhancing educational opportunities and promoting social mobility in Pakistan, its implementation faces multifaceted

challenges. Addressing these challenges requires a comprehensive approach that considers the socio-cultural context, engages stakeholders, and prioritises the needs of students and teachers. In relation to the recruitment of the main study's participants and gaining a comprehensive understanding of the CPD of English teachers, participants were recruited from various public and private universities in Sindh province. The participants were diverse in terms of age, background, city of residence, and the higher degrees they achieved. This provided an opportunity for meaningful comparison and contrasts within the study (Brewis, 2014). It is important to highlight that even though my focus was not exclusively on prestigious and renowned universities, the majority of the responses I received came from such institutions. Each university holds a prominent status, boasting a rich history of educational impact within society. These universities' English departments offer a range of degrees in English Literature and Linguistics and predominantly use EMI. The selected research sites can be categorised into two groups, amounting to a total of four universities.

4.8.1 Universities and participants' selection process

The university selection process was based on convenience, factoring in whether the institution had staff that met the criteria (Brewis, 2014). The participants' selection criteria were straightforward and included being an ELT in a Pakistani university, having a minimum of fifteen years of teaching experience, and engaging in research activities. Given my academic and professional background, I had a good understanding of the local universities. I began by visiting the websites of various universities, with a particular focus on their English departments and faculty. I carefully analysed the profiles of individuals whose emails and profiles were available on the university's website, investing significant time in evaluating their qualifications, years of experience, and their research focus. Here, it is worth noting that initially, I had considered a wide range of universities but later focused on leading public/private universities. This decision was influenced by the fact that many universities do

not regularly update their websites, resulting in limited information about their faculty members. Therefore, I reached out to potential participants through my family members and friends who were associated with various universities in Pakistan.

4.9 Pilot study

Prior to the main study data collection, a pilot study was conducted in September 2020. In terms of participant numbers, three out of the 13 interviews were included in the pilot study. The pilot study served multiple purposes, including rehearsing the interview schedule, identifying potential issues relevant to the research process, and refining the methods to be used in the project. It provided the small-scale rehearsal where I could assess the feasibility of the full study, determine the appropriate sample size and criteria, and understand the difference between structured interviews and the NI approach. Additionally, the pilot study helped improve the data entry, organisation and analysis processes, and emphasised the significance of the researcher's role in data collection and interpretation.

The importance of conducting a pilot study was further highlighted by its effectiveness as a tool for planning and conducting a more large-scale investigation (In, 2017; Morin, 2013). Furthermore, it facilitated a better connection with the participants in the main study by establishing rapport and understanding their preferred methods of sharing information (In, 2017; Morin, 2013).

Considering my intention to launch a narrative study that embraces the emergent, nonlinear, and messy nature of the qualitative inquiry, the pilot study became an essential step. By conducting it, I could thoroughly evaluate the interview process and proactively address potential issues, ensuring that the project maintained its integrity and worth. Specifically, I aimed to avoid the risk of transforming the narrative approach into structured interviews, emphasising the need to navigate this challenge thoughtfully during the pilot study phase.

4.9.1 The notion of information power and sampling in the project

The sample size of this project was determined by considering the concept of ‘information power’, the relevance of participants with regards to their knowledge and exploration of the topic, as well as the aim and quality of discourse (Malterud et al., 2016). According to Malterud et al. (2016), qualitative researchers should try hard to make their methods as robust and defensible as possible because their research is related to human affairs and is not measured solely in numbers but in opinions. Therefore, sample size needs to be considered a crucial element. They suggest that an estimation of sample size is necessary for planning, and the adequacy of the final sample size must be continuously evaluated during the entire research process.

The sample obtained for this study consisted of experienced and knowledgeable experts who were representative of a range of experiences of CPD, which was the focus of my investigation. These participants possessed relevant knowledge and experience, had the ability to reflect, were articulate, and had the time to be interviewed. No other classification criteria, such as gender, age, race or demographic, were used as they were not crucial to my investigation. In total, I conducted interviews with thirteen individuals.

Sample size should not rely solely on the procedures of a specific analysis method, but also on principles for estimating an accurate number of participants. In this regard, Malterud et al. (2016) proposed the concept of quality of information held by each participant.

These authors suggested five components that impacted information power: the aim of the study, sample specificity, use of established theory, quality of interview and analysis strategy. Information power, which guides sample size determination, is related to the aim of the study. A broad study aim needs a larger sample compared to a narrow study aim. For example, a study aiming to explore university English teachers understanding of CPD would require fewer participants than research investigating how university teachers in different departments

manage their CPD. Since English teachers' CPD is limited to a single department, the sample size can be smaller. However, CPD of university teachers from different departments is wider, necessitating a larger sample.

The second component of information power is sample specificity, which refers to experiences, skills, knowledge and attributes of the participants included in the sample. In this research, university English teachers with specific degrees, teaching/learning experiences and attributes were sought.

Furthermore, the concept of information power, which guides the choice of an adequate sample size, is related to the level of theoretical background of the study. Research supported by limited theoretical perspectives usually requires a larger sample size compared to studies that apply specific theories for planning and analysis. This is because established frameworks may provide more prompts to obtain more information. Theories and frameworks available in the context of ELT in universities in Pakistan, for example, would enhance the information power of my study on English teachers' understanding of CPD.

According to the concept of information power, the sample size is highly dependent on the quality of the interview and the conversation that takes place. In this study, the interviews facilitated a clear and strong communication between the researcher and the participants, offering sufficient information. The data were constructed through interactions during the interviews. Through the pilot study, Unsurprisingly, English teachers with more years of experience possessed more background knowledge about CPD than those with fewer. Thus, they were able to provide a deeper understanding of the information needed for the research.

Finally, information power is related to the chosen analysis strategy of the project. As my project aimed for an in-depth analysis of accounts or discourse, it was sufficient to have only a few participants who could provide detailed information. Therefore, a data-driven coding strategy with a thematic focus was adopted for this study. The goal was to explore the CPD

understanding among English teachers in a university setting and to gather their accounts as a valuable contribution to the field of university teaching and learning.

4.9.2 Issues overcome in the pilot study

When I began my research project, one of the crucial decisions I had to make was recruiting participants who could provide the necessary level of information required for the study. I applied purposive, convenience-based sampling techniques. It was essential to establish criteria for selecting participants who could provide valuable insights leading to a comprehensive understanding of CPD and developing some guidelines for it. However, I encountered challenges due to the COVID-19 pandemic and strict lockdown measures in Pakistan, which resulted in most universities being closed and staff members working from home. Additionally, limited internet connectivity made it challenging to sustain lengthy conversations. Initially, the process of recruiting participants and determining their profiles was unclear to me. I considered collecting only CVs at the time of the interview or afterwards, as well as publicly available information from university websites. However, I did not consider collecting information from social platforms like LinkedIn and ResearchGate during the pilot study.

Given these circumstances, I felt inclined to recruit insiders who could actively help me. As a result, I decided to approach my husband's brother and my own siblings in Pakistan, reaching out to them to request assistance in connecting with potential participants. According to research (Swain & King, 2022) when a request comes through a known and trusted colleague, people are more likely to consider seriously compared to when it comes from a stranger. I obtained the participants' consent to participate through personal contact numbers provided by my family members.

Using insiders or relying too heavily on personal networks for recruitment carries certain risks, such as potential bias in selecting participants with specific views. To mitigate these risks, I established guidelines for utilising insiders' assistance. I selected individuals who had a good

and trustworthy relationship with my chosen insider (Swain & King, 2022). This involved spending time getting to know the circle of potential assistants before asking them for their help in recruitment.

An important characteristic of my insider assistants was their knowledgeability (Swain & King, 2022). Additionally, I maintained regular contact with my recruitment facilitators as they were my family members. This regular communication allowed me to address any problems and to determine if there was anything I could do to facilitate the participants in the research process or provide them with more information. When participants received their invitation to participate from my recruitment facilitators, they responded to me directly, ensuring the confidentiality of the research information.

With the support of insiders, during the pilot study stage, I started with three participants from the same public university known for its strong reputation in the region. As the interview is a significant activity in the research process and requires establishing good rapport, I contacted participants through their WhatsApp numbers and discussed the initial process of research and interview procedure. This initial contact happened through exchange of text messages, which gave me confidence in participants' approachability. My participants in the pilot study were all male and over 50 years old as HE in Pakistan is predominantly male-dominated, and in my main study, only one female participant consented to participate. The pilot study participants were assigned pseudonyms (Aqib, Nouman & Faraz), and they received the consent forms (Appendix 1) and information sheets (Appendix 2) in advance. I followed a planned approach during the interviews: the first interview focused on asking a single question, '*Please tell me your professional story, including all events that remain significant in your profession.*' This was followed by a second interview to clarify any confused and unclear statements made during the first interview, and finally, a third interview centred around a conversation on the affordances and barriers of the CPD.

These interviews led me to reflect on the various factors such as number of years in the teaching profession and the attainment of degrees, and I noticed that there were more participants with PhD degrees. Based on this observation, I decided to use participants' profiles as a data collection source. It was important to ensure that each participant had some research achievements. I intended to compare participants' research achievements when they discussed their CPD stories and how they translated their personal learning into a medium of expression beyond teaching. Therefore, it was necessary for my research participants to have several years of teaching and learning experience and a specific degree to achieve homogeneity in the sampling. I realised that participants who had played various roles in their career could provide more diverse and insightful information.

4.10 Main study participants, sampling and amendments

After considering the aspects discussed in *Information power and sampling in the pilot study* (Section 4.9.1), it was determined that a purposive sample of 10 participants, with a minimum 15 years' teaching/learning experience as English teachers, would offer adequate insights to explore their understanding of CPD and development of guidelines.

Table 9 Details about Participants n = 13

Research sites	Participants	Research Site	Years of Experience	Position	Received PhD from
1	Zain & Imran	Public	More than 15 years	Professors	Foreign University
1	Usman & Abdullah	Public	More than 15 years	Professors	Home University
1	Noureen	Public	15 years	Professor	Home University
2	Ali	Public	15 years	Professor	Foreign University
2	Farooq	Public	15 years	Assistant. Professor	Home University
3	Ahmed	Private	15 years	Professor	Foreign University
4	Bilal & Muhammad	Private	15 years	Professors	Foreign University

Initial contact was made through emails, followed by a second round of emails sent to the target participants, similar to the approach described in the *Issues Overcome in Pilot Study* (Section 4.9.2.) above. In the main study, participants who expressed interest were contacted via WhatsApp for interview scheduling, as it was found to be a more convenient communication method in the context. While some target participants did not respond, despite reasonable attempts, those who showed consent were followed up. To ensure purposive and homogeneous sampling, established procedures outlined by Tangco (2007), and Brewis (2014) were employed. Additionally, the snowball technique was utilised, wherein willing participants were requested to recommend other potential participants who met the research criteria (Parker et

al., 2019). Three participants were successfully referred through this technique, and I received consent from them.

4.10.1 Element of bias in snowball sampling

It is important to acknowledge that snowball sampling, as highlighted in research by Parker et al., (2019), can introduce bias into the sample. Participants may, for example, tend to suggest people who share the similar viewpoints on the phenomenon under study. Therefore, it is crucial to recognise that this sampling strategy should be used as a convenient form of sampling and only in specific circumstances. However, due to the challenging circumstances of limited access to English teachers during the COVID-19 pandemic, the snowball technique was adopted. Clear instructions were provided to participants regarding the desired characteristics for referral, aiming to minimise potential bias in the sample selection process.

4.11 Quality of the research: trustworthiness

Since this study is grounded in qualitative research, it represents a contextual truth and a multifaceted reality (O’Kane et al., 2021), as experienced by the participants and the researcher. To ensure academic integrity and establish trustworthiness, I followed procedures informed by qualitative inquiry experts (Denzin & Lincoln, 1995; O’Kane et al., 2021; Shenton, 2004). Trustworthiness in qualitative research is paradigm bound to some extent, with specific standards emerging from selected paradigms. Criteria such as sufficiency of and immersion in the data, attention to subjectivity and reflexivity, data adequacy and interpretation and presentation issues are essential in qualitative research.

To maintain research integrity, I employed the four criteria of trustworthiness defined by Guba and Lincoln (1994): credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. Measures were taken to meet these criteria, including careful analysis of the data, prolonged conversations, utilisation and comparison of multiple data sources.

An important criterion for ensuring trustworthiness in this study involved engaging in extensive and prolonged conversations with the participants. These conversations allowed for comparisons between the accounts and statements provided by participants on different occasions. The long conversations were facilitated through a schema of multiple interview rounds conducted as part of the research methodology. In this study, interviews were organised in three sessions, with careful preparation for each session to ensure productive utilisation of time. The second and third sessions specifically emphasised maintaining a conversational atmosphere.

The adoption of multiple interview sessions proved to be a pivotal component in establishing trust with the participants. The repeated engagements created a sense of familiarity, cultivating open and frank discussions (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Throughout multiple rounds of interviews and by immersing myself in the practices of the participants at the research sites through reflection and contextualisation of their accounts within the society where I had been living and working for a significant period. This approach allowed me to gain a deeper insight into the cultural and contextual factors that shaped the experiences of the English teachers. The participants' statements provided valuable insights, prompting further probing and exploration. The main study involved conducting three interviews with each participant, in total lasting approximately one hour and 20 minutes. This was followed by six months dedicated to data analysis, comparison of multiple data sources, and the write-up of findings.

To ensure trustworthiness, findings from all data sources were analysed and triangulated. Triangulation involved using multiple methods to collect data, gathering information from interviews, analysing English teachers' profiles and keeping a reflective journal (Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Larrivee, 2008). Connecting and verifying data through triangulation increased the study's rigour.

One of the important elements to enhance the trustworthiness of qualitative research is member checking. After completing the first interview transcripts, research participants were contacted to review the content, allowing them to add information and/or clarify any statements made during the interviews. However, research participants did not provide any additional responses beyond confirming or clarifying their statements in the second or third rounds of interviews. Ensuring the accuracy of transcripts, data analysis and data presentation is a crucial aspect of research trustworthiness, as previously mentioned (Guba & Lincoln, 1994; Larrivee, 2008). The primary objective of this process is to verify the mutual understanding between participants and researchers regarding the information conveyed and shared. In order to achieve this, I incorporated a second session in the interview process with each participant to confirm the intended meaning of any implicit statements. For example, when participants discussed challenges in their profession, CPD or field, I openly asked them to clarify their intended message, rather than relying on my own assumptions. As a result, the construction of narrative was a collaborative effort between the participant and researcher, ensuring accuracy and co-construction of meaning.

Another aspect of maintaining academic integrity in this study involved verifying the coding process through peer reviews (O’Kane et al., 2021). Coding verification entailed sharing sections of coded work with my peers, who were qualitative doctoral students and educators who were familiar with ELT in universities as well as coding. I reached out to four of my friends, providing each of them with two pages of coded data (c. 600-700 words), along with different transcripts and a list of codes accompanied by some guiding questions.

However, this code verification process encountered certain challenges. It took longer than anticipated due to my friends’ busy schedules, as they all had demanding commitments, including one friend with significant family responsibilities. The questions I posed to them encompassed various aspects, such as their observations from the provided excerpts, whether

their coding would differ from mine if they were to code those sections, and how they would approach coding those particular data segments. I did not impose any specific coding method on them; I shared the definitions of open and NVivo coding for reference.

Upon receiving the transcripts, my friends had applied their respective coding approaches. The discrepancies I noticed between their coding and mine were minimal. For example, while I used the term “first job” they use “initiating job”, and in cases where I referred to the “current position,” they utilised both “current job title” and “current position.” Additionally, if I had coded a line under the phrase “teaching strategy,” they had coded the same line as an “instructional method.” In essence, the variations in understanding the meaning and capturing it through coding were not substantial. Inviting external reviewers to assess the analytic procedures and claims made in the study contributes to obtaining diverse perspectives (Denzin & Lincoln, 1995; Shenton, 2004), thereby increasing the study's trustworthiness and rigour.

During a qualitative data analysis training, I observed differences in coding approaches based on participants' field. This experience highlighted the influence of disciplinary background on coding practices. Reviewing past and present practices in qualitative/narrative research also contributed to the integrity of this study and supported by Holter (2022). For me, rigour, credulity, and trustworthiness are dependent on transparent methods and methodologies applied throughout the research process.

In non-quantitative research, validity should be judged by readers rather than linked to a singular truth (Holter, 2022). I aimed to make my research process visible and auditable, providing possibilities for others to perceive it as academically rigorous. The final judgement lies with those who engage with this work.

4.12 Ethics in the study

Due to research being a rigorous and time-consuming process, there is no guarantee that ethical issues would not arise during the research process. Measures were taken to protect participants,

requiring more ethical considerations than many other activities, especially since the research involved online interactions where issues can quickly arise (Chambers, 1999). I have complied with the ethical standards given by the UCLAN and ethical consideration was taken in following components of the research, and steps were taken accordingly.

Informed and free/voluntarily participation is acknowledged as one of the core principles of ethical treatment of human participation in any research (Warwick et al., 2021). The informed consent in this study was the result of a process of reaching an agreement to work collaboratively as participant and researcher, and participants were contacted at their disposal. Written consent forms were sent to participants in advance to obtain their consent for the research (Appendix 1), rather than simply having a consent form signed. As previously mentioned, I first contacted the target participants through their friends and colleagues and before starting a formal process of sharing any information they were asked for consent. After receiving their initial consent, they were contacted for a further process of sharing information about their role and researcher's expectations, and the contact involved frequent and timely texting on WhatsApp. For example, on WhatsApp I greeted them and left the response at their disposal and when they responded I continued the process of introducing and sharing information, about myself as the researcher and the study.

In reference to participants' recruitment and ethical implications, in the culture where this research took place it is common to contact people through their friends and family members and be treated like their own family members and be ready to help beyond expectations. I have presented the complete details of how I contacted and recruited participants in the section '*Pilot study*' and '*Virtual interview process*'.

Another important consideration was avoidance of conflict, it is a general principle in qualitative research not to exploit any relationship established as a researcher to further benefit at the expense of the best interests of the research participants (Warwick et al., 2021). For

example, conflicts of interest generally arise from the pre- and post-relationship roles of researcher and participants in their personal lives. The objectivity of the research can be compromised when research is conducted on individuals with whom the researcher had some involvement in another capacity or role. To avoid this type of issues, I contacted completely unknown people for my study whom I did not have any collaboration within any other capacity. A striking feature of this research is that a central status was given to the guiding principles of respect for the dignity of participants (Warwick et al., 2021). Also, it is deemed appropriate to treat participants as persons not mere things or objects. That is, when the researcher engaged individuals as participants in the research, they were treated as human beings with their own distinctive individuality and autonomy. Additionally, to maintain that feature, while planning to adopt qualitative life story research, I focused on listening attentively and empathetically. The narrative is a growing, multidisciplinary tradition of research that utilises in-depth autobiographical interviews as tools to collect stories and it involves listening to informants talk in their own terms about what had been imperative in their lives (Warwick et al., 2021). This trait of narrative/qualitative research emphasises that collected information from participants is typically detailed and individually specific as well as saturated with indicating markers, so that disguising their identities becomes extremely difficult. I have taken precautions through the use of codes that only the researcher can decipher and coded their research work and achievements. I worked diligently on keeping stories unidentifiable in the sense that I sum up courses, training and research into topics. Additionally, the research participants were fully aware of the purpose of the study in advance and had the right to stop participating at any time. I explained to all participants that their data would serve research purposes only.

During the entire process of research, I remain transparent and vigilant. However, I must acknowledge that in future, this data may unfold more elements and concepts as I develop as a researcher and thinker and ultimately may see things in a more connected manner.

4.13 Chapter summary

This chapter provided a comprehensive and concise account of the chosen design. I began with a background on Pakistan, its language policy, and the significance of ELT, which contextualised the research questions and design. Another important aspect dealt with in this chapter is the exploratory nature of the study that led me to the development of the qualitative-narrative approach chosen for the main study, drawing on the rehearsal of a pilot study. In addition, another significant element outlined specific methods employed, such as virtual interviewing, document analysis and reflective journal writing for data collection and information provided. Additionally, the chapter covered the pilot study, which supported the decision-making process for the main study's sampling process. Furthermore, an overview was included of the amendments made for the main study. The chapter also addressed the quality of research by using various strategies to check the data analysis procedures. Finally, it ended by providing an overview of the trustworthiness of the research findings, addressing various characteristics discussed in the relevant literature.

In summary, this chapter provided a comprehensive and inclusive account of the research design decisions by considering the context, theoretical framework, specific methods, pilot study, participants' selection, research quality and trustworthiness of the outcomes.

Chapter Five: Data organisation and analysis

Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to provide some details about data organisation and data analysis procedures. In the first section, the various data organisation steps and data analysing procedures are presented; the subsequent sections present the coding process, the software, and examples of coding and categories with emergent themes. The chapter opens by introducing the thematic and content approach to data analysis. This primary section establishes the foundation for the subsequent content. In the following section, I will explain the significance and rationale behind adopting the thematic and content approach for data analysis.

5.1 Content and thematic analysis

Content analysis is a systematic approach used to analyse qualitative data, such as interviews, documents, or observations, to identify patterns, themes, or categories within the data (Braun & Clarke, 2012; Neuendorf, 2018). In my project, content analysis involved closely examining and categorising the responses and narratives provided by university English teachers in Pakistan. This allowed me to extract meaningful information from participants' accounts and gain insights into their understanding of CPD.

Thematic analysis, on the other hand, was used as a method to identify and analyse recurring themes or patterns across the data. It involved identifying, coding, and organising the data based on the underlying themes or topics that emerge from the responses of the participants (Braun & Clarke, 2012; Williams & Moser, 2019). During this phase, I identified and coded meaningful units of information, such as recurring ideas, significant events, or prominent emotions. As coding progressed, similar codes were grouped together to form initial themes. These themes captured the English teachers' perspectives, challenges, successes, and aspirations related to their CPD. In this study, thematic analysis helped to uncover and interpret

the main themes and sub-themes related to how university English teachers perceive and make sense of their CPD within the Pakistani context.

By employing both content and thematic analysis, I systematically examined the data collected from my research participants. This approach allowed me to identify key concepts and gain a comprehensive understanding of the experiences, perspectives, and challenges faced by university English teachers in Pakistan concerning their professional progress.

After describing the aim and objective of using content and thematic analysis, the next section focuses on stages in data analysis including how data was organised, read and analysed.

5.2 Stages in the data analysis process - data organisation

According to Stuckey's (2014) perspective, effective data management has an essential role in conducting meaningful analysis, and it involves the steps that I have taken to manage all my data. To keep all data in order, I saved it by date and stored it in an electronic file. In this chapter, a detailed description of each step that was taken to organise and convert the data into a meaningful shape has been included under distinct headings to facilitate a clear understanding of the process.

5. 2.1. Initiating the data analysis procedure

Denzin and Lincoln (1995) liken data analysis and interpretation to choreography, where the story must be told in the most effective way to convince the audience. I have attempted to analyse and interpret the interview data and the English teachers' profiles with the intention to present them in a way that would lead to understanding the meaning of the experience under study.

In the data analysis, I took a gradual approach, moving from general to specific coding throughout the entire process of the research. For me, data analysis was a process of continuously making meaning of the data, rather than a distinct task that occurs after data collection. For example, I transcribed the first interviews and designed subsequent ones based

on the insights that emerged from the previous transcriptions, which allowed me to set another round of interviews. This iterative approach to data analysis enabled me to engage with the data in a more meaningful manner and uncover deeper insights into the participants' understanding of their CPD. As William and Moser (2019) noted, data analysis involves examining and interpreting data to understand its significance and meaning.

Before going into detail about each step that I took during my data analysis, I will briefly explain the steps of transcribing, reading, re-reading, coding and categorising data. I have discussed the transcription process in the Methodology chapter due to its relevance to the interview process. This chapter will focus on the remaining steps taken to understand, manage and analyse the data.

5.2.2 Reading the raw data

To obtain meaningful outcomes from each participant's interview and answer my research questions, I adapted a clear framework (Smith, 2016). To ensure accuracy in my analysis, I read the data several times and, when unsure about any element of the interview data source, I retrieved further support from the audio recordings by listening to the context to confirm the meaning of the text and see how and in which sense each participant used the word, phrase, or sentence. Although I was already familiar with the recordings, I found listening to them to be even more helpful during the analysis-writing process. My level of confidence increased when listening and reading the data simultaneously, as I was able to hear each participant's voice and tone when discussing their achievements, which helped me to analyse the data more confidently.

In addition to analysing collected data, I also researched the participants' sense of their professional selves through their social media and research profiles. By examining their online presence, I gained a better understanding of their focus and contributions as researchers, resource persons, course designers and presenters/attendees, which provided additional context

for their responses during the interviews. This approach helped me to gather a more comprehensive understanding of these participants and their perspectives on CPD.

After discussing the data analysis initiating process and elements that were taken care of during the process, in the next section, I will explain how the experience was understood and considered in this study and the basis of that consideration.

5.3 Dewey's notion of experience

When I embarked on the journey of understanding English teachers' CPD experiences I considered the notion of experience in its literal sense and for me understanding this is crucial in this study as it provided valuable insights into English teachers' perspectives and informed the interpretation of data. In this study, the understanding of experience was centred on the notion that university English teachers in the Pakistani context possess knowledge and expertise gained through their professional journeys and educational backgrounds. To obtain a consolidated understanding of their experience I applied Dewey's phenomenon of experience (cited in Muhit, 2013), particularly one of its fundamental principles, continuity of experience. This refers to how experiences, both past and present, influence the future. This strongly resonated with my aim, and it encouraged me to view the English teachers I was studying as complex individuals whose experiences were interconnected (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) and constantly evolving. To better understand how the English teachers' past and present experiences shaped their teaching practices, I used Dewey's phenomenon of experience to acknowledge the interdependence of different stages of professional experience. By doing so, I was able to identify patterns and connections between the English teachers' experiences and their teaching practices.

Connectedness is central to understanding narratives. In this sense, narratives are generally understood to have some form of chronology or meaningful focus; the sequencing of events is not random due to their connectedness, so prior events seem to lead inevitably towards later

ones. For example, one sequence of events may be a teacher who is looking for opportunities for CPD, which lead them towards particular achievements. The connectedness is often constructed around a particular point or meaning that the narrator conveys to the audience (Clandinin & Huber, 2002).

Also, representing each experience in the narrative in a connected way is essential. Namely, the interdependence of past, present and future embedded within each account of a participant lived and re-told. Each participant's experiences are connected to each other since one experience generates another. For example, their initial professional experience generated mid-professional experience, and more academic degrees, which encouraged them to continue their professional progression. In my recordings of the participants, I was able to maintain the integrity of their narratives (Benson, 2018) and their meaningful content whilst embracing the participants' professional journeys (Barkhuizen & Consoli, 2021) and illustrating the connection between their main decisions to become English teachers, their told events and how these influence one another. In other words, by casting such a guiding net on the accounts told, I remained vigilant to any critical aspects of the participants' narratives that may relate to the research. Simply, by exploring the notion of continuity in English teachers' experiences, I gained a more nuanced understanding of the complex factors that shape their teaching practices and professional identities.

5.4 Dimensions of narrative inquiry

To understand the English teachers' CPD, I adapted three dimensions of experience: temporality, sociality and place to analyse the participants' experiences based on time, cultural connections and environment (Clandinin, 2006). As a researcher, I looked at the events and accounts in terms of how they related to the past, present and future. I also paid attention to the English teachers' personal and social experiences, such as their feelings and interactions with others. Lastly, I considered the impact and influence of various physical and geographical

boundaries, such as schools, public/private universities, foreign university and home on English teachers' experiences. By using this framework, I was able to identify patterns in the data and gain a better understanding of their experiences of CPD.

5.5 Coding process

To ensure the relevance of their data, researchers should begin coding as soon as possible. Like grounded theory research, this involves coding previously collected and transcribed data while continuing to collect new data. In my experience, this allowed me to better understand the data and avoid feeling overwhelmed by having too much at once. Briefly, early coding and analysis can assist and streamline the research process and ensure the accuracy and usefulness of the data collected. As I utilised participants' profiles for additional data, the codes used in interview transcripts were applied to the content of the profiles for comparing and supplementing the data resources.

5.5.1 Coding approaches

As Saldana (2021) suggests, there is no one correct way to code data, and the techniques and interpretation of data coding approaches may vary. In qualitative inquiry, a code is a short word or phrase that symbolically carries a meaning, an attribute for a part of a sentence and language. As I was seeking patterns in the data, the coding was data driven. To understand this better, consider the titles of famous books: a good book title captures the essence of what the book is about, reflects what the writer has interpreted as significant to the story, and gives meaning to the content. Similarly, coding is more than just labelling, it leads to clear concepts (Richards & Morse, 2012).

5.5.2 Looking for patterns

During my analysis of each participant's data, I considered several questions to assist me in understanding their experiences and how they related to the research questions, such as CPD, environment, barriers, affordances and attributes of English teachers. I asked myself, "What is

the main experience? What are the other experiences, and how do they connect to the research questions and are there any deeper meaning in these experiences?” These questions were useful in understanding even the smallest unit of data, and they helped to develop a meaningful element containing certain details about the participant and their experience with CPD.

To ensure accuracy, I read the data line-by-line, identifying experiences and understanding how they could be coded and framed within a meaningful category. I used a strategy set with certain components: a beginning, middle, and end and their relationship with CPD (Barkhuizen & Consoli, 2021). In the coding process, related codes that share a common theme or concept are identified by analysing the coded data. After identifying these features, I organised the codes into the categories based on these features. This procedure was useful to understand the meaningful patterns as I read through a multitude of fragmented data from different sources and helped weave together an experience.

5.5.3 Coding and categorising patterns

In larger and complete data sets, one can find that several to many of the same codes will be used repeatedly throughout. This is both natural and deliberate (Saldaña, 2021): natural because there are mostly repetitive patterns of action and consistencies in human behaviour and deliberate because one of the coder’s primary goals is to find these repetitive patterns of action and consistencies in human affairs as documented in the data. For example, in this study, codes such as “accessibility of teaching as profession”, “motivation for PD”, and “aspirations for promotion” may be used repeatedly across multiple participants. These codes capture common themes and concepts that are relevant to the research questions and assist the researcher to identify patterns in the data.

To get from the codes to the patterns, I used categories to help me narrow down and identify the patterns. Indeed, multiple coding cycles enabled a richer understanding of the data (Saldaña, 2021). According to Richards and Morse (2012), the process of categorising allows the

researcher to move from the diversity of the data to its underlying shapes and patterns. In this research, I identified similar codes and grouped them into categories. It is worth noting that many of these categories were latent, meaning that they were hidden or unobservable variables. At first, I thought of categories as a word or phrase describing some explicit part of my data (Williams & Moser, 2019). However, as I revisited my codes, I realised that some of them could be used as categories due to their broader meaning. Therefore, the data in this study were coded multiple times. After recognising patterns in the data and conducting their initial coding, the process of comparing, contrasting and interrogating codes into meaningful units of data remained helpful. In short, my approach involved identifying and grouping similar codes to uncover latent categories to provide underlying insights and patterns in the data.

5.5.4 Use of software

In the main study, I utilised NVivo software to assign codes or comments on segments of data. This process allowed me to preserve the distinctive characteristics of each data segment, making it easier to analyse the data effectively. I conducted in-vivo coding for management and reduction of the data. In-vivo coding, according to Saldana (2021), refers to a word or short phrase from the actual language found in the interview responses given by the research participants. This allowed me to weave the participants' language into descriptive codes. Thus, specific words or phrases used by the participants became their own semantic units of meaning without the use of any researcher-assigned descriptive labels. Additionally, NVivo software provided an opportunity to stay close to the data because the codes were words and phrases used by the participants. The table below is a list of codes I applied.

Table 10 Example of codes

List of codes	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. university education 2. admission 3. BA in international relations 4. master's in English literature 5. BS program evening 6. different options 7. declined the offer 8. strong intention 9. started 10. tutor part time 11. my masters 12. opt teaching as my journey 13. associate professor 14. I am in a teaching 15. elevate myself 16. decided 17. apply university 18. permanent job 19. teaching as my career 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 20. position in English department 21. offered a job 22. cooperative teacher 23. to be a teacher 24. every person 25. struggle 26. university career 27. qualified for GRE 28. I was given [the] option to go abroad 29. my doctorate 30. due to limited funding 31. not go to England. 32. admission different universities 33. I was asked 34. expenses be covered 35. amount scholarship 36. development program 37. did my PhD 38. I'm serving

In addition, the software allowed me to open, browse, interrogate and code several documents per participant simultaneously within the same browser, for example, Ali's interview 1, interview 2, interview 3, his profile and my reflective journal about him. When it comes to other benefits of the software, it was productive. For example, when I was coding a paragraph and a participant's words about their research interests and aims, I could match their statements with their research that was mentioned in their profiles.

Table 11 Examples of categories

Codes to categories	
<p>1) Preparation for teaching</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. university education 2. admission 3. BA in International Relations 4. Master's in English literature 5. BS program evening 6. strong intention 7. tutor part-time 8. opt teaching as my career 9. started 10. my master's 11. position in English department 12. to be a teacher 13. different options 14. declined the offer 15. I didn't prefer to sit that exam 	<p>3) University limited scholarship</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 16. university career 17. I was given option to go abroad 18. due to limited funding 19. not go to England. 20. I was asked to cover expenses 21. amount [of] scholarship 22. development program
<p>2) University career</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 23. I am in teaching 24. offered a job 25. cooperative teacher 26. every person 27. struggle 28. journey 29. qualified for GRE⁶ 30. apply [to] university 31. permanent job 32. my doctorate 33. elevate myself 34. associate professor 35. decided teaching as my career 36. did my PhD 37. I'm serving 38. admission [to] different universities 39. competitive exam 40. administrative jobs 	<p>4) Teaching as profession</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 41. teaching can only give you livelihood 42. teaching is a humble job 43. after doing your master's 44. I believe I [was] born for teaching 45. one more job into the HE 46. I decided to go into teaching 47. to keep yourself updated 48. learning and receiving knowledge 49. more time for family 50. induction in 18 grades

⁶ Graduate Record Exam

5.6 English teachers' profiles: analysis process

As the researcher, interpreting the information was the critical aspect of my research. To address this challenge, I took some specific steps such as trying to understand the context in which the information was shared. Once that was understood, the information was analysed. This involved identifying trends and patterns: the degrees achieved, articles published, and courses designed. The next step that was taken to evaluate English teachers' profiles and this process of evaluation involved determining the importance of the degrees achieved. Finally, I drew conclusions based on the information provided in English teachers' profiles and this involved making inferences based on factual information provided in CVs and research profiles and identifying any implications or recommendations for CPD. I focused on finding the relation between interviews and profiles in reference to knowledge and skills gained, research done, and courses completed and designed. Since I was not interested in verifying the achievements, but in obtaining information about the additional context, I utilised English teachers' profiles as documents.

Research (Holter, 2022; Morgan, 2022; Watt, 2007) suggests that qualitative researchers acknowledge any discrepancies in their data to ensure the accuracy and validity of the research findings. However, the possibility of discrepancies between English teachers' profiles and their interview data was unlikely as both have been presented in a specific form by these English teachers, and my aim was to see what their perceptions of CPD were and how they translated these into reality in the form of academic achievements.

Profile analysis involved three stages: skimming (superficial examination), reading/re-reading (thorough examination) and interpretation. This process combined elements of content and thematic analysis by organising profile information into specific categories related to research questions (Braun & Clarke, 2012; Neuendorf, 2018; Williams & Moser, 2019). Using thematic analysis involved finding patterns within English teachers' profiles, such as their research areas, the type of CPD courses they did, the academic bodies they belong to, and the academic degrees

they achieved. Additionally, I used predefined codes because the profiles analysis was used in this research as a supplementary tool for interviews.

The English teachers' profiles were a rich source of data and were utilised carefully (Morgan, 2022) in three ways. First, I used them to help inform the questions I asked during interviews. By adopting this way of utilising information, I was able to ask more informed and specific questions that were directly related to the English teachers' CPD experiences. Second, they were used in the process of coding to supplement the data collected from the interviews. By contrasting and comparing the information collected from the profiles with the information gathered from interviews, I was able to gain a more complete and subtle understanding of the participants' experiences and perceptions. Finally, I used them to establish background information of the field of ELT to gain a broader understanding of the field, including the courses and degrees that are typically pursued by English teachers. I was able to contextualise the English teachers' experiences within a larger framework of ELT in Pakistan.

Additionally, the information obtained from the profiles was sequenced with interview responses to create meaningful statements. For example, when English teachers reported designing teaching material according to new methods in the ELT field, I compared their responses by analysing the courses they taught or designed and their completion of relevant CPD courses. By examining both, I was able to infer the English teachers' approach towards the field and obtain a deeper understanding of their professional practices.

A significant feature of the English teachers' profiles was their relevance to the main research question and their alignment with the theoretical framework of the research. In particular, I found that the information collected from the profiles best fit with Dewey's notion of continuity of experience. This theoretical framework allowed me to analyse the profiles and identify patterns of gradual development over time. By applying Dewey's framework to the data, I gained a deeper understanding of these participants and their evolution as language teachers.

English teachers' achievements in the form of degrees, courses and seminars attended, papers presented in conferences, courses designed, and published research articles were indicated on their CVs and profiles. Although English teachers' PD can be a complex and multifaceted process, to ensure a real understanding, I took into account the context in which they were working and viewed their achievements within the parameter of local and cultural needs.

5.7 Chapter summary

In this chapter, I have provided a detailed description of the data analysis process of my study, which includes an overview of how I coded the data, software that I used to aid in the analysis, and how codes were transformed into categories. The chapter also includes a brief list of codes and categories to aid in understanding the process of analysis with examples. I have also described the steps taken to manage the data, from reading the raw data to presenting it in the form of codes and categories. Additionally, I have also included a description of the way English teachers' profiles were analysed. As a result, the chapter provides a clear understanding of the data analysis process and elements related to it.

Chapter Six: Findings and discussions

In my opinion, the findings of a research study are analogous to the many facets of a single story seen through different lenses. What I observed as six, you might perceive as nine. It is impossible to definitively attribute an exact meaning to any account, as reality itself is multi-faceted and takes on diverse forms for everyone.

Chapter overview

This chapter is divided into five sections. The first section presents a biographical narrative of each participant, while the remaining four sections present the findings of each of my four research questions. The second section starts with an introduction that outlines the aim and purpose of this study, followed by key considerations that highlight an understanding behind the themes used in this chapter. Next, comes the presentation of the outcomes section, that explains how the findings will be reported. Then, there is a concise introduction to the participants' understanding of CPD. Next, I present how they report their self-directed CPD activities and pursuit of PhDs. I conclude the first section by presenting the participants' reasons for their need for further learning.

Biographical narratives of individual participants

Ali

Ali, employed by a public university, initially pursued a bachelor's degree in International Relations, later opting for an MA in English literature through an evening programme. Facing financial constraints, he also worked as a part-time tutor while completing his master's. Despite being selected for the Police Department, his passion for teaching led him to accept an English teaching assistant position at a local university. In 2008, he joined another local university as

a lecturer in English. In 2011, he qualified for GRE⁷, leading to the opportunity to pursue a PhD abroad. Limited funding directed him to Malaysia, where he successfully completed his doctoral studies.

Currently serving as a professor in a university, Ali highlights the challenges faced in academic promotions, emphasising the crucial role of obtaining a PhD for career advancement in Pakistani universities. He actively engages in PD, attending conferences at various universities. Teaching literary criticism, introduction to literature, and syntax, he discusses the changing criteria for promotions and the importance of a PhD in academic progression.

Ali mentions the desire for knowledge exploration, exposure to diverse perspectives, and the instrumental benefits of promotions and monetary gains as motivations for pursuing a PhD. He highlights the differences in learning environments between Pakistan and other countries, emphasising the broader access to international resources abroad.

Reflecting on his transformation since 2008, Ali notes the significant impact of international exposure on his knowledge, skills, and decision-making. Balancing his career with family priorities, he underscores the importance of providing quality education to his children while remaining in the teaching profession.

Acknowledging the support provided by his university, Ali speaks about the initiatives to establish an English department and the university's role in promoting research and inviting international speakers. He emphasises the need for universities to support teachers' academic growth.

Ali addresses the challenges in ELT in Pakistani schools and colleges: the disparity in class sizes and its impact on effective teaching, the need for modern teaching methods, and reforms to create a student-centred approach.

⁷ Graduate Record Exam.

As a researcher, he has published papers exploring students' the disparities in motivations among students in science and engineering disciplines. Ali emphasises the importance of training for teachers, particularly in effective communication and classroom management.

Concluding with recommendations for a more structured approach to PD, he advocates for teachers' networks, compulsory training, and a time-bound process for individual research initiatives to enhance the overall quality of education in Pakistan.

Bilal

Bilal, employed by a private university, embarked on a journey of PD in the field of education and language teaching approximately 20 years ago. Initially pursuing an MA in English literature somewhat reluctantly, he soon realised the necessity of further professional growth to excel in the teaching profession.

Motivated by the desire for excellence, Bilal sought admission to a programme in ELT in the UK, despite facing financial challenges. Fascinated by the prospect of achieving something extraordinary in teaching, he completed the ELT programme and continued his journey with a PhD in applied linguistics from a UK university, gaining teaching experiences in England along the way.

Upon returning to Pakistan, Bilal joined a university and has been in his current location for the past five years. His academic qualifications, including a specialization in critical discourse analysis, have served as significant milestones in his career. However, he emphasises that PD also involves practical experiences, workshops, and hands-on learning.

The narrative explores the shift in perspective regarding language and literature teaching, recognizing the distinctiveness of ELT and the necessity of specific skills in areas like materials development, syllabus design, and pedagogy. He teaches 20 credit hours per week and, apart from working for external recognition or career advancement, Bilal also now focuses more on

personal intellectual quests and interests, researching diverse topics such as conducting critical discourse analysis on Nikah Nama (a social marriage contract in the Muslim world).

He discusses the cultural and educational differences observed in teaching between Pakistan and the UK, highlighting the challenge of balancing Western teaching approaches with the conservative background of students in Pakistan. Advocating for comprehensive, compulsory training programmes for teachers in Pakistan, Bilal draws parallels with the UK's postgraduate certificate requirement.

Bilal's reflections on the teaching profession acknowledge the challenges faced as an introverted individual who values quiet, and solitude yet has dedicated 20 years to teaching. He emphasises the importance of a teaching environment that caters to various personality types and emphasises ongoing, holistic teacher development.

Ahmed

Ahmed, employed by a private university, embarked on his teaching journey after transitioning from a career in engineering to pursue his passion for teaching English literature and language. Beginning as a cooperative teacher at a university, he taught subjects like English drama and South Asian literature, which deepened his commitment to teaching as a profession.

Ahmed then secured a master's scholarship for the UK, and subsequently, he earned a PhD in applied linguistics, focusing on topics of interest such as willingness to communicate in a second language.

Returning to Pakistan, Ahmed joined a local university as a lecturer, where he taught language courses and conducted research in education and applied linguistics. He prioritised CPD, actively seeking opportunities to enhance his teaching skills and knowledge in language education. His teaching philosophy centres around dialogic pedagogy and critical literacy, aiming to foster dialogue and critical thinking among his students, and a collaborative learning environment where students actively participate in knowledge construction.

Currently a professor, he continues his research on language policy and education as well as pursuing a postdoctoral fellowship, expanding his expertise in educational linguistics and language teaching. Ahmed's teaching responsibilities are 12 to 15 hours per week (4 or 5 courses). His teaching load has been reduced, reflecting his academic advancement and increasing responsibilities. However, Ahmed has remained dedicated to his students' intellectual growth and PD, emphasising lifelong learning and intellectual curiosity.

Zain

Zain is employed by a public university and embarked on his teaching career at a university in Pakistan, primarily focusing on literature. After obtaining an MA in English literature, initially working as a research associate; after three and a half years he became a permanent faculty member.

In 2004, he became a lecturer and in 2006, secured a scholarship for further studies from the HEC, and expressed gratitude for the opportunities it provided. He opted for applied linguistics and completed his MA in TESOL and later obtained a PhD in applied linguistics from a UK University.

Returning to his home institution, Zain attained the position of professor, eventually becoming the director of the Institute of English Language and Literature. He highlights the importance of foreign PhDs in contributing to the growth of academic programmes, including the initiation of MPhil and PhD programmes in literature and applied linguistics.

He mentions his dedication to teaching various subjects, including language learning theory, intercultural language communication, and research methodology. Additionally, he reflects on the influence of his father, who played a significant role in shaping his commitment to learning. Zain highlights the importance of consistency, hard work, and overcoming challenges and uncertainties in professional growth. He acknowledges the changing landscape of promotions

in the academic sector, driven by new rules and guidelines, and expresses concern for the current generation of lecturers who may face limited opportunities.

The narrative continues to unfold in the educational context of Pakistan, where Zain shares insights into his teaching philosophy and the challenges faced in the higher education system. He emphasises the need to create a more interactive and student-friendly learning environment, fostering a space where students can learn beyond textbooks. Acknowledging the impact of the teacher-student relationship on the learning process, Zain notes that students face challenges such as fear of communication, grading concerns, and the perception of the teacher as the sole arbitrator of their grades. He questions whether such barriers hinder the real purpose of education and encourages discussions about life experiences, sharing, and understanding, aiming to impart more than just theoretical knowledge.

He teaches several subjects across different levels, including graduate and postgraduate courses such as Language Learning Theory, Intercultural Language Communication, Second Language Learning, and Micro Teaching. At the MPhil level, he covers Intercultural Language Communication, Research Methodology, and Critical Discourse Analysis, and at the PhD level, he teaches Intercultural Language Communication. Additionally, he supervises PhD students across different semesters. At the moment, he teaches one of the following: bachelor courses with 3 credit classes (9 hours), MPhil courses with 3 credit classes (2 classes), or PhD courses with 3 credit classes (1 class).

The narrative acknowledges personal growth and evolution as a teacher, and transition from a more authoritarian teaching style to one that is more student-friendly, communicative, and focused on holistic development. He broadens the discussion to the challenges faced by the HE teaching community in Pakistan, pointing out systemic issues including unequal opportunities, delays, and funding problems that impact scholars, students, and teachers alike. He highlights the importance of government investment in HE for research, quality education, and

interdisciplinary collaboration and advocates for HE to receive its due attention and funding for the betterment of the entire educational system.

The discussion covers Zain's teaching philosophy, the challenges faced in HE, and the recent policy changes, focusing on the dissatisfaction among teachers, the need for inclusive decision-making processes, the lack of collaboration, disconnected practices, policy changes in HE, and the need for the appropriate people in positions within universities and to develop educational policies.

Usman

Usman, employed by a public university, started his teaching journey in the field of English literature, following the completion of an MA in English literature from a Pakistani university. Initially a research associate, he transitioned to teaching English language to various BA to BSc classes including final-year students. Within the first year, Usman secured a permanent lecturer position, and progressed through the academic ranks, attaining the status of a full professor seven years ago.

Although his journey into teaching began without formal training, it was later reshaped by a postgraduate diploma in teaching English as an international language. This foundational training emphasised a shift to a student-centred approach. Simultaneously, Usman pursued a PhD supervised by a distinguished faculty member, adding depth to his professional profile. Usman's dedication to self-improvement is evident. Pursuing a PhD locally due to the absence of a structured doctoral programme took eight years but added significant value to his academic credentials.

Motivated by his father, a proficient high school teacher in English and mathematics, Usman highlights the intrinsic connection between passion and profession. Throughout his career, he has sought continuous improvement in teaching methods, adapting strategies to diverse student backgrounds and learning levels. In terms of CPD, exposure to refresher courses and

workshops played a crucial role in Usman's growth. However, he expresses concerns about the lack of a robust training culture within his teaching community and advocates for more sharing of experiences among colleagues.

The narrative delves into educational challenges, including inadequate infrastructure, varied student academic backgrounds, and the need for mandatory training courses for faculty. Despite challenges, Usman finds motivation in the honour of the professorial title, financial benefits, and enriching connections with colleagues nationally and internationally.

The narrative concludes with Usman, currently serving as the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, expressing satisfaction with his qualifications and reflecting on the multifaceted motivations within the teaching profession, encompassing passion, financial incentives, and the continual pursuit of knowledge and improvement. Despite his current position, he recently attended a language and literature conference at a local university and teaches PhD courses titled 'Trends and Issues in Literary Theory' twice a week, while supervising three PhD and three MPhil candidates.

Imran

Imran, employed by a public university, initiated his language teaching journey during university studies, starting in a private academy and progressing to teaching at a local school. After graduation, he secured a position at a private school and later transitioned to teaching at a university. He pursued a master's abroad and commenced a PhD in 2008, completing it in 2013. A brief break during his PhD allowed Imran to join the university for a year before resuming his studies. Subsequently, he progressed from assistant professor to associate professor, attaining the rank of professor in 2018.

Imran's instructional portfolio extends beyond ELT, covering subjects such as Language Learning Theory, Micro Teaching, and Research Methodology. Additionally, he supervises two PhD candidates and teaches classes at various academic levels, including BS (credit 9

hours, 3 classes), MPhil (credit 3 hours, 2 classes), or PhD (credit 3 hours, 1 class) in different semesters.

In 2018, Imran undertook an international assignment in China for three semesters, returning due to COVID-19. His commitment to ongoing self-improvement appears evident, and recent PD includes attending a conference at a local university, and networking within the academic community.

Despite institutional constraints and organisational challenges in the educational landscape, Imran remains motivated by the impact of teaching, on individuals and society. Salary, social status, and recognition also emerge as key motivating factors.

The narrative highlights Imran's commitment to ongoing self-improvement, the importance of reflective practices, and the need for a more collaborative and structured approach to PD.

Abdullah

Abdullah's started teaching at a local public school, where he discovered a passion for education. He now teaches in a public university, and transitioning to the Institute of English Language and Literature at a university marked the beginning of his career as a lecturer. He recognised the importance of PD early on and actively engaged in training sessions organised by the UGC, significantly enhancing his teaching skills.

Driven by a commitment to professional growth, he pursued further certifications, including a rigorous one-year course with Cambridge University. This experience provided invaluable insights into effective teaching methodologies, shaping his approach to education. Throughout his career, he has maintained a focus on understanding students' needs and emotions, emphasising the role of continuous learning in becoming a proficient educator.

As a professor in language and literature, he teaches 3 to 6 hours per week, following the common practice in Pakistan. His teaching responsibilities include subjects such as language

learning theory at the undergraduate level, and intercultural language communication at both MPhil and PhD levels. Additionally, he supervises PhD students in linguistics and literature. His dedication to PD appears to extend beyond formal training, encompassing participation in workshops and conferences locally and internationally. Recent participation in events such as a visit to a local university reflects his ongoing dedication to growth and collaboration within the academic community. Despite facing challenges such as infrastructure issues and student politics, he remains committed to creating a conducive learning environment for his students. Acknowledging the crucial support of his spouse, he attributes his success and peace of mind to his partner's understanding and encouragement. This support enables him to maintain his focus on teaching, research, and administrative tasks, embodying his commitment to lifelong learning and PD.

Noureen

Noureen, from an interior area of Sindh is employed by a public university and is on her professional journey with some uncertainty about her career path. Noureen faced challenges in navigating her academic and professional aspirations due to limited guidance and resources. However, she persevered and successfully obtained admission to the university, where she pursued her passion for studying English literature.

Despite initial uncertainty, Noureen gradually discovered her passion for teaching and aspired to become a university lecturer. However, due to academic performance requirements, she transitioned from literature to linguistics, eventually earning a master's degree in ELT. This shift opened up new avenues for Noureen and fuelled her dedication to continuously improve her skills and knowledge in the field of education.

Noureen's journey in PD reflects her proactive approach to enhancing her teaching skills. She actively participated in various training courses, workshops, and MOOCs, focusing on ELT methodologies, e-learning, and educational technology. Her commitment to PD also led her to

pursue a PhD in e-learning, where she explored innovative strategies to integrate technology into education.

Throughout her career, Noureen has demonstrated a willingness to adapt and innovate in her teaching practices. She has embraced the use of ICT tools, audio-visual aids, and collaborative learning methods to engage students and enhance their learning experience. Despite facing challenges in accessing PD opportunities and navigating cultural norms, Noureen's resilience, supported by her family, has enabled her to pursue her PD goals.

Noureen's teaching responsibilities are in line with common practices in Pakistan, where lecturers typically teach 12 to 15 hours per week, which generally equates to about 4 or 5 courses. Additionally, assistant professors teach 9 to 12 hours, associate professors teach 6 to 9 hours, and professors teach 6 hours per week. As she is a professor, she normally teaches 2 courses totalling 6 credit hours per week.

Noureen's journey seems to exemplify the transformative power of continuous learning and adaptation in the field of education. From uncertain beginnings to becoming an innovative educator, she appears to inspire others and make a meaningful impact on the landscape of education in Pakistan.

Farooq

Farooq is employed by a public university,

Reflecting on his career choice, he mentioned that becoming an English teacher was not so much a conscious decision as it was a default option given the limited opportunities in his field of study. Drawing a connection between his learning experiences and teaching philosophy, he highlights the importance of incorporating what had personally helped him as a learner into his teaching methods. For example, his unconventional path involved a transition from college to university-level teaching, spanning students of various ages, from eighth graders to undergraduates. Despite the differences in age, he noted that creativity, understanding of

English, and effective communication abilities did not significantly vary among the students. As for his academic journey, he pursued a postgraduate diploma in Library Information Sciences before studying English language and literature. His pursuit of a PhD in linguistics focused on language learning strategies employed by Pakistani undergraduates.

Discussing challenges within the educational system, he highlighted the disconnect between treating English as a subject rather than a language. He expressed frustration at the rigid curricula that limited his ability to introduce more effective teaching methods. However, despite the challenges, he has attempted to empower his students with learner autonomy, fostering conversation classes where students took a central role. He acknowledged the constraints within the system but aimed to instil a sense of autonomy in his students whenever possible. Dissatisfied with the prevalent grammar-based teaching methods dominating the educational landscape, he strongly advocated for alternative approaches, emphasising communication and audio-lingual methods. Despite the societal pressure favouring grammar-centric instruction, he stood firm in his belief that effective language learning stems from real-time communicative practices rather than rote memorisation of rules.

When queried about his satisfaction with his career choice, he affirmed his contentment, especially in deviating from traditional teaching methods. He considered teaching English not merely as a job but as a means of positively influencing students' language learning experiences. Regarding the PhD, he admitted the limitations imposed by the system, where having a PhD and publishing research papers were prerequisites for promotions. He expressed scepticism about the direct correlation between PhD research achievements and effective teaching.

Despite the systemic challenges, he maintained a positive outlook, viewing challenges as opportunities. However, he acknowledged the frustration of being unable to change the system, emphasising the need for patience and persistence in advocating for meaningful reforms.

In addition to his apparent dedication to reforming English language education, he discussed his current teaching responsibilities across diverse subjects. With a rigorous schedule of 16 hours a week, he covers a broad spectrum including: novels, dramas, psychology, and philosophy. This could reflect his versatility or could be due to the demands of his employer. In brief, his narrative unfolds as a journey of persistence and advocacy, where he strives to bring about positive change within the constraints of a challenging educational system.

Muhammad

Muhammad is an experienced teacher from Sindh, who earned his PhD in ELT from a foreign university. From the early stages of his career, Muhammad displayed an affinity for teaching. Starting with teaching English grammar at local institutes, he ventured into establishing language institutes, introducing the audiolingual method to his hometown. His professional journey continued through teaching positions in Karachi, Saudi Arabia, and other Gulf countries, where he contributed significantly to the EFL field. Notably, Muhammad holds the distinction of being the only Pakistani with a PhD in Mobile Learning, showcasing his pioneering work in blending technology with education. Throughout his diverse career, he has remained dedicated to PD, attending workshops, giving presentations, and conducting training sessions worldwide.

Currently based in Sukkur, Muhammad manages various administrative duties alongside teaching a single course (3 credit hours) focused on communication skills in an undergraduate class. In his teaching philosophy, Muhammad places a strong emphasis on adapting to the dynamic needs of students. Moreover, he advocates for the integration of technology into education, recognizing its role in enhancing the learning experience. Central to his approach is the cultivation of a questioning mindset among students, encouraging critical thinking and active engagement in the learning process.

Aside from his teaching responsibilities, Muhammad actively participates in academic events. He recently spoke at international conferences in Pakistan, addressing the impact of educational technology on 21st-century learners and teachers. As a proactive educator, he conducts PD training on various topics, such as lesson planning, interactive classes, indigenous languages, and student engagement. Muhammad also plays a role in course design at the institutional level, contributing to the academic discourse in Pakistan.

Despite facing challenges and resistance, his commitment to continuous learning has led him to question traditional practices and advocate for innovative teaching methods. As an educator, Muhammad continues to contribute to the development of ELT across different regions, which seems to impact the educational landscape, as suggested by his profile (Appendix 5).

Introduction

As a reminder to the reader, the primary objective of this study is to explore English teachers' understanding of CPD in Pakistani universities.

6.1 Presentation of outcomes

I will present the major findings related to each research question, followed by discussions informed by the insights gained. These encompass faculty perspectives, university departments, and relevant literature, offering a view of language teaching and CPD.

Generally, for all the research questions, the decision to present the findings in an interconnected manner was driven by the concept of narrative, which aimed to provide a meaningful representation of each participant's journey. My primary objective was to present the outcomes in an impactful way. However, deciding on the presentation format and justifying the selections was complex. While NI has been adapted in various ways, the primary aim remains similar: presenting outcomes coherently. I presented each research question separately, which helped build a more holistic understanding.

To obtain a comprehensive understanding of participants' CPD, and related elements, I employed a three-part interview approach. This involved asking participants about their professional journeys. A detailed explanation of this three-part interview method is provided in Chapter Four, Methodology.

6.2 Participants' awareness of the research process

During the interview process, I noted that the participants appeared to have a clear understanding of the research process and its importance. They recognised that the interviews were a crucial part of the study, and that the information gathered would be used to draw important conclusions. I believe that their awareness of the interview process stemmed from their own experience with conducting research. They appeared fully familiar of the intricacies involved in pursuing a research degree, including the entire process of data collection, transcription, and reporting of findings.

This awareness led them to be highly attentive to the questions asked and the responses they provided. Throughout the interview process, they were very focused, avoiding conversations that were not directly related to the research phenomenon, even when the opportunity arose. This seemed to demonstrate their commitment to the research process.

Furthermore, the participants were highly respectful of the boundaries established during the interviews in the form of questions, they provided rich descriptions within the phenomenon explored. In short, by staying on topic, providing relevant information, and adhering to established boundaries, they made the interview process highly productive and contributed significant insights to this study. The findings are presented under each research question thematically and are illustrated by quotations from participants' statements.

6.3 Inclusion of strategic quotes

Including quotes to support the chosen themes involves a deliberate selection process. While I selected participants based on their clarity and direct relevance to the respective theme, it is

important to note that all exhibited some level of interest in every theme identified in the findings due to their interconnectedness within the broader context of the study. However, all participants are included in a balanced way to promote unity of focus. Quotes are either integrated into the text to elaborate or presented alone to emphasise the main or subtheme. In each section, I will provide an overview of the findings pertaining to the related headings. Detailed descriptions, along with relevant quotes, will be presented in the subsequent parts of those sections.

RQ1. How do the participants understand CPD and their needs for professional development?

This research question was approached by focusing on specific elements. First, the participants' definition and perception of CPD were examined through exploring their understanding of it within the context of language teaching and its significance for their professional growth. Second, the study explored the participants' awareness of and access to local CPD opportunities, including their knowledge of available resources, support systems, and institutional initiatives for professional learning. Third, the study investigated the participants' current practices and experiences related to CPD, such as pursuing degrees, attending pedagogic courses, participating in workshops and conferences, or engaging in self-directed and other-directed learning. Additionally, the factors, motivations, reasons and perceived needs for their participation were explored. This included understanding their areas of interest, specific skills or knowledge gaps they wished to address, and the relevance of these needs to their teaching practice and career growth. As a result, the question generated a variety of responses, all of which have been sorted and condensed in Table 12 presented below.

Table 12 Categories related to participants' CPD understanding.

Categories
Promotional and recruitment policy
Participants' perception of CPD
Participants' awareness of CPD opportunities
Participants' current CPD approaches and popular CPD activities
Pursuit of CPD and participants' perceived needs

By examining English teachers' understanding of CPD and need realisation, I am specifically addressing the cognitive, academic and pedagogical processes involved in their learning approaches, concept of PD and commitment to it, strategies they adopt to improve teaching skills, and the knowledge and practices they develop. By need realisation, I am referring to the sources that stimulate their pursuit of CPD, such as pursuing a PhD, completing pedagogic training, enrolling in short courses, attending seminars, participating in workshops and writing for publishing.

Prior to discussing the findings for this research question, it is imperative to furnish contextual information regarding promotional and recruitment policy requirements within Pakistani universities. This information, assembled from the participants' statements, is relevant for all subsequent discussions pertaining to CPD and its prioritisation. Additionally, this helps to understand the level of assistance and clarity of guidelines from the HEC or institutions for the PD of English teachers in Pakistani universities. The policy has been presented in chapter Two section 2.4, under the heading 'Recruitment and promotional policy in Pakistan' and aligns with participants' accounts of current policy.

6.4 Promotional and recruitment policy drawn from this research

Some participants' accounts (Ali, Bilal, Farooq) discussed the academic degrees and research activities in language teaching in Pakistan, which are part of the promotional and recruitment policy (see Table 13). However, it is worth noting that no compulsory pedagogic courses for teaching at university level have been highlighted. All except one participant in this research study are university professors.

Table 13 Requirements for promotion and recruitment

Job status	Prerequisites of job at university (Public/Private)	Required degree	Function
Research Associate	MA. English Literature	MA. English Literature	Contract basis
Lecturer	MA. English Literature	MA. English Literature	Permanent job role
Assistant Professor	PhD	PhD	Promotion
Associate Professor	12 Research papers	PhD	Promotion
Professor	15 Research papers	PhD	Promotion

6.5 Participants' perception of CPD

A noteworthy element of these participants was their use of the terms CPD and PD interchangeably and relating to learning that is continuous throughout the duration of their career. This also reflects the viewpoints of Day (1999) and Mann (2005) regarding teacher PD and CPD.

6.5.1 CPD: bridging the gap for quality teaching

According to the reviewed literature (Giraldo, 2014; Mann, 2005; Powell et al., 2003; Qaisra & Haider, 2023), CPD has a variety of definitions; and different participants perceive it in different ways, for instance, one participant expressed his viewpoints and understanding of the ‘function’ and perception of professional growth:

‘Professional development is that gap and qualifications that help you to complete your job professionally and most expectedly put the quality first of everything’ (Bilal: 2-3).

Bilal appears to be emphasising the importance of CPD in ensuring that a person is able to perform their job to the highest quality and “that gap” likely refers to the difference between a person’s current skill level and the optimal level required to perform their job. This response also suggests that CPD is key to closing that gap. Additionally, the phrase “most expectedly put the quality first of everything” indicates that the goal of PD is to prioritise quality in one’s work.

It seems this participant takes responsibility for his professional learning, and it has played a vital role for him as a professional. This aligns with the widespread belief that it is essential for teachers to have a decisive role in their own PD process (Mann & Webb, 2022; Stuart & Thurlow, 2000).

6.5.2 CPD as lifelong learning and self-directed activity

Mann (2005) emphasises the significance of self-directed self-development as a cornerstone of English teachers’ career growth, based on their belief in CPD, highlighting the essence of personal responsibility. Embracing the essence of CPD in teaching, where lifelong learning and adaptability are key for educators to thrive in the dynamic realm of education (Bell & Harrison, 2018), one of the participants, Muhammad provides an account that aligns with this:

‘For me teaching and CPD is a lifelong learning and learning never stops. To teach this digital generation you need to update yourself’ (216-222).

Muhammad emphasises the idea that teaching and CPD are ongoing processes that require a lifelong commitment to learning. The phrase “learning never stops” suggests that there is always a space for growth and improvement, both for teachers and for students. The participant also emphasises the significance of staying up to date with current trends and technologies, particularly when it comes to teaching language to a “digital generation”. As the ways in which students learn and interact with technology are constantly evolving, it is important for teachers to adapt their teaching methods accordingly.

CPD was perceived as learning with a purpose that adds value to a teacher’s professional understanding in the form of enhanced skills, knowledge and practice as, for example, Abdullah emphasised his learning curve by attending various pedagogic courses. He reports:

‘You can maximise learning experience only after you go through rigorous training, I did different certificates and courses, I had done 6 to 7 certificate courses with HEC, which was at that time UTC, which was coupled by a postgraduate certificate by Cambridge university’ (43-46).

Abdullah highlights his attainment of various courses that sheds light on his continuous learning and emphasised his understanding of CPD. In the context of CPD, this statement highlights the participant's proactive approach to enhancing his professional skills and knowledge. It emphasises the value placed on structured and formalised training to improve one's capacity and expertise. This dedication to ongoing learning and certification is a common approach among professionals seeking to stay current and effective in their fields.

Briefly, these participants highlight two things: the importance of ongoing learning and growth in the professional sphere, as it enables English teachers to continually improve their skills. Second, effective teaching requires a commitment to ongoing learning and willingness to adapt to new technologies and trends in language teaching. That willingness encourages language teachers to view teaching and PD as a lifelong journey rather than a one-time accomplishment.

Bilal and Muhammad's accounts not only align with the research (Mann & Webb, 2022) findings and reinforce the significance of self-directed CPD as a driving force behind effective language teacher development, but also exhibit the participants' broader understanding of CPD in educational practices. After detailing the participants' comprehension of CPD in the form of their definition or perception of it, the next step involves examining the extent of their awareness regarding CPD.

6.6 Participants' awareness of CPD opportunities

This has been examined through two distinct lenses: their past actions and how they planned their future in terms of career development; and two main facets: initial attainment of CPD opportunities and preferences for following specific international/foreign degrees.

6.6.1 Awareness of pedagogic courses and their need or impact on ELT

During their CPD journey, the English teachers in general seemed more satisfied with the pedagogic courses' content for their teaching role rather for their promotion as these courses were the most easily available for CPD and their attendance was influenced by the culture of their organisation (university). These responses were apparent among all participants for teaching courses at their initial stage of their profession:

'I was lucky enough that during those days a diploma was announced by that day in the HEC. They announced a postgraduate diploma in teaching of English as an international language that helped me a lot in the very start of my career' (Usman:26-28).

The above statement mentions the role of chance in accessing valuable educational opportunities, highlights the relevance of formal education to career development, and prompts reflection on the responsibility of educational authorities in providing accessible PD avenues. It emphasises the need for more proactive approaches to continuous learning and growth and suggests CPD is not necessarily structured according to the needs of English teachers in the department or compulsory for all new language teachers.

Another participant, Imran, reports:

'It's a lot easier to go and join any institute and tell them [institutes] that you want to teach, so they won't ask for any certification except your education right now; the tradition is that in order to become a university teacher you need only [a] basic qualification, no training at all. I don't know [if] this is fortune or misfortune this is how things are yet. So, as I was inducted here [university] without any training...I was not required to possess any certifications as an English teacher, nor was I offered structured CPD for teaching English as a language' (29-35).

This observation is resonant with the research by Shamim (2011) and Nawab (2017), which reported that certification or pedagogic training in Pakistan was not a requirement in foreign language teaching. Usman's positive experience stresses the importance of investing in education and pedagogic training programmes. According to Abdullah,

'Participating in such programmes can equip English teachers like me with the necessary skills and knowledge to succeed in our careers. Additionally, they can enhance the overall quality of language teaching in our respective domains... that certificate course at Cambridge brought me this insight that all along my teaching notions had been misplaced and there is still a lot that I had not actually thought about as a teacher' (37-46).

6.6.1.1 Awareness of changing professional demand

Another trend these participants from reputable universities were aware of was the significant impact of foreign qualifications for their professional growth, and the desire for an international qualification was evident and led them towards two goals: achieving a higher degree and gaining professional skills. A noteworthy point is that universities in Pakistan did not offer degrees related to applied linguistics when these participants were applying for higher degrees which is why some decided to pursue overseas qualifications. Additionally, some participants received scholarships as permanent faculty members of the department (Ali, Ahmed, Zain, Imran, Muhammad), and some were self-financing (Bilal, Usman, Abdullah, Noureen, Farooq).

As the study delved into the participants' perceived CPD needs and uncovered areas for further growth in their professional practice, according to one,

'it became evident that realizing the significance of pursuing a linguistics-related degree or PhD as an initial developmental step could potentially bring about profound changes, both on [a] personal and institutional level' (Zain:32-35).

Further to exemplify this:

'I decided that I would be opting [for] ELT or applied linguistics and I like it that [it] is actually the area which we as a university, and faculty members were lacking because we did not have any linguistic[s] programme, we were not offering any degree in it, or a PhD programme at all; this was a reason both for personal reasons and professional reasons so that's why I have done my MA in TESOL in applied linguistics from a foreign university.' (Zain:35-40)

The decision to pursue an MA TESOL is influenced by several key factors, including personal interest, career motivations, and the absence of linguistic programmes at the university. Personal interest plays a crucial role in one's career choices, as a genuine passion for a subject can be a strong motivator for success (Al Asmari, 2016). Many participants from the study expressed a similar need to study linguistics. For example, Muhammad explains the absence of linguistics degrees:

'actually, what happened I didn't want to do [an] MA English literature I'm not the person with like interest in literature, but I was interested in linguistics [but] because MA English literature was the only degree available around us in English I went for this one' (92-98).

Farooq further shares his experience:

'I did not have any option other than to have [a] degree in literature as universities in my region were offering no other degrees' (80-81).

Some participants demonstrated their awareness by explaining how linguistics can support ELT: Usman says:

'Studying applied linguistics is vital for language teaching, it provides a deeper understanding of language mechanics and effective teaching methods' (34-38). Ahmed adds, 'Linguistics was my interest it was basically because I was interested in exploring

how language works and how I can become a better language teacher and this knowledge [obtained from a linguistics degree] can be applied to developing language programmes, curricula, and training other educators' (50-54).

Applied linguistics is a field that is focused on the practical application of linguistics theory to real-world problems (Yusupova & Abduramanova, 2022). This can include areas such as language teaching, language policy, and language assessment. Therefore, pursuing a career in applied linguistics can offer the opportunity to make a tangible impact on language education and policy, as well as to work on innovative solutions to language-related challenges.

The participant's choice to pursue an MA TESOL in applied linguistics is well-justified. It aligns with the importance of studying applied linguistics for effective language education methods, especially in non-native environments (Haidar et al., 2022). Given the university's lack of a linguistics programme, this decision reinforces the significance of filling this educational void. Furthermore, TESOL and applied linguistics play a crucial role in language education, especially in a country where English is a key language for development and progress.

A significant observation prevalent in the reviewed literature (Jadoon et al., 2020; Nawab, 2017; Siddiqui et al., 2021) is that English teachers in Pakistan often possess a degree in literature, as this is commonly considered sufficient to teach language, without specific pedagogical qualifications. However, the awareness demonstrated by the participants contrasts with this prevailing view; they recognise the global importance of the English language and its relevance to their respective degrees.

In conclusion, within the Pakistani context, where English language teaching often involves rule-based instruction without practical application, there is a common misconception that a literature degree suffices for teaching EFL or ESL. However, the research participants demonstrate a distinct preference for less conventional degrees and pedagogic courses in their language teaching. This preference underscores their keen awareness and inquisitive mindset

regarding CPD. It reflects a recognition that effective language teaching involves more than just literary knowledge and highlights the evolving perspectives within the field.

The following section addresses the third aspect of this research question and discusses findings related to the CPD activities that English teachers in Pakistani universities engage in.

6.7 Participants' CPD approaches, practices and popular CPD activities

One of the categories identified during the data analysis while examining English teachers' perceptions of CPD is 'Participants' current CPD practices and experiences.' This category encompasses participants' descriptions of their CPD activities, including academic degrees, publications, workshops, conference attendance, and presentations. It also sheds light on the motivations driving these CPD endeavours, whether institutional or self-directed.

In this section, I will begin by discussing an academic degree, the PhD, which holds significant importance in the professional growth of the participants. This discussion will highlight how individuals view their career progression through the lens of obtaining a PhD. In the next section, I will present examples that exhibit current CPD practices to highlight the language teaching/learning policy and nature of such activities in Pakistani universities. Additionally, motives behind achieving a PhD will also be included.

6.7.1 PhD as HEC directed academic activity: Other-directed CPD, PD

All participants viewed their perspectives on attaining a PhD degree as prevalent among English teachers in Pakistan which will be elaborated in the section below. Two underlying rationales emerged to explain why obtaining a PhD was regarded as a significant accomplishment, irrespective of whether its attainment is from a foreign or home university.

In this section, first I will present an overall understanding that emerged from this sub-theme and then I will discuss this understanding.

Zain, discusses the first reason why faculty at his university pursue a PhD:

'Young scholars primarily pursued a PhD to achieve promotion aligned with the academic guidelines set forth by the HEC,' (175-176).

Secondly, Imran, emphasises the impact of a PhD on his professional approach as it is

'a recognition of the multifaceted advantages of the PhD journey for both personal and professional growth has been noted' (90-93).

Farooq emphasises how

'teachers' academic degrees were connected to their broader personal and professional goals; a lecturer can't get promoted to the next grade without a PhD. So, even if you're a great teacher and really dedicated, you won't get that promotion unless you have the degree' (249-251).

However, a third perspective emerged among English teachers, as exemplified by Bilal, who observed that

the integration of his PhD research into his teaching practices was not realised.

'...teaching doesn't have much to do with the PhD whatever my area is... I did critical discourse analysis that it was [a] major specialty, but I don't use a single word from my PhD in my teaching practices... (64-67).

This detail highlights the difficulty in the application of research into instructional strategies and the irrelevance of PhD research in practical teaching in Pakistan.

Despite this, Bilal asserts,

'there was unanimous consensus regarding the importance of obtaining a PhD in advancing one's career, as it is a prerequisite for securing the position of Assistant Professor and all subsequent higher academic positions beyond the role of a Lecturer in Pakistan' (19-20).

All other participants agree with Bilal's statement (Ahmed: 8-9; Imran: 13; Noureen: 54-55; Muhammad: 44; Farooq: 229). Ali further elaborates that

'this widely accepted status of the PhD degree serves as a gateway to various career opportunities within academia and demonstrates the HEC's commitment to promoting excellence in education and research' (68-74).

One of the participants, Zain, revealed the HEC policy:

'... as I spoke earlier about the HEC so they also set new rules and guidelines that the promotions for the teachers will depend upon certain achievements in life so of course like you know as these new requirements were coming for the teaching profession at university level' (175- 178).

Zain's statement emphasises the impact of new rules and guidelines set by the HEC. No participant mentioned any pedagogic course as part of HEC policy for any monetary and promotion incentive. The participant above notes that these new requirements are based on certain achievements, which suggests that promotions are no longer based solely on seniority or experience, but on earning a PhD.

This response of Zain suggests that these new requirements are a significant change for the teaching profession in Pakistan, as they represent a shift towards a more merit-based system for determining career growth. The implication is that teachers will now be required to demonstrate specific achievements to advance in their careers, rather than simply rely on their years of service or experience. The details have already been presented in section 6.4.

Another crucial aspect that emerged from another discussion is the prioritisation of a PhD for professional advancement. However, a notable counterpoint was raised by some participants, with one indicating little or no incorporation of his PhD research into his professional work.

This can be seen in the perspective shared by Bilal:

'I think it is [PhD] more related to your personal development at your intellectual quest, you don't need to be a doctor to be a good teacher it is more related to the area of intellect and scholarly [work]. Really so it has, it doesn't have much to do with the PhD or with the teaching. Whatever my area is I did critical discourse analysis that was [a]major specialty, but I don't use a single word from my PhD [...for] teaching purposes, though it helped me to get a better status in my career, a better salary' (62-67).

Bilal believes that good teaching is strongly connected to personal growth and pursuing appropriate knowledge. For instance, if an educator focuses on enhancing their skills and competencies, these domain-specific qualities become crucial. Bilal suggests his success as a

teacher is not necessarily dependent on his formal education, the subject of which he never applies in his teaching. However, applying PhD research in teaching will be discussed further in research question four section ‘Participants as researchers.’

Although he acknowledges that his PhD did help him achieve promotion, his response suggests it may not necessarily be the most important factor in determining one’s ability to teach effectively. All participants had accomplished PhD degrees as their priority (See English teachers’ profiles, Appendix 5).

Furthermore, in relation to the significance of obtaining a PhD, some participants (Ali, Ahmed, Zain and Imran) achieved scholarships to pursue their research degrees overseas due to the prestige and reputation of the foreign universities and for improving their skills and work experience in the independent environment of such countries. Those (Ali, Bilal, Ahmed, Zain, Imran and Muhammad), who had completed their PhD overseas recognised a significant positive transformation in their professional approach elaborated in Imran’s statement below. This evolution was particularly noticeable, and they readily embraced this transformative process:

‘I pursued a PhD degree, and what significantly influenced this reflection was my academic journey, encompassing both my PhD and master’s degrees. These experiences greatly benefited me in the initial stages of my career. But yes, what I did during the degree to achieve, yes that did help me to broaden my own reflective practices from the task [PhD] even when I’m not working for degree, [it]is helping me to come up with some better strategies as a teacher’ (88-92).

This participant discusses the impact of obtaining a PhD degree overseas. He acknowledges it was a significant achievement, but also noted that it was the experience and challenge he faced during his academic journey that had a greater impact on his reflective practices and personal development. It was the work he did during his master’s and PhD degree programmes, explains Imran, *‘that helped me to broaden my own reflective practices’ (103-106).*

This experience appears to have provided him with opportunities to develop and refine his critical skills, enabling him to become more self-reflective and better at learning from his experiences. I have integrated more quotes from this participant in research questions three and four. Specifically, in the 'Factors impacting CPD' section of question three, he highlights organisational structure as a hindrance. In the 'Public and private institution' section, he expresses admiration for a previous private institute employer, emphasising their provision of reflective practice. Furthermore, his mindful and reflective approach shines through in the 'Teaching content' section of research question four.

The only female participant in this research speaks about her motivation for pursuing a PhD:

'When I applied for a job at the university and became a lecturer, I felt the some [kind of] motivation driving me forward. It was the desire to advance my career and [to] improve my prospects that led me to pursue a PhD. I knew that furthering my education would not only help me grow professionally but [would] also enable me to achieve greater success in my career' (50-55).

PhD achievement is also recognised as a form of CPD and is valued as a resource for personal learning and the acquisition of transferable skills. One of the participants, Muhammad, reports:

'When I did my PhD, I only did it in order to learn something new what, I have learned after my PhD, I have developed the sense of looking at things differently analysing things that's all [the] PhD has given me, nothing apart from teaching me or like instilling the ability to analyse things from different aspects, that's all' (174-178).

Muhammad's experience exemplifies this perspective. While his primary motivation for pursuing a PhD was to gain new knowledge, which aligns with the fundamental purpose of a doctoral programme to advance knowledge in a specific field he also acknowledges the development of the ability to approach issues from different angles and explore them from multiple perspectives. This highlights one of the significant benefits of engaging in continuous learning (Khan & Abdullah, 2019; Mann & Webb, 2022; Richards & Farrell, 2005).

In summary, all participants prioritised earning a PhD degree as their primary academic goal for professional advancement, as evidenced in their profiles (Appendix 5). Additionally, they recognised the PhD process as an opportunity to develop transferable skills. Nonetheless, having a PhD may not directly link to effective teaching.

6.7.2 Participants’ self-directed CPD activities

Responses related to CPD revealed a wide range of self-directed activities, notes Abdullah, Bilal, and Muhammad, ‘*such as workshops*’ (Abdullah:149; Bilal:26; Muhammad:78), ‘*courses*’ (Imran:132-133; Noureen:250-261; Usman:17-18), and ‘*conferences*’ (Ali:83; Ahmed:281; Muhammad:310) that participants have attended and were interested in to expand their knowledge and improve their teaching strategies. I have already mentioned why a PhD was participants’ first preference for language teaching and in Table 14 I present a list of self-directed CPD activities they attended and were interested:

Table 14 List of self-directed CPD activities

CPD activities other than PhD
Professional learning through work
Collaboration through membership of professional bodies
CPD through attending events
CPD through presenting at conferences
Learning based on research for the field of language teaching and action research

A breakdown of CPD activities, along with potential approaches, is detailed in Chapter Three (Section 3.6.4, Table 5). The list presented in this chapter is derived from statements and profiles provided by the participants and exhibits both similarities and differences compared to the list extracted from the reviewed literature.

The adopted CPD approaches can be categorised as formal and informal, as well as self-directed and policy-directed, with respect to their relevance in the field. It is noteworthy that most participants tend to favour a self-directed approach to CPD rather than a group or externally directed one. Moreover, there is a lack of institutional collaboration in terms of peer-mentoring and peer coaching. Nevertheless, collaborative writing efforts are gaining prominence in the field.

6.7.2.1 Professional learning through work

In this study, the participants exhibit a range of activities that show the continuity of their learning curve. The first activity is related to their learning through teaching as evidenced by Ahmed's comment:

'as a university language teacher, professional development occurs through active participation in teaching responsibilities, assuming various roles, and actively seeking opportunities for growth and improvement' (152-159).

Bilal' learning evidenced by his statement:

'I'm very fond of research and exploring new things, reading and writing things, and teaching' (373).

Ahmed's learning and teaching philosophy:

'I chose teaching as my preferred profession because I'm truly in love with it. I see my students as friends and consider them architects of knowledge. Together, we construct knowledge, having open dialogues in the classroom where everyone is like a Socrates. We debate, and when we don't agree, we simply agree to disagree. This is how I learn and teach at the university' (152-159)

Zain's thoughts on the relationship between teaching and learning evidenced by the following comment:

'I think that teaching is one of the very useful and influential ways to learn more and then share the same thing with the, like you know, with the generations which have to come' (91-93).

Muhammad's view of teaching:

‘I believe teaching is a best way to learn and improve [one]self’ (126).

The key aspect of these participants’ CPD is that their development efforts are primarily self-directed and informal. Muhammad’ profile in Appendix 5 shows by actively engaging in their teaching practice and different roles, and seeking opportunities for growth and improvement, these participants show their commitment to continual growth, and their current practice of CPD (Abdullah:60-66). Several studies (Campbell, 2004; Hoekstra et al., 2009; Kryvonis, 2013; Vadivel et al., 2021) report the growing interest among English teachers in engaging in less formal and more collaborative learning within their work contexts.

6.7.2.2 Learning through collaboration and membership of communities of practice or professional learning communities

In relation to collaboration among teachers, CoP (Wenger, 2011) or PLC (Darling-Hammond, 1990; Rosenholtz, 1989; Senge, 1990) have been discussed in the literature to describe diverse groups of individuals united by a collective vision of learning to collaborate, both within and beyond their immediate community, to investigate their practices and collectively develop improved approaches that benefit other teachers, learners and the ELT field (Liu & Yin, 2023; Zhang et al., 2023). Many of the participants in this study are active members of learning communities. For example, Usman states:

‘I have some strong collaborations and connections’ (210). [He also emphasises his acquisition of knowledge through these collaborations:] I have got connections with professors here in the country and even abroad when I travel, so I’m constantly in touch with a lot of knowledgeable people. And, you know, this back-and-forth of ideas and insights? It’s really positive for us, helping us grow in so many ways’ (279-283);

Imran mentions his professional connections:

‘I maintained some professional connections like international and countrywide, where I learn about research, teaching and professional trends’ (185-186).

Many participants have fostered a mutual learning through shared activities and experiences, driven by their shared objectives and goals visible from their membership of such activities publishing as a joint venture (Appendix 5).

Some of these participants utilised their memberships to such communities as a form of learning activity. For example, Abdullah demonstrates his enthusiasm for participation in a strong network:

I'm a member of SPELT, and I've been actively participating in various training sessions. Just last week, I attended three workshops hosted by Singapore, the Philippines, Thailand, Vietnam, and other Asian countries. I also serve as the Deputy National Director of the International Society of Teachers, Researchers, and Administrators, based in Bangkok, Thailand, which operates across 11 or 12 countries. Additionally, I'm a member of the Learning and Education Development Academy in Manila, Philippines. I'm dedicated to staying at the cutting edge of my field' (153-154).

The main aim and a valuable aspect of CPD is enhancing professional skills, knowledge, and practices, and collaboration through memberships of professional bodies within institutions or externally (Kitchen, 2022; Toole & Louis, 2002). These connections were noted in four levels: first with SPELT, university academic councils, alumni associations and international English teachers' associations (Ali:185; Bilal: 29; Ahmed: 54; Abdullah: 151; Muhammad: 46). Many participants have mentioned community affiliation while sharing their information through their profiles. Alumni associations organise social and cultural activities to provide social interaction among alumni members to strengthen the community. Additionally, as all participants are professors apart from Farooq, they are the members of academic councils in their universities.

By joining professional bodies or associations related to language teaching or their specific field of expertise, these participants have shown their commitment to gain access to a network of peers and resources that support their professional growth.

'Being a member of such organisations provides me with opportunities for collaboration, sharing best practices, attending conferences, and participating in workshops' (Noureen: 251).

Zain supports the similar view of usefulness of learning communities for PD

'membership in these organisations offers me chances to collaborate, share best practices, attend conferences, and take part in workshops' (64).

Some of the English teachers, for example, Bilal, Muhammad and Abdullah have shown their affiliation with TESOL Arabia, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Association of English Language Teachers (KSAALT) and Thailand. (See Appendix 5). Through collaboration with other language practitioners within these professional communities, some of the English teachers have shared insights (Abdullah:155-166; Muhammad: 47). Furthermore,

'as a member of professional bodies, I often attend conferences, workshops, or webinars that address current trends, research, and best practices in language teaching' (56-57).

Noureen echoed this sentiment, emphasising that through active participation in such events,

'I have enhanced my knowledge, learned new methodologies, and acquired practical skills' (58-59).

Abdullah also noted the benefits derived from participating in these PD opportunities

'I have improved my understanding, gained new teaching approaches, and developed practical skills' (155-157).

A notable point of these memberships can be seen as many of these participants mainly write in collaboration with like-minded professionals, stay updated with the latest trends, and expand their professional networks (Noureen: 222-225). To maintain anonymity, I have not listed each participant's publications. However, I have included all the publications by coding them into topics in Appendix 5.

6.7.2.3 Learning through attending CPD events

One of the most popular CPD activities was attending CPD events that can be divided into three types: university institution-based events, off-site events arranged by the HEC and private

sector organisations, and online events organised by Western universities. Bilal emphasised the significance of immersing oneself in various learning environments to boost PD. According to him,

‘English teachers derive immense value from such engagements’ (455-458).

Noureen shared a similar perspective, underlining the importance of interacting with diverse learning settings to enrich professional growth,

‘being a part of such professional events, I learned a lot and received a positive impact on my teaching abilities as an English teacher’ (258).

Limited range of institution based CPD events.

A shortage of institution based CPD events can be observed through these participants’ profiles and their statements. When some of these English teachers (Ahmed, Abdullah, Imran, Noureen, Muhammad) attended CPD events, they engaged in intentional PD activities. A limited count of workshops or events, organised either by the participants’ institution or by the HEC, is evident in their profiles. In addition, a range of off-site CPD events, organised by either the US embassy, the British Council and Pakistani-based private organisations or virtual ones by Western universities, can be seen on participants’ profiles. For example, Usman highlights the availability of refresher courses from various resources:

‘You come across a lot of useful things, but they don’t always stick in your mind. However, when you take these off-site refresher courses, they really help reinforce what you’ve learned and put it into practice’ (172-173).

Muhammad also discusses his engagement with developmental courses:

‘Over the last 20 years, I’ve been actively involved in professional development courses. Even now, I’m enrolled in a few online courses. Just yesterday, I signed up for a language teaching course. These courses come from various sources and universities’ (222-223).

Participants’ views about these CPD events have been reported in research question three.

Besides the HEC, there are a few global CPD providers mainly in Pakistan (See chapters 2 & 3) that organise CPD events for the TESOL field. They are however not very popular among

all English teachers as their workshops/courses are not required for recruitment and promotion, they are often not publicised in universities or English teachers may not be able to attend them due to time constraints or professional responsibilities (Raza et al., 2022). However, some participants (Ahmed, Abdullah, Noureen, Muhammad) have engaged in online and off-site CPD with a specific focus on their personal needs that may be dependent on their personal inclination (Muhammad: 221-223). For example, Bilal, Zain and Imran spent more time in organising CPD events as teacher trainers rather than attending them and one participant, Farooq had never attended any CPD event. (See Appendix 5). According to Muhammad,

'I have noticed that attending online CPD events has become increasingly important and prevalent recently, largely due to the impact of COVID-19' (223).

Furthermore, participants' profiles indicate that engaging in online CPD events and obtaining certification continues to be a common practice among them, as highlighted by Ali (444-446) and Noureen (245). According to Abdullah,

'I have observed a significant shift towards virtual platforms, creating a new trend in CPD, especially in developed countries and notably for developing nations like Pakistan' (146-152).

The impact of an increase in virtual CPD events has been noted among some of these English teachers, providing them with convenient access to a diverse range of learning opportunities from the comfort of their own environments (Imran: 133; Noureen: 224-227). Further, Usman elaborates the main reason for attending virtual CPD events.

'The primary advantage is that it enables professionals like us to stay up-to-date with the latest language teaching trends and advancements. This ensures that we remain competitive in our respective fields' (16-18).

Additionally, according to Abdullah

'Virtual CPD events like these really enhance networking opportunities for us. We get to connect with experts from around the world, which fosters knowledge sharing and collaborative growth' (220-223).

The flexibility of attending online events saves time and resources, eliminating the need for extensive travel and accommodation arrangements (Muhammad: 221-223). Embracing virtual CPD events is an effective way to enhance professional skills, expand knowledge, and adapt to the demands of language teaching. Another notable trend observed in some participants' profiles is their participation in off-site CPD events, often requiring them to travel to different regions of the country. For instance, regional headquarters and metropolitan cities tend to offer a wider array of CPD opportunities for language teachers, as highlighted in Noureen's account

'English teachers frequently engage in off-site events because they provide us with more flexibility to tailor our CPD experiences to our personal and professional needs' (247-249).

'This flexibility enables us to address the specific demands of our profession' (Abdullah: 59-162).

In contrast, in-house CPD events are less common among teachers. According to Muhammad, *'this disparity may be attributed to the fact that in-house events either do not typically match teachers' needs or do not come with any monetary incentives'* (200-206).

It is important to note that certain participants attended CPD activities during the early stages of their university education. Specifically, English teachers such as Ali, Bilal, and Ahmed, who earned their master's and PhD degrees from foreign universities, actively participated in numerous CPD events (refer to Appendix 5 for details). According to Bilal's account,

'CPD events have significantly contributed to my growth in various dimensions: these include knowledge enrichment through participation in workshops and seminars, skill development attained through courses, as well as networking and collaboration opportunities' (51-54).

Similarly, according to Abdullah:

'participating in these CPD events has enabled me to refine my instructional practices and stay up-to-date with effective teaching approaches' (148).

This aligns with the discussion in response to research question 4 in this chapter. Concluding this part, attending CPD events remains an important component for English teachers' by

actively engaging teachers in learning experiences that aim to improve teaching practices, enhance subject knowledge, and promote continuous growth in the field of language education (Mann, 2021).

6.7.2.4 CPD through presenting at conferences

An English language teacher can develop professionalism through presenting at conferences, which is considered an important form of CPD (Mann & Webb, 2022; Richards & Farrell, 2005). According to Ahmed, one of the participants in this study,

‘presenting at conferences offers numerous opportunities for professional growth and development’ (280).

He exemplifies this by highlighting one of his presentations during his PhD. He recalls

‘the first time I came across the idea of dialogic pedagogy was when I attended a conference at Cambridge. I presented a paper there about unwillingness to communicate, but the talks by Neil Mercer and others were on the topic of dialogic pedagogy. I got the idea from there, followed it up by reading stuff on it so I thought this is the best idea we can use in language teaching’ (281-286).

This trend is also evident among other English teachers. Usman states,

‘traveling abroad for conference presentations is productive for your professional learning’ (280-281).

Muhammad adds,

‘I have presented at conferences for my personal grooming and professional development several times’ (78).

When a language teacher presents at conferences, they engage in activities that align with the principle of development (Mann & Webb, 2022). These teachers have shared their expertise, experiences, and research findings with a wider audience. According to Usman,

‘by disseminating my work, I have contributed to the collective knowledge base in the field of language teaching, [and] provided insights and perspectives that can benefit other language teachers’ (280-283).

Presenting at CPD events takes place in three ways: within the university where teachers work (Ali:181), at national and international conferences (Usman: 282), off-site in regional or

metropolitan cities and organised by a public or private host or the HEC (Noureen: 248). Usman, a participant from Site 1, where presentations often focus on social themes like gender and culture, with some emphasis on regional poets, does not seem to reflect CPD activities for English teachers, as indicated in his profile.

In contrast, Muhammad from a private university presents novel and innovative teaching concepts during conferences, such as leveraging gadgets as tools and pedagogical aids for language learning (259-274). Muhammad also presented a conference paper that introduced the idea that learning, and teaching are interdependent, a concept elaborated upon in one of his articles (140). This article delves into the realm of learning, emphasising the importance of recognising student diversity and adapting teaching strategies accordingly. Muhammad places students at the core of the teaching process (144), a departure from the prevailing traditional 'one-size-fits-all' approach. According to Farooq,

'the outdated practice of treating all students the same, without considering their individual needs and abilities, still prevails in Pakistan' (52-53).

According to Muhammad,

'students are my first priority and the primary focus of my teaching' (150).

In a Pakistani society where mobile devices and gadgets are often viewed as obstacles to education, Muhammad redefines them as tools for effective language pedagogy (305). Moreover, in the realm of research, Ahmed and Noureen presented their research findings on CPD events, with a primary focus on topics related to students (refer to Appendix 5 for further details).

An integral aspect of participating in CPD events is highlighted by one of the participants, Bilal, who, due to a fear of public speaking, has never presented at such events. Bilal's anxiety related to public speaking is clearly evident in his statement:

'I have written lots of paper over the last 10 years of about 20 papers, but I haven't presented in any conference so that is a major drawback actually in my career that it is not that I can't present, but that's I don't feel like I don't feel like talking I am a quiet

introvert[ed] person I am more comfortable in writing at my table rather than talking to a group' (Bilal: 449-453).

Bilal's statement shows that, usually, English teachers who present at various CPD events are motivated enough to overcome issues like lack of confidence. However, Bilal was an exception. This motivation indicates a self-directed approach to CPD, rooted in their individual interests and professional pursuits (26-27). Even though he has not presented at conferences, according to Bilal,

'presenting at conferences requires us as teachers to reflect on our teaching practices, research methodologies, and findings. This process of critically examining our work promotes self-reflection, encourages refinement of teaching strategies, and fosters a deeper understanding of the subject matter' (51-54).

Among the participants, Farooq stands out as the only individual who has never presented or actively participated in any CPD activity. Farooq's stance is based on two primary reasons. He states that,

'I perceive that institutional CPD events lack a direct connection to real learning (236, 256). Second, 'I strongly believe that my foremost responsibility is teaching' (417). I am burdened with a heavy workload of teaching responsibilities, which leaves me with insufficient time to attend CPD events elsewhere' (418-419).

Considering the above-mentioned elements, presenting at conferences and at workshops has been seen as CPD for English teachers (Ahmed: 305-308). According to Raza et al. (2022) and Richards and Farrell (2005) presenting at CPD events is both formal and informal CPD activity. Presenting at events involves active participation in CPD activities, knowledge sharing, reflective practice, collaboration, and staying current with advancements in the field.

'By presenting at conferences, we as English teachers have contributed to our own professional growth and development, while also benefiting the broader language teaching community' (Ahmed: 309-310).

6.7.2.5 Learning through writing for the field of language teaching and classroom research

Action research has been widely discussed in the literature (Crookes & Chandler, 2001; Kasi, 2010) and is common among these participants (Ali: 286; Bilal: 83; Ahmed: 235; Zain: 397). It involves teachers investigating their own situations with the aim of solving classroom challenges, refining their practice, or enriching their professional insight (Coghlan & Brannick, 2014; Crookes & Chandler, 2001). For instance, Noureen used her MPhil degree research to tackle her personal challenge of speaking anxiety, which she also noticed in her students. She explains:

'It [MPhil degree research] was all about the students again personally when I was learning English language, I had the same kind of feeling. My MPhil was in English language anxiety, actually right so uh there was a time when I was having the same kind of feeling - unable to speak in English.' (Noureen:175-185)

In this study, some language educators have advanced professionally by contributing to the discourse in language teaching (Usman:18; Imran:160; Abdullah:122). They have done so through a combination of formal and informal CPD, driven either by self-direction or institutional guidance. Engaging in research on classroom issues is viewed as proactive approach to CPD for language teachers (McKeown et al., 2002; Richards & Farrell, 2005; Stake, 2010).

Certain studies (Hoekstra et al., 2009; Mann, 2005; Richards, 2023) align with the perspective of these individuals regarding their inclination to contribute to the field of language teaching through scholarly endeavours, such as publishing research papers, articles, book chapters, or instructional materials, thereby enhancing the collective knowledge and understanding of language education. Notably, these participants have written a substantial number of publications addressing various classroom issues and current, contextual topics in the field of language teaching, as illustrated in Appendix 5. These publications are disseminated through

local, continental, and international journals in EFL, TEFL, and ESL. For instance, Bilal, as discussed in Section 6.7.2.4, has authored nearly 20 research articles (Refer to Appendix 5).

Engaging in writing for the field of language teaching stands out as a significant form of CPD. This practice demands thorough research and exploration of specific topics or areas. Bilal's research topics, as evident from his work, are notably aligned with the context of TESOL and linguistics in Pakistan. Through the process of writing, Bilal states:

'I'm writing papers because there are requirements, I need to keep my profile alive and rich so in that way, I'm writing for others. But over the past few years I do [it] for myself, for my intellectual quest' (78-89).

He has not only deepened his understanding of the subject matter but has also actively remained connected with current literature and research, thereby expanding his expertise.

As mentioned, Bilal experiences high levels of anxiety when speaking in public. From this, one can infer that Bilal prefers expressing himself through publishing when he says:

'as a teacher I am more comfortable in writing at my table rather than talking to a group' (453-455).

On the contrary, several other participants, including Ali, Ahmed, Zain, Usman, Imran, Abdullah, Noureen, and Muhammad, have chosen to share their insights through conference presentations.

In addition to writing on related topics for English teachers, classroom research is also apparent. For example, Ali speaks about his research into the 'investigation of anxiety factors during oral presentations' where he utilised action research and provided practical opportunities for students to present their views on their chosen topics. He arranged this type of event for his students and presented outcomes in the form of his publications. Additionally, he describes his class situation and the reasons behind students' hesitant behaviours, and emphasises that:

'only 5% [of] people [... are] voluntarily ready to come in front of the class and to speak, but most of these students they declined, they declined this offer and they say sorry sir I

can't I feel ashamed I feel anxiety I'm not confident and people will laugh at me, ok so this anxiety the mental stress is actually because of the students' background so we need to actually work on that. (Ali: 309-315)

By emphasising the classroom and student related research Ali highlights his growth as teacher,

'writing for the field of language teaching involves reflecting on teaching experiences, classroom observations, and student outcomes. It encourages teachers to critically analyse their instructional practices, identify challenges, and propose solutions or improvements' (290-292).

By writing and sharing his insights, research findings, or instructional materials, Ali says,

'I have contributed to the advancement of the field. I personally believe this kind of research is very important, that's why we have worked on this and continue to focus on it for ELT classes in Pakistan and one needs to work very specifically [on] students outcomes' (291-293).

His contributions may provide valuable perspectives on students and teachers' challenges, innovative approaches, or evidence-based practices that benefit other educators in the wider teaching community.

In addition, writing for the field of language teaching demonstrates a commitment to CPD. It showcases these English teachers' expertise, research capabilities, and ability to contribute to the field. Generally, these publications can enhance professional credibility, open up opportunities for collaboration and enhance English teachers' engagement, and potentially lead to career advancement.

By actively engaging in writing activities for the field of language teaching, these participants have engaged in self-directed learning, critical thinking, and knowledge dissemination, all of which align with the principles of CPD (Mann & Webb, 2022).

'Writing contributes [to] my professional growth, promotes reflective practice, and enables me to make meaningful contributions to the field while enhancing my own teaching practices' (Ahmed: 235-236).

In conclusion, these participants demonstrate an understanding of CPD as an ongoing lifelong process. They proactively identify CPD opportunities, with an initial focus on pedagogical

courses, even in the absence of specific guidance from their institutions or the HEC. As mentioned, almost all participants have actively engaged in a diverse range of CPD activities, encompassing self-directed, institutionally guided, formal, and informal approaches, as integral parts of their CPD journeys.

Approaching a PhD from diverse perspectives, these participants have harnessed its benefits for professional advancement, personal growth, scholarly pursuits, and intellectual enrichment. Beyond academic achievements, many participants initially recognised the significance of their profession based on societal needs and its impact on culture. They have also contributed to the profession through initiatives such as '*establishing language centres*' (Muhammad: 18-19), '*starting English teaching programme*' (Imran: 45-47) and exploring '*natural language learning methods*' (Farooq: 129-130).

In addition to earning PhDs, they have adopted various strategies for CPD, including '*short pedagogic courses*' (Abdullah: 121-123), '*personal reading, class observation, one-shot events like seminars or webinars, one-day workshops*' (Usman: 41-43), and 'research' (Bilal: 26-28). The latter represents an ongoing process of acquiring and developing knowledge and competence (Adams & Mann, 2021; Mann & Walsh, 2017) through systematic investigation and interpretation of knowledge to contribute to their respective fields.

RESEARCH QUESTION TWO

In the first section, I discussed the participants' understanding of CPD and their adopted strategies. This section delves into the factors that these English teachers believe influence their CPD and career growth. The factors, as described in their interviews, will be presented in chronological order, following the journey of an English teacher from entering the profession to their current state and their evolving aspirations for the future.

RQ.2) How do specific environmental factors within and outside ELT in Pakistani universities contribute to the professional growth of the participants?

The research sites' (chosen universities) details have been mentioned in the Chapter Four (Section 4.8), however, I have included additional contextual details where relevant in this chapter. Participants are all postgraduate teachers from different public and private universities, so they exhibit different perceptions about their institution's environment. Chapter Two 'Context of the study' (Section, 2.1.1 & 2.1.2) discusses the contexts in more detail. These participants reported the following influencing factors during their career planning, execution and achievement.

Table 15 Influencing environmental factors for English teachers.

Specific factors
Societal support (parents, father's profession & spouse)
Institutional support: institution as a student (home & foreign)
Institution as an English language teacher (home: public & private)

6.8 Social support

Social support plays a pivotal role in career development by involving the provision of assistance, comfort, and support to individuals, aiding them in effectively managing

psychological and societal stressors they encounter in their lives (Zain: 113-116; Usman: 60-64). In addition, participants mentioned:

'For me, social support is multidimensional. It's about feeling cared for and loved, and receiving information that helps me in various ways' (Noureen: 240).

'This invaluable support can originate from interpersonal connections, with family members holding particular significance' (Zain: 253-258)

'[It] encompasses a distinct form of assistance offered by family' (Imran: 52)

'[and] colleagues to address specific challenges' (Abdullah: 50).

6.8.1 Parents (home environment & father's profession⁸)

In every society, *'an individual's first environment is his home'* (Muhammad 52). Zain further elaborates on this, suggesting that

'the home environment is the combination of certain activities that an individual and their family do, which affect their development and career planning' (222-225) [This] encompasses the opportunities an individual has to interact with books and everyday experiences to help them make sense of their world' (249-251).

These insights highlight the significant influence of familial and home environments on individuals' career growth trajectories.

Notably, one of the participants, Usman, shares personal insights into the life experiences that have had a profound impact on his professional journey:

'as far as the home and facilities are concerned I never had to worry about anything, and then of course like you know when you have facilities and that that comfort you really just need to put in some efforts; there were opportunities and then there was all the support available for me that I could have, and then using those opportunities and parental and family support' (58-63).

⁸ In traditional Pakistani culture the mother plays the role of homemaker and father heads the home, due to this reason, children follow in their father's footsteps.

This participant, while reflecting on his journey to success in his professional life, highlights the pivotal role of his comfortable home environment. He attributes a significant portion of his achievements to the nurturing atmosphere he experienced within his family. The support and encouragement provided by his parents played a crucial role in shaping his career path and allowing him to reach his professional goals. This underscores the profound impact that a supportive home environment can have on an individual's career development and overall success.

One of the participants, Zain, acknowledges some habits of his father that developed a positive learning environment for him that supported him for his entire life. He reports:

'He [father] has been very influential that is my father my father has been a teacher himself he is a book lover he has been reading all his life his love for books his love for like reading has been like you know a lifelong and that is beyond any kind of immediate goals.' (Zain: 215-243)

In accordance with Zain's statement,

'parenting behaviour and educational support for their children could cultivate children's learning habits and influence their later career choices and academic performance' (224-225).

Thus,

'a positive home environment is crucial, as it encourages individuals to adopt a favourable attitude towards their careers and to have confidence in themselves' (Noureen: 239-240).

Zain, further reports his father's contribution in his professional learning:

'He [father] has been most instrumental person and shaped me what exactly I think I am today so of course like you know that both parents are always important but in terms of academic growth and like you know professional development I think definitely it is my father's contribution.' (115-117)

Zain acknowledges the crucial role of his parents, with a particular emphasis on his father's influence on his academic progress and CPD. This statement indicates how individuals are influenced by their parents and shaped by their everyday life experiences within a specific

environment. It highlights the profound impact of one's environment on their personal and PD (Ali et al., 2017). Another participant, Ahmed, highlights the influence of his father:

'My father was a teacher in a reputable university and all what I have today is a direct and indirect influence of his profession and personality' (Ahmed: 148-150).

This suggests that the father's career as an educator had a positive impact on the individual's life and choices and served as an inspiration and guidance. Direct influences could refer to specific teachings, values, or advice imparted by the father due to his role as a teacher. Teachers in Pakistan are perceived as individuals of significant value and influence. In addition, Ahmed's statement highlights the significance of his father's personality in shaping his life. Additionally, the fact that the father taught at a reputable university implies that he was highly regarded in his profession, which might have further influenced this participant's perception of the value of education and the impact of teaching.

6.8.2 Spouse as supporters for professional growth

Some participants such as Abdullah and Noureen report their spouse influences that impacted their career and continued to grow and motivate them to continue their progress in their profession or personal life. People's educational achievement may be positively correlated with their life partners' education or with their support. Noureen, illustrates this:

'I must say that my husband always supported me and encouraged me for career and studies and as my husband is also in [the] same field, he always supported me and guided me throughout my professional career, and he is senior to me in his career, so he is a strong pillar' (236-240).

The participant acknowledges the crucial role of her family, particularly her father and husband, who is also in the same profession. This mentorship and guidance from a more experienced professional may well have contributed to her professional growth and confidence. While the participant's statement is valuable, it is important to consider the potential implications of attributing her career success primarily to male figures (father and husband).

This could reinforce traditional gender roles and highlight the gender factors that contribute to career development. For example, if gender roles and expectations are different for male and females in Pakistani society, these differences could impact how parents interact with their children, what educational opportunities are provided, and how career choices are supported. However, I must acknowledge that some participants highlight their parents' support, home environment as crucial in their progress. Additionally, several studies (Ali & Rasheed, 2021; Fazal et al., 2019; Shah et al., 2020) found that in Pakistani society women receive a significant amount of support for continuing their career. The above statement may be applicable to many female English teachers' situations in Pakistan and may offer insights into the essence of traditional Pakistani society.

Another participant, Abdullah acknowledges his wife's support:

'I must appreciate my wife's support I could focus I become a better teacher because I have got a very good life partner, I believe that I really wouldn't have been able to focus as much on my career and my profession and my teaching I wouldn't have been able to give this much time' (319-334).

This participant expresses gratitude for his wife's support, highlighting the value of recognizing and appreciating her contributions. His spouse's support has enabled Abdullah to focus more on his career. This implies that a supportive partner can have a positive impact on an individual's professional life by providing emotional support, possibly handling household responsibilities, and offering encouragement.

In conclusion, the statements from participants Ahmed, Zain, Abdullah, and Noureen highlight the substantial impact and support they received from their fathers and spouses. These accounts emphasise the pivotal roles played by fathers, husbands, and wives, including the influence of fathers' professions, personalities, and values on individuals' educational choices and achievements. Furthermore, it is worth noting that several research studies (Björklund &

Salvanes, 2011; Li & Qiu, 2018) have established a significant connection between a family's socioeconomic status and students' academic performance.

6.9 Institutional support

In the realm of CPD, Ali highlights the significant influence of institutional support and the CPD process, stating,

'one of the most notable impacts on CPD choices lies in the CPD process and support available within an institution' (174-185).

This observation is supported by Farooq, who emphasises the evolving requirements for teachers to align with institutional development guidelines and HEC policies:

'teachers are now required to align with the institution's development requirements and HEC policies' (219-222).

Muhammad points out that although

'in many cases, teachers are compelled to engage in certain degrees solely to achieve promotional objectives (177) [... even though they are not required to achieve field-related qualifications across Pakistani universities' (199)

Furthermore,

'some universities do not encourage or facilitate career development through CPD activities' (Abdullah: 145).

The reluctance to promote CPD runs contrary to the fundamental principle of continuous learning, despite the well-documented positive impact of CPD. Pakistani universities, however, place great importance on the attainment of specific degrees as a means to meet standardised global and institutional goals. This perspective gains particular significance, as emphasised by Farooq (219), considering Pakistan's comprehensive efforts to review and enhance language teaching practices over the last two decades (Aziz, et al., 2023; Aziz et al., 2020). In order to

'to effectively deal the challenges posed by rapid changes, Pakistan's HEC is adopting initiatives akin to those of other countries such as more scholarships, training projects and teacher reforms' (Zain: 515).

This approach has led to an increasing recognition of the significance of teacher development, evident in the allocation of funds, provision of training opportunities, teacher support mechanisms, and promotional avenues, particularly within the domain of language instruction. However, despite these efforts, there remains a noticeable gap in institutional and administrative roles, *'which are not functioning'* (Imran: 215-216). These participants' statements have a significant alignment with current literature that reports challenges in the form of absence of clear guidelines for continuing professional growth (Aziz et al., 2023; Aziz et al., 2020).

6.9.1 Location of institution for further studies

The profession of teaching, being a public endeavour, is deeply shaped by societal norms:

'teaching is a public profession and powerfully influenced by the social norms, expectations, and environments' (Imran: 46).

The role of educators and the learning environment in shaping individuals' success cannot be overstated:

'students studying in positive learning environments exhibit higher levels of motivation, engagement, and aptitude for learning and career planning' (Ahmed: 154-163).

Conversely, students

'may struggle to absorb information, maintain motivation, and stay engaged when faced with unsupportive conditions' (Ali: 317-319).

Six out of the ten participants in this study pursued their degrees in Western countries, obtaining master's and PhD degrees from renowned universities in developed nations. They detailed the impact of these environments on their experiences:

'In my country I never questioned anything all my life I never even thought of that, my teacher could be wrong or a book in front of me could be, could have twisted facts, whereas in the UK it is entirely different I question everything so that that was the major difference I guess I found' (Bilal: 125-128).

The statement indicates a notable cultural disparity in attitudes toward questioning and critical thinking, potentially reflecting broader cultural and educational influences within Pakistan. Farooq states the impact of lack of critical thinking and curiosity among his students (145-146).

‘This lack of inquiry can lead to various consequences, such as passively accepting information without thorough evaluation,’ (161-162).

‘This could hinder intellectual growth and the ability to develop comprehensive perspectives (Bilal: 119-124).

Bilal's experience studying in the UK highlights a notable shift in his approach to learning. During his time there, he developed a habit of critically questioning teachers' statements and textbook content, reflecting a more open and intellectually curious mindset likely fostered by the university environment. He reports:

‘In the UK, I explored a wealth of knowledge, learning to question. Teachers served as facilitators, and I developed a questioning spirit’ (119-120) [...] *fostering critique and inquiry is vital for personal growth and intellectual maturity’* (Bilal: 370-374).

‘encouraging students to pose questions, challenge ideas, and seek evidence-based knowledge empowers them to become active, independent learners and critical thinkers’ (Muhammad: 126-127).

‘this approach to questioning also fosters a dynamic and enriched learning atmosphere, where ideas are explored and debated, leading to a deeper comprehension of diverse subjects’ (Usman: 153).

In summary, these accounts serve as a reminder of the significance of promoting critical thinking and questioning in the learning process. They exemplify how cultural and educational disparities between countries can significantly influence an individual's approach to learning, highlighting the transformative potential of embracing questioning as a means of personal growth and intellectual development.

Another participant, Ali drew attention to an additional dimension concerning foreign and home university environments, specifically related to the aspect of environment and resources. He conveyed an intense sense of belief in his learning capabilities; however, he that, prior to his experiences in a foreign university, he had not perceived any other learning environment as comparably conducive to his educational growth as his own home university. However, he was profoundly influenced by studying for his own research degree at a university in the Far-East:

'it is [a] more learner independent environment and you are open, this is this is you; your laptop and the world is yours all [and] more important differences [are] that we have access to all the international [and] national journals, the books and the libraries of other countries are well equipped as compared to the libraries in our country' (Ali: 98-104).

The participant's observation that studying abroad can lead to greater learner independence may indicate that the university where he earned his postgraduate degree promotes a more organized education system and encourages self-directed learning. In some countries, the education system may emphasise independent learning, allowing students to take ownership of their learning journey. On the other hand, in a country like Pakistan, the education system might be more teacher-centric, which could limit opportunities for independent learning (Awan, 2022).

One can say that while there may be differences in the approach to learner independence between countries, it is essential to recognise that it is not solely determined by geographical location but by specific factors. These factors include the educational system, teaching methods, and individual student characteristics, all of which can be influenced by the general wealth of the country, as it affects the availability of resources and investment in education. Shamim (2008) and Nawab (2012) have highlighted the impact of passive learning environments in institutions, which often provide fewer opportunities for self-directed learning and rely on rote learning habits.

Ali points out that overseas, students have access to a broad range scholarly sources such as international journals, books and articles unlike universities in Pakistan which either lack sources or do not recognise the importance of independent or the self-directed learning, which can also be influenced by individual students' characteristics.

6.9.2. Public and private institutions

Public and private universities exert diverse influences on English teachers, including both positive and negative attitudes, which can be either supportive or unsupportive. A productive work environment can be described as a place where there is trust, cooperation, support, accountability, and equity (Abbas et al., 2023). In this type of environment, one wants to strive for shared purpose, values and trust. A participant from a public university shares his experience of receiving support from their organisation:

'If I talk about Pakistan, there are a few universities [...which] support their staff. It depends on leadership, and a university is a source of inspiration for teachers as it provides funding for going abroad, for conferences and even organises conferences and training for teachers. It provides all kind of support. I invited international speakers in my university and leadership supported me with financial assistance and required facilities' (Ali: 168-174).

This demonstrates a commitment to teacher development and encouraging teachers to stay updated with the latest advancements in their fields. These opportunities not only enrich their knowledge and expertise but also bring fresh perspectives and ideas back to the institution. When a university actively supports its staff in these ways, it sends a positive message that their contributions are valued, and that it is committed to their success (Abbas et al., 2023). Considering this, Abdullah observes,

'as a result, teachers are more likely to feel motivated, engaged, and dedicated to their roles, which can have a positive impact on student learning outcomes as well... institutions that prioritise supporting their staff and fostering an environment of

inspiration tend to retain talented teachers, contributing to their reputation and overall standing in the academic community' (238-240).

However, Ali also acknowledges that not all universities in Pakistan have the same level of resources or leadership commitment, and the availability of CPD opportunities may vary. As he highlighted, the learning and development of English teachers is not an isolated activity; rather, it involves collaborative efforts. The reviewed research (Mann, 2005; Mann & Walsh, 2017; Mann & Webb, 2022) supports this. According to some studies (Dayan et al., 2018; Tahira et al., 2020) the institutional environment's importance is undeniable and PD resources and funding depend on its socio-economic situation and support. However, Sullo (2007) asserts, the desire to learn is innate. Ali suggests that

'given the appropriate environment, English teachers will be able to learn and make sense of their experiences within the professional environment; and ideally become more self-directed and responsible for their personal learning' (153).

On other hand, an unsupportive working environment refers to one with ineffective communication, unprofessionalism, lack of communication between employee and management and disparity of professional opportunities, which can lead to lower performance.

For example, Imran's narrative illustrates this point:

'In my private university job through reflective practices through appraisals I was able to understand where my teaching position is or how far I'm able to perform well, but that doesn't happen in my current job. There isn't [a] systematic and organised environment of improving your practices so you can continue doing what you're doing during your first year [and] you can do it until you retire'. [...] 'the first type of environment encourages employees to continually improve their skills and adapt to changing educational needs, whereas the second may hinder professional growth and could potentially lead to a lack of motivation or engagement among English teachers' (Imran: 101-117).

The private university appears to value and prioritise teacher development and quality teaching, which is reflected in the implementation of reflective practices and performance appraisals as

Imran reported. This emphasis on growth and improvement fosters a culture of continuous learning and excellence. However, Imran points out,

'in contrast, the lack of a similar approach in the current job, in a public university, is due to various factors such as inadequate resources, lack of emphasis on CPD, or a more traditional approach to education that does not actively promote continuous growth' (207-208).

To improve this institutional environment, there is a need to introduce structured reflective practices, regular performance appraisals, and CPD opportunities. This could lead to greater job satisfaction and increased motivation among teachers.

In brief, Imran's statement emphasises the importance of a systematic and organised approach to reflective practices and CPD in the institutional environment. Such an approach can significantly impact English teachers' performance, job satisfaction, and the overall quality of teaching and learning provided. On other hand, a participant who works in a private university reports full-time available support for English teachers to attend events and develop a more professional approach. Muhammad reports:

'As an experienced English language teacher in [an] English department we have different course[s] running in our department and have teachers of different age groups varying from 25 to 65. Some of our teachers never used any device except a simple phone. [...To]my surprise they are all online during COVID as [the] organisation provided them initial required training for online teaching and [is]open 24 hours, [...] to respond [to] their queries related to online teaching' (280-288).

This participant reveals the organisation's effective and timely support for new challenges and highlights the adaptability of the departments and its teachers in adjusting to the changing circumstances brought about by the pandemic. It also shows the importance of training and support in facilitating the transition to online teaching for those who may be less familiar with technology.

This participant's statement aligns with findings from other research in the field. For instance, Lee (2011) suggests the favourable influence of institutional environment on English teachers, highlighting how supportive environments can lead to CPD and enhanced teaching skills and improved pedagogical approaches. Similarly, studies by Borg (2015), Al Asmari (2016), Rind and Kadiwal (2016), and recent research by Qaisra and Haider (2023) all emphasise the pivotal role of a nurturing institutional context in promoting professional growth among English teachers, fostering English teachers' CPD and ultimately enhancing the quality of education.

In conclusion, the findings depict a distinct scenario in which participants have encountered various forms of social support from their families, which have acted as a driving force throughout their lives for personal and PD. Participants also elaborated on their experiences as students within Pakistani and foreign universities, and their roles as language professionals in both public and private educational institutions. It is noteworthy that one participant expressed contentment with his current position at a public university, citing the freedom he enjoys in teaching and planning his classes. In contrast, another participant from the same university voiced dissatisfaction with the institution's reluctance to embrace changes due to its slow and rigid structures. This variance in opinion can likely be attributed to the divergent experiences these two participants underwent in their teaching and learning journeys.

Finally, one participant highlighted the enriching environment of a foreign university where a culture of critical thinking thrived. In summary, these findings provide a portrayal of English teachers' experiences concerning the impactful environments they have experienced.

RESEARCH QUESTION THREE

In the second section, I presented various internal and external factors influencing career and CPD of these participants. This section depicts a picture of the affordances and impediments faced in their CPD, careers, and professions. I provide details to understand the nature and types of positive and negative factors.

RQ.3) What are the affordances or barriers to the development of teachers' independent professional growth?

An important aspect of this study is when participants were asked directly or indirectly about the affordances and barriers in their CPD; they used the terms CPD, career and profession interchangeably. For example, if they encountered any hurdle in their profession, it was viewed as a hindrance to their career and progress as well. In essence if anything impeded their career, it also hindered their CPD, and vice versa. Therefore, in this section, the three terms will be used interchangeably to describe the development of English teachers.

'My views on career development align on the premise that it's a lifelong pursuit demanding continuous improvement,' (Usman: 71).

'I believe that ongoing development and enhancement are essential for my career'
(Imran:133).

'In my opinion, career development is a lifelong journey that demands continuous improvement' (Noureen:303-304).

However, there are potential consequences of obstacles:

'I firmly believe that any obstacle in my professional or CPD endeavours would inevitably impede my career advancement' (Ali: 446-447).

'I am convinced that any hindrance encountered in my professional or CPD pursuits would invariably hinder my career progression' (Muhammed: 369-370).

These perspectives collectively highlight the significance of CPD, and the potential challenges faced in advancing one's career.

Some of the obstacles mentioned in participants' statements reported in this section do not seem to be directly related to CPD but can still have an impact as they can shape their mindsets and affect their motivation towards CPD. For example, when English teachers express concerns about their students' background, the lack of national oversight, or the unparallel policies in education, it suggests there may be disparities across the system (Zain: 183-185). Reflecting on the impact of such disparities, Imran states,

'this can either push English teachers to work harder on developing their skills or cause them to remain in their traditional role' (221-223).

This research question highlighted a range of responses from the participants, which were grouped under the following themes as presented in Table 16.

Table 16 Affordance and barriers for CPD

Affordances	Barriers
Social status	Factors impacting CPD
Promotional incentives	Absence of CPD activities
Teacher autonomy	Promotional hurdles
Freedom of developing a course content	Irrelevant CPD activities

6.10 Affordances for CPD

Some of the English teachers described below show both intrinsic and extrinsic motivation with regard to their careers and CPD:

'I feel internal motivation, internal drive, and satisfaction when I engage in activities that I find personally fulfilling' (Noureen: 79-80).

'English teachers often see CPD and career advancement as a means to enhance their professional knowledge and skills, which can lead to more job satisfaction and a sense of personal achievement' (Bilal: 26-28).

Some of the English teachers described below show both intrinsic and extrinsic motivation with regard to their careers:

'advancing in our career can bring extrinsic benefits such as higher salaries, promotion, and social and cultural recognition' (Imran: 233-234).

'these extrinsic benefits, especially monetary ones, can be particularly attractive to English teachers, especially in countries like Pakistan where TESOL and language learning are in high demand. Promotion can also provide a sense of progress and achievement, as well as open up new opportunities for professional growth and advancement' (Ali: 55-57).

Research conducted by Khalid (2016), Islam et al. (2020), and Manan (2021) indicates that English is widely recognised as a significant tool for learning and teaching due to its social prominence, influenced by two factors: extrinsic and intrinsic motivation.

Briefly, English teachers see CPD and their career in TESOL as offering a range of benefits, both intrinsic and extrinsic. These benefits can provide motivation and drive for CPD and advancement, which ultimately benefits not only the individual but also the wider field of TESOL and learning. This will be discussed further in subsequent sections.

6.10.1. Social status as extrinsic motivation for CPD

Social and cultural affordances can also be seen as key benefits of CPD for teachers.

'As I advance in my career, I often earn greater respect and recognition within my profession and the broader community' (Usman: 278).

Working in a university and engaging in CPD can also create opportunities for community networking, collaboration with fellow professionals, and the dissemination of knowledge and skills, all of which contribute to earning respect in society:

'When we have the title with our name Professor Doctor so that makes [it] a big deal for us to think about and we see ourselves in the 21 grades,⁹ so that is also a kind of a motivation because after all we are human beings [...] so it is [an]honour first of all to be [in] a university profession' (Usman: 271-275).

The notion of social status serving as a motivator for CPD aligns with Lev Vygotsky's sociocultural theory (1978) of cognitive development. Vygotsky's theory, articulated in works like 'Thought and Language' (2012) and 'Mind in Society' (1978), places a strong emphasis on the influence of social and cultural factors on human development and learning. In essence, Vygotsky suggests that learning is not an isolated, individual process but rather one that is profoundly shaped by the social and cultural context in which it occurs.

In the context of the pursuit of 'Professor Doctor' titles among English teachers, Vygotsky's sociocultural theory comes to life. Viewing oneself within this academic hierarchy can be interpreted as an acknowledgment of the diverse levels of expertise and knowledge that individuals accumulate throughout their educational journey. This perspective aligns remarkably well with Vygotsky's concept of the Zone of Proximal Development, where learning is viewed as a socially and culturally mediated process. Here, the attainment of 'Professor Doctor' signifies the culmination of this developmental journey, representing a motivating goal.

Moreover, Vygotsky's theory underscores the crucial role of the social environment and interactions with others in cognitive development. When individuals achieve the esteemed title of 'Professor Doctor,' it not only reflects personal achievement but also carries significant socio-cultural weight. This title signifies recognition within the broader cultural and societal

⁹ There are four faculty ranks or grades in Pakistan: lecturer (18), assistant professor (19), associate professor (20), and professor (21).

context and is seen as a symbol of expertise and accomplishment. English teachers, in their pursuit of this recognition, are influenced by the sociocultural norms and values prevalent in their communities.

In the specific cultural context of Pakistan, as exemplified by Akram and Mahmood (2007) and Maunah (2020), there is a strong emphasis on certain professions and qualifications as markers of expertise and social status. Being a university teacher, holding the title of 'Professor Doctor,' is one such esteemed role. This cultural emphasis on academic achievement and social recognition aligns with Vygotsky's theory by illustrating how social and cultural factors motivate English teachers to engage in CPD and advance their professional knowledge and skills.

In conclusion, Vygotsky's sociocultural theory provides a rich framework for understanding the deep socio-cultural and motivational aspects associated with the pursuit of the 'Professor Doctor' title among English teachers. It highlights how this pursuit is not merely a personal endeavour but a reflection of the complex interplay between individual aspirations, societal values, and the socio-cultural context.

Regarding the positive socio-cultural impact on ongoing learning mentioned above, CPD plays various crucial roles. These include keeping knowledge and skills up to date fostering confidence and credibility, offering a sense of professional direction, serving as a motivating force for maintaining continuous growth, and ensuring teachers remain responsive to changing societal and cultural contexts (Mann, 2005). The multidimensional impact of CPD and teaching is exemplified by the following account:

'And then that you made [a salary] from this profession and then your relations with the professors in the country at least within the country, you are in touch with so many people or sometimes if you travel abroad you have got [the] opportunity to be in touch with the foreign professors also so when you are in touch with so

many people, learned people you have a kind of like influx of knowledge and ideas so this is all which is very much positive for us' (Usman: 275-281).

The participant's statement suggests that being in this profession has many positive aspects beyond just financial gain.

'These advantages drive English teachers further in their profession, fostering CPD and generating a positive influence and highlights their pivotal role in driving English teachers towards ongoing growth and facilitating a constructive impact within their field as visible from my professional achievements' (Zain: 346-352).

6.10.2 Promotional incentives and monetary benefits

These refer to the benefits a teacher receives in pay increases or additional allowances after achieving a degree. Their impact and importance in their personal, social and professional life can be seen as Imran recounts the diverse forms of impact he experienced:

'Well I think [that] salary and social status are the most important motivating factors [that], apart from that yes we need physical comfort in order for that [to involve] respect and having one's voice being heard [as] important factors that [are] being given consideration; [they] are important as well so if not achieved through money if there is praise [and] appreciation in terms of prizes and awards, that can also help. [Therefore, it's not] always monetary compensation but then there is some kind of benefit; even words of appreciation can help [in] getting work done' (233-237).

This statement suggests that the participant believes that financial and social factors are important motivating elements, but there are other factors that can also drive motivation, such as physical comfort, respect, recognition and non-monetary rewards. He implies that positive feedback and appreciation can have a significant impact on motivation, and that even non-monetary rewards can be effective in motivating English teachers.

Both Usman and Imran have a similar understanding about their profession and development, as both their statements discuss the importance of financial rewards and recognition in motivating English teachers. Both participants are from the same highly prestigious public

university. Usman emphasises the value of connections, achieving promotion in the form of higher titles, salary and the exchange of knowledge, while Imran focuses more on the importance of social status, physical comfort and appreciation. Briefly, it is likely that these factors work together in complex ways to drive motivation, and that their relative importance may vary depending on the individual and the context.

6.10.3 Teacher autonomy as an affordance

In addition to socio-cultural impacts and monetary benefits, teacher autonomy emerges as a significant affordance for developing an independent learning approach and fostering continuous growth. Teacher autonomy covers a sense of self-direction, capability, and freedom for educators in their teaching efforts (Tan et al., 2023).

‘Teacher autonomy enables me to devise and implement effective teaching content and strategies that benefit both my students and the institution according to the needs’ (Ahmed: 214-215).

The following statement illustrates the theme:

‘I believe that by and large I do not find the environment at my institution in any way hampering or interfering with what I want to do, we have a lot of teacher autonomy; nobody had ever come and said don't teach it that way. Why [are] you teaching this much? Why are you overworking while engaging people [in] group discussion’ (Abdullah: 267-271).

Even though inappropriate classrooms with deficient resources have been identified as a hindrance to the implementation of new teaching methods in Pakistan (Jadoon et al., 2020), the above statement regarding teacher freedom implies that some participants enjoy a significant degree of autonomy, which can serve as a positive factor for CPD because autonomy empowers teachers to tailor their instructional methods to their students' needs and their own CPD objectives (Tan et al., 2023). According to Noureen,

‘autonomy encourages me as a teacher to experiment with various teaching strategies, fostering innovation and professional growth’ (130-135).

The institution's attitude toward teacher autonomy carries dual implications. On the one hand, valuing teacher autonomy can empower educators to enhance their PD, leading to greater effectiveness and job satisfaction. This supportive environment encourages CPD. On the other hand, an institution that appears indifferent to teacher practices may inadvertently demotivate educators and hinder CPD. When institutions trust and respect their teachers, it fosters motivation and better outcomes for students.

6.10.4 Freedom to develop course content

In Pakistan, private universities offer more flexibility and autonomy in designing courses and planning lessons to meet the specific needs of students (Iqbal et al., 2023).

‘Having this freedom allows me to tailor my teaching methods, materials, and assessments to create a more engaging and effective learning experience’ (Imran: 107-108).

‘As a teacher in university, being able to adapt the curriculum to suit the diverse backgrounds, interests, and learning styles of my students allows me to foster a more personalized and student-centred approach to education’ (Farooq: 355).

Bilal, who is employed in a private university, highlights a significant aspect of the working environment in his statement reported below, which reflects the significance of autonomy and freedom in course content design and lesson planning, and directly aligns with the principles of CPD by fostering a dynamic and growth-oriented approach to teaching (Mann & Webb, 2022). Having the freedom to design course content also implies that the participant has more opportunities for implementing CPD learning:

‘one implication of this approach is that our institution values creativity, a student-centred approach, and innovation’ (149-150). [...] You can choose your own material you can make what you want to do with your students how to teach them you show them a video, or you want to talk to them, or you want to teach them a piece of grammar you can include anything’ (Bilal: 202-205).

Adopting a student-centred approach means the focus is on meeting the needs of individual students. By giving English teachers the freedom to choose their own material, it implies that the institution recognises that different students have different learning styles and preferences. The freedom to choose material can be seen as a form of PD, as teachers could explore untapped resources and strategies that can enhance their skills and knowledge. Bilal's statement about teacher autonomy is consistent with Abdullah's, described in the section 'Teacher autonomy' as affordance, though these participants are from different institutions.

In the context of facilitating CPD, teacher autonomy, and content design, existing literature highlights that qualified English teachers who are knowledgeable about new pedagogical methods often encounter obstacles, such as overcrowded classrooms, insufficient administrative support, and limited resources (Kasi, 2010; Khan, 2015; Nageen et al., 2023), preventing their implementation. However, these above-mentioned accounts by Bilal and Abdullah offer optimistic indications of a shifting scenario in TESOL practices within Pakistan.

6.11 Barriers for CPD

Participants identified several barriers to CPD. For instance, one participant reported:

'As an English teacher in Pakistan, I face several challenges in my work and CPD efforts' (Noureen:391)

'I often struggle with a lack of time due to a heavy workload' (Ahmed: 350-351)

'There's a lack of affordable CPD activities available to me' (Bilal:16)

'I find limited opportunities to implement and apply my learning' (Usman:239-240)

'I also encounter a lack of necessary facilities to support my work' (Ali: 297-298)

Research (Nawab, 2017; Shamim, 2011) into language teaching in the HE context of Pakistan has revealed that these barriers can significantly impact the motivation, growth, and application of CPD learning:

‘despite the importance of CPD for English teachers to improve their teaching skills and keep up with current professional trends and techniques, these challenges can hinder our ability to do so effectively’ (Bilal: 149-152).

To address these challenges, various opinions have been offered:

‘English teachers should be provided with more time and resources to engage in CPD activities,’ (Farooq: 354)

‘teachers should be given more affordable and accessible CPD opportunities’ (Usman: 178).

‘there should be a greater focus on providing English teachers with opportunities to implement and apply their learning in real-world contexts, rather than just theoretical knowledge’ (Zain: 507-08).

[There should be] ‘improvements in the educational system’ (Farooq: 27),

‘schools, and colleges [should] train students’ (Ali: 308-309)

‘English teachers can apply new concepts in classes’ (Usman: 149-150).

Ultimately, addressing these challenges will require a collaborative effort from various stakeholders in the field of ELT in Pakistan. Based on the background information in the literature, the factors impacting CPD are diverse and can be outlined as follows.

6.11.1 Factors impacting CPD

In discussing the factors affecting CPD, the participants made the following comments:

‘this can involve reflecting on one’s teaching practice and areas for improvement and seeking out opportunities that address those areas’ (Zain 37-41) [...] *achieving goals*

related to CPD for English teachers involves several important aspects,' (Zain: 123-146).

'one key aspect is increasing awareness of the range of available CPD activities, and another is recognizing and identifying personal needs and selecting appropriate PD activities that align with them' (Ali: 356-362).

'however, it is not sufficient to simply engage in professional learning and development activities; it is also crucial to incorporate that learning into one's classroom practice by applying new knowledge and skills to teaching situations and assessing the impact of that learning on student outcomes [...] effective CPD involves an ongoing process of reflection, implementation, and evaluation, with a focus on ongoing improvement' (Imran: 76-83).

'it is important for institutions to provide flexibility and support' (Ahmed: 337-338).

'This [institutional support] can include offering time and resources for CPD activities, as well as creating a supportive and collaborative culture that encourages ongoing learning and growth' (Usman: 208-209).

By providing these kinds of support, institutions can help English teachers to achieve their continuous learning goals and enhance their teaching effectiveness.

One of the participants narrates some elements that impact CPD learning and its implications in his university:

'I think the way our organisational structure works that is one big flaw, because it is a government institute which operates in a manner where it's very little room for improvement, there are big, there's a huge complete process [for] making any changes or improvement. So, there are big bodies that don't meet very often. They meet yearly, they're quite disconnected, but none of that thing is taking place so in or in, in government organisations which have got history like they're very old, making things better is really difficult because of the rigidity that it offers in its functional and organisational structure' (Imran: 200-210).

These observations suggest that the challenges faced in CPD at this institution are partly due to the complex and slow-moving nature of its organisational processes. The difficulties in effecting change and improving CPD opportunities appear to stem from the established, inflexible procedures rather than a lack of will or interest. Focusing on streamlining decision-making processes and enhancing the efficiency of communication channels might be initial steps toward addressing these barriers.

6.11.1.1 Absence of CPD activities as a barrier to CPD

The Literature Review chapter, specifically section 3.5.4 titled ‘Different Approaches to CPD’, provides an overview of the various possibilities and activities related to CPD. It is crucial for English teachers to carefully plan and select programmes that facilitate personal improvement in order to ensure effective teaching. One of the participants, Usman emphasises the importance of regular engagement in CPD programmes and advocates making them mandatory to enhance the overall quality of teaching. Despite having achieved a PhD, the participant feels the need for consistent training.

‘In the faculty [...] regular basic training courses should be there which we don't have [...] Now and then, there are some differential courses but that is not [...] compulsory] for all the faculty members, especially for the new entrants, so sometimes the new entrants are there, new faculty members are there, they spend some four years five years six years without any training at all so this should not be. There must be, along with their higher degrees like MPhil. PhD, [...] teaching training courses must also be there on a regular basis that would also help us’
(Usman: 243-250).

In his statement, Usman raises a notable concern regarding the absence of regular training courses for faculty members within his institution. He stresses the importance of addressing this issue by advocating for mandatory training, particularly for newly appointed faculty members. He points out the need for a consistent provision of training alongside academic pursuits such as MPhil and PhD programmes. His concern reflects the potential consequences

of inadequate training, particularly for newcomers who may find themselves without essential PD opportunities for extended periods.

In line with research findings (Dayan et al., 2018; Nawab, 2017; Tahira et al., 2020), Usman 's response underscores the significance of CPD for faculty members in HE settings, particularly in the field of language teaching. It highlights a potential gap in the current approach to training and development, emphasising the need for more structured and comprehensive programmes. This call-to-action urges institutions to prioritise faculty training and development, recognising the pivotal role of CPD in enhancing teaching quality within HE.

6.11.1.2 Promotion policy as a barrier to CPD

Understanding the significance of CPD in professional growth, various perspectives shed light on its impact:

‘from my perspective, CPD plays a vital role in professional growth’ (Imran: 158-161).

‘one of the key motivations for pursuing professional learning and development is the potential for career advancement and promotion’ (Ali: 420-421) [...] ‘policies around promotion criteria and timelines are unclear, leading to confusion and frustration for professionals seeking to progress in their career’ (Ali: 429-430)

‘without clear guidelines and expectations, professionals may become demotivated and struggle to see the value of investing time and resources in CPD’ (Usman: 251-52)

‘the lack of clarity around promotion has created a sense of unfairness, with some professionals feeling like they were not being given equal opportunities to advance in their careers’ (Zain: 612-614).

Usman emphasises the importance of addressing challenges by establishing clear and transparent policies. He asserts,

‘to address these challenges, it is important for universities and professional bodies to establish clear and transparent promotional policies that outline the criteria for advancement and the timeline associated with it [...] such policies will provide

professionals with a better understanding of what is required to advance their careers, thereby increasing their motivation and engagement in the CPD process' (100-105).

Clear promotional policies can significantly benefit professionals;

'by doing so, professionals can have a better understanding of what they need to do to advance their career, which can help to increase their motivation and engagement in the CPD process' (Abdullah: 68-9).

'when promotion policies are transparent and fair, it can contribute to a positive organisational culture that values ongoing learning and development [...] a positive culture fosters an environment where professionals like me are attracted and retained, demonstrating commitment to our ongoing growth and development' (Zain: 610-612).

'I see the main issue as a profession in teaching at the university level is actually promotional problems, on the way the promotions are being made, you see, particularly having that degree is one other way if anybody is timely earning a PhD, so he has greater chances to become a senior' (Ali: 412-418).

This last statement implies that the promotional system may not be based solely on merit or teaching effectiveness, but rather on the attainment of higher degrees such as a PhD. Thus, English teachers who have earned a PhD degree are given preference in the promotion process, regardless of their teaching skills or effectiveness. The promotional process for teachers is not be fully aligned with their PD.

To address this issue, it may be necessary to reconsider the criteria used for promotions and to ensure that they align with the PD of teachers. This could involve incorporating ongoing PD opportunities and measuring progress in teaching effectiveness, research, and service to the institution and the community. By doing so, universities can promote a culture of CPD, which can benefit both the teachers and students. This would involve a shift towards a more merit-based approach recognising and rewarding effective teaching, rather than solely relying on academic credentials.

Existing literature (Adams & Mann, 2021; Dayan et al., 2018; Nawab, 2017; Tahira et al., 2020) suggests two categories of professional learning: subject related knowledge and skills, and development of critical thinking, collaborative problem-solving skills, and a reflective approach. It also indicates that teachers often choose off-site and in-house CPD activities based on their personal needs or due to the perceived irrelevance of institutional offerings. For example, Abdullah reports:

'I initiated my CPD with HEC and then I moved to off-site CPD activities due to the personal relevance of the activities' (47).

'I remain engaged in informal self-directed CPD activities due to my personal aspirations' (Muhammed: 221-222).

'There appears to be a discrepancy between the CPD activities deemed significant by teachers and those valued by institutions. For example, I find some CPD activities irrelevant' (Usman: 184-186).

Notably, institutions where teachers are employed may not fully recognise or acknowledge the value of learning opportunities that arise from everyday practice as CPD (Adams & Mann, 2021), as Ali mentioned, the PhD is seen as the only way for promotion. This discrepancy often shapes the prevailing trends in CPD activities and trends pursued by English teachers.

6.11.1.3 Department permission as a barrier for CPD

Getting departmental permission can be a hurdle in Pakistani universities, as strict procedures often hinder approval for CPD activities. One of the participants, Noureen, discussed embracing active CPD engagement while unveiling challenges in attending CPD events:

'...it becomes very difficult for me to get leave from my own department for participating, for example, and I've already told you that I've been participating in various PD courses offered by [the] HEC, offered by the regional English language office. I've been participating in various PD courses, you know, and other times what happens that there are some of my colleagues, they know how to complain to the director, that's why they ask [the] director, 'Do you allow only her? Why not

us?’ You know what the answer is then the director says she herself has applied for this particular PD course, and now she has applied [for] the leave’ (245-254).

In light of this statement, we can infer that difficulties in obtaining leave for CPD courses can create reluctance to apply for leave, which may impact English teachers' growth and skill development, potentially affecting their overall productivity and performance.

The findings and this participant’s experiences are aligned with earlier research (Adams & Mann, 2021; Mann, 2005) where, CPD is considered a voluntary activity that can be pursued independently. However, it can be more effective when supported and recognised by the institution. Additionally, Faisal et al. (2019) highlight that teachers are under immense pressure to undertake specific degrees for visibly promotional incentives, yet CPD courses are not valued for their role in visibly improved teaching.

In conclusion, the statement illustrates the difficulty of obtaining leave for CPD events, opportunities and courses. The presence of competition for leave approval and potential disparity in the uptake of such events can create challenges for English teachers seeking opportunities for professional growth and development.

6.11.1.4 Irrelevant CPD activities as barrier to continuous growth

It is important for English teachers to carefully evaluate the relevance and potential benefits of CPD activities, enabling them to make informed decisions about their CPD:

‘by reflecting on our teaching methods, we can prioritise our professional learning, selecting appropriate CPD programmes tailored to our individual needs’ (Farooq: 31-36).

‘by engaging in self-evaluation and targeted PD activities, I stay updated with the latest teaching methods, ensuring the provision of quality education to my students...I believe self-assessment not only facilitates my career goals but also emphasises the significance of CPD for me as an individual English teacher, considering my unique personal and professional demands’ (Abdullah: 139-144).

However, Bilal highlights a specific challenge related to CPD.

'I've talked to many teachers, and they say that mostly they [...trainers] give us theoretical things which we cannot apply in our classroom because we don't have that flexibility in our teaching routine' (289-291).

This disconnection between theoretical knowledge and practical application can occur due to a variety of factors, including a lack of resources, time constraints, or institutional policies that also have support in reviewed literature. As discussed, in chapter 3, several researchers (Al Asmari, 2016; Manan et al., 2016; Mann & Webb, 2022) have found that CPD programmes are more effective when the participants are involved in designing and delivering a programme that fits their needs. As a result, trainers can work with teachers to identify specific areas of their teaching practice where the new knowledge and/or skills can be integrated, while still maintaining the existing structure of their teaching routine.

Briefly, the statement above highlights the need for a more practical and applicable approach to teacher training and PD. By addressing this challenge, teachers can benefit from training and resources that directly support their teaching practice and enhance their students' learning experience.

RESEARCH QUESTION FOUR

In the previous section, I have reported the findings related to affordances and barriers to CPD as reported by these participants. In this section, I discuss the participants' development as novices during the initial years of language teaching, and then report how they later exhibit various professional characteristics by adopting distinctive roles in their universities.

Q.4. What significant characteristics do the selected participants exhibit as English teachers in both their early and experienced years?

In this study, the novice to expert model, proposed by Benner (1984), provides a framework for understanding the journey individuals undergo in mastering the skill of ELT. This model delineates five stages: novice, advanced beginner, competence, proficiency, and expertise. Novices, typically defined as individuals with up to five years of teaching experience, begin with limited experience and rely on prescribed methodologies, grappling with fundamental challenges like classroom management (Dayan et al., 2018; Guskey & Huberman, 1995). As they transition to the advanced beginner stage, they start to recognise patterns in language teaching but still require guidance.

Experienced or expert teachers, usually with between 10 to 15 years of experience, have attained degrees, training, and development in language teaching. They have likely engaged in significant professional learning activities and possess a deep understanding of effective language teaching principles:

'I have refined my pedagogical skills through practice, reflection, and contributions to the field, such as publishing articles or presenting at conferences' (Usman: 13-18).

'I have enhanced my teaching skills through hands-on experience, thoughtful reflection, and professional contributions, such as publishing articles or presenting at conferences' (Abdullah: 200-201).

Teachers' advancement to proficiency is marked by seamlessly integrating research-based practices, demonstrating a profound understanding of language nuances, and often mentoring peers to foster meaningful language learning experiences.

6.12 Participants as novice English teachers

The rationale behind exploring this research question was to illuminate the early stages of the participants' careers, which may reveal their needs and professional approach, and shed light on training policies. To address this question, I explored their early professional period, their experiences, and their current professional characteristics. I also examined their views during both their early and experienced years of teaching to see how their professional and personal attributes developed over time. Through this research, my aim was to develop knowledge that considers various attributes and teaching preferences at different stages of an English teacher's professional journey. This would provide insights into how CPD influenced their professional growth and how it impacted other stakeholders such as students, institutions, policies, and the field.

When the participants were initially inducted as co-operative¹⁰ teachers at the selected research sites, many exhibited specific qualities and characteristics. These attributes were assessed through various means, including their pursuit of academic degrees, attitudes towards language teaching, interactions with students, and classroom management skills. These qualities are summarised in Table 17 below.

Table 17 Participants' attributes

Themes
Attitude towards language teaching
Traditional teaching methods
Classroom approach and attitude towards learners

¹⁰ Co-operative teacher is an initial stage of teaching profession in Pakistani universities.

6.12.1 Attitude towards language teaching

Generally, for English teachers in the Pakistani context, the concept of sustainability in their profession is a crucial motivation for their development (Shamim, 2018). According to Noureen,

‘this can include acquiring new teaching techniques, exploring new technologies, developing cultural competencies, and keeping up to date with changing educational policies and practices’ (44-46) [...] I recognise the need to continually update my knowledge and skills to remain relevant in the profession and to ensure my longevity as a professional English teacher’ (85-88).

Ali provides the rationale for setting goals,

‘as a result, I set goals for my CPD that are aligned with my vision of a sustained career’ (64-66).

Zain further speaks about his PD journey and impact,

‘by engaging in CPD, I have enhanced my effectiveness as an English teacher, contributed to the improvement of my institution, and helped to shape the future of my field in a sustainable and meaningful way’ (169-170).

Ahmed further elaborates on his inclination towards ELT,

‘I was interested in exploring how language works and how I can become a better language teacher, I wanted to explore the current approaches and methods in language teaching’ (50-51).

In the following section, I will illustrate the approach these participants took in framing and reaching their objectives. By interpreting this data, I aim to shed light on their inclination towards their respective fields.

6.12.1.1 Goal-oriented nature of participants

As novices, some participants decided to pursue degrees in the field of language teaching to enhance their understanding and expertise. The following quotation illustrates a significant characteristic of one participant:

'I planned to be a college teacher and then [my]second aim was to get [a] PhD degree' (Usman :88-89).

This implies that he was deliberate and purposeful in his career planning. By setting specific goals, he may have been able to stay motivated and on track in pursuing his chosen profession that is visible from his achievements. Usman's personal goal is common in the field of language teaching in Pakistani universities (Raza, Coombe & Davidson, 2022).

Novice teachers enter the teaching profession with a set of beliefs about teaching and learning (Dayan et al., 2018) and generally, during the early years, learning is aimed at developing an understanding of practice, followed by later periods of reflection on work and discussion from which, teachers may continue to gain new insights and improve their skills. This is where a programme of CPD is so important and may take various approaches or forms according to the teacher's individual or contextual needs.

Another participant also shares a similar goal-driven approach:

[I] 'set certain goals, for example, when I joined this university then I decided the initial goal was actually to do a PhD; [...] then I have made some small goals - number one now I have to prepare myself for the GRE [Graduate Record Examinations] if I'm qualifying it then, second, I have to qualify [for] the IENGLISH TEACHERS, this was my second goal, then appeared admission and desired country' (Ali: 20-24).

By setting these smaller goals, the participant was able to create a roadmap for achieving his goal for earning a PhD. The statement suggests he recognised early on, the importance of qualifications in achieving goals. This diligent preparation for standardised tests indicates his intention to secure a scholarship and pursue a foreign degree and highlights his proactive stance in seeking opportunities for international education. This goal setting may indicate his commitment as a responsible and dedicated professional. It is also evident they prioritise obtaining a PhD over other forms of training. This mindset not only reflects their personal

choices but also highlights the prevailing cultural and pedagogical norms within the country's language teaching context.

6.12.1.2 Attitude towards training

When reflecting on their early days in the profession, these participants' statements convey their perspectives on teaching English and the training process, distinct from their pursuit of a PhD degree. For instance, despite aiming to do a PhD, Usman said:

'...in the very start of my career I didn't bother about training and how to teach language'
(30-31).

The use of the term "bother" implies a lack of interest or concern about training and teaching methodologies. This suggests he did not prioritise or see the value in acquiring formal training or developing a comprehensive understanding of how to effectively teach language, which can have implications for the quality of teaching and the learning outcomes of students. Without a foundation in effective teaching techniques, this participant may have missed opportunities to optimise his instructional strategies and support his students' language development.

Another participant, Noureen, elaborated on her lack of knowledge about training:

'I didn't have any idea about getting training. I didn't know what kind of activities to use, which methods would be suitable, or which strategies should be applied for different types of learners' (120-122).

Lack of knowledge about training may have limited her professional growth. Engaging in professional development opportunities, such as training workshops or courses, can expand educators' knowledge and skills, enabling them to provide more effective and engaging language instruction.

The statements from the participants imply a lack of interest, concern or knowledge regarding training and pedagogy in language teaching. This raises concerns about potential consequences for teaching quality, professional growth, and student learning outcomes. It underscores the need for initial teacher training in language teaching, adherence to prior guidelines, and

ongoing PD. Such training is crucial for teachers to enhance their skills and provide effective language instruction.

These participants' statements align with Shamim's (2018) findings, which indicate a lack of motivation and awareness among English teachers regarding training. The statements also highlight a prevailing lack of consistency mentioned by Imran, that

'in Pakistan, I have noticed that pedagogical and specific qualifications for teaching English are not a requirement' (32-33).

6.12.1.3 Limited field knowledge

The limited language field knowledge at the early stage of teaching is further exemplified:

'When I started, I did not know much about ELT, I mean so I can admit that I have not planned everything [...]. I mean I did not know much about language teaching, frankly speaking' (Zain: 308-310).

This statement reflects a common experience among novice or inexperienced teachers in the Pakistani context who may initially face challenges due to their limited knowledge and understanding of language teaching principles. The participant's statement shows self-awareness is crucial as it sets the foundation for personal growth and improvement. This idea is closely aligned with the concept of self-directed CPD. A key aspect of self-directed CPD is the recognition that professionalism demands not only identifying but also actively addressing both personal and institutional CPD requirements (Mann & Webb, 2022).

Another participant, Imran spoke about his limited awareness of the ELT field:

'When I started in ELT, I was only aware of the need for strictness in class, with no interactions and a complete lack of knowledge about methods and approaches. I was the centre of attention' (80-82).

This participant's perspective highlights the proactive role that professionals must take in their ongoing development, a responsibility that includes addressing both individual and organisational learning needs.

Essentially, Imran's statement highlights the initial challenges and learning curves that many of the English teachers faced when starting their teaching careers. It emphasises the importance of CPD and the need for teachers to enhance their knowledge and skills in language teaching to provide effective instruction and create meaningful learning experiences for their students. The above-mentioned participants' accounts reveal that many of them lacked a deep understanding of language teaching. In the context of effective teaching, a crucial aspect of the planning process involves incorporating examples of successful lessons and demonstrating how language learning operates in practical scenarios. It is imperative to comprehend how effective teaching directly contributes to effective learning, as emphasised by Richards (2023).

6.12.1.4 Self-confidence

Most of the participants reported feeling overconfident about their teaching ability, as shown by the following participant's account.

'I was usually motivated and then I also believed that perhaps whatever I know, I have pretty much command over it, also they were kind of feelings of being overconfident about everything that I was doing at the time. Perhaps I thought that whatever I was doing was right and perhaps [a] wonderful way of doing things'
(Imran: 61-64).

This refers to the early phase in the participant's teaching journey where he felt highly motivated and had a sense of self-assurance about his teaching methods. This might have been based on his perceived proficiency in the subject matter and the belief that he was employing effective teaching strategies. Research by Qaisra and Haider (2023) shows a need for help for these new teachers to change and grow their beliefs beyond their perception of their ability; they need to see different ways of thinking about second language teaching. Research by Richards (2023) offers suggestions on integrating identity-focused content into teacher CPD programmes for language teachers.

This overconfidence might have led Imran to overlook potential areas for improvement or alternative approaches to teaching. This mindset of considering his own way as the only right

way may have limited his professional growth and hindered his openness to new ideas or different perspectives. Generally speaking, he was unaware about best practices, and did not know what he did not know. Although

'confidence can be a valuable asset for teachers' (Imran: 91),

'[there is a] need to create a balance between confidence and humility in teaching, to remain open for improvement, and to recognise what is essential' (Noureen: 368-371).

'[Furthermore,] it is essential to maintain a reflective and receptive attitude to continue learning and adapting one's teaching practices' (Usman: 157-158).

'[Finally,] recognising the need for ongoing PD and remaining open to different approaches can lead to further growth and improvement as an educator' (Muhammed: 134).

These perspectives highlight the nuanced approach required in teaching, balancing self-assurance with a willingness to learn and adapt to ensure effective education delivery.

In summary, some participants in the early stage of their teaching career displayed distinct attitudes towards language teaching: a strong awareness of the requirements and skills needed for pursuing a PhD and admission into foreign universities and a clear understanding of the academic expectations and qualifications necessary for such studies. However, they had an indifferent attitude towards or lacked awareness of pedagogic courses, the need for specific qualifications in ESL or EFL and some were overconfident in their teaching ability. This indicates that they may have viewed ELT as subject knowledge rather than a skill that requires specialised pedagogical training or qualifications for effective language instruction.

The reason behind this disparity can be explained by the fact that pursuing a PhD is considered an essential requirement for professional promotion, while pedagogic courses are not included in the HEC policy and do not lead to any monetary benefits. Consequently, participants may have prioritised pursuing a PhD due to its direct impact on career advancement and financial

gains. These findings are consistent with previous studies conducted by Shamim (2011), Nawab (2012), and Qaisra and Haider (2023).

In this section, I report findings regarding the attitudes of some English teachers towards the field of language teaching. Next, I will describe the teaching methods employed by novice English teachers, which prioritise content presentation over comprehensive delivery methods. Subsequently, I will present findings related to the materials used by these English teachers during the early stages of their careers, offering valuable insights into the ELT landscape in Pakistan.

6.12.2 Traditional teaching methods

In the realm of education in Pakistan, traditional teaching methods have long prevailed. However, as experienced educators, participants like Noureen, Imran, and Usman advocate for a shift towards more dynamic and learner-centred approaches:

‘language teaching methods should be task-driven and need-driven, focusing on the specific goals, needs, and interests of the learners’ (Noureen: 127-129).

‘the delivery of content is as important as the content itself for successful learning and teaching’ (Imran: 79-81).

‘teachers should employ effective instructional strategies that engage students, providing opportunities for students to use the language in authentic contexts and enhance language acquisition’ (Usman: 150-155).

Moreover, Imran shares his early teaching experience, reflecting on the limitations of his teaching approach:

‘When I started first content happened to be more important to me than the process of doing or delivering that content’ (71-72) [...] *this mindset is commonly observed among novice teachers’*(74).

'[Teachers] may focus primarily on the content they are teaching and may not initially consider the pedagogical techniques or instructional approaches needed to facilitate effective learning' (Zain: 328-330).

While content is undoubtedly crucial in teaching, the process of delivering that content is equally important. Effective teaching involves not only having knowledge of the subject matter but also employing appropriate instructional methods, engaging teaching strategies, and creating a conducive learning environment for students (Stronge, 2018).

'As a novice progresses in their teaching journey, [...] they may realise the significance of the teaching process and become more conscious of the methods they employ to facilitate student understanding and engagement' (Abdullah: 33-36).

They may recognise the importance of instructional design, student-centred approaches, and effective communication to enhance the learning experience. This transformation of English teachers will be discussed in subsequent sections.

Research (Dayan et al., 2018; Tahira et al., 2020) indicates that novice teachers, who bring preconceived beliefs about their teaching and students' learning often face challenges during their classroom practices. However, with experience and PD, educators often recognise the importance of both content and instructional strategies in achieving successful learning outcomes. Additionally, to truly surpass in teaching and cultivate a conducive learning atmosphere for students, effective language instruction needs the integration of practical activities rooted in real-life and everyday matters (Shahzadi & Ducasse, 2022).

6.12.2.1 Teaching content

When English teachers introduce relevant content into their lessons, they not only enhance student engagement but also facilitate language learning experiences (Shamim, 2011). However, the participants at the initial stage of their profession often indicated a limited perspective, utilising limited resources and methods, mistakenly viewing this as fulfilment of their instructional responsibilities. For example, Zain reports:

'I mean our job see like you have a one grammar book we get that book to the class, teach them some language rule, teach them what [it] is teaching them, you just write down on the board I mean, I mean you have done your job' (326-330).

This statement aligns research (Akram et al., 2020; Akram, & Yang, 2021; Channa & Panezai, 2019) that highlights the common use of only one textbook for language teaching in Pakistani universities.

Zain's early teaching shows a narrow approach towards language teaching and a limited role in the teaching process at a Pakistani university, where his primary task was to write down language rules on the board and consider this as fulfilling his responsibilities. This lack of engagement with instructional methods indicates a deficiency in interactive teaching techniques and student-centred approaches. However, it is important to note this does not reflect his current teaching practices.

On the topic of teacher development, another participant, Usman states:

'as teachers gain more experience and engage in professional development, they often adopt more dynamic and student-focused approaches that go beyond simply presenting information' (153-159).

This statement aligns with existing research (Richards, 1990; Saeed et al., 2021; Shahzadi & Ducasse, 2022) that highlights the imperative for English teachers to acquire more understanding of English as a language skill.

Ahmed emphasises

'it is crucial for language teachers to embrace a more comprehensive approach that recognizes the value of practical application and current issues to create a more dynamic and effective learning environment,' (248-254).

The benefits of incorporating practical activities and real-life content in language instruction, which can enhance student engagement and promote a deeper understanding of the language, should not be overlooked.

In conclusion, the insights gathered from the participants' narratives shed light on their limited perspectives regarding teaching methods and indicate a need for CPD to enhance their

professional approach. One participant's inclination towards prioritising content over delivery methods and another's persistent adherence to a teacher-centred approach, devoid of fostering active learning, highlight the prevailing limitations. Zain's early inclination towards rote learning, merely writing information on the board without concern for true comprehension, further stresses these limitations. These instances collectively point out the limited grasp of effective language teaching methods the teachers had in the early stages of their career.

Looking back, the teachers identified the need for a broader and more adept understanding of instructional techniques, underlining the importance of fostering a more dynamic and effective CPD for novices.

I have looked into how new English teachers teach to give an indication of ELT in Pakistan. Stressing the importance of teaching methods, I have shown the need for training and CPD for early educators, especially English teachers. The participants' early preference for content over delivery methods and their limited resources offer insightful information.

In the next section, I will examine classroom management and teachers' attitude towards students and share findings about the teaching style that focuses more on the teacher than the students in TESOL in Pakistan. Referring to their early careers, these participants' insights show that they might not be very effective at engaging with their students' learning as they may not fully grasp their students' needs, thoughts, and different ways of learning. I will also touch on research that puts emphasis on the importance of training for new teachers in the field of education.

6.12.3 Classroom approach and attitude towards learners

Classroom approach refers to the methodology, instructional strategies, and techniques employed by teachers to facilitate or hinder learning (Richards & Rodgers, 2014). This includes the specific framework, principles, and methods used to structure and deliver lessons, engage students, and achieve desired learning outcomes. Participants in this study, while reflecting on

their early career stage, demonstrated some indifference or unawareness of students' needs and various learning styles. However, the introductory part of the following section highlights their current understanding, contrasting it with their reflections on their novice period.

6.12.3.1 Indifferent attitude towards students

In the words of Noureen,

'by digging into the theories and research within the field of learning and the learner, teachers can gain insights into the factors that influence language acquisition and the strategies that can enhance learning outcomes, which can shape their instructional decisions, teaching methods, and classroom practices' (155-157).

This exploration provides a conceptual and theoretical basis on which a teacher consciously or unconsciously develops their personal understanding of their teaching (Siddiqui et al., 2021).

'...it encompasses various aspects related to how individuals learn languages, including cognitive processes, socio-cultural factors, learner characteristics, and motivation,' (Ahmed: 291-297).

'it is crucial to recognise the importance of considering students' thoughts and feelings during learning' (Muhammad: 144-145).

Neglecting student perspectives can hinder engagement, motivation, and individual learning needs (Seven, 2020). Furthermore,

'valuing and incorporating student voices promotes a supportive classroom climate, fosters student autonomy and empowerment, and enhances overall learning outcomes,' (Ali: 109-110).

By prioritising student-centred approaches and creating an environment that values their thoughts and feelings, early-stage teachers can lay the foundation for effective teaching and positive student experiences. However, in relation to the early career of these participants, one teacher commented that: *'I never bother about what students think and feel.'* (Bilal: 164). This statement emphasises the importance of ongoing PD for early-stage English teachers. Engaging in continuous PD is crucial for their growth, as it allows them to enhance their teaching skills,

expand their pedagogical knowledge, and stay abreast of current best practices in language teaching.

The lack of attention by Bilal towards learners and a teacher-centred approach differs from another participant's viewpoint. According to Zain,

'successful teaching involves a comprehensive understanding of learners, encompassing numerous factors that provide insights into individual educational needs and preferences' (399-400) [...] by understanding learners from these multiple dimensions, teachers can modify their teaching methods, materials, and support structures to establish a broad and efficient learning environment that addresses the distinct needs of each student' (418-420).

In the following statement, Zain demonstrates a lack of concern or responsibility regarding why some students learn while others do not. He comments on his early career teaching philosophy:

'Why some students actually learn others don't learn we never, we were never bothered about this question. If somebody learned very good. If somebody did not learn, that won't be your problem, so this is how' (325-326).

There is an assumption that if some students excel in their learning, it is seen as positive, but if others struggle or fail to learn, it is not considered the concern of the teacher. However, as English language is treated as the language of development in Pakistan and education is a fundamental right, as English teachers, it is responsibility to ensure that all students have equal opportunities to learn and succeed (Nawab, 2017; Shamim, 2011). Dismissing the question of why some students struggle or fail to learn overlooks the potential underlying factors that may be hindering their progress.

There are many reasons why students may experience difficulties in learning (Nawab, 2017). These can range from variations in learning styles and preferences, to differences in prior knowledge and background, potential learning disabilities or socio-economic factors. When an English language teacher ignores why some students struggle, they miss important chances to understand and overcome the obstacles that hinder their learning. As English teachers, it is

essential to adopt a proactive approach to support all learners effectively (Alhassan et al., 2021). This involves understanding and addressing individual learning needs, employing differentiated instruction strategies, providing additional resources or support, and fostering a positive and inclusive learning environment. By recognising the diverse learning needs of students, teachers can help create a supportive and engaging atmosphere where every student has the opportunity to thrive.

The perspectives expressed by these participants align with the findings of research in Pakistan conducted by Shamim (2008) and Jadoon et al. (2020), which reveal a prevalence for teacher-centred classrooms in government institutions, where the instructional approach centres around the use of grammar translation (Nasimi & Ghaemi, 2022). According to Farooq,

‘in these educational environments, teachers predominantly prioritise the explanation of grammar rules over fostering a development of English language skills’ (38-39).

Notably, the pedagogical strategy primarily revolves around teacher-led lectures. As a consequence, in Zain’s words,

‘opportunities for interactive and engaging activities, as well as meaningful exchanges, are limited, ultimately resulting in minimal efforts to enhance students’ speaking proficiency’ (325-327).

In conclusion, Pakistani universities should prioritise the implementation of student-centred CPD programmes for all early career teachers, particularly English teachers, to foster a deeper understanding of their students, their needs, and learning styles:

‘learners’ [should have a] central role in any language class (Usman: 70), and

‘it is crucial for English teachers to examine the reasons behind certain students’ difficulties or failures’ (Zain: 339).

By identifying and addressing these issues, universities and English teachers can help create a fairer educational environment for all students (Felder & Brent, 2005; Moloney & Saltmarsh, 2016), contributing to enhanced learning outcomes and nurturing the progress and growth of every student.

6.12.3.2 Lack of awareness of diverse learning styles

In terms of classroom approach and attitude towards learner's context, knowing learners and their preferences and learning styles are essential components for successful teaching (Moloney & Saltmarsh, 2016). Noureen narrates her early thoughts about language teaching and its relationship with learners. She acknowledges her lack of awareness regarding the diverse and distinct learning styles of her students.

'I was not aware about different learning styles of my students, their characteristics, their needs and when they were not learning anything in my class, I was scolding them' (124-128).

This lack of awareness could have hindered her ability to effectively cater to the individual needs of each student. Furthermore, scolding students raises concerns about the teacher's classroom management strategies as well as the authoritarian role of teachers in the Pakistani context (Manan, 2021). Scolding can create a negative and discouraging environment, potentially further disengaging students and impeding their motivation to learn.

Earlier studies (Bhatti & Memon, 2016; Samad et al., 2021) have examined anxiety among students in EFL classes in Pakistan, attributing it to multiple factors and untrained English teachers emerge as a primary contributor to this language class anxiety.

Another participant, Abdullah, reports his frustration with the lack of awareness of diverse learning styles:

'I didn't know much about the different learning styles, learning abilities, and competencies of my students, or how teaching methods should change with their age groups, and it was really frustrating' (68-70).

To improve teachers' awareness and reduce students' anxiety in EFL classes, Mann (2021) suggests a more effective approach that involves gaining knowledge about different learning styles, adapting teaching methods to accommodate those styles, and implementing strategies to support and engage struggling students. This indicates that CPD should be compulsory for English teachers. According to Noureen,

'CPD enables English teachers to include a variety of instructional techniques, provides personalised attention, and fosters a positive and inclusive classroom atmosphere' (352-354).

In summary, this prior lack of awareness regarding student learning styles and needs, along with an ineffective disciplinary approach has implications for pre-service certification in language teaching and CPD policy for developing an understanding among English teachers of diverse learning styles and supportive teaching strategies through pedagogic courses to significantly enhance the learning experience for students and promote a more positive and productive classroom environment.

6.12.3.3 Absence of teacher responsibility for student learning

In the EFL context teachers need to set aims, anticipate learners' difficulties by assessing students' needs and use appropriate resources to assure learning (Rani et al., 2022). However,

'universities in Pakistan tend to adopt a teacher-centred approach and depend on scarce resources, resulting in less accountability for teachers regarding their students' learning' (Imran: 65-66).

'the university context in Pakistan often employs a teacher-centred approach and relies on limited resources, thereby placing less responsibility on teachers for their students' learning' (Farooq: 25-27).

One of the participants, when reflecting on his early career, mentions having limited responsibility for all his students' learning:

'tell them (students) some people will understand others won't understand that the class time will be over, that's it. I mean, I mean, you have done your job' (Zain:329-331).

This participant's teaching may not have been the most effective or constructive to address students who are struggling to understand or engage in the classroom. He reveals a less beneficial and a less proactive approach about his early career teaching. However, the literature (Bhatti & Memon, 2016; Samad et al., 2021) discusses an alternative approach that views every

student has having their own unique learning journey, and it is completely normal for some concepts to be challenging to grasp. It is the teacher's responsibility to ensure that everyone has a chance to understand the material. If any student finds it difficult, they must be encouraged to ask questions or seek additional support (Rani et al., 2022). One needs to note that learning takes time, and a teacher's goal should be to help students succeed.

This approach acknowledges the varying learning abilities of students, emphasises the importance of seeking help, and reassures students that their teacher is committed to their success (Rani et al., 2022). It promotes an encouraging and supportive learning environment, which can motivate students to persist and actively engage in their learning process.

Abdullah reveals a similar attitude to Zain:

'I had never thought about the students, their need, their emotions, the cognition level of my students, and their effective role in class (408-416).

This acknowledgment, in hindsight, as an experienced English language teacher signifies the impact of PD and the need for it for various reasons. Effective teaching requires a student-centred approach that takes into account individual needs, emotions, and cognitive abilities (Abdullah: 98-99). Without this awareness, teachers may struggle to create a conducive learning environment that engages and supports students' growth (Rani et al., 2022).

Understanding students' diverse learning styles, levels of cognitive development, and individual strengths and weaknesses helps teachers tailor their lessons and materials to meet the specific needs of each student and ultimately bring innovation into language teaching.

Noureen highlights the impact of relevant pedagogic PD and the significance of the teacher's role in classroom management for fostering learner engagement:

'through professional development, teachers can be equipped with strategies for differentiated instruction (357-358) [...] an effective teacher should possess the ability to manage a classroom environment that promotes student engagement and active participation' (364-365).

Training can provide guidance on establishing clear expectations, managing student behaviour, and facilitating effective communication to create a positive and productive classroom climate (Qaisra & Haider, 2023).

According to Bilal,

'lack of pedagogical knowledge may result in limited teaching methods or ineffective instructional strategies, so PD opportunities offer teachers a chance to explore and learn new pedagogical techniques, such as active learning, cooperative learning, and differentiated assessments, enabling them to enhance student engagement and learning outcomes (225-228).

Previous research (Nawab, 2017; Rani et al., 2022; Shamim, 2011) revealed that teaching takes place in similar ways across different settings in Pakistan and all classes were teacher centred. Teachers would spend much of the time by talking and writing on the board. These studies suggested a lack of training among teachers regarding interactive classes and aligned with the participants statements above.

To summarise, these participants expressed a lack of awareness and understanding about various aspects of language teaching. Their descriptions and realisation of their earlier perceptions about teaching show the need, importance, and impact of CPD in enhancing novice teachers' skills and competencies.

As the nature of this study was narrative, and participants shared their experiences in a chronological manner, offering insights into their early days as novices and how they had grown into knowledgeable professionals, the subsequent section will present the findings concerning the diverse roles and contributions these participants have undertaken in their field. Findings will discuss their effectiveness as teachers, their growth as knowledgeable professionals, their contribution as field researchers, their supervisory roles, and their engagement as course developers, resource persons, and critics in their field. This will give an insight into their approach to handling these roles, their attitudes towards language teaching, and their interactions with students. Furthermore, their identity as researchers and their

contributory roles that demonstrate their status in the realm of language teaching will be explored to shed light on how they developed an understanding of their students' needs, thoughts, and varied learning approaches. Lastly, I will share findings that explain their teaching styles, which prioritise students over a solely traditional teacher-centred approach.

6.13 Participants as experienced English teachers

Participants' profiles are evidence of their professional growth. When they speak about their current comprehension of their field, Muhammad acknowledges a transformation

'I have really beefed up my professional skills, broadened my knowledge, and enriched my practice. Along the way, I have welcomed a variety of viewpoints, strengths, attributes, characteristics, teaching styles, and techniques' (27-44).

Similarly, Ali articulates his expertise –

'my professional journey has been about fine-tuning my skills, deepening my understanding, and diversifying my methods. It's been about embracing various perspectives, qualities, traits, teaching methods, and approaches' (09-30).

These elements were categorised into different themes, as illustrated in Table 18.

Table 18 Participants as experienced English teachers.

Participants as Experienced English teachers
As knowledgeable persons
As effective teachers
As field researchers
As supervisors
As course developer/resource person/critic

Examining the responses of experienced English teachers, these findings unveil that their involvement in CPD activities over a substantial period has reshaped their perspectives on their:

'profession and subject expertise' (Usman: 14),

'teaching and learning methodologies across various subjects' (Noureen: 368),

'academic courses' (Abdullah: 222),

'interactions with students' learning' (Zain: 50), and

'the content and delivery methods' (Imran: 64).

In the subsequent section, the transformation of these participants from novices to knowledgeable individuals in the field of language teaching will be presented. These participants now emphasise the significance of acquiring additional qualifications to enhance their impact as language practitioners, a perspective that has evolved from their previous attitudes as novices who may have overlooked the importance of training and professional learning. For example, Muhammad highlights his inclination for continuous professional learning, stating,

'the importance of acquiring additional qualifications to amplify my impact as a language practitioner is indispensable' (221).

Abdullah further emphasises this perspective by explaining,

'initially, I was unaware of certain practices, but through active engagement with students, field research, and literature, I have transitioned to a more informed and involved approach' (107-109).

This transformation points out their growing awareness of the dynamic and evolving nature of the field and their dedication to ongoing professional skill enhancement.

6.13.1 Knowledgeable person

At the start of their language teaching careers, participants like Ali acknowledged a lack of awareness regarding language teaching and its requirements (122). However, with time, they underwent a gradual realisation of the importance of acquiring more skills and knowledge in language teaching:

'I now perceive language teaching as a crucial area that requires continuous learning and improvement' (Muhammed: 225),

'language teaching is a field that demands continuous learning and improvement' (Noureen: 50),

'I recognize the need to expand my knowledge in pedagogical strategies, language acquisition theories, and subject knowledge' (Bilal: 273),

'my current understanding of the profession reflects the necessity of expanding knowledge in various aspects of language teaching' (Abdullah: 94).

'The special thing is that one should be qualified in one's profession because teaching requires knowledge of that subject, so I always went for collecting more and more knowledge' (Usman: 69-73).

The idea that teaching necessitates a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter is indeed crucial. This importance is exemplified by the following participants:

'I believe that experienced and knowledgeable English teachers can draw upon their expertise to provide accurate and insightful explanations, foster deeper comprehension, and effectively address students' questions and challenges' (Imran: 66-67).

'I believe in continuously seeking knowledge to foster my professional growth and development' (Ahmed: 63).

'the continuous pursuit of knowledge is a commitment to professional growth and development' (Usman: 17).

This aligns well with the role of educators who aim to stay updated with the latest linguistic developments, teaching methodologies, and educational trends (Mohira & Isakjon, 2022).

Noureen emphasises that

'engaging in ongoing learning not only enhances the teacher's own proficiency but also enriches the learning experience they provide to their students' (228-229).

This collective emphasis on continuous learning highlights the dedication of educators to both personal and professional growth, ultimately benefiting their students and the educational community:

'subject knowledge plays a crucial role in teaching, encompassing communication skills, facilitating discussions, creating engaging learning materials, managing classroom dynamics, and applying diverse teaching strategies' (Bilal: 54-55).

'subject knowledge is vital in teaching and includes communication skills, applying varied teaching schemes, and many more' (Imran: 76-77).

'an experienced and knowledgeable teacher ideally possesses a blend of subject expertise and effective pedagogical skills to ensure successful knowledge transfer' (Usman: 74-77).

Briefly, the statements rightly emphasise the significance of subject knowledge and ongoing learning for English teachers. While knowledge of the subject matter is essential, effective teaching also requires a holistic set of skills encompassing pedagogical techniques, communication, and a student-centric approach. Striking a balance between subject expertise and teaching methodologies is vital for providing a comprehensive and impactful learning experience.

'self-correction, reading scholarly literature, and feeling a continuous need to improve professional skills are important elements of CPD in the modern era' (Ali: 456).

'during these years of professional experience, I engaged in reflective practices and ongoing development' (Abdullah: 12).

Zain and Muhammed stated that they had actively learned from their own teaching experiences and planned or organised their own PD (Zain: 398; Muhammed: 168-169). Usman also reveals his ongoing efforts to be a knowledgeable person.

'With the passage of time I just got into the things I studied a number of books on one [subject] in the same subject and then bit by bit I was improving, and I was having [a] grip on the subject there. So, I started from classic criticism and now in the department I am the one who teaches modern criticism' (113-116).

Before I discuss the statement, it is worth noting the context of language teaching in Pakistan. As mentioned in an earlier part of this thesis, teaching qualifications are flexible, often allowing

literature degree holders to teach language (Zain: 333-337). Two participants, including Usman, who have a PhD in literature, continue in this field. The statement exemplifies the practice of teaching language through literature in Pakistan. Usman's statement reflects a journey of transformation from being a novice to becoming a knowledgeable language practitioner. The participant's progression, from initially studying numerous books to gaining a solid understanding of the subject highlights a commitment to self-directed learning and continuous improvement. His gradual improvement and growing mastery of the subject stresses the importance of consistent effort and dedicated engagement with the material.

Usman continues:

'my journey exemplifies the role of immersion in field research and literature. [...] By engaging deeply with various resources, I expanded my understanding and developed a concrete perspective' (5-18) [...] This approach aligns with my principles of becoming a knowledgeable practitioner in any field, where thorough exploration of relevant materials contributes to a well-rounded expertise' (230-231).

In brief, the participant's journey from studying extensively to becoming a teacher of modern criticism indicates his transformation into a knowledgeable language practitioner. This transformation reflects his dedication to ongoing learning and growth within the field, positioning him to make a meaningful impact on both his own understanding and the education of his students (Usman:130).

In conclusion, the discussions highlight the integral role of expertise and ongoing learning for experienced English teachers. The participants' statements feature the necessity of a solid foundation in the subject knowledge, enabling English teachers to effectively communicate, engage students, and apply diverse teaching strategies. The commitment to CPD aligns with the evolving nature of education, fostering not only the teacher's proficiency but also enriching the learning journey for students.

Ultimately, these discussions provide a valuable information of the complex nature of being an experienced and knowledgeable language practitioner and the dynamic interplay between

subject knowledge, teaching methodologies, and continuous development, all of which contribute to creating a holistic and impactful learning experience for both educators and students alike. I have presented findings related to the participants' journeys as knowledgeable individuals and their trajectories of adopting this status.

In the upcoming section, I will present findings concerning these participants as effective teachers. This will include their comprehension of teaching methods that prove effective regardless of whether they are innovative or based on old practices. I will also discuss their dedication to accommodate students' learning preferences and their perspective on ELT as a field of study with practical implications.

6.13.2 Participants as effective teachers

In this section, I examine the intriguing realm of research participants who possess exceptional teaching knowledge and explore the profound impact of using tailored teaching methods to maximise learning outcomes. As previously discussed in the section on 'Teacher-centred Classes', FLA and SLA each have distinct requirements. SLA involves learning a new language as a second language, with a focus on explicit instruction in linguistic and communicative skills beyond the first language (Islam, 2013). These differing contexts necessitate tailored approaches to language learning and teaching. Farooq appears to exemplify effective teaching in SLA:

'in both cases, the methodologies and approaches employed for teaching need to be appropriately tailored to ensure practical and effective language learning experiences for students' (42-46).

The teacher's understanding of tailored teaching and what works and what does not work has a significant impact on students' learning.

Farooq reports his teaching approach based on his understanding of different teaching methods.

'My personal experience is [the] communicative method, audio-lingual method and task-based methods and many more are updated language teaching methods and

what should we know and worry about is the effectiveness of the method. How much and what extent it works for a group of students? If it is effective, [it] does not matter how old, it is. I always provide listening and real time communicative practice to my students with interesting topics like drama and novels' (Farooq: 28-35).

This participant has worked with a variety of modern language teaching methods and emphasises the importance of considering their effectiveness for a specific group of students.

This is indeed crucial and the key consideration of this participant worth noting here is whether the method facilitates effective language learning and can help students achieve their language proficiency goals:

'factors such as student engagement, meaningful communication opportunities, and the ability to transfer acquired skills to everyday life contexts are essential in assessing effectiveness,' (Farooq: 44-46).

He appears to argue that evaluating a method's effectiveness, rather than its novelty, is crucial.

According to Farooq, effective teaching methods should seem to actively involve students, offer relevant communication practice, and enable the practical application of learned skills.

This approach appears to ensure that teaching strategies are assessed based on their practical impact and alignment with educational objectives, rather than merely their innovative aspects.

Research by Yuan et al. (2022) acknowledges the significant impact of a customised approach towards all methods for effective learning creation.

Returning to the statement of Farooq, who emphasises the provision of real-time communicative practice to his students through listening. Farooq's approach centres around meaningful interactions and language use in authentic contexts. The incorporation of engaging topics such as drama and novels can enhance student engagement and motivation, making the learning experience both enjoyable and effective. Current research (Alhassan et al., 2021; Samad et al., 2021) in both SLA and FLA contexts emphasises the teacher's friendly role and the use of gentle error correction to foster a social classroom environment.

As a language teacher, Farooq has demonstrated a commitment to staying updated with the latest research, methodologies, and best practices in language teaching, which reflects his dedication to the profession. However, he has not mentioned any engagement with CPD. Farooq's perspective is that CPD tends to be more theoretical, and he does not see a direct link between it and effective teaching in his context. Nonetheless, Farooq's emphasis on utilising various teaching methods and providing listening and communicative practice clearly reflects a learner-centred approach to language teaching and that is reported in above statement.

Zain pointed out

'experienced and passionate second language teachers understand that creating a supportive and inclusive learning environment is crucial for their students' success and contributes to effective teaching and learning' (398-400).

This description of effective teaching is further exemplified by Noureen:

my focus on practicality and the use of customized strategies and techniques directly relate to the concept of effective teaching'(76) [...]ELT is a practical field; it needs specific strategies. I am using different ELT strategies, methods and techniques according to the needs, ability levels and background of students as well as providing them feedback (78-100), [...] for me, effective teaching is a central theme in language instruction, and my active engagement in CPD highlights its significance (248-249).

Her statement is also supported by research by Qaisra and Haider (2023). She emphasised the practical nature of language teaching by stating,

'effective teaching goes beyond theoretical knowledge' (80). [...]It] involves the application of strategies and methods that align with students and facilitate their language acquisition (91-92) [...]and this] requires adapting teaching approaches to the diverse needs, abilities, and backgrounds of learners' (128).

Her statement and her rich profile are the indicators of her engagement in CPD that seem to have equipped her with a broader toolkit of teaching methods and enabled her to navigate various learning scenarios effectively (145-148).

Furthermore, the participant's acknowledgment of the significance of providing feedback reflects a crucial element of effective teaching (Guan, 2018) as it fosters a learning environment where students can identify areas of improvement and make necessary adjustments (100).

Noureen also stated,

'through participation in structured learning opportunities as part of my self-directed CPD, I have enhanced my capacity to provide precise and influential feedback, thereby positively influencing the outcomes of learning' (250).

In summary, Noureen's perspective on language teaching and her proactive engagement in CPD exemplify a commitment to effective teaching. Her focus on practical strategies, customisation of methods, and attention to feedback aligns with the principles of fostering meaningful learning experiences and driving positive student outcomes (Mann, 2005).

Another attribute of effective teaching visible in the following statements is adaptability:

'as teaching is a progressive profession, it constantly challenges teachers to think in new ways' (Ahmed: 210-211).

'this requirement for adaptability and innovation is an essential aspect of effective teaching' (Zain: 440-441).

'I was [a] teacher by choice, I started from grammar teaching and then I worked with audio lingual methods. I like to bring change into things with good purposes. I thought I have my students. I should change them and encourage them to ask questions. I know this generation has [a] different lifestyle and they need to be taught differently. We need to see what students want to see and what is important for them that should be our focus while teaching language. We need to learn what our students want to learn, adapt yourself to students' lifestyle and then teach them' (Muhammad: 138-144).

The statement above showcases a teacher's proactive approach to language teaching and highlights his willingness to adapt and evolve as a practitioner. The participant's journey reflects a recognition of the need to employ various strategies to effectively engage students in language learning and their desire to start positive change aligns well with the principles of

effective teaching. A commitment to improvement and innovation in teaching methodologies demonstrates an awareness of the evolving needs of students and the broader educational scenario. By aiming to encourage student curiosity and questioning, Muhammad acknowledges the importance of fostering critical thinking and active engagement – both of which are key components of effective teaching.

Muhammad's adaptability as a teacher seems exceptional, particularly in Pakistani society where, according to Zain,

'the teacher is considered an authority who does not care about students' [...] effective teaching involves understanding and responding to the unique characteristics of each group of students and adopting teaching methods to suit their needs' (Zain: 404 - 406).

This approach of integrating students' interests and priorities into the curriculum aligns with student-centred teaching, which is considered a symbol of effectiveness in language teaching. Additionally, the assertion regarding the adjustment of teaching methods to match students' learning styles and preferences appears to be in line with the principles of CPD, as highlighted by research into CPD (Mann & Webb, 2022). Through active participation in CPD, Muhammed says,

'I have potentially strengthened my capacity to incorporate innovative strategies to effectively address my diverse students' needs' (391).

In conclusion, Muhammad's commitment to driving positive change, fostering student engagement, and adapting teaching methods based on students' lifestyles and preferences reflects the essence of effective teaching (146-147). His proactive opinion and openness to continuous improvement, combined with the impact of CPD, highlights a dynamic and responsive approach to ELT that leads to enhanced learning outcomes and student success (149-150).

Both Noureen and Muhammad's perspectives on teaching highlight their strong commitment to CPD and its positive impact on effective teaching. Their emphasis on practicality,

personalised strategies, and adaptability aligns with essential principles of effective teaching. Through CPD, they enrich their repertoire of teaching methods, ensuring a flexible and impactful instructional approach. The participants' dedication to offering feedback and student-centred teaching further supports their effective instructional methods, creating an environment conducive to improved learning outcomes and student achievements.

In the next section, I will discuss how these participants, now working as field researchers, make meaningful contributions to their respective fields, society, and the realm of language teaching. What is particularly interesting is that the topics which were once unimaginable to these as novices in their field have not only gained significance in their eyes but have also become the subjects of their research, such as classroom and personal challenges, informed by observations of their students.

6.13.3 Participants as field researchers

All participants except one, have shown their professional growth as researchers in their current stage of teaching as can be seen from their research profiles. For instance, Zain said,

'I actively promote language teaching and engage in research related to areas I never imagined exploring earlier in my career in HE' (196-197).

These English teachers conduct research on various modern, real-classroom topics, such as technology integration in the classroom, multi-methods education in L2, and assessment and feedback. Zain has conducted research on *cooperative learning, students' perceptions and preferences for teacher feedback, factors causing L2 motivational change over time, and an investigation of Pakistani EFL learners' communication anxiety*. Zain stated,

'through my research I have made significant contributions to understanding these important aspects of language learning and teaching' (519-525).

This participant's dedication to exploring these topics indicates his commitment to enhancing the field and improving language education practices (556-557).

Usman's research primarily revolves around teaching, learning, assessment, and research methods within his field and demonstrates a deep understanding of his area of specialisation and highlights his enthusiasm for advancing knowledge and contributing to the field. He speaks about his research and focus:

'In my research experience, I really dove into my classroom experiences as a core area of study. What really sparked my interest was observing my students—they came from all sorts of backgrounds. They had different ways of learning and varying levels of understanding, so I had to figure out how to connect with each of them. It wasn't like I could just stick to one strategy and hope it worked for everyone. I had to mix things up and use different approaches. I had my teaching theories from books, but honestly, it was the classroom experiences that made the difference. I saw that I had students with all sorts of levels—some were strong, while others struggled. So, I used my research skills to explore, publish and apply different teaching methods, adjusting as needed' (293-201).

Imran has made a significant contribution to the field of English language learning through his numerous publications. He elaborates on his role as a researcher and his intentions for conducting research.

'You know, one of the most rewarding aspects of my work has been seeing how research can really enhance learning. I've focused a lot on improving my own skills, knowledge, and competence, but also on addressing the issues students face in language learning. Through my research, I've not only deepened my understanding of these challenges but also found practical ways to tackle them - because actually research and actually search[ing] is all about making things better, particularly and then improving yourself professionally' (247-252).

His research spans a wide range of topics, including anxiety in language learning, analysis of speeches, diverse student backgrounds, teaching English in large classes, learner autonomy, and learning English as a second language. In total, he has authored 27 articles that featured these subjects, displaying his expertise and dedication to advancing knowledge in the domain. Through his research, Imran has provided valuable insights and practical implications for

English teachers and researchers working in language teaching and learning. (See Appendix 5).

Abdullah has solely focused on exploring everyday language factors that affect English language skills and competency among university graduates. He highlights the importance of research for teacher's professional growth:

'research, research—it's really the key to what keeps you going. Because, as I say, professional development... how can I develop professionally unless I engage in research? And for a teacher, research is an endless adventure. Without it, I don't think a teacher would ever truly grow' (122-124).

His research encompassed various aspects, including *English learning motivation and anxiety, writing skills, and factors causing anxiety in speaking EFL*. By examining these areas, Abdullah aimed to gain insights into the challenges faced by university graduates and identify strategies to enhance their English language proficiency. He explains,

'through my research, I have contributed to the understanding of how motivation, anxiety, writing skills, and speaking anxiety impact language learning outcomes, particularly in the context of non-native English speakers at the university level' (125-127).

In summary, the above-mentioned participants in the study have demonstrated significant growth as researchers in their current stage of teaching. They actively engage in research related to diverse areas, expanding their horizons beyond their earlier careers in TESOL in HE to cover a range of modern, real classroom topics, such as technology integration, multi-methods education, assessment and feedback, cooperative learning, students' perceptions and preferences, L2 motivational change, and communication anxiety among EFL learners. Their dedication to exploring these areas shows their commitment to developing the field of language teaching and improving language education practices.

An alternative perspective is that a significant portion of their research is institutionally directed, often as a requirement for promotion. However, it is worth noting that their choice of research

topics remains highly relevant to issues within the Pakistani language teaching and learning context.

Each participant brings unique expertise and contributions to the field. Their contributions enrich the understanding of these subjects and offer practical implications for English teachers and researchers in order to improve language learning outcomes and contribute to a deeper understanding of various aspects of language learning and teaching. In brief, these participants' dedication to research and their commitment to advancing the field are evident, benefiting both English teachers and learners. Their research is also evidence of their decision to adopt research as a form of CPD.

I have presented the study's findings concerning these participants as they undertook distinctive roles, one of which was that of researchers. I have highlighted their invaluable contributions to research, incorporating a range of subjects and illustrated how these individuals evolved as characterised by their concern for students, engagement with field-related matters, and their efforts to present a broader perspective for the benefit of others' learning and teaching.

In the upcoming section, I intend to emphasise certain findings pertaining to the roles of these participants as supervisors within their respective universities, guiding their students. Additionally, I will incorporate findings concerning the specific subjects chosen by students for their research degrees. By directing my attention towards these research topics, I aim to demonstrate the closeness of these subjects to real classroom challenges and language learning issues.

6.13.4 Participants as supervisors

The production of knowledgeable individuals is a crucial aspect of contributing to the field (Andriopoulou & Prowse, 2020). Ahmed stated,

'adopting professional roles and taking on the responsibilities of mentoring research students and supporting them in investigating issues related to SLA is significant for an English language teacher and is a kind of contribution' (243-244).

This practical demonstration and application of expertise are evident in the supervisory role undertaken by these English teachers. One example is Ahmed, who is actively involved in research activities and is supervising four M.Phil. students whose research topics are around code-switching, the impact of assessment, essay writing skills, university teachers' perceptions of EMI, and willingness to communicate in English. (See Appendix 5).

Under Ahmed 's guidance, these students are receiving valuable support and mentorship to conduct their research and contribute to the advancement of knowledge in the field of SLA. It is worth mentioning that awareness of professional roles and responsibilities refers to the understanding of one's moral and social responsibilities as a teacher in the modern world (Andriopoulou & Prowse, 2020). Ahmed noted,

'it involves effectively utilising this comprehension to benefit the institution and foster the development of skilled and knowledgeable individuals' (153-158).

This awareness is clear in the actions of these participants, particularly in their roles as supervisors, as they strive to produce more skilled and well-informed individuals for the language field.

As an experienced English language teacher, Zain has made significant contributions by supervising the successful completion of three PhDs and 15 MPhil degrees within his department. (See Appendix 5).

Zain reflects on his supervision experience as a significant journey of providing guidance:

'so, you know, we (university) offer a lot here, especially to our younger scholars. Over the years, I've had a few people who have pursued their PhDs under my guidance, and quite a number of scholars have also completed their MPhil under my supervision. It's really been a wonderful journey for my research students' (56-59).

He actively engages in research leadership, guiding, mentoring, and supervising students across various areas of study. This involvement serves as a catalyst for the advancement of knowledge and contributes to the field of language teaching. By actively taking on this role, Zain demonstrates a commitment to fostering intellectual growth, supporting research endeavours, and nurturing future scholars.

In brief, these findings have highlighted the crucial roles undertaken by English teachers as mentors and supervisors for research students, specifically within the domain of SLA. This active engagement not only develops the growth of learned individuals but also plays a central role in driving the progress of the field. The practical manifestation of Ahmed and Zain's expertise is demonstrated through their supervisory roles of MPhil students and shows the profound influence of mentorship on producing valuable and impactful research.

In the subsequent section, I will present the participants' accounts, focusing on their roles as course designers, teacher-educators, and critics within their field. By reporting their accomplishments, I aim to demonstrate their significant contributions to the language field and implications of their learning for the development of the language teaching profession.

6.13.5 Participants as course developers/resource persons and critics

Experienced English teachers in this study, possessing a profound understanding of language learning principles and pedagogical approaches, bring a wealth of expertise to course development and leadership roles. This expertise has been shaped by the impact of CPD and their transformation through CPD.

One of the study participants, Ahmed, holds a significant role as both a course leader and course developer. With expertise and experience in curriculum design and instructional leadership, Ahmed stated

'I always play a crucial role in shaping the educational setting and facilitating the learning experiences of students, [...] my efforts are always directed towards creating an environment that nurtures academic growth and supports students in reaching their full potential' (215-218).

The participant does this within the constraints of a prescribed syllabus. For instance, he reports:

'I always include new material in my course in each semester according to the need of my students following the stream of syllabus prescribed by the institute [institution]' (Ahmed: 214-224).

In another participant's account, with a special emphasis on the individuality of learners, Abdullah discusses his course planning:

'When I prepare my course, I have to read those plans, I think about get[ting] to know the nature of learners, I want to see their background where they actually come from, what are their strengths and weaknesses? What is their emotional world? Because every time every time you get a new group of learners, you are interacting with a new world. You may be teaching the same course, yeah, but you are not teaching the same content to the same people. This world is a different world with different humans, with different frustrations, with different challenges, with different excitements' (Abdullah: 96-103).

The participant emphasises the significance of understanding the nature of the learners. This includes gaining knowledge about their backgrounds, origins, strengths, weaknesses, and emotional state. It is worth noting that this emphasis on individuality and socio-psychological elements represents a significant shift in the teaching approach of this ELT practitioner. As a novice ELT teacher, he admits to not previously caring about his students or learners in the classroom. However, as an experienced ELT practitioner his instincts and experience have led him to consider various factors that are essential for successful teaching and learning. This transformation reflects his expertise, skills, and competency development, all of which contribute to his ability to effectively engage with his students. Abdullah highlights the importance of accepting the individuality of learners and understanding that teaching cannot be approached with a one-size-fits-all mindset. This signifies his acknowledgment of the need to adapt and tailor teaching methods to the specific characteristics and requirements of each group of learners. As an experienced English language teacher, the ability to select, adapt, supplement, and effectively utilise appropriate teaching materials and aids is a crucial aspect, and these skills not only demonstrate expertise but also serve to engage and motivate learners (Felder & Brent, 2005; Moloney & Saltmarsh, 2016).

In the context of HE in Pakistan, becoming a resource person entails meeting specific criteria, often tied to educational qualifications (see Chapter Two). Not everyone can assume this role. However, the many study participants except one exhibit a noteworthy inclination towards taking on the role of workshop presenters, showcasing their abilities as resource persons. One such participant, Muhammad, exemplifies these qualities through his facilitation of workshops on various topics including teaching writing skills, utilising technology in teaching and creating awareness on learning communities. (See Appendix 5). Muhammad emphasised his role as a teacher-trainer:

'I became a certified teacher trainer, and I started giving training sessions to different groups. I've travelled to around 20 to 25 countries, where I've conducted workshops and training in English language teaching, through these workshops, I effectively engage with and guide fellow English teachers in areas of professional development and pedagogical innovation' (74-78).

Another participant, Imran, shows great passion for providing training to more teachers as a resource person. He says:

'As a resource person, I really want to help and train more people. I think it's important to focus on professional development, especially in training more teachers. It's something I'm passionate about, and I plan to keep doing it for as long as I'm here' (171-173).

In reference to course content and best practices, Noureen stated

'over the years of my professional experience, I have not only focused on incorporating the best instructional practices, which included considering learners' needs and integrating new and updated content into my language teaching, but I have also begun exploring the creation of independent learning opportunities' (341-344).

One participant, Bilal, reported his critical approach towards the prescribed English textbook and shared his thoughts on the course material:

'I was analysing [...] exercises after each test and they were closed answers they give students to think on the [topic ...] as they guided something on specific lines. They never gave them a free field to run and explore themselves and definitely

they were leading the students to think according to the policy of the government of that time and they were blocking [their critical] thinking process. So, that's why I thought that this material is not good to encourage critical thinking of learners' (348-355).

Bilal's realisation highlights his understanding of the types of questions and exercises that have the potential to foster learning and critical thinking and showcases his competency in pedagogic knowledge, enabling him to discern what is essential for successful critical thinking and learning.

In conclusion, Ahmed, as course leader and course developer demonstrates thorough alignment with the syllabus. Abdullah's emphasis on tailored teaching reflects his growth, while their material selection showcases engagement skills. Bilal's critique of a textbook's limitations highlights his pedagogic insight. Apart from Bilal, their roles extend to workshop presentation, marking them as vital resources in Pakistani HE. As instructional methods are refined, the integration of best practices and the encouragement of independent learning become increasingly important. Briefly, these English teachers are pivotal in shaping effective language teaching, adapting to diverse needs, and thriving in a dynamic educational scene.

6.14 Findings and Narrative Inquiry

When I began my research, my intention was to employ an NI approach, aiming to establish connections among my findings. Specifically, I sought to craft cohesive professional journeys for the participants involved. In the realm of NI, researchers possess the freedom to choose the mode of presenting their findings. One common approach is through storytelling, creating a narrative curve parallel to a journey with a clear beginning, middle, and end. In my study, I focused on this narrative method of presenting research outcomes.

I initiated the presentation of research findings by delving into participants' understanding of CPD in response to the first research question. This exploration encompassed their overall approach to professional learning, encompassing motives, objectives, and strategies. Moving

forward, the middle part of the narrative took shape. Here, the second research question found its place, providing intricate details about participants' societal and institutional contexts as influential factors in their professional growth. Not only did they highlight the impact of family members and their university environment during their student days, but they also discussed their roles as English teachers within their universities. The third phase focused on presenting the affordances and barriers that English teachers perceive in their quest for continuous growth. In detailing their professional journeys, participants disclosed a spectrum of integrative and instrumental motivations for their CPD pursuits. Simultaneously, they openly outlined various obstacles they encountered. Lastly, the fourth research question culminated the narrative, by portraying participants' transformation from novice teachers with distinct weaknesses to experienced and expert English teachers. This journey encompassed the adoption of diverse professional roles and contributions to the field.

In summary, the presentation of findings illuminates participants' tentative steps into the profession, marked by limited knowledge and bewilderment, and for some, lack of awareness about their role and responsibility of the teacher for students' learning. As they faced and overcame numerous challenges, their learning journey involved utilising field research, online courses, and collaboration, ultimately leading to the realisation that further academic studies were necessary. This process led them from novice status to their current state as English teachers with applying well-thought through and widely recognised strategies and approaches in their teaching.

6.15 Summary unveiling the journey

The focus of this study centres around four key elements pertaining to the participants. Firstly, I explore participants' initial feelings upon entering the teaching profession, examining whether they were confused or confident. Secondly, I explore the actions they took and strategies they employed during this period, considering whether they pursued any PD

opportunities. Thirdly, I investigate the reasons behind their confusion or confidence, examining whether it stemmed from their classroom experiences or personalities. Finally, I analysed whether they had experienced any changes in their approach to teaching after obtaining additional degrees or attending training programmes.

The participants shared their experiences in a chronological manner, beginning from the stage when they completed their master's degrees and aspired to secure employment. Initially, many of them found themselves in temporary roles within the profession. However, this initial stage kindled a love for their profession and motivated them to recognise the importance of enhancing their skills to ensure job sustainability. This prompted them to pursue higher degrees in their field. With the prospect of career advancement and long-term stability, they actively sought funding opportunities, eventually achieving success in their endeavours. The decisions they made during this initial stage played a transformative role in their journey towards becoming successful English teachers. The insights garnered from this time period led me to focus on their thoughts and experiences both as novice and experienced professionals.

6.16 Summary of the chapter

In this chapter, I have presented the outcomes of my research. I began by addressing the first research question, which focused on English teachers' understanding of CPD and how they pursued further learning to enhance their effectiveness and success in their profession. I interpreted their comprehension of CPD as a lifelong learning process, as reflected in their statements. Moreover, I explored their chosen strategies in response to this question. Notably, pursuing a PhD emerged as the primary preference for all participants, seen to sustain their profession and serve as a valuable learning tool. Gradually, their professional learning choices extended beyond the national policy requirements, encompassing various additional resources of PD and CPD.

Following that, the second research question aimed to understand the distinct environmental influences that impact these English teachers. I elaborated on the contextual and institutional factors that play a crucial role in supporting their career progression, CPD initiatives, and overall professional advancement. Notably, the influence of parents, particularly the father's profession, personality traits, and occupation, emerged as a significant factor driving English teachers to make optimal decisions regarding their professional pathways.

In the third research question, I explore the various opportunities and challenges identified in the context of CPD, career progression, and professional growth. Specifically, aspects like social status, promotional incentives, teacher autonomy, and the freedom to design courses were perceived as advantageous for fostering both personal and professional learning and development among the English teachers. In contrast, several barriers were identified that impede their CPD efforts. These included the absence of a structured CPD policy, obstacles to promotion, and engagement in irrelevant CPD activities. Lastly, I uncovered findings concerning the characteristics of these as novice and experienced teachers. Addressing the first aspect of this research question, participants as novice teachers, I explored their attitudes towards the English language, their teaching methodologies, classroom dynamics, and approaches to interacting with learners. Shifting to the second part, I examined the various roles they adopted as: knowledgeable professionals, curriculum designers, supervisors, researchers, and critical resources within their domain. The findings presented within this chapter have provided responses to each research question which has been addressed in detail, and supported by recent and relevant data.

In the next chapter, Chapter 7: 'Conclusion, Recommendations, and Implications', I will identify and the topics and ideas that have emerged from my thesis and research study: unbalanced professional growth policy, blurred institutional and HEC policies, the impact of CPD, an emergent CPD culture in Pakistan, and teacher identity and agency. In addition to

these topics, I will also discuss the recommendations that have arisen from this research and the implications suggested by the findings.

Chapter Seven: Conclusions, recommendations and implications

Chapter overview

In this final chapter, I present the conclusions, recommendations, and implications of my research. I start by highlighting the key concepts that emerged from my thesis, such as teacher identity and agency. Then, I discuss the unbalanced professional growth policy and the blurred policy relationship between institutions and the HEC. I also present the impact of CPD and the emerging CPD culture in Pakistan. Following these key ideas, I delve into the conclusions drawn from these areas. Subsequently, I present my recommendations and the implications of my study. This chapter also delves into my personal insights and aspirations that have developed throughout this research, as well as my possible future research projects. Additionally, I provide some guidelines to support the future application of these findings. Finally, the chapter concludes with a summary that recaps the main points discussed.

7.1 Key concepts which emerged from my thesis

The findings of my study can be grouped into several key areas: teacher identity and agency, unbalanced professional growth policy, institutional and HEC policy complexities, the impact of CPD, and the emerging/alternative CPD culture in Pakistan. These areas shed light on the present landscape of CPD practices and teacher development within the realm of TESOL in Pakistan.

7.2.1 Teacher identity and agency

In the field of TESOL, the concepts of teacher identity and agency have gained significant importance in the past decade. These concepts cover various aspects, including the cultural context of learning, teaching methods, language beliefs, and how language can empower

individuals. Personal motivation emerges as the main driving force behind the professional growth of English teachers.

The findings of this study shed light on the significance of identity theory in discussions about language teaching and teacher identity. There has been a notable shift from traditional perspectives on language teaching to more critical and sociocultural approaches, wherein identity and discourse play pivotal roles in language learning and teaching.

In the Pakistani TESOL context, identities of these research participants as language teachers are further shaped by foreign degrees and certifications in language education. They realise the importance of self-representation through various roles and become more aware of sociocultural contexts, diversity, ethnicity, the native/non-native distinction, and beliefs about language learning, leading to the adoption of various teaching methods.

English teachers actively engage in events such as presentations and research and attend CPD events, reflecting their socially informed perspectives. They draw from diverse theoretical approaches, including sociocultural theory, language socialisation theory, and critical applied linguistics, which have strong connections with identity and agency (Channa2020; Zafar et al., 2022). Gee's (2000) idea that it is not only about what you say or how you say it; it is also about who you are and what you are doing while you say it holds relevance in understanding teacher identity.

Through this research, English teachers are no longer perceived merely as technicians following fixed behaviours or methods. Instead, they view themselves more holistically, taking into account various factors that influence their identities and their work in the classroom.

7.2.2 Unbalanced professional growth

The study reveals an unbalanced policy on professional growth. The HEC policy places a strong emphasis on teachers obtaining a PhD as the primary criterion for promotional incentives, disregarding the importance of other CPD activities. While the HEC organises

various CPD events, accessibility issues and lack of awareness prevent many English teachers in universities from accessing them. In addition, achieving a PhD is also highly preferred among English teachers, while other professional activities are considered optional. This social positioning of teacher development in the country distinguishes it from the approaches adopted by educators elsewhere. The participants' explanations of the PhD, including its importance, the rationale behind pursuing the degree, and the perceived lack of usefulness of its research for their careers in some cases, are discussed in Section 6.7.1, under the title PhD as an HEC-Directed academic activity.

CPD is a non-static and complex process, dependent on various factors, including the perspectives of teacher education, the availability of CPD resources in different regions, and the context in which teachers operate. The effectiveness of CPD also relies on the involvement of teachers, PD organisations, and institutions. In brief, teacher development in Pakistan is shaped by specific contextual factors and the availability and accessibility of CPD opportunities, making it distinct from approaches used elsewhere.

7.2.3 Blurred institutional and HEC policies

The research findings highlight the restrictive nature of institutional workplace collaboration systems and the blurred policies of the HEC concerning CPD in Pakistan. These factors significantly impact English teachers. For example, the human resource development approach adopted by institutions and the ambiguous policies of the HEC have a profound effect on English teachers. Experienced and novice English teachers have individual needs, preferences, and career development goals. Unfortunately, these individual concerns often receive inadequate attention within the institutional context, leading to challenges for teachers' professional growth and development.

7.2.4 Impact of CPD

The impact of mandatory degrees and voluntary CPD proved to be transformational for these English teachers, even though CPD activities may not be actively encouraged or promoted within institutions. Typically, English teachers engage in self-directed and informal CPD activities off-site, often as one-shot events.

This thesis reveals that English teachers undergo gradual development in their profession. They begin as novices and progressively transform into experienced educators through continuous efforts to enhance their abilities, skills, and knowledge; and CPD courses and academic degrees play a significant role in bringing about positive changes in their teaching approaches, personal growth, interactions with students, and contributions to the field.

Additionally, the impact of CPD is also felt at the institutional level. As English teachers pursue higher degrees from foreign institutions, there has been a noticeable change in the provisions offered by their own institutions. Previously, institutions primarily provided degrees in English literature at the MA level, but with the influence of CPD, more diverse and specialised degree options are now being offered.

7.2.5 An emergent CPD culture in Pakistan

The scarcity of institutional CPD opportunities in Pakistani universities as reported by these participants has led English teachers to embrace alternative CPD platforms, giving rise to a new culture of CPD in the country. English teachers are now exploring online CPD events, employing YouTube videos, and enrolling in virtually designed courses to enhance their professional growth and teaching practices. These alternative resources have empowered English teachers to stay up to date with the latest trends in language teaching and foster a collaborative approach to learning within the educational community.

7.2.6 Conclusion

In conclusion, this study provides useful insights into the CPD experiences of English teachers in Pakistan. The participants displayed a strong sense of mindfulness towards their profession, recognising the importance of CPD. They exhibited a proactive individual approach, seeking opportunities beyond mandated requirements to enhance their teaching practices and skills, revealing that English teachers are fully aware of the significance of CPD for their personal and professional growth. Alongside pursuing their PhDs and fulfilling national promotion policies, all participants except one, Farooq, actively engaged in self-directed informal and formal learning through attending various courses, workshops, seminars, and webinars. These findings underscore the dedication of English teachers to their CPD and their commitment to staying up to date with the latest teaching methodologies and approaches. By recognising the importance of CPD and adopting a proactive stance, English teachers demonstrate their drive to excel in their roles and provide the best possible learning experiences for their students.

The transformative impact of CPD on English teachers is apparent, as most participants progressed from the initial stage of their profession to becoming professors. However, there was one participant, Farooq, who did not attend any CPD events, publish articles, or take on additional roles. This suggests a possible disparity in CPD achievements among English teachers, with personal motivation and agency potentially playing a significant role in the pursuit of CPD, even in areas not explicitly mandated by national policies.

The study identified several social factors that influence CPD choices and career growth, including family influence and societal norms. It highlighted the affordances of being English teachers in Pakistan, such as the prestige associated with academic titles, the allure of high salaries and social status.

Additionally, the research uncovered student backgrounds as a barrier to implementing CPD practices effectively in the classroom. The study identified challenges arising from the diverse

levels of competency among students and the inadequate learning environments within universities.

Another significant finding was English teachers' earlier experiences and attitudes towards teaching. All participants reported a change in their teaching approach in one or another way after they had engaged in further, HE and/or CPD. Their shift from a teacher-centred approach to facilitators of individual student learning showcases their realisation of the importance of continuous learning and the transformative impact of their own HE and/or CPD.

Overall, this study sheds light on the complexities and nuances of English teachers' CPD experiences, emphasising the need for personalised and supportive approaches to foster their CPD. Understanding the factors influencing CPD choices and the potential hurdles can lead to more effective and targeted strategies for enhancing English teachers' teaching practices and their overall impact on students' learning experiences. Indeed, English was perceived as more than just a subject; it was regarded as a vital communication skill in a society where it holds significant social prestige. English teachers felt compelled to excel in teaching English, as it had a positive impact on their own social standing and career opportunities.

Despite most participants' dedication to CPD, the role of institutions was found to be lacking. There was a notable gap in both the HEC and HEIs' policies regarding CPD support and the absence of national oversight and monitoring mechanisms for CPD in the context of English teachers. Furthermore, departmental and institutional interest in supporting CPD initiatives was limited, further hindering the professional growth of English teachers. In addition, the absence of a conducive learning environment hindered the effective implementation of CPD practices. English teachers expressed the need for proper training and development opportunities for new appointees in Pakistani universities, as many still adhered to traditional teaching methods. A lack of adequate resources and structured training programs was also a significant challenge. Despite this, a number of English teachers (Ali, Bilal, Ahmed, Zain, Usman, Imran, Abdullah,

Noureen and Muhammad) reported implementing new approaches, methodologies, and strategies in the classroom, leading to improved student learning outcomes. In conclusion, this study highlights the importance of nurturing a supportive CPD ecosystem within their HEIs. However, both the HEC and individual institutions need to take a more proactive role in formulating comprehensive policies and providing adequate resources to foster a culture of CPD. Addressing the identified gaps and challenges can lead to a more dynamic and empowered community of English teachers, ultimately benefiting students and the education system as a whole. By recognising the positive impact of CPD and investing in the professional growth of English teachers, HEIs can contribute to a more vibrant and effective ELT environment.

7.3 Recommendations

Higher education institutions play a crucial role in the CPD of English teachers. To create a holistic and unified approach to teaching and learning, comprehensive CPD programmes are essential. This can be achieved through improved support policies, funding, and a collaborative culture that sets clear guidelines for ensuring the quality of teaching practices and improved student experiences.

- Regular monitoring by the HEC and HEIs is necessary to review and ensure the impact of CPD policies in universities and departments. Assessing CPD practices and trends among English teachers by the HEC and HEIs will contribute to balancing CPD practices. To promote a collaborative environment and ensure a uniform policy of quality teaching and learning, continuous departmental communication is imperative. Facilitating collaboration among English teachers with clear guidelines for peer-support is essential for maintaining quality teaching practices that follow the curriculum.

- In order to enhance the quality of English teachers, a more skills and knowledge-based recruitment policy should be introduced. Making pedagogic teaching qualifications prerequisites for entering the profession will further contribute to the development of appropriately qualified faculty.
- Adopting a systematic and continuous approach to CPD for qualified faculty is necessary to ensure uniformity in teaching and learning at universities. Each institution should facilitate gradual engagement of all staff in CPD events to keep them aware of new advancements in the profession.
- To address the lack of CPD opportunities, inter-university collaboration can be beneficial. Encouraging various universities to engage in mutual CPD endeavours will help them cope with challenges related to insufficient funding and lack of awareness or encouragement.
- Experienced English teachers can play a vital role in facilitating new faculty through workshops and training provisions. In cases where there is a lack of funding to send all staff to seminars or webinars, English teachers can be encouraged to present and disseminate their learning to the faculty.

By implementing these strategies, institutions can take a proactive role in promoting the CPD of English teachers, ultimately leading to an enriched teaching and learning environment.

7.4 Implications of my study

This research has both practical and significant theoretical implications for the field of ELT and CPD research. The practical implications are evident in the strategies being implemented for disseminating the research findings. The theoretical implications, when viewed through the lens of Vygotsky's (1978) theory of social development and learning, enrich our understanding of CPD among English teachers in Pakistan.

In relation to practical implications, I have taken proactive steps to ensure that the research findings reach relevant stakeholders involved in ELT and CPD. I have initiated the dissemination process by sharing the research findings with English teachers in further education colleges and HEIs in Pakistan via virtual platforms, receiving highly positive feedback during a presentation at a doctoral conference, reinforcing the research's value. Furthermore, one of my articles has been accepted for publication in *IATEFL Voices* in the UK, offering an excellent opportunity to share the research findings with a broader international audience and contribute to the global discourse on language teaching and CPD. Simultaneously, I am actively engaged in ongoing writing focused on the CPD trajectories of Pakistani English teachers, aiming to reach out further to spread findings of this critical area in language education.

Additionally, the study contributes to the theoretical understanding of English teachers' CPD experiences in Pakistan, drawing parallels with Vygotsky's emphasis on social interaction and scaffolding. By examining how English teachers perceive and engage with CPD, the research addresses a notable gap in the existing literature. The findings feature the role of social interaction and collaboration in English teachers' CPD journeys, aligning with Vygotsky's theory that learning is a social process. English teachers' gradual awareness of the pedagogic importance of CPD can be seen as a form of experiential learning.

Furthermore, the study reveals disparities in CPD implementation, specifically in terms of English teachers' engagement in colleague mentoring, tutoring, professional dialogues, and departmental collaboration. These disparities suggest a potential gap in the application of global CPD policies, which are commonly used in developed countries. Recognising these discrepancies can encourage policymakers to consider adopting successful global CPD policies while also embracing Vygotsky's ideas about the importance of social support and collaboration in the learning process.

The research contributes to a broader understanding of CPD practices and their impact on teacher development, in line with Vygotsky's concept of Zone of Proximal Development as previously discussed. It uncovers the factors influencing English teachers' CPD choices and highlights the transformative effects of CPD on their career growth.

Moreover, the study highlights the influence of societal and cultural factors on English teachers' CPD decisions, similar to Vygotsky's recognition of the role of culture in shaping cognition. This insight can inform future research on the role of cultural context in shaping CPD practices and approaches to PD, emphasising the need for culturally responsive and context specific CPD initiatives.

In conclusion, this research, when viewed through the lens of Vygotsky's theory of social development and learning, offers valuable insights into CPD among English teachers in Pakistan. It contributes to the field by highlighting the role of social interaction, collaboration, and cultural context in their PD. Additionally, the study opens avenues for future research on CPD practices, cultural influences, and global best practices, aiming to inform and improve CPD strategies in the field of language teaching in line with Vygotsky's socio-cultural theory. The active dissemination of research findings ensures that these insights are accessible and beneficial to those in the field.

7.5 Personal development

Throughout my research journey, my primary goal was to gain awareness into CPD from the perspectives of English teachers in Pakistani universities. However, as I collected and analysed the data, I found myself immersed in a vast amount of information, which proved to be a truly enriching and challenging experience. It took me more than a year to thoroughly analyse, interpret, and re-interpret the data, and I was amazed by how each engagement with the data revealed newer insights, leading to a deeper understanding of CPD. In addition, the process of conducting this research has exposed me to a wide range of literature, which significantly

contributed to shaping my understanding of CPD and its association with English teachers in not only the Pakistani context but also in various other contexts. The more I delved into the data and explored relevant literature, the more my comprehension of CPD evolved.

As I conclude this thesis, I can confidently say that I now possess a much more informed perspective on CPD and its relevance to English teachers in Pakistani universities, as well as in broader educational settings. This research journey has allowed me to revisit different sections of my study and gain a deeper appreciation of CPD, influenced and informed by the entire research process.

7.5.1 Insights and aspirations

In my exploration, I gained valuable insights into English teachers' perception of CPD as a continuous and lifelong process of professional evolution. I discovered that the participants' understanding of CPD is not only influenced by their cultural context but also shaped by their individual backgrounds, past experiences, and career stages.

During my research, I found that these English teachers, who are aware of practices in other professional contexts, particularly those who have received education from foreign universities, are drawn to CPD initiatives that encourage collective sharing of their professional knowledge and experiences. They value opportunities where they can engage with others who have similar educational backgrounds and can relate to their professional discourse.

However, despite their eagerness for collaborative CPD experiences, many English teachers face challenges in their current roles as they simultaneously juggle institutional academic requirements and their own professional aspirations. This sometimes leads to a lack of opportunities that cater to their specific needs and understanding within the university systems. Nonetheless, these English teachers are not stagnating; they actively seek alternative means to fulfil their professional needs. Their statements and the initiatives they undertook suggest that

they view growth as an ongoing and dynamic process. They find immense value in collaborating with like-minded individuals who share mutual interests and understanding.

Prior to conducting this research, I had personally experienced a lack of a strong professional network within the Pakistani EFL teaching context. As an EFL teacher myself and a researcher in this field, my intention in conducting this research was not only to create new understandings for myself but also to foster meaningful interactions with the individuals I engaged with — whether they were participants in my study, doctoral graduates in the UK, or my fellow Pakistani colleagues, and I aspired to contribute to the development of a supportive and vibrant professional community for English teachers in Pakistan, where collaborative learning and knowledge-sharing can thrive. By recognising the significance of CPD and the power of mutual understanding and interests, I aim to help facilitate an environment that encourages ongoing growth and empowers English teachers in their professional endeavours.

7.5.2 My current research project and future research inspiration

At the beginning of this study, my interest was somewhat broad, focusing on the overall development of English teachers in universities in Pakistan. However, as I delved deeper into the research, I became particularly interested in understanding the CPD experiences of university teachers.

In future I aim to explore how English teachers' approaches to teaching and learning impact the learning experiences of university graduates in the Pakistani context. I aim to gain a deeper understanding of how these university graduates perceive their learning experiences. I intend to explore what factors may influence their preference to pursue academic degrees from foreign institutions as their first choice.

Additionally, I am keen to explore the motivational issues affecting CPD engagement among FE English teachers since, for future research, I have strong inclination to explore FE English teachers' PD as current research has provided me a foundation for FE and many participants

shown their concerns related to FE education sector. Understanding the kind of PD, they need and driving forces behind it will be essential in designing effective and relevant CPD programmes that cater to FE English teachers' needs and aspirations.

Moreover, the research has sparked my interest in understanding students' and teachers' identities. Unravelling the dynamics of how these identities shape their educational experiences can provide valuable insights into creating a more supportive and inclusive learning environment.

As I continue to reflect on my research findings, several questions pertaining to the development of English teachers and the impact on university students' personal and professional understanding have arisen. These questions inspire me to pursue further investigations, possibly in collaboration with other teachers who share similar interests and understandings.

In the future, I hope to contribute to the field of ELT in Pakistan by exploring these areas and expanding our knowledge of how CPD influences the educational journey of both teachers and students. By addressing these questions, I aim to promote CPD among English teachers in order to enhance the overall learning experiences of university students in the Pakistani context.

In this concluding section, I aim to shed light on my enhanced sense of CPD, drawing from the significant revelations collected during my research. It is my hope that this will contribute to the existing body of knowledge on CPD and provide valuable implications for the CPD of English teachers in the context of Pakistani universities and beyond.

7.6 Some guidelines

When I divided the data into specific categories for easier management, I discovered that this division offered clarity. During interviews with participants, it became evident they have achieved significant success and have often exceeded their own expectations. In their narratives

detailing their professional journeys, they discussed distinct stages and the strategies they employed to achieve success at each stage.

Their observations about courses they pursued, their academic degrees, initial job experiences, and the values they embraced collectively contributed to and provided a comprehensive form of their own CPD. It is worth noting that these participants also talked about the challenges they faced during the early stages of their careers, including limited resources and a lack of awareness about effective teaching methods. However, the success they have achieved through CPD can serve as a guiding light for other English teachers. By adopting the proven approaches, techniques, and methods that these successful participants incorporated into their professional journeys, other English teachers can navigate their own paths to success more effectively. This understanding offers a vital resource for educators seeking to enhance their teaching skills and advance in their careers.

7.7 Chapter summary

In this concluding chapter, I have presented the key concepts that emerged from this research, along with recommendations and implications drawn from my study. I also delved into my personal insights and inspiration that evolved during the research process. Finally, I outlined my intentions for future research.

References

- Abbas, A., Ekowati, D., Suhariadi, F., & Anwar, A. (2023). Workplace: An empirical study on spiritual leadership in Pakistani higher education. *International Journal of Business and Systems Research*, 17(4), 367-386.
- Abbas, F., & Bidin, S. J. (2022). A critical analysis of the language planning and policy (LPP) in Pakistan and its impact on indigenous languages of Pakistan. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 8(1), 85-96.
- Abbas, F., Rana, A. M. K., Bashir, I., & Bhatti, A. M. (2021). The English language proficiency as a global employment skill: The viewpoint of Pakistani academia. *Humanities and Social Sciences Review*, 9(3), 1071-1077.
- Abbas, S. (1993). The power of English in Pakistan. *World Englishes*, 12(2), 147-156.
- Abdullaev, Z. K. (2021). Second language learning. *Mental Enlightenment Scientific-Methodological Journal*, 2021(06), 1-11.
- Abidi, S. M., & Malik, A. A. (2020). Career assessment in Pakistan: Current scenario. *New Horizons*, 14(2), 255.
- Adams, P., & Mann, K. (2021). Teacher professional learning and professional update in Scotland. *Education 3-13*, 49(5), 592-605.
- Ahmad, R., Khanum, A., & Ali, F. (2022). Rethinking and reconstruction of tradition and modernity of Islam in textbook knowledge of madrassah education system in Pakistan. *Webology (ISSN: 1735-188X)*, 19(2)

- Ahmed, S., & Rao, C. (2012). Inconsistencies in English language teaching in Pakistan: A comparison between public and private institutions. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 4(15), 95-105.
- Akram, H., Yang, Y., Ahmad, N., & Aslam, S. (2020). Factors contributing low English language literacy in rural primary schools of Karachi, Pakistan. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 10(6), 335-346.
- Akram, H., & Yang, Y. (2021). A critical analysis of the weak implementation causes on educational policies in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI)*, 4(1), 25-28.
- Akram, M. (2017). Learning and teaching English in Pakistan: Predicaments and solutions. *International Journal of Educational Sciences*, 19(1), 10-14.
- Akram, M., & Mahmood, A. (2007). The status and teaching of English in Pakistan. *Language in India*, 7(12), 1-7.
- Al Asmari, A. (2016). Continuous professional development of English language teachers: Perception and practices. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 7(3), 117-124.
- Alhassan, A., Ali, N. A., & Ali, H. I. H. (2021). EFL students' challenges in English-medium business programmes: Perspectives from students and content teachers. *Cogent Education*, 8(1), 1888671.
- Ali, A., Ahsan, S., & Dziegielewski, S. F. (2017). Social and family capital and youth career intension: A case study in Pakistan. *Cogent Business & Management*, 4(1), 1362838.

- Ali, R., & Rasheed, A. (2021). Women leaders in Pakistani academia: Challenges and opportunities. *Asian Journal of Women's Studies*, 27(2), 208-231.
- Ali, S. S., Amin, T., Khalid, S., Ali, I., & Hussain, M. (2020). Analysis of the Afghan refugee students' attitudes towards English language and English language learning: A case study of KPK, Pakistan. *Ilkogretim Online*, 19(4), 5546-5553.
- Amabile, T. M., Patterson, C., Mueller, J., Wojcik, T., Odomirok, P. W., Marsh, M., & Kramer, S. J. (2001). Academic-practitioner collaboration in management research: A case of cross-profession collaboration. *Academy of Management Journal*, 44(2), 418-431.
- Amanov, A. (2023). Developing language skills by listening to teaching a foreign language. *Журнал Иностранных Языков И Лингвистики*, 5(5).
- Amponsah, S., Ampadu, E., & Thomas, M. (2023). Professional development among in-service teachers: Motivational factors, pathways and coping strategies. *Educational Review*, 75(4), 703-718.
- Andriopoulou, P., & Prowse, A. (2020). Towards an effective supervisory relationship in research degree supervision: Insights from attachment theory. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 25(5), 648-661.
- Ashraf, M. (2016). The effectiveness of integrating computer assisted language learning (CALL) into the textbook based syllabus of English language: Teachers' and learners' perspectives. *Research Journal of Language & Literature (RJLL)*, 1(1), 115-140.
- Aslam, H. D. (2011). Analysing professional development practices for teachers in public universities of Pakistan. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(4), 97.

- Awadelkarim, A. A. (2023). The role of English seminars in the cognitive and professional development of university EFL instructors and researchers: Seminars as a community of practice and mechanism for continuous professional development. *English as a Foreign Language International Journal*, 3(1), 42-70.
- Awan, S. N. (2022). ELT, teacher education, and the EMI context in Pakistan. In N. A. Raza & C. Coombe (Eds.), *English language teaching in Pakistan* (pp. 27-34). Springer.
- Aziz, A. A., Hamzah, M. H. B., & Radhakrishnan, M. (2023). Synchronising online resource (Penzu) and computer application for language instructions: A Pakistani post covid-19 pandemic context. *Russian Law Journal*, 11(6s).
- Aziz, S., Hassan, H., & Bibi, M. (2020). Quality teaching at higher education: Demands and challenges. *Journal of Educational Research (1027-9776)*, 23(2)
- Banks, J., Carvalho, L. S., & Perez-Arce, F. (2019). Education, decision making, and economic rationality. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 101(3), 428-441.
- Barkhuizen, G., & Consoli, S. (2021). Pushing the edge in narrative inquiry. *System*, 102, 102656.
- Bates, C. C., & Morgan, D. N. (2018). Seven elements of effective professional development. *The Reading Teacher*, 71(5), 623-626.
- Bayram, İ, & Canaran, Ö. (2018). Reflections on a teacher led CPD model for EFL teachers. *International Online Journal of Education and Teaching*, 5(2), 419-431.
- Bell, E., & Bryman, A. (2007). The ethics of management research: An exploratory content analysis. *British Journal of Management*, 18(1), 63-77.

- Bell, J., & Harrison, B. T. (2018). *Vision and values in managing education: Successful leadership principles and practice*. Routledge.
- Bhatti, N., & Memon, S. (2016). Investigating the perceptions of Pakistani English language learners on language learning anxiety in EFL classroom. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 7(5), 23-34.
- Bialostosky, D. H. (1989). Dialogic, narratology, and the virtual space of discourse. *The Journal of Narrative Technique*, 19(1), 167-173.
- Björklund, A., & Salvanes, K. G. (2011). Education and family background: Mechanisms and policies. In E. A. Hanushek, S. Machin, & L. Woessmann (Eds.), *Handbook of the economics of education* (Vol. 3, pp. 201-247). Elsevier.
- Bolton, G. (2010). Reflection and reflexivity: What and why. *Reflective Practice: Writing and Professional Development*, 1-24.
- Borg, S. (2015). Overview-beyond the workshop: CPD for English language teachers. *Professional Development for English Language Teachers: Perspectives from Higher Education in Turkey*, 5-12.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27-40.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). *Thematic analysis*. American Psychological Association.
- Brewis, J. (2014). The ethics of researching friends: On convenience sampling in qualitative management and organization studies. *British Journal of Management*, 25(4), 849-862.

- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2015). *Interviews: Learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing*. Sage Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Buehl, M. M., & Beck, J. S. (2014). The relationship between teachers' beliefs and teachers' practices. *International handbook of research on teachers' beliefs* (pp. 66-84). Routledge.
- Burke, V., Jones, I., & Doherty, M. (2005). Analysing student perceptions of transferable skills via undergraduate degree programmes. *Active Learning in Higher Education*, 6(2), 132-144.
- Campbell, K. (2004). *Jacques Lacan and feminist epistemology*. Routledge.
- Carruthers, J. (1990). A rationale for the use of semi-structured interviews. *Journal of Educational Administration*,
- Chambers, M. (1999). The efficacy and ethics of using digital multimedia for educational purposes. *The Convergence of Distance and Conventional Education: Patterns of Flexibility for the Individual Learner*, 5-16.
- Channa, L. A., & Panezai, S. G. (2019). Top-down English policy and bottom-up teacher take: An interview-based insight from the Baluchistan province of Pakistan. *The Qualitative Report*, 24(9), 2281-2296.
- Channa, L. A. (2017). English in Pakistani public education: Past, present, and future. *Language Problems and Language Planning*, 41(1), 1-25.

- Channa, L. A. (2020). Agentive apprenticeship of observation and English teacher identity: A Pakistani case of learning to teach English. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 23(1), 117-136.
- Charmaz, K., & Belgrave, L. (2012). Qualitative interviewing and grounded theory analysis. *The SAGE Handbook of Interview Research: The Complexity of the Craft*, 2, 347-365.
- Chaudary, I. A. (2011). A new vision of professional development for tertiary teachers in Pakistan. *Professional Development in Education*, 37(4), 633-637.
- Chen, R. H. (2022). Effects of deliberate practice on blended learning sustainability: A community of inquiry perspective. *Sustainability*, 14(3), 1785.
- Clandinin, D. J. (2006). Narrative inquiry: A methodology for studying lived experience. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 27(1), 44-54.
- Clandinin, D. J., & Huber, J. (2002). Narrative inquiry: Toward understanding life's artistry. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 32(2), 161-169.
- Coe, R., Waring, M., Hedges, L. V., & Ashley, L. D. (2021). *Research methods and methodologies in education*. Sage.
- Coghlan, D., & Brannick, T. (2014). *Doing action research in your own organization*. Sage.
- Coleman, H. (2010). Teaching and learning in Pakistan: The role of language in education. *Islamabad: The British Council*, 1-56.
- Coles, R. (1989). *The call of stories: Teaching and the moral imagination*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.

- Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (1990). Stories of experience and narrative inquiry. *Educational Researcher*, 19(5), 2-14.
- Craft, A. (2002). *Continuing professional development: A practical guide for teachers and schools*. Routledge.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. Pearson.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2017). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage.
- Crookes, G., & Chandler, P. M. (2001). Introducing action research into the education of postsecondary foreign language teachers. *Foreign Language Annals*, 34(2), 131-140.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (1990). Teacher professionalism: Why and how. In A. Lieberman (Ed.), *Schools as collaborative cultures: Creating the future now* (pp. 25-50). Falmer Press.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., & Gardner, M. (2017). Effective teacher professional development. research brief. Learning Policy Institute.
- Day, C. (1999). Professional development and reflective practice: Purposes, processes and partnerships. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 7(2), 221-233.
- Dayan, U., Perveen, S., & Khan, M. I. (2018). Transition from pre-service training to classroom: Experiences and challenges of novice teachers in Pakistan. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences*, 12(2), 48-59.

- Deakin, H., & Wakefield, K. (2014). Skype interviewing: Reflections of two PhD researchers. *Qualitative Research, 14*(5), 603-616.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1995). Transforming qualitative research methods: Is it a revolution? *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 24*(3), 349-358.
- Diaz-Maggioli, G. (2004). *Teacher-centred professional development*. ASCD.
- Dilshad, M., Hussain, B., & Batool, H. (2019). Continuous professional development of teachers: A case of public universities in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education and Research, 41*(3), 119-130.
- Dogan, C., & Kirkgoz, Y. (2022). Promoting continuous professional development of English teachers through action research. *International Journal of Educational Reform, 31*(3), 246-277.
- Edge, J. (2003). Imperial troopers and servants of the lord: A vision of TESOL for the 21st century. *TESOL Quarterly, 37*(4), 701-709.
- Elhussain, S. W., & Khoja, A. Y. (2020). Collaborative reflection on shared journal writing to foster EFL teacher CPD. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 15*(2), 271-281.
- Faez, F., Karas, M., & Uchihara, T. (2021). Connecting language proficiency to teaching ability: A meta-analysis. *Language Teaching Research, 25*(5), 754-777.
- Faisal, F., Noor, N., & Khair, A. (2019). Causes and consequences of workplace stress among Pakistan university teachers. *Bulletin of Education and Research, 41*(3), 45-60.

- Fareed, M., Jawed, S., & Awan, S. (2018). Teaching English language at SSC level in private non-elite schools in Pakistan: Practices and problems. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 5(1), 80-95.
- Farrell, T. S. (2008). Critical incidents in ELT initial teacher training. *ELT Journal*, 62(1), 3-10.
- Fatima, J., & Naseer Ud Din, M. (2010). Evaluative study of MA education programmes of teacher education at higher education level in Pakistan. *Contemporary Issues in Education Research*, 3(12), 29-34.
- Fazal, S., Naz, S., Khan, M. I., & Pedder, D. (2019). Barriers and enablers of women's academic careers in Pakistan. *Asian Journal of Women's Studies*, 25(2), 217-238.
- Felder, R. M., & Brent, R. (2005). Understanding student differences. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 94(1), 57-72.
- Freeman, D. (1989). Teacher training, development, and decision making: A model of teaching and related strategies for language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 23(1), 27-45.
- Freeman, D. (1998). *Doing teacher research: From inquiry to understanding*. Heinle & Heinle Boston.
- Gallagher, S. (2014). Self and narrative. In M. K. Wrathall & N. Keane (Eds.), *The Routledge companion to hermeneutics* (pp. 403-414). Routledge.
- Garden, E., Loebel, E., Sanky, C., Chudow, J., Fallar, R., & Parkas, V. (2021). Key insights from the development and implementation of a novel virtual interview process for

- medical school admissions during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Academic Medicine*, 96(8), 1156-1159.
- Garet, M. S., Porter, A. C., Desimone, L., Birman, B. F., & Yoon, K. S. (2001). What makes professional development effective? results from a national sample of teachers. *American Educational Research Journal*, 38(4), 915-945.
- Garner, A., & Bedford, L. (2021). Reflecting on educational preparedness and professional development for early-career nurse faculty: A phenomenological study. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 53, 103052.
- Gee, J. P. (2000). Chapter 3: Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. *Review of Research in Education*, 25(1), 99-125.
- Giraldo, F. (2014). The impact of a professional development program on English language teachers' classroom performance. *Profile Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, 16(1), 63-76.
- Glesne, C. (2016). *Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction*. Pearson.
- Godínez Martínez, J. (2022). Action research and collaborative reflective practice in English language teaching. *Reflective Practice*, 23(1), 88-102.
- Golombek, P. R., & Johnson, K. E. (2021). Recurrent re-storying through language teacher narrative inquiry. *System*, 102, 102601.
- Grant, L., & Rothenberg, J. (1986). The social enhancement of ability differences: Teacher-student interactions in first-and second grade reading groups. *The Elementary School Journal*, 87(1), 29-49.

- Gravani, M. N., & John, P. D. (2005). 'Them and us': Teachers' and tutors' experiences of a 'new' professional development course in Greece. *Compare*, 35(3), 303-319.
- Guan, L. (2018). A study of self-development of EFL teachers in the universities of Sichuan province in China. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 8(7), 766-777.
- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2(163-194), 105.
- Gul, S., & Channa, L. A. (2022). Dialectal preferences: A mixed methods study of ESL students' attitudes towards Englishes in Pakistan. *Asian Englishes*, 1-16.
- Gul, N., Sabih-UI-Hassan, S., & Imran, S. (2022). An Exploration of the Factors Responsible for English Language Oral Fluency Problems Faced by the Undergraduate Level Students in District Kohat. *Journal of Education and Social Studies*, 3(2), 95-109.
- Gursoy, D., Akova, O., & Atsız, O. (2022). Understanding the heritage experience: A content analysis of online reviews of world heritage sites in Istanbul. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, 20(3), 311-334.
- Guskey, T. R., & Huberman, M. (1995). *Professional development in education: New paradigms and practices*. ERIC.
- Haidar, S., Malik, S., & Samiullah. (2022). Neoliberalism, globalisation and Englishism: Exploring ideological assumptions attached with the English language languages in Pakistan. *Neoliberalization of English language policy in the global south* (pp. 195-213). Springer.

- Hattie, J. (2008). *Visible learning: A synthesis of over 800 meta-analyses relating to achievement*. Routledge.
- Hayes, D. (2019). Continuing professional development/continuous professional learning for English language teachers. In S. Walsh & S. Mann (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of English language teacher education* (pp. 155-168). Routledge.
- Helate, T. H., Metaferia, T. F., & Gezahegn, T. H. (2022). English language teachers' engagement in and preference for experiential learning for professional development. *Heliyon*, 8(10)
- Hien, L. T. (2021). Communicative language teaching in teaching esl for university students. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 3(6), 49-57.
- Hoban, G. F. (2005). Developing a multi-linked conceptual framework for teacher education design. In G. F. Hoban (Ed.), *The missing links in teacher education design* (pp. 1-17). Springer.
- Hoekstra, A., Brekelmans, M., Beijaard, D., & Korthagen, F. (2009). Experienced teachers' informal learning: Learning activities and changes in behavior and cognition. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 25(5), 663-673.
- Holloway, K., Arcus, K., & Orsborn, G. (2018). Training needs analysis—The essential first step for continuing professional development design. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 28, 7-12.
- Holter, M. T. S. (2022). The ethical and methodological dilemma of questioning the truthfulness of a participant's story: Using "Circulating reference" to enhance the

- validity of qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 21, 16094069221117985.
- Hopkins, D. (2014). *A teacher's guide to classroom research*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Hussain, M. S., & Farid, A. (2013). English language teaching to young learners: Possible pitfalls after lowering the age of compulsory English in Pakistan. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 2(3), 95-99.
- Hustler, D. (2003). *Teachers' perceptions of continuing professional development* (Research report). Manchester Metropolitan University & John Howson Education Data Services, <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/4154585.pdf>
- Iftikhar, S., Fu, Y., Naureen, S., Cao, Y., & Zhou, C. (2022). Cascading of teachers training at higher education in Pakistan: An evaluation of a faculty professional development program. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 94, 102130.
- Iftikhar, S., Guerrero-Roldán, A., & Mor, E. (2022). Practice promotes learning: Analysing students' acceptance of a learning-by-doing online programming learning tool. *Applied Sciences*, 12(24), 12613.
- Ilyas, M., & Zamir, S. (2020). CPD of university teachers in Pakistan: Challenges and prospects. *ISSRA Papers*, 12, 113-124.
- Imran, S., & Wyatt, M. (2015). Pakistani university English teachers' cognitions and classroom practices regarding their use of the learners' first languages. *Asian EFL Journal*, 17(1), 138-179.

- In, J. (2017). Introduction of a pilot study. *Korean Journal of Anaesthesiology*, 70(6), 601-605.
- Iqbal, S., Ashfaq, T., Azlan Bin Taib, C., & Rizal Razalli, M. (2023). The effect of quality culture on service quality of public and private universities: A comparative analysis. *Plos One*, 18(4), e0283679.
- Irfan, H., & Pashby, P. (2020). Exploring the professional development of English teachers through appraisal of TESOL programs in Pakistani universities.
- Islam, M., Lodhi, A. S., & Khan, A. M. (2020). Future L2 selves of Pakistani learners of English: A qualitative perspective. *Linguistics and Literature Review*, 6(1)
- Jadoon, A. U. R., Chishti, M. I., Afzaal, M., & Afzal, T. (2020). Challenges faced by newly inducted teachers implementing revised English curriculum in Pakistan. *English Language Teaching*, 13(7), 52-66.
- Janghorban, R., Roudsari, R. L., & Taghipour, A. (2014). Skype interviewing: The new generation of online synchronous interview in qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-Being*, 9(1), 24152.
- Jin, S. A. (2009). Avatars mirroring the actual self-versus projecting the ideal self: The effects of self-priming on interactivity and immersion in an exergame, wii fit. *CyberPsychology & Behavior*, 12(6), 761-765.
- Jones, R. E., & Abdelfattah, K. R. (2020). Virtual interviews in the era of COVID-19: A primer for applicants. *Journal of Surgical Education*, 77(4), 733-734.

- Josselson, R. (1996). On writing other people's lives: Self-analytic reflections of a narrative researcher. In R. Josselson (Ed.), *Ethics and process in the narrative study of lives* (pp. 60–71). Sage. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483345451.n5>
- Jowett, A., Peel, E., & Shaw, R. (2011). Online interviewing in psychology: Reflections on the process. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 8(4), 354-369.
- Jussim, L., & Eccles, J. S. (1992). Teacher expectations: II. construction and reflection of student achievement. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 63(6), 947.
- Kapur, A. (2021). *Life as a geographer in India*. Taylor & Francis.
- Kasi, F. (2010). Collaborative action research: An alternative model for EFL teacher professional development in Pakistan. *Asian EFL Journal*, 12(3), 98-117.
- Kayani, S., Kayani, H., Raza, K. K., Kayani, S., Li, W., & Biasutti, M. (2022). Interpersonal factors affecting adolescents' career exploration in PAKISTAN. *Sustainability*, 14(13), 7681.
- Kayi-Aydar, H. (2021). A framework for positioning analysis: From identifying to analysing (pre) positions in narrated story lines. *System*, 102, 102600.
- Keshf, Z., & Khanum, S. (2022). Career guidance and counselling services in Pakistan from the perspective of students and career services providers. *Pakistan Journal of Psychological Research*, 37(1), 39-66.
- Khalid, A. (2016). A study of the attitudes and motivational orientations of Pakistani learners toward the learning of English as a second language. *SAGE Open*, 6(3), 2158244016665887.

- Khan, H. K. (2011). Becoming teacher educators in Pakistan: Voices from the government colleges of education. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 37(3), 325-335.
- Khan, S., & Abdullah, N. N. (2019). The impact of staff training and development on teachers' productivity. *Economics, Management and Sustainability*, 4(1), 37-45.
- Khan, U. A., & Ahmed, I. (2015). The impact of continuous professional development (CPD) program on teachers' professional development in Pakistan. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(1), 98.
- Khan, W. (2015). Quality of teacher education in Pakistan. *The Dialogue*, 10(2), 212-219.
- Khanda, G., Ali, Z., & Brohi, F. M. (2021). The impact of English language imperialism over Balochi. *Jahhan-e-Tahqee*, 4(3), 448-457.
- Khushik, F., & Diemer, A. (2018). Critical analysis of education policies in Pakistan: A sustainable development perspective. *Social Science Learning Education Journal*, 3(09), 1.
- King, N., Horrocks, C., & Brooks, J. (2018). *Interviews in qualitative research*. sage.
- Kitchen, J. (2022). Critically inquiring as community through self-study communities of practice. *Learning through Collaboration in Self-Study: Critical Friendship, Collaborative Self-Study, and Self-Study Communities of Practice*, 221-233.
- Kryvonis, M. (2013). Models and types of continuing professional development of foreign languages teachers in the USA. *Žmogus Ir Žodis*, 15(1), 120-123.
- Lantolf, J. P., & Pavlenko, A. (1995). Sociocultural theory and second language acquisition. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 15, 108-124.

- Larrivee, B. (2008). Development of a tool to assess teachers' level of reflective practice. *Reflective Practice, 9*(3), 341-360.
- Lee, N. (2011). An evaluation of CPD learning and impact upon positive practice change. *Nurse Education Today, 31*(4), 390-395.
- Lewis, S. (2015). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches. *Health Promotion Practice, 16*(4), 473-475.
- Li, Z., & Qiu, Z. (2018). How does family background affect children's educational achievement? evidence from contemporary China. *The Journal of Chinese Sociology, 5*(1), 1-21.
- Lieblich, A., Tuval-Mashiach, R., & Zilber, T. (1998). *Narrative research: Reading, analysis, and interpretation*. Sage.
- Lier, L. V. (1998). The relationship between consciousness, interaction and language learning. *Language Awareness, 7*(2-3), 128-145.
- Liu, S., & Yin, H. (2023). How ethical leadership influences professional learning communities via teacher obligation and participation in decision making: A moderated-mediation analysis. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership, 51*(2), 345-364.
- Macià, M., & García, I. (2016). Informal online communities and networks as a source of teacher professional development: A review. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 55*, 291-307. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.01.021>

- Mahboob, A. (2017). English medium instruction in higher education in Pakistan: Policies, perceptions, problems, and possibilities. *English medium instruction in higher education in Asia-Pacific: From policy to pedagogy*, 71-91.
- MALIK, N. A. (2014). Chapter twelve advances in teacher education. *ELT in a Changing World: Innovative Approaches to New Challenges*, 203.
- Malterud, K., Siersma, V. D., & Guassora, A. D. (2016). Sample size in qualitative interview studies: Guided by information power. *Qualitative Health Research*, 26(13), 1753-1760.
- Manan, S. A. (2021). 'English is like a credit card': The workings of neoliberal governmentality in English learning in Pakistan. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1-17.
- Manan, S. A., David, M. K., & Dumanig, F. P. (2016). English language teaching in Pakistan: Language policies, delusions, and solutions. In R. Kirkpatrick (Ed.), *English language education policy in Asia* (pp. 219-244). Springer.
- Manan, S. A., Haidar, S., & Amin, R. U. (2023). Beyond market and language commodification: Contemplating social-market value and social-welfare concerns in language education policy and practice in Pakistan. *Language and Education*, 37(1), 88-104.
- Mann, S. (2005). The language teacher's development. *Language Teaching*, 38(3), 103-118.
- Mann, S., & Walsh, S. (2017). *Reflective practice in English language teaching: Research-based principles and practices*. Taylor & Francis.

- Mann, S., & Webb, K. (2022). Continuing professional development: Key themes in supporting the development of professional practice. *Research-Publishing.Net*,
- Mariam, S., Khawaja, K. F., Qaisar, M. N., & Ahmad, F. (2023). Blended learning sustainability in business schools: Role of quality of online teaching and immersive learning experience. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 21(2), 100776.
- Mårtensson, K., Roxå, T., & Olsson, T. (2011). Developing a quality culture through the scholarship of teaching and learning. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 30(1), 51-62.
- März, V., Kelchtermans, G., & Dumay, X. (2016). Stability and change of mentoring practices in a capricious policy environment: Opening the “Black box of institutionalization”. *American Journal of Education*, 122(3), 303-336.
- Maunah, B. (2020). Social and cultural capital and learners’ cognitive ability: Issues and prospects for educational relevance, access and equity towards digital communication in Indonesia. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 11(1), 163-191.
- McKeown, R., Hopkins, C. A., Rizi, R., & Chrystalbridge, M. (2002). *Education for sustainable development toolkit*. Energy, Environment and Resources Centre, University of Tennessee Knoxville.
- Mendieta, J. A. (2013). Narrative research: An alternative approach to study language teaching and learning. *Revista Folios*, (37), 135-147.
- Meyer, D. K., & Turner, J. C. (2002). Discovering emotion in classroom motivation research. *Educational Psychologist*, 37(2), 107-114.

- Mishra, P. (2010). Challenges and problems in the teaching of grammar. *Language in India*, 10(2)
- Mishra, P., & Koehler, M. J. (2006). Technological pedagogical content knowledge: A framework for teacher knowledge. *Teachers College Record*, 108(6), 1017.
- Mizzy, N. B. (2022). Being a reflective teacher: Using narrative inquiry as professional development in physical education. In J. Smith & L. Brown (Eds.), *CPD for teaching and learning in physical education* (pp. 209-231). Routledge.
- Mohira, A., & Isakjon, T. (2022). Methodology of English language. *American Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Development*, 3, 68-71.
- Moloney, R., & Saltmarsh, D. (2016). 'Knowing your students' in the culturally and linguistically diverse classroom. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online)*, 41(4), 79-93.
- Morgan, H. (2022). Conducting a qualitative document analysis. *Qualitative Report*, 27(1)
- Morin, K. H. (2013). Value of a pilot study. *Journal of Nursing Education*, 52(10), 547-548.
- Muhammad, R., Shahid, C., & Gurmani, T. A. (2023). Analysis of the factors affecting the implementation of communicative language teaching approach in Pakistani private and public institutions. *Journal of Languages, Culture and Civilization*, 5(1), 17-29.
- Muhammad, Z. (2016). Pakistani Government Secondary Schools Students' Attitudes towards Communicative Language Teaching and Grammar Translation in Quetta, Balochistan. *English Language Teaching*, 9(3), 258-270.

- Muhit, M. A. (2013). Notion of experience in John Dewey s philosophy. *Philosophy and Progress*, 9-24.
- Nageen, S., Ul Hussan, K. H., & Akmal, F. (2023). Role of teacher for the successful implementation activity-based curriculum.
- Nagendra, K. (2014). Listening as a basic skill of communication. *Journal of Business Management Social Science Research (JBM&SSR)*, 3(4), 31.
- Nash, R. (2012). *Teacher expectations and pupil learning (RLE Edu N)*. Routledge.
- Nasimi, S., & Ghaemi, F. (2022). Perceptions of EFL teachers to continuous professional development in Iran. *Journal of Foreign Language Teaching and Translation Studies*, 7(1), 105-131.
- Nasreen, A., & Mirza, M. S. (2012). Faculty training and development in the public sector universities of Punjab. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(3), 229-241.
- Nawab, A. (2012). Is it the way to teach language the way we teach language? English language teaching in rural Pakistan. *Academic Research International*, 2(2), 696.
- Nawab, A. (2017). What difference could in-service training make? insights from a public school of Pakistan. *Teacher Development*, 21(1), 142-159.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2018). 18 content analysis and thematic analysis. *Advanced Research Methods for Applied Psychology: Design, Analysis and Reporting*, 211.
- Neuman, K., & Blundo, R. (2000). Curricular philosophy and social work education: A constructivist perspective. *Journal of Teaching in Social Work*, 20(1-2), 19-38.

- Nooruddin, S., & Bhamani, S. (2019). Engagement of school leadership in teachers' continuous professional development: A case study. *Journal of Education and Educational Development, 6*(1), 95-110.
- O'Dowd, R., & Dooly, M. (2022). Exploring teachers' professional development through participation in virtual exchange. *Re CALL, 34*(1), 21-36.
- O'Kane, P., Smith, A., & Lerman, M. P. (2021). Building transparency and trustworthiness in inductive research through computer-aided qualitative data analysis software. *Organizational Research Methods, 24*(1), 104-139.
- Ogilvie, D. M. (1987). The undesired self: A neglected variable in personality research. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 52*(2), 379.
- Omodan, B. I. (2022). The potency of social constructivism on classroom productivity in universities. *Studies in Learning and Teaching, 3*(1), 36-45.
- Parker, C., Scott, S., & Geddes, A. (2019). Snowball sampling. *SAGE Research Methods Foundations*. Sage
- Pasupathi, M. (2003). Emotion regulation during social remembering: Differences between emotions elicited during an event and emotions elicited when talking about it. *Memory, 11*(2), 151-163.
- Patnaik, E. (2013). Reflexivity: Situating the researcher in qualitative research. *Humanities and Social Science Studies, 2*(2), 98-106.
- Polanyi, L. (1995). Language learning and living abroad. *Second Language Acquisition in a Study Abroad Context, 9*, 271.

- Polkinghorne, D. E. (1988). *Narrative knowing and the human sciences*. Suny Press.
- Polkinghorne, D. E. (1995). Narrative configuration in qualitative analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 8(1), 5-23.
- Poon, J. (2013). Blended learning: An institutional approach for enhancing students' learning experiences. *Journal of Online Learning and Teaching*, 9(2), 271.
- Poskitt, J. (2005). Towards a model of New Zealand school-based teacher professional development. *New Zealand Journal of Teachers' Work*, 2(2), 136-151.
- Powell, E. D., Furey, S., Scott-Evans, A., & Terrell, I. (2003). Teachers' perceptions of the impact of CPD: An institutional case study ed. *Journal of in-Service Education*, 29(3), 389-404.
- Prestridge, S., & Main, K. (2018). Teachers as drivers of their professional learning through design teams, communities, and networks. *Second Handbook of Information Technology in Primary and Secondary Education*, 433-447.
- Putri, F. F. T., & Damayanti, I. L. (2023). EFL teacher learning in online community of practice. *EDUKASIA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 4(2), 1055-1064.
- Qaisra, R., & Haider, S. Z. (2023). The influence of in-service teachers training programs on the professional development of schoolteachers. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(1), 507-516.
- Rahman, B., Abdurrahman, A., Kadaryanto, B., & Rusminto, N. E. (2015). Teacher-based scaffolding as a teacher professional development program in Indonesia. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 40(11), 4.

- Rahman, T. (2020). Pakistani English. In K. Bolton, W. Botha, & A. Kirkpatrick (Eds.), *The handbook of Asian Englishes* (pp. 279-296). Wiley library.
- Rani, U., Samad, A., & Ali, M. (2022). An investigation of English language teaching anxiety of Pakistani ESL teachers and their self-efficacy beliefs at college level. *Jahan-E-Tahqeeq*, 5(1), 185-203.
- Rasheed, S., Zeeshan, M., & Zaidi, N. A. (2017). Challenges of teaching English language in a multilingual setting: An investigation at government girls secondary schools of Quetta, Baluchistan, Pakistan. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 7(4), 149-157.
- Raza, N. A., & Coombe, C. (2022). Volume introduction: English language teaching in Pakistan: Theory, research, and pedagogy. In N. A. Raza & C. Coombe (Eds.), *English language teaching in Pakistan* (pp. 1-10). Springer.
- Raza, N. A., Coombe, C., & Davidson, P. (2022). Teacher development through outreach programs. In N. A. Raza & C. Coombe (Eds.), *English language teaching in Pakistan* (pp. 13-26). Springer.
- Raza, K., Coombe, C. A., & Reynolds, D. (Eds.). (2021). *Policy development in TESOL and multilingualism: Past, present and the way forward*. Singapore: Springer.
- Rehman, N. A., Sultan, M. F., & Shakir, K. (2023). Gets the ball rolling through the intellectual leadership of QEC leaders. A quantitative model with parallel mediation of self-assessment mechanism & effective internal audit. *International Journal of Social Science & Entrepreneurship*, 3(2), 328-348.
- Rehman, A., Bilal, H. A., Sheikh, A., Bibi, N., & Nawaz, A. (2014). The role of motivation in learning English language for Pakistani learners. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 4(1), 254-258.

- Richards, J. C. (1990). Beyond training: Approaches to teacher education in language teaching. *Language Teacher*, 14(2), 3-8.
- Richards, J. C. (2023). Teacher, learner and student-teacher identity in TESOL. *RELC Journal*, 54(1), 252-266.
- Richards, J. C., & Farrell, T. S. (2005). *Professional development for language teachers: Strategies for teacher learning*. Cambridge University Press.
- Richards, J. C., Jack, C., & Lockhart, C. (1994). *Reflective teaching in second language classrooms*. Cambridge university press.
- Richards, J. C., & Rodgers, T. S. (2014). *Approaches and methods in language teaching*. Cambridge university press.
- Richards, L., & Morse, J. M. (2012). *Readme first for a user's guide to qualitative methods*. Sage.
- Richardson, V., & Placier, P. (2001). Teacher change. *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 4, 905-947.
- Riessman, C. K. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. Sage.
- Rind, I. A., & Kadiwal, L. (2016). Analysing institutional influences on teaching–learning practices of English as second language programme in a Pakistani university. *Cogent Education*, 3(1), 1160606.
- Roberts, J. (2016). *Language teacher education*. Routledge.

- Rodrigues, S., Bhutta, S. M., Salim, Z., Chauhan, S., & Rizvi, N. (2019). Implementing a teaching and learning enhancement workshop at aga khan university: Reflections on the implementation and outcomes of an instructional skills workshop in the context of Pakistan. *Scholarship of Teaching & Learning in the South*, 3(1), 100.
- Rosenholtz, S. J. (1989). Workplace conditions that affect teacher quality and commitment: Implications for teacher induction programs. *The Elementary School Journal*, 89(4), 421-439.
- Rovira, L. C. (2008). The relationship between language and identity. the use of the home language as a human right of the immigrant. *REMHU-Revista Interdisciplinar Da Mobilidade Humana*, 16(31), 63-81.
- Ryan, K. E., & Schwandt, T. A. (2002). *Exploring evaluator role identity*. IAP.
- Saeed, F., Rashid, A., Saleem, W., & Afzal, M. S. (2021). Implications of computer-aided learning in ELT for second language learners and teachers during covid-19. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 9(3), 1528-1541.
- Safron, C., & Richards, K. A. (2023). Qualitative research design principles. In K. A. Richards, M. A. Hemphill, & P. M. Wright (Eds.), *Qualitative Research and Evaluation in Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*. Jones & Bartlett Learning.
- Sahito, Z., & Vaisanen, P. (2018). Effect of English language competency on the job satisfaction and motivation of teacher educators: A narrative analysis. *Journal of Education and Teaching*, 25(4), 345-360. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2018.1234567>
- Saldaña, J. (2021). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. sage.

- Salifu, I., & Agbenyega, J. S. (2016). Teacher motivation and identity formation: Issues affecting professional practice. *MIER Journal of Educational Studies, Trends and Practices*, 3(1)
- Salter, M., & Rhodes, P. (2018). On becoming a therapist: A narrative inquiry of personal-professional development and the training of clinical psychologists. *Australian Psychologist*, 53(6), 486-492.
- Samad, A., Ali, M., & Khan, A. K. (2021). An exploration of classroom-related sources of foreign language speaking anxiety of Pakistani university students. *Sjesr*, 4(1), 211-221.
- Schank, R. C. (1990). *Tell me a story: A new look at real and artificial memory*. Charles Scribner's Sons.
- Sciarra, D. (1999). The role of the qualitative researcher. In M. Kopala & L. A. Suzuki (Eds.), *Using qualitative methods in psychology* (pp. 37-48). Sage.
- Senge, P. M. (1990). *The art and practice of the learning organization*. Doubleday.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1993). *Building community in schools*. Jossey-Bass.
- Seven, M. A. (2020). Motivation in language learning and teaching. *African Educational Research Journal*, 8, 62-71.
- Shah, K., Ahmad, N., & Khan, N. (2019). Analysis of national education policies: Issues and challenges in Pakistan and development of science education. *Strength for Today and Bright Hope for Tomorrow*, 19(11), 77-85.
- Shah, S., Bashir, M. S., & Amin, M. (2020). Career progression of women academics in Pakistani universities: Enablers and barriers. *Sjesr*, 3(3), 11-21.

- Shahzadi, A., & Ducasse, A. M. (2022). Language assessment literacy of teachers in an English medium of instruction university: Implications for ELT training in Pakistan. *Studies in Language, 11*(1), 93.
- Shamim, F. (2008). Trends, issues and challenges in English language education in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, 28*(3), 235-249.
- Shamim, F. (2011). English as the language for development in Pakistan: Issues, challenges, and possible solutions. In H. Coleman (Ed.), *Dreams and realities: Developing countries and the English language* (pp. 291-310). British Council.
- Shamim, F. (2014). Towards an understanding of teachers' resistance to innovation. In A. Ahmed, M. Hanzala, & F. Saleem (Eds.), *ELT in a changing world: Innovative approaches to new challenges* (pp. 87-98). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Shamim, F. (2018). Conclusion: Teaching English in difficult circumstances—Lessons learnt and the way forward. In K. Kuchan & F. Shamim (Eds.), *International perspectives on teaching English in difficult circumstances: Contexts, challenges, and possibilities* (pp. 243-253). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Shankar, K. (2022). Perceptions and initiatives of teachers toward continuing professional development: A study at the tertiary level. In S. P. Dhanavel (Ed.), *Continuing professional development of English language teachers* (pp. 85-104). Springer.
- Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information, 22*(2), 63-75.

- Siddiqui, A., Aslam, H. D., Farhan, H. M., Luqman, A., & Lodhi, M. A. (2011). Minimizing potential issues in higher education by professionally developing university teachers. *International Journal of Learning and Development, 1*(1), 59-71.
- Siddiqui, K. A., Mughal, S. H., Soomro, I. A., & Dool, M. A. (2021). Teacher training in Pakistan: Overview of challenges and their suggested solutions. *IJORER: International Journal of Recent Educational Research, 2*(2), 215-223.
- Sims, S., & Fletcher-Wood, H. (2021). Identifying the characteristics of effective teacher professional development: A critical review. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 32*(1), 47-63.
- Sinclair, C. (2008). Initial and changing student teacher motivation and commitment to teaching. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 36*(2), 79-104.
- Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (2006). Language policy and linguistic human rights. *An Introduction to Language Policy: Theory and Method, 273-291*.
- Smith, B. (2016). Narrative analysis. *Analysing Qualitative Data in Psychology, 2*, 202-221.
- Smythe, L., & Giddings, L. S. (2007). From experience to definition: Addressing the question 'what is qualitative research?'. *Nursing Praxis in New Zealand, 23*(1)
- Sokel, F. (2019). The effectiveness of a professional development course: Teachers' perceptions. *ELT Journal, 73*(4), 409-418.
- Soomro, M. A., Memon, N., & Memon, S. A. (2016). Concept of best practices in English language teaching to Pakistani ELT fraternity. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies, 7*(4), 119-123.

- Stake, R. E. (2010). *Qualitative research: Studying how things work*. Guilford Press.
- Stronge, J. H. (2018). *Qualities of effective teachers*. ASCD.
- Stuart, C., & Thurlow, D. (2000). Making it their own: Preservice teachers' experiences, beliefs, and classroom practices. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *51*(2), 113-121.
- Stuckey, H. (2014). The first step in data analysis: Transcribing and managing qualitative research data. *Journal of Social Health and Diabetes*, *2*(1), 6.
- Sullo, B. (2007). *Activating the desire to learn*. ASCD.
- Swain, J., & King, B. (2022). Using informal conversations in qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, *21*, 16094069221085056.
- Tahira, M., Hassan, A., Malik, A., & Yousuf, M. I. (2020). Teacher education in Pakistan: Issues and problems. *Online Submission*,
- Tahseen, R., Omer, U., Farooq, M. S., & Adnan, F. (2022). Text summarization techniques using natural language processing: A systematic literature review.
- Tai, M. K., & Omar, A. K. (2023). Relationship between professional learning community and teacher attitudes toward change. *International Journal of Management in Education*, *17*(1), 1-18.
- Tan, L., Wei, B., & Cui, T. (2023). Relationships among perception of teacher autonomy support, achievement motivations, intellectual risk-taking, and science academic performance: A serial mediation model. *International Journal of Science Education*, *45*(1), 43-64.

- Tongco, M. D. C. (2007). Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *Ethnobotany Research & Applications*, 5, 147-158.
- Toole, J. C., & Louis, K. S. (2002). The role of professional learning communities in international education. *Second international handbook of educational leadership and administration* (pp. 245-279). Springer.
- Uline, C., Wilson, J. D., & Cordry, S. (2004). Reflective journals: A valuable tool for teacher preparation. *Education*, 124(3)
- Umrani, T., & Bughio, F. A. (2017). Language politics and role of English in Pakistan. *ARIEL-an International Research Journal of English Language and Literature*, 26, 1-15.
- Ur, P. (2012). *A course in English language teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Usman, M., Samad, A., & Tahir, Z. (2023). An investigation into the socio-cultural factors causing EFL classroom speaking anxiety at the selected universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), Pakistan. *Journal of Policy Research*, 9(1)
- Vadivel, B., Namaziandost, E., & Saeedian, A. (2021). (2021). Progress in English language teaching through continuous professional development—teachers' self-awareness, perception, and feedback. Paper presented at the *Frontiers in Education*, 6 757285.
- Van Veen, K., Zwart, R., & Meirink, J. (2012). What makes teacher professional development effective? A literature reviews. *Teacher Learning that Matters*, 23-41.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (2012). *Thought and language*. MIT press.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). Socio-cultural theory. *Mind in Society*, 6, 52-58.

- Vygotsky, L. S., & Cole, M. (1978). *Mind in society: Development of higher psychological processes*. Harvard university press.
- Warsi, L. Q., & Khurshid, K. (2022). The role of self-assessment in English language teachers' professional development in Pakistan. *Education Research International*, 2022(1), 9401995.
- Warwick, I., Chase, E., & Peppin-Vaughan, R. (2021). Power, participation, and partnerships in research. In T. McCowan & E. Unterhalter (Eds.), *Education and international development: An introduction* (pp. 94-110). Bloomsbury.
- Watt, D. (2007). On becoming a qualitative researcher: The value of reflexivity. *Qualitative Report*, 12(1), 82-101.
- Wenger, D. (2004). The collaborative construction of a management report in a municipal community of practice: Text and context, genre and learning. *Journal of Business and Technical Communication*, 18(4), 411-451.
- Wei, R. C., Darling-Hammond, L., Andree, A., Richardson, N., & Orphanos, S. (2009). Professional learning in the learning profession: A status report on teacher development in the US and abroad. technical report. *National Staff Development Council*,
- Wengraf, T. (2001). Preparing lightly structured depth interviews: A design for a BNIM-type biographic-narrative interview. *Qualitative Research Interviewing*, 111-152.
- Wertsch, J. V., & Sohmer, R. (1995). Vygotsky on learning and development. *Human Development*, 38(6), 332-337.

- Wijaya, A. R. T., & Kuswandono, P. (2018). Reflecting critical incident as a form of English teachers' professional development: An Indonesian narrative inquiry research. *IJEE (Indonesian Journal of English Education)*, 5(2), 101-118.
- Williams, M., & Moser, T. (2019). The art of coding and thematic exploration in qualitative research. *International Management Review*, 15(1), 45-55.
- Yaqoob, U., Arif, F., Samad, M., & Iqbal, A. (2017). Career counselling and its knowledge among high school students in Pakistan. *International Journal of Community Medicine and Public Health*, 4(7), 2261-2268.
- Yasmin, F. (2021). From theory to practice: The need for language labs in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation (Muhammad ERE)*, 5(2)
- Yasmin, M., Naseem, F., & Masso, I. C. (2019). Teacher-directed learning to self-directed learning transition barriers in Pakistan. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 61, 34-40.
- Yin, R. K. (1994). Discovering the future of the case study. method in evaluation research. *Evaluation Practice*, 15(3), 283-290.
- Yuan, R., Liao, W., Wang, Z., Kong, J., & Zhang, Y. (2022). How do English-as-a-foreign-language (EFL) teachers perceive and engage with critical thinking: A systematic review from 2010 to 2020. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 43, 101002.
- Yusupova, N., & Abduramanova, D. V. (2022). The significance of linguistic information in the English language classroom. *Academic Research in Educational Sciences*, 3(3), 478-482.

- Zafar, A., Zafar, M. A., Faize, F. A., & Ahmad, R. H. (2022). Understanding teacher identity and perceptions of action research as a professional development tool in Pakistan. *Journal of Education*, 00220574221106753.
- Zahid, G., Hooley, T., & Neary, S. (2020). Careers work in higher education in Pakistan: Current practice and options for the future. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, 48(4), 443-453.
- Zaidi, M., Javed, F., & Baig, S. (2020a). An analysis of the HEC's English language teaching reforms (ELTR) project. *Global Language Review*, 1, 293-303.
- Zaidi, M., Javid, F., & Baig, S. (2020). An analysis of the HEC's English language teaching reforms (ELTR) project. *Global Language Review*, 1, 293-303.
- Zaidi, R. (2023). Urdu and English. In B. Yoon & K. L. Pratt (Eds.), *Primary language impact on second language and literacy learning: Linguistically responsive strategies for classroom teachers* (pp. 195-210). Rowman & Littlefield.
- Zhang, J., Yin, H., & Wang, T. (2023). Exploring the effects of professional learning communities on teacher's self-efficacy and job satisfaction in shanghai, China. *Educational Studies*, 49(1), 17-34.
- Zia, T., Bangfan, L., Khokhar, M. F., Sharif, M., Akhter, S., & Hussain, M. I. (2023). Higher education policy in Pakistan, challenges and opportunities in global context. *Research*, 8(2), 208-218.
- Zuber-Skerritt, O. (2013). *Professional development in higher education: A theoretical framework for action research*. Routledge.



CONSENT FORM
Participation as an academic in the project
‘An exploration of Understanding of English Language Teachers’ Professional Development:
A narrative enquiry of academics in Pakistani universities to develop a professional standards
framework’

Please read the project information sheet and if you agree, please tick the relevant boxes to acknowledge your agreement. If you have any queries, or do not agree, please contact me on my email saijaz@uclan.ac.uk.

Research ethics approval number:

Name of researcher(s): Dr. Tania Horak and Shamim Aijaz

1. I confirm that I have read and have understood the information sheet dated (date) for this study. I have had the opportunity to consider the information, ask questions and have these answered satisfactorily.

2. I understand and agree that my participation will be in the form of Skype interviews and the interviews will be recorded and I am aware of and consent to the use of these recordings for the PhD degree and academic publication.

3. I understand the purpose of this research, as well as that my participation is voluntary, and that I am free to stop taking part and can withdraw from the study at any time without giving any reason and without my rights being affected. In addition, I understand that I do not have to answer all the questions if I do not feel comfortable answering.

4. I understand that if I withdraw from this study data collected prior to my withdrawal will be destroyed and no further data will be collected.

- 5. I understand that the information I provide will be held securely and in line with data protection requirements at the University of Central Lancashire.

- 6. I understand that verbal consent and collected data will be retained for a maximum for five years period and will be kept in a locked cupboard and in UCLAN network by the researcher and will be password protected.

- 7. I understand that confidentiality and anonymity will be maintained, and it will not be possible to identify me in any reports, presentations or publications arising from the research. As pseudonyms will be used to mention my narrative. I am being offered anonymity in following ways: institutional, personal and narrative.

- 8. I agree to take part in the above study.

Name: _____

Signature: _____

Researcher's
Signature: _____

Date: _____

Principal Investigator
 Dr. Tania Horak
 School of Humanities, Language
 language & Global Studies
 studies
 University of Central Lancashire,
 Lancashire,
 Preston
 Preston
 +44 (0) 177289 3055
Thorak@uclan.ac.uk

Student Investigator
 Shamim Aijaz
 School of Humanities,
 & Global
 University of Central
 +44 (0) 7455334980
Saijaz@uclan.ac.uk



Information Sheet for Academics

Title: Exploring university English language teachers' understanding of their continuing professional development: a narrative inquiry into the Pakistani context.

Thank you for taking time to read this information sheet.

What is the purpose of the study?

The aim of this study is to explore the understanding of individual English-Language-teachers' academic development, in Pakistani universities to develop a professional standards framework. The outcomes of the study in terms of the academics' experiences about the departments' environment, the factors behind independent professional learning, and the barriers and encouraging elements of the continuity of the development will possibly support to form a basis for a professional standards framework.

Why have I been asked to take part?

As an academic you are invited to participate in virtual interviews in this study that will help to generate the data for a research project for PhD degree in the UK.

Do I have to take part?

You are under no obligation to take part in this study. If you do decide to participate, you will be asked to retain this information sheet as well as give your verbal consent during virtual interview. Your decision to participate does not bind you to the study and you are free to withdraw without reason two months after the data collection. Your participation is valuable, and it would be much appreciated if you could participate in all three rounds of the interviews.

What do I have to do if I decide to take part?

As part of this study, you will be invited to take part in the virtual interviews, according to your availability.

What are the benefits and risks of taking part?

The study may provide you with a platform to think reflectively about your role and may possibly support you with an understanding of how to develop a robust practice through sharing your experience. **A few things could possibly be real or potential risks for you, such as you**

might not feel comfortable to disclose any personal information. You will not be forced to provide information that you prefer not to discuss.

What if I have a complaint about the study?

If you are unhappy at any point of the study and wish to raise this concern then please contact the researcher Shamim Aijaz on Saijaz@uclan.ac.uk or the Supervisor Dr Tania Horak, on [:THorak@uclan.ac.uk](mailto:THorak@uclan.ac.uk), or the University Officer for Ethics BAHSS (Business, Arts, Humanities and Social Science) on OfficerForEthics@uclan.ac.uk

Will my taking part in the study be kept confidential?

Before initiating the research, the researcher will seek a general permission (without mentioning any name of the staff member) from the heads of the academics' departments. The researcher and supervisors will be the only people that will have access to the information gathered. **According to the university regulations**, the information collected will be stored for a maximum of five years and will be kept in a locked cupboard **and will be** password protected. The university's standard privacy notice for research participants: https://www.uclan.ac.uk/data_protection/privacy-notice-research-participants.php

What will happen to the results of the research study?

The collected data will be used in a research project to accomplish the PhD degree and may be used in subsequent academic publications and academic presentations (with relevant anonymisation).

Interview procedure

In the first part of the interviews, you will be asked to talk about the story of your professional life: all the important events and experiences that remain significant to you personally in your professional life. The second part of the interviews depends on the narration of the first round of the interviews and will consist of a questioning phase to complete the gaps in the first interview. A third part of the interviews will follow where we will discuss the affordance and barriers behind academics' professional achievements or disappointments in their CPD.

Thank you for considering taking part in this research.

First Interview *question with all participants*

Could you kindly provide an overview of your professional journey, starting from your earliest experiences and highlighting significant milestones, training, and degrees that have been pivotal in your career? Or would you like to share your professional journey?

Second interview questions.

Q Could you please discuss your PhD research and its relevance to your professional success? Specifically, what was the focus of your PhD, and how has it contributed to your career and achievements?

Q Do you believe that a PhD primarily pertains to career advancement, or do you think it also significantly impacts personal and professional growth? What are your thoughts on this matter?

Q When comparing the learning environments between Pakistan, where you began your academic journey, and country, where you spent a significant part of your educational life, did you notice any differences? These differences could be related to social, environmental, or other aspects. If so, could you please share your observations on the distinctions you encountered during your academic experiences in these two countries?

Q. As you reflect on your journey from starting as a teacher to the present year, how would you describe the transformation in your perspective and personality during this time? What specific changes have occurred, and what factors do you believe have contributed to these changes?

Q. When considering the factors that have driven the changes in your learning and understanding over time, such as societal influences or mentors who have guided and inspired you, could you share your insights on the individuals or sources that have played a significant role in shaping your growth and capacity for change?

Q. You believe that your personal motivation, beliefs, and the support of your parents, spouse, and other family members have played a significant role in your journey! Are there any

additional factors or elements you would like to highlight in shaping your beliefs and perceptions?

Q. Considering your university environment, where you likely had personal goals and aspirations, do you believe that this environment played a supportive role in helping you achieve those goals? If so, could you elaborate on how the university environment contributed to your progress?

Q Do you think that without strong institutional support, your achievements would have been different? Could you speculate on how your journey might have been impacted in terms of achieving your current position and success?

Q. Do you think that having strong institutional support would have resulted in even greater achievements for you, or do you believe your current position and accomplishments would have been different with that support? If yes, how?

Q. If you did not have access to the facilities and resources that you currently have, especially considering the varying policies in different universities, where do you think you would be today? Do you believe you would have been able to turn your dreams into reality under different circumstances?

Q. Have you observed any disparities in teaching methods or educational philosophies within the university where you work? If yes, please elaborate.

Q. Considering your strong personal passion for teaching and your belief that teaching is a way of continuous learning, It is evident that your approach has influenced your students positively. However, not all teachers may share the same passion or philosophy. How do you think individuals who don't inherently possess these qualities can maintain a balanced approach to teaching? What strategies or approaches would you recommend for such educators?

Q. Let's discuss your research, particularly your recent work on investigating instructional challenges in ELT. What motivated you to delve into this area, and does it reflect any

dissatisfaction with existing instructional methods, especially in EFL classes? Additionally, could you share your insights on what you believe would be more appropriate strategies or teaching methods for EFL classes?

Q. What strategies have you employed throughout your career, and what key elements do you consider as crucial ingredients in your professional journey?

Q. When addressing the barriers and challenges in your continuous professional development (CPD) and career, what specific obstacles do you think are common to individuals in your profession? Can you highlight some of the key hurdles that professionals might encounter in their CPD journeys?

Q. Do you believe that training policies present any challenges or obstacles for teachers, particularly new teachers who require essential information and support when beginning their careers? Do you think there should be policies in place to encourage teachers' participation in training programs?

Q. Besides your PhD, have you obtained any pedagogic certificates or additional qualifications? If yes, please would you like to elaborate.

Q. Do you have any insights or recommendations regarding the establishment of collaborative networks among institutions, including universities, colleges, and schools? Do you believe that adopting such networks or training systems could significantly benefit English teachers at various educational levels, from schools to colleges and universities? If yes, how?

Q. What were the driving factors that led you to choose teaching as a profession? Did you prioritise teaching due to specific opportunities or other considerations? Is there anything you'd like to share about your decision to pursue this career path?

Q. Reflecting on your journey from the beginning of your career to the present, what notable changes do you believe have occurred? Additionally, what do you consider to be the most significant factors or agencies that have played a pivotal role in your professional development?

Q. It is apparent that you had clear goals in mind, such as aspiring to become a teacher and then a scholar. It seems you had a well-defined path in your career journey, any development you plan for future?

Q. How would you describe your emotions and experiences throughout the various stages of your professional development?

Q. In addition to the supportive environment provided by your family, do you believe there were other external factors or influences that contributed to your success, considering your favorable social status and circumstances?

Q. What educational or developmental programmes are you interested in learning more about, or what specific areas of personal development would you like to explore?

Q. What significant achievements or milestones have you personally experienced or witnessed in your teaching or educational journey?

Q. What additional information or insights would you like to share on a topic or subject that you find significant or interesting?

Q. In your educational or professional journey, have you found that the various training programs and refresher courses you've taken truly met your specific needs and goals, or do you believe they were primarily designed to meet broader faculty needs?

Q. What specific elements or improvements do you believe would make a CPD course or educational programme 100% effective for you based on your previous experiences where it was 50% helpful? What aspects should be included to enhance its effectiveness?

Q. How has your PhD degree influenced your teaching methods and overall approach to education? Can you describe any specific changes or impacts it has had on your educational practices?

Q. How would you describe the connection between your evolving mindset and how it has influenced your educational journey, or is there another aspect you would like to highlight?

***A few questions around research interest and motives!

Probing Questions from all participants

Q. Could you say more about that or give me more details about that?

Q. Could you give me one or two examples of that?

Q. Could you clarify what you mean by that?

Q. Could you help me understand what you mean here? Earlier you said X and now you appear to be saying something different; could you help me to understand how these ideas relate together?

Third round interview

1. How and what are the things that hindered your CPD?
2. Would you like to say anything about affordance of CPD?
3. Would you like to add anything?

It has almost been 20 years since I actually started my teaching career in the same institution earlier we used to call it the Department of English because at that time we were only offering one degree that was basically in literature so my basic degree or the Master's that we did I did but also in English literature it took me some time to become lecturer because of course like you know it is not easy to just get a permanent job and then it is also the same practice I think in different parts of the world that they actually hire the young graduates on the contract basis initially so it took me some three and half years to become lecturer and in that time I was working as a research associate, like you know we used to call it research associate now we call it teaching assistant, which is actually the more precise word so I mean in that capacity of course, like you know, it was a great learning experience until I became a permanent faculty I was hold for teaching English language courses as well as major courses which involved literature so I mean it gradually that improved my teaching capabilities. I learned a lot about actually the real issues and the problems which teachers face day-to-day inside the classroom outside the classroom and afterwards, like you know well, I became a lecturer in year 2004 and then it was exactly that time in which HEC Higher Education Commission was established and then they had started you know some scholarships in that time I called that was the policy of the government and the General Musharraf & Dr. Ata UL Rehman as a head of HEC and so they like you know gave a very good opportunities to, you know, young faculty members and they were very generous in terms of the scholarships which they offered. So I was also, you know, I started thinking about the scholarship in around 2006 and that even I got the scholarship in 2006, but by the time I get admission and join University so that took place in 2007 so I just briefly explain about my initial teaching career as a research associate and as a lecturer and it was exactly during this time that I got this opportunity So my Masters at that time I had to actually choose that either I will be doing my M Phil or Masters and later on PhD

in literature, or I would rather choose applied linguistics or ELT so I mean like many some of our colleagues I also thought that I think Linguistics in this changing scenario in the changing world has got a more professional appeal and I like it that is actually the area which we as a University and faculty members were lacking because we did not have any linguistic program we were not offering any degree in it, you know a PhD program at all? I mean I I guess in the entire Sindh province there might be few people who are qualified Oh you know PhD holders in linguistics this was a reason both for personal reason and professional reasons I decided that I would be opting ELT or applied linguistics. so that's why I've done my MA in TESOL in applied linguistics from university of (name) and then later on I've done my PhD in applied linguistics from abroad then I came back. Of course, like you know uh with PhD and then with the required number of experiences you get your promotions so of course like you know, for last two and half years I've been working for the professor. And then there comes a time when you are senior enough to become the head of the Institute, so I'm also serving for more than a year as a director of the Institute of English language and Literature.

Appendix 5: Individual Participants' Profiles

Participant Ali

Participant one Ali	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD Linguistics, foreign country MA Linguistics, foreign country MA. English Literature, Home country
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Professor & chairman of the department 2) Teacher of English 3) Research Associate 4) Teacher trainer 5) PhD Program Course Coordinator 6) PhD Research Supervisor/Examiner 7) Member of Board of Studies 8) HEC recognised Resource Person for Research Methods and ELT 9) Certified Trainer for GRE 	
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Learning and speaking anxiety 2) Instructional issues in ELT fraternity in EFL classrooms 3) Critical analysis of English learning habits of non-native 4) Quantitative survey method guideline for researcher 5) Developing reading comprehension 6) Motivation of student for learning English as L2 7) Level of job satisfaction among teachers 8) Students attitude towards reading English text 	
Workshop/Course/Content development as teacher & resource person	

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Language learning through literature 2) Curriculum and material design 3) Learner speaking anxiety. 4) ESL, EFL, ESOL 5) Principles of second language acquisition 6) Teaching grammar effectively 	
CPD In-house/off-site events	
<p>Presenting paper on language anxiety and at international conference within home country. Keynote Speaker on pedagogy in EFL classroom in schools in home country.</p> <p>Presented paper at focus on the students ‘different learning styles and EFL at a European university.</p> <p>Presented 4 papers on current trends in EFL conferences at different home universities.</p>	
HEC organised CPD events	
<p>How to teach Business English? One-year HEC-British Council International Resource Person One-month training on ‘Planning and Assessment’</p>	
Membership of PLC & CoPs	<p>SPELT</p> <p>University Alumni association</p> <p>Academic council</p>

Participant two Bilal	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD in Applied Linguistics foreign country MA. in English Language Teaching MA. Literature CELTA
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. ESOL Lecturer 3. ESOL Tutor 4. Assistant professor 5. PhD Programme Course Coordinator 6. Member of Board of Studies 7. HEC recognised Resource Person for Research Methods and ELT 8. Certified teacher trainer 	
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interaction patterns WhatsApp conversation in EFL classroom 2. Exploring cultural representations in ESL textbooks. 3. Integration of technology with pedagogy 4. Mobile learning, languages, literacies & cultures 5. Academic writing & Meta-discourse 6. Annual faculty evaluation process in EFL teachers 7. Language power & Ideology in Commercial discourse 8. Voices in an English textbook 9. Teaching of Critical Reading Skills in ESL & EFL contexts 10. Review of Reading Goals in the National Curriculum of English language 11. A Preamble for Novice Researchers 12. An Evaluative study of an English Textbook 13. Discourse intonation VS grammatical intonation 	

Workshop/Course/Content development as teacher & resource person	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language learning theories 2. Discourse analysis 3. Academic writing 4. Language learning through literature 5. Curriculum and material design 6. CALL 7. Psycholinguistics 8. ESL, EFL, ESOL 9. Language assessment & feedback techniques 10. Using authentic material in ESL/EFL classroom
<p style="text-align: center;">Attended CPD In-house/off-site events</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Attended conference at a UK university. 2. Attended a conference on Language acquisition strategies among non-natives. 3. Attended conference at a metropolitan city of Sindh, Pakistan 4. Attended conference culture & Applied linguistics significance 5. Language education in developed countries 6. Language teaching & diversity of learners 7. Cutting Edges Research Conference 2021 at a UK University 	
Published books	Critical discourse studies
Membership of PLC & CoPs	SPELT University Alumni association Academic council TESOL Arabia.

Participant three Ahmed	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD Applied Linguistics, foreign country MA. English language teaching MA English language & Literature
Professional Experiences	
1. Professor 2. Assistant professor 3. Postgraduate teaching assistant 4. Lecturer 5. Cooperative teacher	6. PhD Research Supervisor/Examiner 7. Member of Board of Studies 8. HEC recognised Resource Person for ELT 9. Teacher trainer

1. Research & publications

2. Investigating Science Teachers' Translanguaging Practices in Intermediate Classrooms.
3. Analysis of Alignment between Secondary Level English textbooks and National Curriculum
4. Language Education, Challenges and Strategies of University
5. Students in English-medium Instruction (EMI) Classes: A case study. Perceptions of Undergraduates of English Medium
6. Instruction: Exploration of Challenges and Solutions.
7. Willingness to Communicate in a Second Language Theory: A Narrative Review, Research in Education.
8. Exploring the Functions of Intermediate
9. Students' Translanguaging practices in a Science Classroom
10. Integration of Information and Communication Technology in Teaching and Learning of Engineering
11. Content at Public Sector Universities of Pakistan.
12. Do Economic, Social and Political Globalization affect Terrorism?
13. Economic Freedom, Democracy and Income Inequality.
14. Teaching English as Foreign Language
15. Using Different Language Teaching Models
16. Academic Writing Development in English
17. Investigating Socio-cognitive Functions of Mother tongue in a postgraduate EFL classroom
18. Reflections on issues faced by novice researchers during data collection and analysis
19. Factors preventing in-service University English Language Teachers from Becoming Action Researchers
20. Does family come first? Family motivation-individual's OCB assessment via self-efficacy
21. Understanding the nature of variations in postgraduate
22. learners' willingness to communicate in English, Cogent Education,
23. Dynamics of factors underlying willingness to communicate in a second language

Workshop/Course/Content development as teacher & resource person	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language-in-education policy 2. Bilingual and Multilingual Education 3. Translanguaging 4. Individual differences in second/foreign language pedagogy 5. English Language Teaching (ELT) 6. Dynamic Assessment in a second language classroom 7. Teacher Research in a second language classroom Linguistic Human Rights
<p style="text-align: center;">Attended/Presented at CPD In-house/off-site events</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Presenting paper on ‘Translanguaging, linguistic 2. human rights at international conference at home University 3. Keynote Speaker on Dialogic pedagogy in EFL. 4. Presented paper at ‘Focus on the learner: Contributions of individual differences to second language learning and teaching’ in European country 5. Presented three Research papers at UK Universities 	
<p style="text-align: center;">a. Supervision & mentoring students of master’s in philosophy</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Exploring the functions of English language teachers’ translanguaging use inside a classroom. 3. Investigating the nature and functions of intermediate students’ translanguaging practices in biology classroom in a public sector college. 4. Examining the impact of dynamic assessment on intermediate students writing 5. Analysing university teachers’ perceptions of English as a medium of instruction 6. Understanding the perceptions and code-switching practices of teachers in public sector 7. Exploring the factors of intermediate students’ willingness to communicate in English 8. Examining the impact of public sector school principals’ leadership styles on the school performance 	
Membership of PLC & CoPs	<p>SPELT</p> <p>Academic Council (University name)</p> <p>Alumni Association</p>

Participant four Zain	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD Applied Linguistics, foreign country. MA A. Linguistics & TESOL, foreign country MA. English Literature, home country
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. Assistant professor 3. Lecturer 4. Cooperative teacher 5. PhD Programme Course Coordinator 6. PhD Research Supervisor/Examiner 7. Member of Board of Studies 8. HEC recognised Resource Person for 9. Research Methods and ELT 10. Certified Trainer for GRE 	
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language Learning Strategies, Language Policy and Planning 2. Teaching English and Developing Intercultural Communication Through Drama. 3. Language politics and role of English in Pakistan. 4. Cooperative Learning and Pakistan. 5. Students' Perceptions and Preferences for Teacher Feedback 6. Factors causing L2 motivational change over time. 7. Content & Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) 8. Bilingual Education 9. Second Language Acquisition (SLA) 10. Intercultural Communication 11. Learners' Individual Differences 12. An investigation of Pakistani EFL learners' communication anxiety. 	
Workshop/Course/Content development as teacher & resource person	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Fresher courses of English teaching/EAP/EFL 2. Language teaching pedagogy 3. Teaching English to diverse background students 4. Qualitative research methods in English language teaching 5. Discourse analysis

Supervision	Produced three PhDs and 15 MPhils
Membership of PLC & CoPs	SPELT University Alumni association Academic council

Participant five Usman	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD, Literary criticism, home country PG Diploma, home country MA. English Literature, home country
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. Teacher of English 3. Research Associate 4. Cooperative teacher 5. PhD Programme Course Coordinator 6. PhD Research Supervisor/Examiner 7. Member of Board of studies 8. HEC recognised Resource Person for Research Methods and ELT 	
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Critical Studies of Novels 2. Teacher/Student Perception/ESL Classes 3. Exploring the Narrative Structure 4. Gender/Stereotype/Based Socialisation 5. An Analysis of Existential Aspect of Poetry 6. Resourcefulness of Women 7. Social subjects 8. Some Concern for the Students of Education 9. Students' Perceptions and Preferences for Teacher Fee 10. Short stories 11. Teacher Training/Empowerment 12. Language Teaching Methods. 13. Reading/Writing Test. 	

Attended/Presented CPD In-house & Off-site events

1. Conference on Language & literature
2. Contributions of different poets
3. ELT Professional Development
4. Conference on Education
5. International Conference on Literature and Linguistics
6. Conference on Women Problems.
7. One-year HEC-British Council International Resource Person
8. One-month training on 'Testing and Assessment'

Supervision

Two PhD and six MPhil candidates

Edited & Published books

1. Four edited works on Language, Literature & Teaching
2. English for academic purpose for students & teachers (two separate books)
3. English for employment for students & teachers (two separate books)
4. Teachers, students' & Participants' manual (two separate books)

Membership of PLC & CoPs

SPELT

Academic Council of university

Alumni Association

Member of curriculum committee

Participant six Imran	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD applied Linguistics, foreign country MA. International English Language Teaching MA English Literature
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. Assistant Professor 3. Lecturer 4. Research Associate 5. Lecturer 6. MPhil Programme Course Coordinator 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Member of Board of Studies 8. HEC recognised Resource Person 9. Member of scrutiny committee for MPhil & PhD. 10. MPhil Research Supervisor/Examiner
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Foreign language anxiety among students 2. Teaching English in large classes 3. English speaking anxiety 4. Learners' beliefs about foreign language learning 5. Reading text 6. Role of English in Pakistan 7. Public and private schools 8. English-medium or vernacular schools 9. Issues and challenges of action research 10. Motivation of students at university level 11. Exploring role of vowels 12. Rural and urban university classrooms 13. Motivation towards English language learning 	
Supervision	Produced two MPhil scholars.
Workshops/Course/Content Development as teacher & resource person	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language teaching 2. ELT Pedagogy 3. Planned, evaluated and revised course content and course materials 4. Teaching in large classes 5. Academic writing 	

6. Language learning through novel	
7. Curriculum and material design	
Membership of PLC &CoPs	SPELT University alumni association Academic council National curriculum council

Participant seven Abdullah	
Categories	Details
Qualification	PhD in linguistics in Pakistan Certificate in Teaching English as International Language MA. in English Literature
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. Assistant professor 3. Lecturer 4. Cooperative teacher 5. MPhil Programme Course Coordinator 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6. Member of Board of Studies 7. HEC recognised Resource Person 8. Member of scrutiny committee for PhD 9. MPhil Research Supervisor/Examiner
Research & Publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Task-based learning 2. Factors responsible for Learners' anxiety in Speaking English 3. Learners' self-regulation and autonomy in learning English 4. Code-switching in television talk shows and its impacts on viewers 5. Social media tools at developing academic writing skills 6. The adaptability prospects and implications of Digital methods of writing and reading 7. A study of intra-sentential code mixing in a multilingual context 8. Investigating the effects of rubrics on assessment of writing tasks 9. An overview of theories and approaches to code-switching 10. Learners' beliefs as EFL speaking anxiety factors at public university 11. Fossilization in the learning of the present tenses 12. An error analysis of undergraduate learners' language translation 13. Impact of socio-economic background on motivation for Learning English Language 14. Teaching of English in an Islamic Education based EMI institute 15. Web-based English language learning 16. Assessing the role of motivation in enhancing teachers' performance 17. Language textbook development 18. Code-mixing gender-based differences and motivations 19. Using group-work with large class 	
Workshops/Course/Content Development as teacher & resource person	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language & literature 2. Contributions of different poets in English language 3. English language teacher Professional Development 4. Workshop on 'Classroom Management' 	

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Workshop on ‘English Language Teaching’ Effectiveness of English Curriculum & Blended Learning Approach 6. Methods & Approaches of Teaching English as Second language 7. Workshop: Conference Scholarship Mentoring workshop 8. Teacher Training Workshop: Cooperative Learning syllabus Design & Material Development
Attended/Presented at CPD events
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How to develop Speaking skills? (Online) 2. Impact of classroom activities on English language learning. (Online) 3. One-year HEC-British Council Inter Resource Person (Research Methods-face-to-face) 4. Teach English Now! Theories of Second Language 5. Planned, evaluated and revised course content and course materials. (various courses) 6. Language teaching pedagogy (Coursera)
Supervision
Produced two PhD & four MPhil scholars
Membership of CoPs & PLCs
<p>SPELT University academic council English teachers’ association of Thailand University alumni association</p>

Participant eight Noreen	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD Applied Linguistics, home country. MPhil Education (Foreign Language Learning) MA English Language Teaching MA English Literature
Professional Experiences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Professor 2. Assistant professor 3. Lecturer 4. English Teacher 5. MPhil Programme Course Coordinator 6. MPhil Research Supervisor/Examiner 7. Member of Curriculum committee 8. HEC recognised Resource Person for ELT 	
Research & publications	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Development of E-Learning 2. Cultivating inter-cultural communicative competence in L2 3. Gender differences in motivation for learning English as an L2 4. The function of code switching in EFL classroom of university 5. Foreign language anxiety in undergraduate university students 6. Foreign language anxiety and willingness to communicate in English 7. Language anxiety in university learners of English 	
Attended Online CPD Course	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mastering Online Pedagogy (Epigeum) 2. Introducing to Teaching Online (Epigeum) 3. Coaching Teachers (Coursera) 4. TESOL Certificate (Coursera) 5. Teach English Now! (Coursera) 6. Teach English Now! Lesson Design & Assessment (Coursera) 7. (Coursera) 8. Teach English Now! Theories of Second Language Acquisition (Coursera) 9. Acquisition (Coursera) 10. Teach English Now! Foundational Principles (Coursera) 	
HEC & British Council Institutional-based courses	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. One-year HEC-British Council International Resource Person (Research Methods) 2. One-month training on 'Testing and Evaluation' 	
US Embassy, British Council	

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. One-week Consultative Workshop (US Embassy, AIOU) 2. English works! Two-week Teacher Training (US Embassy, 3. Methodology for TESOL 10-week course (US Embassy) 4. One-year HEC-British Council International Resource Person (Research Methods) 	
Trainings Conducted as Resource Person	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Business Writing Skills 2. Goal Setting & Career Development 3. Reading & Writing Skills 4. One-week Training Workshop 'Research Methodology & Skills' 5. Analysing Quantitative Data with SPSS 6. Workshop on 'Teaching English to Young Learners' 7. Workshop on 'Classroom Management' 8. Workshop on 'English Language Teaching' 9. Workshop on 'Lesson Planning' 	
Presented at conferences	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Promoting Learner Autonomy through ICT in an ESL classroom 2. English language learners' attitude towards E-Learning at university 3. The impact of E-teacher (TESOL Methodology) Course on my ELT Practice 4. English language learning strategies & their applicability in Pakistani Context 5. Impact of classroom activities on English language learning 6. Foreign language anxiety in Pakistan undergraduate EFL learners & its relationship 7. with willingness to communicate in classroom. 8. Language anxiety in Commerce students 9. Attitude to Learning English & Socialisation in the Community 10. Pakistani students' attitude towards Learner autonomy 11. Learner autonomy in Learning English as a foreign language 12. Factors that cause presentation anxiety in ESL Learners 	
Course designed	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Research Methods 2. Psycholinguistics 3. Discourse Analysis 4. Syllabus Design & Material Development
Member of CoPs & PLCs	<p>SPELT</p> <p>Alumni association</p> <p>University academic council</p>

Participant Farooq

Participant nine Farooq	
Categories	Details
Qualifications	PhD Applied Linguistics, home country. MA English Literature, home country
Professional Experiences	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Assistant Professor 2. Lecturer 3. Research Associate 4. Administrative Experience as the Head of English Centre in the University. 5. Revised a book
Contribution to Literature	Wrote a story

Participant ten Muhammad	
Categories	Details
Qualification	PhD foreign country MA. Applied Linguistics MA. English literature CELTA
Professional Experiences	
1. Professor 2. Associate Professor 3. Assistant Professor 4. Lecturer EAP & EFL 5. Teacher Trainer Educator 6. English language trainer	7. English Language Instructor 8. HEC approved supervisor 9. Technology Consultant & Trainer 10. Certified Trainer 11. CEFR Rated Expert 12. English Language Teacher Trainer
Research & Publications	
1. Harnessing artificial intelligence in Education 2. Supporting self-regulated learning 3. A study of cultural metaphoricity in a local author's English novel 4. "Foreign speech accent and comprehensibility: technology integration 5. Interaction patterns in WhatsApp conversation in EFL classroom: pedagogical implications 6. Impact of inhouse professional development training on teachers 7. Integration of technology with pedagogical perspectives 8. Harnessing the technology for 21 st century 9. Review: Mobile learning, languages, literacies & cultures 10. Self-perception of non-native English-Speaking-Teachers 11. Improving the learning environment: identifying the factors that impede or Motivate learning. 12. Mobile phones: underutilised pedagogical devices 13. The way we teach, the way they learn	
Attended CPD events	
HEC & AKU organised	
1. Certified Professional Trainer in teaching vocabulary, speaking, pronunciation, evaluation & correcting learners. 2. Certificate in Lesson Planning, Classroom Management & Teaching	
Online Course European Universities	
1. Certificate in writing as English Teacher & in Research Methods 2. Certificate in Teaching with Technology 3. Certificate in 'Teaching to Adults & TESOL-Business English Teaching Trainer. 4. Teaching Vocabulary, Speaking, & Pronunciations 5. Evaluation & correcting Learners.	

Udemy Online	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Certificate in ‘Write Papers & Get Your Research Published. 2. Certificate in Apps in the Classroom. 	
Developed courses	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Teaching with Technology 2. Teaching to Adults TESOL 3. Business English Teaching 4. How to develop Speaking skills? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Effectiveness of English Curriculum & Blended Learning Approach 6. Methods & Approaches of Teaching English as Second language
Presentations & Workshops	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Abnormalities in New Normal (Online discussion) 2. A Solution to technology integration (Online discussion) 3. A workshop on ‘Academic Writing, ‘Teaching English to the digital Generation,’ ‘Effective Integration of Technology in Teaching’ & ‘Technological device learning: WhatsApp for enhancing Pedagogical instruction. 4. Workshop: Conference Scholarship Mentoring workshop 5. Workshop: The Use of Facebook in Professional Development 6. A Talk on ‘Motivate the Unmotivated’ 7. Workshop on ‘Personal Learning Networks & 21st Century Challenges’ 8. A paper presented on ‘Activity based approach to Mobile Learning’ 9. Paper presented on ‘Student-Teacher Interaction Patterns in WhatsApp Conversation. 10. Using devices to Improve students’ Motivation’ 11. Teachers’ Perceptions of social media as a Tool for Professional Development 12. Social Media in Teacher Professional Development 13. Paper: The Way we Teach, The Way They Learn 14. Paper: Using Cell Phones in a Language Class Effectively 15. Teacher Training Workshop: Cooperative Learning 	
Membership of PLC & CoPs	TESOL Arabia KSAALT SPELT