

**Point of View in Ulysses: a critical application of  
Palmer's approach to the representation of  
consciousness**

**by**

**David McGrath Wilkinson**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the requirements for the  
degree of Master of Philosophy at the University of Central  
Lancashire

March 2012

## Student Declaration

### Concurrent registration for two or more academic awards

- Either \*I declare that while registered as a candidate for the research degree, I have not been a registered candidate or enrolled student for another award of the University or other academic or professional institution
- or \*I declare that while registered for the research degree, I was with the University's specific permission, a ~~\*registered candidate~~/~~\*enrolled student~~ for the following award:
- 

### Material submitted for another award

- Either \*I declare that no material contained in the thesis has been used in any other submission for an academic award and is solely my own work
- or \*I declare that the following material contained in the thesis formed part of a submission for the award of
- 

(state award and awarding body and list the material below):

\* delete as appropriate

### Collaboration

Where a candidate's research programme is part of a collaborative project, the thesis must indicate in addition clearly the candidate's individual contribution and the extent of the collaboration. Please state below:

Signature of Candidate



Type of Award

MPHIL

School

Journalism, Media and Communication

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to thank my supervisory team of Anne Wichmann, Dawn Archer and Brian Rosebury for their help and support while I was completing my thesis. I would also like to thank Elena Semino and Scott Brewster for their invaluable contributions while getting started with my research.

My thanks and gratitude must also go out to my wife, Clair, and my three children without whose support and patience this would never have been completed.

## Abstract

Joyce's *Ulysses* is a novel that has proven notoriously hard to pin down in terms of what is going on at any given point. Viewpoints shift throughout, and at times even appear to merge into one another. Previous approaches to point of view in the novel have tended to use one of a number of discrete analytical approaches, looking primarily at explicitly marked indicators of either consciousness or deixis. They have ignored sources of information about fictional minds that are not explicitly cued as such, such as those found in the adverbs used to describe characters' speech, or in narrative descriptions of their actions. My contention was such analytical approaches, focusing on explicitly marked depictions of consciousness in novels (for which *Ulysses* is famous), might be strengthened by looking at generally ignored, more subtle indications of mental functioning, in order to provide a fuller picture of what is going on in this complex work. All indicators of consciousness are seen as valid within this approach; it is therefore one that incorporates any example of situated mental functioning to be found in the novel.

Drawing upon potentially any indicator of mental functioning, within a more holistic overview of consciousness in the novel, was found to provide a fuller, yet still linguistically focused account, and one which was also more cognitively salient. It is derived in part from Palmer's ideas regarding how characters' situated mental functioning might be tracked, using non-standard indicators of consciousness. Such information, Palmer has suggested, is stored in continuing consciousness frames for characters that then feed into embedded narratives for them. This is then stored within their overall 'fictional' encyclopaedias for the text in hand. This is a subsection of readers' much larger 'internal' encyclopaedias, which contain all of the knowledge they possess; this is narrowed down to only the most relevant elements by the text itself i.e. through a text-driven process, and then stored in discrete 'fictional' encyclopaedias, specific to the current text. Palmer's ideas were then developed in terms of ideas developed by Fludernik and others, and also current thinking within cognitive science. My contention is that a reader will subjectively enter the text at any indication of mental function, in order to understand it from a first person perspective within such a consciousness frame. This point I have termed 'subjective centre point'.

These are relatively new approaches to analysing point of view in novels, and this is the first time such ideas have been applied to *Ulysses*, which has, however, attracted the attention of a good deal of traditional approaches to this topic. By applying a variety of ideas to a selection of episodes from *Ulysses*, it was shown that these non-standard indicators of consciousness, when incorporated within a more eclectic approach to subjectivity in the novel, deepened the insights afforded by looking at explicitly marked subjective elements of the text alone. The logical extension of this is to incorporate further approaches that will enable fuller, more truly holistic, analyses to be undertaken.

# Contents

## Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Overview .....	1
1.2 Viewpoint .....	4
1.3 The Representation of Speech and Thought .....	6
1.4 The Work of Palmer .....	7
1.5 Summary .....	11

## Chapter Two: Point of View

2.1. The Realisation of Viewpoint in Fiction .....	13
2.2. The Polyphonic Narrative of <i>Nausicaa</i> .....	14
2.3 How Point of View in Fiction is Assessed .....	21
2.3.1 Narratorial Point of View .....	22
2.3.2 Speech and Thought Presentation in the Novel .....	24
2.3.3 Locative Dimensions to Point of View .....	29
2.3.4 Psychological Dimensions to Point of View .....	31
2.4. Subjective Centre Point .....	37
2.5 Summary .....	38

## Chapter Three: Palmer's Subframes of the Continuing Consciousness Frame

3.1. Introduction .....	39
3.2 The Three Subframes of Continuing Consciousness Frames .....	40
3.2.1 The Thought-Action Subframe. ....	41
3.2.2 The Thought-Action Continuum in <i>Circe</i> .....	44
3.2.3 Intermental Thought .....	48
3.2.4 Consensus of Opinion Intermental Thought in <i>Circe</i> .....	50
3.2.5 Doubly-Embedded Narratives .....	52
3.2.6 Bloom and Molly as an Intermental Unit .....	54
3.3 Summary .....	61

## **Chapter Four: Fictional Minds in Nausicaa: the application of Palmer alongside other approaches to fictional consciousness**

4.1 Introduction. . . . .	63
4.2 Gerty MacDowell and Bloom in Nausicaa. . . . .	64
4.3 The Interplay of Narrative and Speech and Thought Presentation . . . . .	66
4.4 Continuing Consciousness Frames in Nausicaa . . . . .	81
4.5 Gerty's Embedded Narrative . . . . .	81
4.6 The interwoven viewpoints of Nausicaa: a summary . . . . .	93

## **Chapter Five: Applying Palmer's 'Embedded Narratives' and 'Intermental Thought' to Clarify Issues of Point of View in *Ulysses*: conclusions and implications**

5.1 Introduction . . . . .	95
5.2 Summary of the Research. . . . .	96
5.3 Conclusions and Implications for Further Study . . . . .	97

## **Bibliography**

### 1.1 Overview

Joyce's *Ulysses* is a novel that has attracted a great deal of critical attention since its publication in 1922, much of this focused on the complexity of viewpoint in the novel, and in particular the difficulty of establishing a clear-cut perspective. *Ulysses* certainly contains multiple, conflicting and unstable viewpoints, and the information that readers receive about characters is often partial and contradictory. Bradbury has suggested that *Ulysses* does more than simply depict any objectively observable reality and that

we must read this writing as writing, not, as with so many novels, simply  
looking through the word to the world it seems to stand for

(Bradbury, 1993: 158).

Rather than an objective fictional world accurately described and delineated by a consistent and reliable narrator, readers are encouraged to subjectively engage with the multiplicity of voices and viewpoints it contains. This has the effect of bringing these fictional minds to the fore. To construct a coherent picture of the fictional world, readers must assess the inner worlds of the characters in order to understand each one's motivations and perceptions, as well as the relevance and trustworthiness of these within the storyworld as a whole. The problems this creates while reading the novel has filled many works of literary criticism in the nearly ninety years since the novel's publication.

Kenner (1978), for instance, described the shifting styles and viewpoints in the text as intruding into the space in which, in more traditional novels, the reader would expect to find expressed a clear-cut narratorial viewpoint. He suggests that this can lead to characters' points of view becoming merged, and that even the standard narrative is infiltrated by the idiomatic language of characters. Within 'the normally neutral narrative vocabulary [we find] a little cloud of idioms which a character might use if he

were managing the narrative' (Kenner, 1978: 17). These create 'screens of language, through or past which it is not easy to see' (ibid 41) that obscure, reflect and colour every viewpoint in the novel. Cohn refers to this process as 'stylistic contagion' (Cohn, 1978: 33). Iser (1978) suggests that so many multiple viewpoints presented within a single text places excessive strain on readers, as they attempt to develop a dynamic network of mini 'embedded narratives' for all of the characters, to allow them to follow what is going on in the text.

There have also been stylistic approaches to the novel, and of these the studies by Wales and Fludernik are the most relevant to my thesis. Wales (1992) has suggested that it is through focusing on the complex and chaotic language through which the characters' interwoven viewpoints are expressed that readers are able to find meaning in the novel. This seems to anticipate an approach to *Ulysses* that examines all viewpoints and their dialogic interaction in the novel. The interweaving of viewpoints will reduce the apparent clarity of the narrative voice, and this multiplicity of viewpoints then becomes central to the storytelling process. This may force readers to work harder to assess which viewpoint, if any, is most valid, as well as having to work to remember the input from the multiplicity of contrastive, and at times conflicting, viewpoints.

It is this process at work which this thesis sets out to examine. Throughout the study, ideas derived from the work of Palmer will be applied in order to analyse whole fictional minds in action, based on all possible indicators of consciousness. My contention is that at what I term 'subjective centre-point'-a term that describes any indications of subjectivity to be found in the text-readers will apply a frame for consciousness to the novel and understand it at this point as representative of a subjective engagement with the fictional world. They will therefore apply their frames for the comprehension of conscious behaviour to the novel at any such points. This chimes with Palmer's ideas relating to continuing consciousness frames that track a characters' subjective engagement with the storyworld through the novel. These ideas will be introduced fully in 1.4. They are ideas that were developed in relation to what Palmer described as 'behaviourist' texts; these are texts that self-consciously avoid standard indications of consciousness. He proposed that in such writing a good deal of information about mental functioning is provided for readers, otherwise reading them would become impossible, but that this is not always apparent at an analytical level when existing approaches to point of view are applied.



Such behaviourist texts formed the focus for the ideas developed in Palmer's 2004 work, *Fictional Minds*. In this work, however, he also suggested that a future direction of study based on his ideas would be to analyse modernist texts, such as *Ulysses*. This analysis could be used to assess how the self-conscious reaction of writers of this period to the norms for mind presentations of realist novels manifests itself. For instance, it could help to show how these writers 'disrupt the causal flow of consciousness, motives, and action that was established as part of the nineteenth-century norm' (Palmer, 2004: 241).

*Ulysses* describes a day in the life of a variety of inhabitants of Dublin, as seen through the eyes of a variety of Dublin characters. Leopold Bloom is an advertising canvasser walking through the city whose naïve and earthy fascination with the world that he sees contrasts with the bookishness of the young student, Stephen Dedalus. Primarily it is the viewpoints of these two characters that are encountered, as well as Molly Bloom in the final section. These, however, are simply the dominant voices in a work that is packed with voices of all kinds, often mingling within a single episode. Bersani discusses how the much commented on stylistic intrusions in the novel most frequently 'take the form of discontinuities or inconsistencies of points of view' (cited in Coyle, 2000: 151), which includes instances 'where different characters' points of view are briefly merged' (ibid).

Early commentary on the novel often reacted negatively to such writing, by, for example, suggesting that 'As a whole, the book must remain impossible to read' (Leslie, S., 1922, cited in Deming, 1970: 207). Similarly, Wyndham Lewis scathingly attacked Joyce as someone who played with language at the expense of any interesting novelistic structure, and suggested that 'what stimulates [Joyce] is *ways of doing things*, and technical processes, and not *things to be done*' (Lewis, 1927: 106-7, emphases original). *Ulysses* certainly broke away from the traditional mould for the novel and has greatly influenced much that has come since; with the passage of time the stylistic effects that attracted such scorn on first publication have come to be more generally appreciated and seen not just as over-intellectualised flourishes, but as a powerful source of effects in the novel.

This chapter provides a general introduction to some previous work on *Ulysses*, while also introducing further approaches that will be developed and applied throughout the thesis. Chapter Two then develops approaches to viewpoint, and the representation of speech and thought, and looks at how these could be used to develop insights

afforded by an analysis using Palmer alone. In Chapter Three the approach adopted by Palmer is developed and applied to small sections of *Ulysses* as a stand-alone analytical tool. In the process the other stylistic approaches discussed in Chapter Two are contrasted with those of Palmer, demonstrating how they foreshadow his approach, one which takes the full range of characters' mental functioning as central to an analysis of the novel. This is because any indication of subjectivity is representative of 'subjective centre point', and will therefore trigger a frame for comprehension in terms of consciousness. In Chapter Four all these ideas are applied alongside those of Palmer in a full analysis of the Nausicaa episode. In Chapter Five, the insights afforded by the analyses carried out throughout the study will be brought together and their value assessed. This will be in terms of testing the proposed conceptual apparatus for *Ulysses*, while suggesting further applications and directions this approach could take.

## **1.2 Viewpoint**

In Chapter Two, some traditional narratological/linguistic approaches to facets of viewpoint and how this may be tracked in novels will be examined; at the same time, some possible limitations of focusing on discrete and differentiated facets of viewpoint will be introduced. Ideas developed from those of Palmer provides a possible solution to these limitations, one that takes a more holistic approach to the assessment of viewpoint and its possible effects, and it is in this direction that the thesis will then head. This approach looks at all indications of consciousness, since all are indicative of subjective centre point. As already touched on, this will invariably trigger a reading that requires the use of readers' frames for comprehending consciousness.

It is necessary to track the viewpoints found in a novel, since it is these that allow readers to follow what is happening in the fictional world. For instance, it may be necessary to gauge how a character has acted previously in the novel in order to assess how he or she might behave in the future, or there could be some ongoing disparity between what a character thinks and how they act, or how other characters feel about them. This could prove crucial to a reader's interpretation of this character and the relevance they hold to the story as a whole. The process of keeping track of characters helps construct a clear picture of what is happening in the world of the novel, with the information necessary for this coming to readers via the viewpoints of characters and/or narrators. In *Ulysses* the information available can be both unclear and contradictory at times, coming as it does from many juxtaposed viewpoints onto the same scene, so

readers will have to assess which elements are most relevant to the pictures of characters they have drawn up to this point.

Narrators, meanwhile, range from being a participant in the world of a novel, with only a limited view of events, to being situated outside the world of the novel and in possession of an all seeing, omniscient viewpoint. This can include awareness of the perceptions, drives and motivations of characters. Within traditional narratology, when the story is told by a narrator who relates what a character sees or feels, this is called reflector mode, or 'showing' narrative; the character then being described as the focaliser. This is contrasted with stories told solely from an external narrator's viewpoint; these are referred to as 'telling' narratives. The distinction is not always straightforward since it can be hard to differentiate narrative and character viewpoint at times, especially in a complex, multi-layered novel such as *Ulysses*.

This raises the question: in order to clearly understand what is happening in a novel, is it always necessary to so rigorously disentangle the two? Even in supposedly 'showing' narratives, the narrator is still able to manipulate what appears to be character viewpoint, for instance in the more narrativised forms of speech and thought presentation that will be introduced in 1.3.

I would suggest that the problems inherent in disentangling the viewpoint modes within the narrative, or those for speech and thought presentation, suggests that the modes do not necessarily capture readers' real reactions to a text. This is, of course, not something that these modes are intended to do-they are simply analytical tools-but the closer analytical approaches come to real reading strategies the more convincing they become. So an approach that uses the idea of consciousness frames i.e. stores of knowledge about conscious reactions and behaviour, as would be used in the day-to-day comprehension of the subjective reactions of others, in order to comprehend all indications of consciousness, regardless of source, appears more cognitively salient than an approach designed primarily to categorise and delineate the modes that are present.

It is my contention that readers will derive information about characters' mental functioning from all sources where consciousness, or subjective engagement, is indicated in the text, and use the most relevant aspects of this to build a picture of the interacting consciousnesses present. The point at which readers will start to comprehend the text as subjectively mediated is what I term 'subjective centre point'. The continuing, subjective assessment of a character is then continued through the text through what Palmer (2004) terms 'continuing consciousness frames'. These ideas will be developed more fully as the thesis progresses.

On-line reading strategies certainly do not appear to include a need to analyse a text in terms of discrete, well-categorised units. The analytical tools used to assess viewpoint should be able to draw on a full, if eclectic, mix of approaches, looking at consciousness in a broader way to provide more complete analyses of fictional consciousness that are more satisfying in how they might reflect real reading strategies. The possibility of doing this, and issues shown up by its application to a highly complex novel, is what I set out to measure and assess in this thesis.

### **1.3 The Representation of Speech and Thought**

Many of the subjective impressions we receive of characters come via the representation of their speech and thought. Linguistic and narratological approaches to this aspect of narrative fiction include the work of Pascal (1977), Banfield (1982), McHale (1983), Rimmon-Kenan (1983), Ehrlich (1990) and Fludernik (1993). The metalanguage chosen to discuss this in the current study derives from Leech and Short's work *Style in Fiction* (1981, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. 2007), and developed through subsequent work in this field (Semino, Short and Culpeper, 1997; Simpson, 1997; Short, Semino and Wynne, 1997; Semino, Short, 2004). From the outset, it should be stated that there are problems inherent in delineating discourse so precisely into clearly defined modes. This is something that Leech and Short themselves identify when they discuss how the various modes they propose are easily able to slip into one another, with the boundaries between them at times hard to demarcate.

It may also seem strange that I am referring only to the 1981 work by Leech and Short, and not to the wealth of subsequent work in this field. The reason is that this model provides all the tools necessary to augment the analyses that have been carried out using Palmer. Subtler gradations and further categories have been provided by later studies, but the original model is able to show all relevant indications of consciousness as well as to what extent the narrator is controlling the impressions we receive. Indeed, the fuzziness between them is an asset, with further gradation unnecessary within this study, taking as it does a broader and more holistic approach to viewpoint in the novel.

There are two reasons why I have chosen the model developed by Leech and Short. Firstly, as touched on above, it recognises the 'fuzzy-edged' nature of the categories it proposes, and that these may slip easily from one to another. Also, unlike some other models, it allows for the incorporation of moods and feelings into the analysis of thought, with the mode for the narration of internal states. It also includes, on equal terms, the narrative thought report mode. Both of these modes are, I feel,

crucial to a reader's full understanding of character. Yet all too often, especially in studies of modernist writing, there has been intense study of direct and indirect speech and thought, often discussed in terms of interior monologue or stream of consciousness, with the modes closer to narrative viewpoint and the narration itself deemed of secondary importance, at best. This might be a reaction to the perceived primacy of the controlling narrators of a good deal of realist fiction, but to relegate the effects of narrative input in modernist texts seems perhaps a little premature.

All the modes can best be seen, to use Fludernik's (1993: 426) expression, as 'objective correlatives of emotion and hence of consciousness'. To me this means, therefore, that they are all representative of a 'subjective centre point', an idea which will be further developed in 2.4. Since it is any indications of consciousness in which this study is interested, these elements can be seen in both character representations, discourse and explicit narratorial input. Any such indications are taken as potentially triggering consciousness frames in the reader, who projects this into the position of the character or that of an observer in order to vicariously experience the fictional world from this particular viewpoint. The objective input of a narrator can then also perform a linking function to help tie these viewpoints into the fuller context of the fictional world.

#### **1.4 The work of Palmer**

Palmer (2004) suggests that any indication of mental functioning will trigger a subjective engagement with the text, even if this is found within what appears to be action description. Such points, where mental functioning is perceived to be taking place, represent what I have termed 'subjective centre point'. For example 'he hid' indicates a subjective assessment of the fictional world that has created a perceived need to hide, along with indications of shared mental functioning and the thoughts of a character about another character, which will fuel a subjective, consciousness-based reading. This idea is derived from an important theoretical construct from cognitive science, termed frame theory. This primarily deals with real life situations, discussing the cognition of these in terms of holistic situation schemata, or frames which, metaphorically, store knowledge and apply this to new but related situations. The current study proposes that the same process of using pre-existing frames to comprehend a text, especially as these relate to consciousness, is crucial for the comprehension of the fictional world and the discourses it contains.

On a day-to-day basis, people are used to making ongoing and evolving hypotheses about situations based on limited knowledge and filling relevant gaps in world knowledge from pre-existing, related schema. As Palmer says, in his 2004 work *Fictional Minds*, from our internal encyclopaedias we are able to ‘bring to the reading process our real-world knowledge of how to fill gaps and create narratives for actual people’ (Palmer, 2004: 200). The mechanics of this are something that Palmer’s ideas set out to clarify, by focusing on what he terms ‘embedded narratives’, each of which contains as coherent a picture of a character as possible.

These ‘embedded narratives’ are constructed from information contained in what Palmer (2004: 15) terms ‘continuing consciousness frames’, which are mental frames or schema. They maintain an awareness of a character’s consciousness whether currently present in the storyworld or not, in the same way that when a person leaves a room we do not consider that person to no longer exist. Readers are drawn to fictional characters’ inner worlds, and cannot help but develop a continuing consciousness frame for them, not only because this process is crucial to the processing of the novel as a whole, but also because each character will command attention as figures against the fictional ground of the novel.

Embedded narratives contain not only an awareness of a character’s consciousness and its content, but also the context of this consciousness and how it interacts with the embedded narratives of other characters and with the narrative itself. Each provides clues to motivations and allows readers to guess at possible future actions. Without the guidance provided by a consistent narrator it may be the case that readers’ perceptions of characters remains partial, containing contradictory and incoherent information. Palmer suggests that ‘we strongly prefer to read a text for maximum cognitive payoff’ and that the reading process is ‘creative in constructing coherent and continuous fictional consciousnesses from what is often a bare minimum of information’ (Palmer, 2004: 176). This means that as well as the bottom-up references a good deal of top-down input derives from the reader. As Perry suggests, most information a reader derives about a text is ‘not explicitly written in it; rather it is the reader himself who supplies it by the mere fact of choosing frames’ (Perry, 1979: 45). This includes the application of theory of mind, which describes an ability to understand other people’s thought processes and related actions through applying intuitive, ‘folk psychology’ to the situation.

In cases where the narrator appears to skew the input from characters so that it becomes problematic to understand their thoughts and the motivations for their actions, or when the narrative input contradicts readers’ intuitive or adductive inferences about the

characters, then our ability to apply theory of mind is said to be blocked. As will be seen later in the thesis, this may be the case for the presentation of Gerty MacDowell in *Nausicaa*, which superficially might appear to capture the viewpoint of a vapid, naïve and gullible young woman, yet does also seem to present many further psychological layers, deepening readers' engagement with, and understanding of this character. In the process of readers' impressions of Gerty being deepened, and the underlying complexity of the character expressed more clearly, she also appears more sympathetic as it becomes possible to empathise to a higher degree with her behaviour. This process is shown more fully by looking at more diverse indications of mental functioning than those contained in traditional viewpoint or speech and through presentation modes.

In my analysis of this episode in Chapter Four, in which I apply Palmer alongside Leech and Short's speech presentation model, I show that there are multiple and varied discourses for Gerty contained within this single episode. This suggests that each alone does not capture the reality of Gerty, and that only by either combining them and finding a way to square the multiple contradictions, which at times might also emanate from the narrator and characters other than Gerty, or even by disregarding some of the reductive and limiting discourses for her altogether, can the reader come anywhere close to understanding her fictional reality.

Palmer's continuing consciousness frames can include up to three major subframes. Each can be crucial to the impressions we develop for a character, yet Palmer suggests they have often been ignored. These are:

- The relationship between thought and action, which looks at examples such as 'he hid', discussed above.
- Intermental or shared thinking, which looks at examples of thoughts seemingly shared by more than one person simultaneously.
- Doubly embedded narratives, which looks at examples of thoughts by one character about what another character may be thinking.

All exist in addition to the more clear-cut presentation of characters' consciousnesses via the more or less mediated presentations of their thoughts by a narrator, within Leech and Short's modes ranging from the Narrative Report of a Thought Act (NRTA) to Direct Thought (DT).

It will prove valuable to assess the degree to which Palmer's ideas can be applied to texts that differ from those to which his ideas have previously been applied. Through

this, it might be possible to show, for instance, how whole mind presentation may have remained relatively constant across these periods, if the innovative thought presentation techniques of modernism had not been not afforded analytical primacy. The current study goes some way to address this future direction for Palmer's ideas, while developing ideas relating to the centrality of an engagement with texts in terms of indications of mental functioning. Narrative can be seen as 'a perceptual activity that organises data into a special pattern which represents [. . .] experience' (Brannigan, 1992: 3). The way in which experience is *represented* is well shown by the application of Palmer's ideas, as the current study sets out to show. The way in which this data is organised in order to *explain* experience will also be addressed by this thesis.

The main thrust of Palmer's work is that readers are given a good deal more information about fictional minds than is immediately apparent, particularly in what he has termed 'behaviourist narratives', with awareness of character consciousness explicitly presented and greater focus on plot and action, rather than thoughts and feelings. These, on the face of it, appear to contain less input about characters' minds. This is not the case in a 'consciousness novel' such as *Ulysses*, which does, however, exemplify how a lack of explicitly expressed narratorial guidance and the presentation of multiple viewpoints simultaneously may create problems for the assessment of the many fictional minds it contains. This will have implications for reader focus and subsequent comprehension of the narrative, something which early commentators on *Ulysses* found troubling.

In this study I primarily examine how Palmer's ideas can be brought to bear on the Nausicaa episode of *Ulysses*, and provide a focused account of issues relating to viewpoint that have been previously observed by stylistic and literary commentators. These ideas will also be applied to a selection of additional episodes as a means of assessing the model's ability to explain a variety of different styles of 'consciousness writing', although admittedly from the same novel. Palmer's assertions centre on the fact that there is often a good deal more information about characters' mental functioning available than is suggested by looking at consciousness solely in terms of viewpoint and speech and thought presentation models. At times, however, it will be relevant to refer to speech and thought presentation. As has been discussed above, to do so I will use Leech and Short's 1981 model which posits a cline ranging from highly narrativised, indirect forms of speech and thought presentation to the direct forms, which accurately present the content of characters' speech or thought. The details and relevance of this approach will be introduced fully in Chapter Two, alongside other approaches to fictional point of view.



The term *discourse* now needs to be more clearly defined. It is a famously slippery term, and has been defined in terms ranging from Werth's all encompassing one of 'the combination of a text and its relevant context' (Werth 1999: 47) to simply describing speech. In the current study it is taken to mean 'ways of seeing the world' (Sunderland, 2004: 6). This definition has strong affinity with the broad interpretation of viewpoint taken here, as understood within what Palmer, building on the work of Bal (1997) and Doležel (1998), terms 'aspectuality'. This describes how indications of mental functioning demonstrate a viewpoint onto the world that reflects contextual considerations such as the physical or social situation around the discourse and the ideologies to which the experiencing consciousness has been exposed. It leads to this person or character seeing some aspects of either the real world or a fictional one, and not others.

As the thesis develops various discrete approaches to viewpoint will be brought together into a more holistic approach, which will be applied to a variety of episodes of *Ulysses*. At this stage, it could perhaps be described more as an eclectic approach, with the ultimate goal being to develop this into a unified, holistic approach to point of view. Palmer describes this in terms of aspectuality, or the experience of the storyworld from within a certain vision, and this also reflects the general approach that my analyses will take. These will potentially incorporate all indications of an aspectual engagement with the fictional world i.e. an engagement that chooses to ignore some aspects of the fictional world while increasing focus on others.

## **1.5 Summary**

In this chapter some approaches to *Ulysses* have been explored. These have focused on the complexity of viewpoint in the novel and the problems this may create for readers. Approaches to fictional point of view have briefly been introduced as have approaches to speech and thought presentation and the whole minds approach of Palmer. The idea that looking at a more diverse and eclectic range of indications of mental functioning may prove more valuable than trying to delimit the analysis within strict modes has also been introduced. It has been suggested that readers may comprehend situated mental functioning more holistically, through consciousness frames developed at what I term 'subjective centre point', then continued through the text for each character in what Palmer describes as 'continuing consciousness frames'. These then provide information for what he terms 'embedded narratives' developed for each character.

In Chapter Two, ideas relevant to point of view are developed further. Where possible these will be discussed in terms of *Ulysses* and also in terms of some relevant stylistic approaches to the novel. This leads into Chapter Three in which Palmer's approach is developed fully. As already touched on, this approach relates to the tracking and assessment of fictional minds within a narrative, using potentially all indications of consciousness to do so. Its central idea—that of embedded narratives developed for each character, which clash and blend throughout the novel—is somewhat akin to Bakhtin's notions of polyphony and dialogism. Palmer has extended these, however, to incorporate action descriptions as well as voice, providing a framework that allows them to be assessed in a more linguistically rigorous fashion..

To assess the value of applying Palmer alone, in Chapter Three his ideas will be applied to short sections of *Ulysses* as a stand-alone analytical tool. Looking at fictional texts in terms of whole minds interacting, rather than as discrete elements of speech and thought presentation, locative or psychological point of view, is shown to be rewarding and to provide valuable insights. This is not to disregard the fact that each of these discrete approaches must feed into an overarching 'whole minds' approach, as Palmer proposes, and all have undoubtedly produced interesting and valid commentaries on fictional texts.

Before this return to Palmer in Chapter Three, however, I will first review further ideas relating to viewpoint and to the representation of speech and thought. These foreshadow and complement Palmer's approach as well as being relevant to the full analysis of *Nausicaa* found in Chapter Four. This develops Palmer's insights by applying other analytical approaches alongside it on the way, perhaps, towards a more holistic approach to viewpoint in the novel.

### 2.1 The Realisation of Viewpoint in Fiction

Within the fields of narratological and stylistic research, point of view or viewpoint analysis assesses the direction from which narration or characters' perceptions proceed. This is seen as one-sided, and the point of view from which a text is expressed is linked to the attitudes a reader develops in response to it. The three key factors in the transmission of viewpoint in a written text have been seen as: the represented speech and thought of characters, the location from which the fictional world is being appraised in terms of space and time, and what Uspensky (1973) has termed the psychological point of view. This captures a narrator's or a character's subjective reactions to his or her position in the fictional world, allowing 'access to one particular character's psychological and ideological perspective' (Emmott, 1997: 119). These approaches will all be dealt with in more detail in 2.3.

Firstly though, 2.2, there will be a brief discussion of Bakhtin's notions of dialogism, polyphony and heteroglossia, in terms of which the multiple-voiced narrative of *Ulysses* could be described. Bakhtin's approach can be seen as foreshadowing Palmer's 'whole minds' approach. Like Bakhtin's notion of voice this suggests that characters should be seen as interacting subjects, not as objects simply presented and delineated by the narrative, with the clash and interplay of consciousnesses deemed central to narrative. Bakhtin's ideas focused on the dialogism of texts in which 'voices' interact on an equal footing, leading to a polyphony of all these multiple voices. As Palmer puts it:

Readers experience the subjectivity of characters' embedded narratives and realize (sic) that the events of the storyworld are aspectual. The same object or event will be experienced under a different aspect by another character or by the same character at a different time.

(Palmer, 2004: 187)

As touched on in the previous chapter, Palmer's term, 'embedded narrative', is comparable with Bakhtin's term, 'voice', but it extends the notion to capture the action, whole context and behaviour of characters, and also conveys a clearer sense of these embedded narratives as constructs, mediated through narratorial input rather than simply as a given. Bakhtin's ideas are so pervasive and useful within narrative theory that they need to be addressed so we will now look at these as they relate to voice, dialogism, polyphony, and heteroglossia in the Nausicaa episode of *Ulysses*.

## **2.2 The polyphonic narrative of Nausicaa**

Bakhtin's work on the novel, focusing on the writing of Dostoevsky, was not widely known in the West until the 1970s, but since he was drawn to novels because he felt they illustrated the distinctive features of language as it is actually used, Wales suggests that he 'would have been fascinated by *Ulysses*' (Wales, 1992:71). The terminologies he used offer a broad way of conceptualising the process through which readers focus on, and attempt to meaningfully bring together, multiple viewpoints within a text. Fludernik suggests that 'stylistic interaction between the narrative and the reported discourse can no longer be discussed without reference to Bakhtin's dialogic principle' (Fludernik, 1993: 7).

Bakhtin identified a dynamic dialogue between the characters' voices and that of the narrator in Dostoevsky's works, which he called 'dialogism' in which all voices interact on an equal footing, later accepting that this could be found in the work of many different authors. He contrasted this with monologism in which one dominant viewpoint was presented, often via the narrative position. The outcome of dialogism in a narrative text is a polyphony of multiple voices, with these subjective voices bleeding into one another and any singular meaning left pending. Only through negotiating a route through all these multiple viewpoints can any meaning start to become clear.

Nausicaa is one episode in which many, often contradictory, viewpoints colour the narrative. The idea of the narrator and the characters' phrasing and attitudes capturing multiple, interwoven viewpoints is highly relevant to Bakhtin's notions of dialogism, heteroglossia and polyphony and these will provide a useful 'way in' to looking at the episode in a more linguistically rigorous fashion. For instance, there might superficially appear to be a clear-cut difference between Gerty and Bloom's inner voices in the episode, each seen in the following extracts, the first of which represents Gerty's inner voice and the second Bloom's.

1. Then mayhap he would embrace her gently, like a real man, crushing her soft body to him, and love her, his ownest girlie, for herself alone.

(Joyce, 1993: 342)

2. A defect is ten times worse in a woman. But makes them polite. Glad I didn't know it when she was on show. Hot little devil all the same. Wouldn't mind.

(ibid 351)

The first extract, expressive of Gerty's inner voice is, however, not straightforward, as it is expressed in the language of romantic fiction, possibly inviting an assessment of it as parodic. Other sections of Gerty's discourse are expressed differently, so within the representation of Gerty we can discern many different discourses at play. These might be used to parody various discourses and attitudes, or to express different levels and facets of Gerty's personality. It is my contention that through attempting to resolve such contradictions and multiplicities of meaning that understanding of the character is ultimately developed; this is also clearly reflective of Bakhtin's approach to voice in the novel.

Bakhtin termed the interaction of discourses expressing contrastive attitudes within the novel, which can be conducted using multiple dialects, idiolects and register, 'heteroglossia'. This term specifically focuses on the social dimensions of the multiple viewpoints expressed, but all these terms can be seen as describing the representation of characters in fiction as a collaborative, interpenetrative process, and one that does not privilege any singular point of view. This is an idea that will be developed throughout the thesis in further analysis applying ideas relating to continuing subjective centre point, consciousness frames and embedded narratives.

Bakhtin's idea of heteroglossia resists ideologies that might be imposed through the multiple discourses that it carries, since it allows these to interweave freely. In *Nausicaa*, the narrator presents elements reflecting the heteroglossic discourses to which Gerty is exposed, and through which she assesses her worth, and other elements are to be found within her own represented thoughts. Reported thought is dialogised by bringing it into a dialogue with the narrator, who by choosing to report it in an unrealistically overstated way at times, expresses both a stance towards Gerty's thoughts and at the same time his attitude to the other discourses that have occupied these. This can be seen in extract 3, below, in which Gerty's reflections mirror the language of romance novels, with what

appears to be narrative and Gerty's represented thought interwoven and overlapping. Both employ the language of the adverts and articles to be found in women's magazines.

3. It was Madame Vera Verity, directress of the Woman beautiful page of the Princess novelette, who had first advised her to try eyebrowline which gave that haunting expression to the eyes, so becoming in leaders of fashion, and she had never regretted it.

(Joyce, 1993: 334)

Bakhtin defines parodic texts as those in which the author presents a discourse in a way that gives it a meaning that is the opposite of what appeared to be its originally intended meaning. This is useful for purposes of ridicule in which the discourse 'becomes an arena of battle between two voices' (Bakhtin, 1984: 193). This can perhaps be seen in *Nausicaa*, when Gerty's more naïve expectations are parodied by the gulf between these and her reality, seen in her own reflections and also described by the narrator, and later by the content of Bloom's thoughts. In the process it would not only be Gerty who is parodied and this facet of her viewpoint undermined, but also the discourses that have infiltrated and influenced this viewpoint.

Indeed, I would suggest that we are receiving Gerty's authentic thoughts and feelings and by looking at all the variations contained in these readers will be able to create a fuller and more sympathetic character. She is not simply naïve and foolish but a complex mix of resentment and bitterness about her life and situations, joy, vanity, earthiness and confusion; a situation not unusual among all people. It should be no surprise given her physical condition and home life that she at times escapes into the fantasies provided by romance literature, yet at the same time she does also at times seem aware that this is simply fantasy. This interpretation is one that will be shown more fully through an analysis taking into account potentially all indications of situated mental functioning. Given this interpretation, it seems that the narrator is mocking this way of thinking, and the shallowness of romance literature, but not Gerty herself and in the process readers are encouraged to build a richer and more complete image of this character.

Our overall assessment of characters comes via the multiple presentations of them, both in collaboration and discord with other characters. Bakhtin's term dialogism describes this discursive construction of meaning; it is an interdependent view of human communication. Pearce suggests that in Bakhtin's terms we can 'mean' but only

‘reflexively within an interlocution relationship’ with the subject achieving a provisional and dynamic perception of the self/world through the refractive mirror of his or her addressee (Pearce, 1994: 19).

In *Nausicaa*, there is a good deal of narrative hyperbole that would certainly not be out of place in poorly written novels, or in adverts. This is, however, contrasted at every turn with the character’s own thoughts; this serving as a mirror to constantly shift our perception of Gerty and suspend our judgements. Within the narrative are often found echoes of the subjective viewpoint both of a character and of the narrator, as the narration develops a dual voiced, dialogic quality to it, especially at points where the narrative moves into Gerty’s represented thought.

4. Gerty was dressed simply but with the instinctive taste of a votary of  
dame fashion for she felt there was just a might that he might be out.

(Joyce, 1993: 335)

5. The very heart of the girlwoman went out to him her dreamhusband,  
because she knew on the instant it was him

(ibid 342)

In both of these examples there is a shift from narrative to represented thought as the narrator presents just enough of Gerty’s thoughts to then parody the contents of the narrative, expressive as each is of women’s magazines and romance literature. Alongside this, the narrative frequently contains its own asides and juxtapositions of hyperbolic comments with internally contradictory thought or action. At other points the narrator seems to undermine the idealised values of Gerty’s community, such as the expectations of her to be unquestionably good and helpful around the house, as in the following example.

6. A sterling good daughter was Gerty just like a second mother in the  
house, a ministering angel too with a little heart worth its weight in gold.

(ibid 339)

This seems to reflect both how Gerty thinks she should feel about her situation in order to be a good daughter, while parodying it through the sentimental and insincere language used, in this process capturing the bitterness and resentment she really feels. Modernism

has been seen as a step forwards both from the past and from ‘low’ contemporary culture, so to see such things parodied within the narrative of such a prototypically modernist text as *Ulysses* should perhaps come as no great surprise. Cohn suggests that the narrator of *Nausicaa* presents a ‘burlesque of sentimental kitsch that molds (sic) the common denominator between his narration and Gerty’s thoughts’ (Cohn, 1978: 121), as the narrator’s exaggerated expression of certain values parodies these very values.

The narrative often appears to be the projection of discourses that contain these idealised values. It is expressed in terms of such discourses, to which Gerty perhaps aspires, but which are in reality unattainable to her as she resents her situation and cannot behave as a romantic heroine might behave in one of the novels she reads.

Enmeshed within the narrative, it is therefore not unusual to find the discourses and the ideologies they carry (primarily those of advertising and romance literature) that have helped shaped aspects of Gerty’s world view, which will be incorporated within the ‘fictional’ or ‘storyworld encyclopaedia’ for her (Doležal, 1998, Palmer, 2004). A ‘fictional encyclopaedia’ is one that is developed to comprehend a specific text, and developed based on this single specific text, although they are also fed into from readers’ pre-existing ‘internal encyclopaedias’ based potentially on all the information a reader has ever encountered. This is something that is referred to within in Palmer’s approach, and will be returned to later in this thesis.

Readers’ impressions of Gerty are further extended through the refractive mirror seen between narrator and character. This is seen in the following example in which we see Gerty’s reaction to what she considers to be the mocking words of one of the other girls, Edy Boardman.

7. [S]he glanced up and broke out into a joyous little laugh which had in it all the freshness of a young May morning. She knew right well, no-one better, what made squinty Edy say that because of him cooling in his attentions [. . .]

(ibid 334)

As in the examples in which Gerty is presented as a character in a romance novel, which is then contrasted with the reality of her situations and impressions, here the narrator presents a misleading external impression of her mood, which is perhaps how she wishes to be seen, with this then mirrored by her own more scathing assessment of Edy’s behaviour and the reasons for it.



Wales suggests that it is often in the chaotic language of *Ulysses*—through which the characters' interwoven voices are dialogically expressed—that we find meaning in the novel. This, she feels, makes the writing in *Ulysses* a perfect example of polyphony. She proposes that the inventive techniques of thought presentation in *Ulysses* are as much a 'rhetorical *tour de force*' (Wales, 1992: 67) that is intended to parody multifarious conventions—in much the same way that the novel is to some extent a parody of the original Homeric epic—as they are an attempt to accurately represent the inner life of the characters.

Language for Joyce is not simply a transparent medium of reality but that reality itself. It is also its own world, consciously foregrounded by word-play, syntactic deviations, leitmotifs, symbolism and ambiguity.

(ibid)

She proposes that the defamiliarising elements and unusual constructions and lexis help create the exuberant inventiveness of the writing, this being a game of sorts with the reader, creating the necessity of re-reading in order to extract meaning from all the ambiguities it contains. In the terms developed earlier in this chapter, these features will cause a reader to engage subjectively with the text in order to comprehend the voices it contains. It is through seeing all of these as different ways of perceiving objective reality that the value of any one of them is undermined, and 'multifarious conventions' parodied.

Wales follows Senn (1984) in using the umbrella term dislocations to describe what have been loosely described as 'deviations' present in the novel, and suggests that in the novel as a whole this process is particularly marked in passages focalised through Stephen's consciousness but that it also occurs in sections of narrative without Stephen's explicit focalisation, such as in Nausicaa, as well as in the representation of Bloom's interior monologue. It creates a dialogic interplay between the narrative voice and inner voices, and can generate a marked sense of mental confusion or, as seen in the case of Gerty in Nausicaa, it also provides the refractive mirror through which readers' impressions of her can be enriched, and other discourses that affect her potentially parodied.

At times the narrative or a character's thoughts are disrupted by the intrusion of other narratives, or thoughts that are unattributed, puns being a common feature of the novel. At others there is a sudden, unmarked shift from third person, past tense syntax to a more chaotic, less ordered form, generally occurring as we shift into a character's

thoughts. Such representations of voice gel with Fludernik's and Wiebe's descriptions of elements that can trigger a subjective reading-which will be discussed in 2.3.4-which cause the reader to project his or her consciousness frame into the text at this point. This process is described in this thesis as subjective centre point. This can clearly be seen in final lines of the Nausicaa episode, although as might be expected by this point viewpoints also appear merged and interpenetrative, a process termed hybridisation by Bakhtin.

8. Because it was a little canary bird that came out of its little house to tell the time that Gerty MacDowell noticed the time she was there because she was as quick as anything about a thing like that, was Gerty MacDowell, and she noticed at once that that foreign gentleman that was sitting on the rocks looking was

*Cuckoo*

*Cuckoo*

*Cuckoo*

(Joyce, 1993: 365)

Wales suggests that

By such 'dislocations' [. . .] the reader is made part of the dynamics of the text and so actively, and pleasurably, engages with its multiple perspectives and resonances.

(Wales, 1992: 106)

The idea that this process makes the reader vicariously 'part of' the fictional world is central to this study. In the above example these resonances can be seen in the links, derived both from fictional, storyworld encyclopaedias and real world knowledge stored in internal, mental encyclopaedias, between 'Cuckoo' and the fact that Bloom knows he is being cuckolded by Molly at this point, and to the cuckoo clock that Gerty had earlier described as having seen in the priest's house. It also injects humour and supports a sense of knowing familiarity between narrator, Gerty and reader. What Bloom was doing on the beach appears to be known by both Gerty and the narrator but the narrator is choosing to leave this unsaid, itself indicating an aspectual stance towards the subject matter and the

characters' reception of it. As when describing her reactions to Edy, the narrator presents Gerty as she wants to be perceived, here by cutting short the description of her awareness of what Bloom was doing before it is actually expressed.

Finishing with 'was' is also an example of Wales's dislocutions, here generating double meaning since it could mark either the progressive to be followed by a main verb such as masturbating or a slang equivalent, which is sidestepped by the narrator as discussed above, or it could be a copula to be followed by cuckoo as an adjective indicating that Bloom *was* 'cuckoo', or crazy (the first use of this given by the OED is 1918 and it appears in several texts from the same period as *Ulysses*). Finally, though, any singular, clear-cut meaning is unclear, and this process encourages a more subjective and exuberant engagement with the text, just as Wales has described.

Such wordplay could also be described in terms of what the Russian Formalists termed defamiliarisation. Fludernik remarks on the increasing playfulness of the language as *Ulysses* progresses, suggesting that it reflects a shift in the narrative structure that is determined by the increasingly defamiliarising effects that Joyce wished to achieve. The chapters up until Nausicaa present a seemingly more realistic representation of the fictional world, but this realism rapidly decreases through the novel as we become more aware of the narrative presence, and through this, Joyce himself, parodying literary and social conventions.

Wales discusses how any sense of realism becomes markedly less apparent in later episodes, episodes in which the narrative creates a marked sense of playfulness. This makes what is being described appear ever less realistic. The narrator ironically presents the viewpoint of a character coloured by the viewpoint of the discourses which have helped shape that character, adding extra embedded layers to every viewpoint. At times it also presents viewpoints shared by, or created by, others not present in the scene, indicating the linguistic traces of the ideologies carried by these discourses and allowing these too to enter into the dialogic turmoil that comprises the narrative, a process Bakhtin described as intertextuality.

### **2.3 How Point of View in Fiction is Assessed**

Whatever account of events we receive at any given point carries with it either an attitude or a position in space or time. Approaches within literary criticism have looked at narrators or fictional characters as discrete entities, assessing, for instance, whether narrators are first or third person, omniscient or limited, and using selective elements of psychological theory to gauge character motivation. Here, models deriving from

stylistics that explicitly focus on the linguistic content both of characters' speech and thought, and of narration, will form the primary focus. This is in order to assess what is going on in *Ulysses* in terms of the effects created by the presence of multiple and interwoven viewpoints. Such assessments, based on linguistic analysis of the text, will examine how the language of the narrative is able to generate subtle but definite effects through interaction with character viewpoint.

Three traditional indicators of viewpoint: speech and thought representation, spatio-temporal location and psychological point of view, will be dealt with in turn, in sections 2.3.2, 2.3.3 and 2.3.4 below. These focus primarily on character viewpoint, although all do acknowledge the importance of narrative input, so in 2.3.1 there is a brief discussion of ideas relating to how narrative viewpoint may affect reader's interpretation of the viewpoint of characters. Although this is dealt with on its own here, it does also cross over into the sections that follow, especially those that relate to speech and thought presentation.

As the thesis develops, all these eclectic approaches will be developed and seen to be relevant but within a more holistic way of assessing characters' mental functioning, one which takes the information required to do this from potentially all indications of mental functioning in the novel, whether from a character or a narrator, affording no primacy to the information derived from either. This approach focuses on characters in terms of subjective centre point, which is the point at which readers will process the information in terms of it being representative of the consciousness of a fictional character, and will use their frame for the comprehension of consciousness to do this. This information is then processed as the novel progresses within continuing consciousness frames, which provides the information necessary to build embedded narratives for each character.

### **2.3.1 Narratorial Point of View**

Of the three primary roles in the transmission of a literary text: author, narrator and reader, it is the narrator who most obviously appears to control, correct and at times play with the fictional world presented to the reader. It is the narrator who, within the confines of this world, provides the linguistic material that most resembles face-to-face interaction for readers, and who traditionally creates the illusion of a coherent and ordered story being told. The narrator performs what in terms of the speech and thought presentation categories could be described as a linking function between character

viewpoint and the entire context of the fictional world, an idea that is developed in 2.3.2, below.

For now, though, the important idea is that the reporting of events and the speech and thought of characters that comes via the narrator can be coloured by the narrator's subjective viewpoint. This occurs not only in narrative reports of speech and thought, but also in indirect forms. In *Ulysses*, since sections of direct speech are indicated with an initial dash only, both narratorial comment and the thoughts of characters can momentarily appear to merge with the unmediated speech of a character, as seen in the following extract from the Cyclops episode:

9. —Ay, says I. How are the mighty fallen! Collector of bad and doubtful debts. But that's the most notorious bloody robber you'd meet in a day's walk and the face on him all pockmarks would hold a shower of rain. *Tell him*, says he, *I dare him*, says he *and I doubledare him to send you round again* [ . . . ]

(Joyce, 1993: 279)

Here there is a shift from speech to thought and, further, since this character is also the narrator, to narrative. This then moves into embedded, reported speech, with this demarcated using italics. Such shifts can be captured using Leech and Short's model, but the relevance of these shifts to the reader may be less easy to ascertain, since the speech and thought presentation modes alone do not capture the sense that the initial Direct Speech is current to the situation and the later section is reporting on a previous meeting by the narrator who is also the speaking character at the start of this section. Such subtle discrimination, based on a certain degree of subjective judgment, can prove important when analysing the text for its possible effects on the reader and in the approach adopted in this thesis such judgements will be seen as equally valid, all potentially providing material for the continuing consciousness frames and thereby embedded narratives of readers.

Also in *Ulysses*, reporting clauses or inquit tags can, and frequently do, present a narrative viewpoint that could colour a reader's response to the speech or thought being presented, as seen in the following examples from Nausicaa:

10. —Come here, Tommy, his sister called imperatively, at once!

(ibid 332)

11. —Let him, she said with a pert toss of her head and a piquant tilt of her nose.

(ibid 338)

In these examples, the narrator is providing highly relevant information regarding the mental state and general disposition of the character doing the talking, yet this input could be ignored if focusing too closely on the content of speech and thought alone. This is seen in the adverbs or narratives descriptions used to describe the way in which the words are expressed, in the above examples these are ‘imperatively’ and ‘with a pert toss of her head and a piquant tilt of her nose’.

The speech and thought categories clearly narrow down the analytical focus onto represented speech and thought alone. This is fine, but through narrowing the focus and simply accepting the narrative content, important facets relating to irony, for instance, or the attitudes of one character towards others might be missed, since this is neither contained in the speech nor the thought of the character. The degree to which this could provide a Bakhtinian mirror, as seen in the discussion of Nausicaa, previously-one that could dialogically refract the content of the speech or thought with the represented subjectivity of characters-would not, therefore, be assessed.

The relevance of these ideas will be further developed as the thesis progresses. For now, suffice it to say that in order to gain a full understanding of characters’ mental functioning, I would argue that all indications of mental functioning must potentially be taken into account. This is something with which most narratologists and stylisticians would probably agree, yet the discrete focus that comes from application of many analytical tools can at times distract from this. In Chapter Four in particular, the increased value of taking into account any indication of subjectivity and assessing them all on a par with one another, will clearly be shown.

### **2.3.2 Speech and Thought Presentation in the Novel**

As discussed in the introductory chapter, for the purposes of this study I have chosen to apply Leech and Short’s 1981 model for Speech and Thought Presentation. The reasons for this are that the approach emphasises the fuzzy nature of the categories; indeed, the increased numbers of categories that have been introduced in later work in this field were seen as counterproductive for an approach that attempts to take a broader and more holistic approach to the representation of consciousness in the novel.

Within Leech and Short's approach, the freer forms of discourse such as Direct Speech and Thought (DS, DT), are taken to be mimetic attempts to capture the immediacy and dynamism of unmediated reality, whence one progresses along a cline, or continuum, to arrive at Narrator's report of Internal State or Voice (NI, NV), which lie at the opposite end. This continuum, with modes shading into one another throughout its length, serves to capture the fuzzy-edged nature of all the categories.

NV simply indicates that speech occurred while in NI what was felt is also indicated by the narrator. The modes that follow, moving along the cline towards the freer forms, are Narrative Report of a Speech Act (NRSA) and Narrative Report of a Thought Act (NRTA). The former indicates both that speech occurred, with some content of the speech act indicated, while the latter represents this for thought. Both content and, in the case of speech, the propositional force of an utterance is able to be controlled by the narrator. If a topic is clearly indicated within these categories 'P' is added after to give NRSAP for speech and NRTAP for thought.

Indirect Speech (IS) and Indirect Thought (IT) show that speech or thought occurred, with the speech act indicated and the propositional content specified for speech, and a verbal approximation of the thoughts given in the case of thought. Free indirect speech and thought (FIS and FIT) capture more of the subjective stance of the character. Direct Speech (DS) and Direct Thought (DT) indicate everything that IS and IT do while also purporting to faithfully represent the words and structures used to convey that content, although with a caveat regarding this for thought, which is discussed below. Free Direct Speech (FDS) and Free Direct Thought (FDT) are the same as DS and DT but without any reporting clause, or inquit tag, which is seen to increase the illusion of mimesis, with no narrative commentary provided about how these acts were performed.

In the model as it stands there is also a mode for writing presentation, and when present this too will be relevant to a full assessment of viewpoint, but since it does not relate to any of the examples I will be using from *Ulysses*, I will put it aside for the purposes of this thesis. It should be noted, however, that what is referred to here as Speech and Thought Presentation (S+TP) is now referred to as Speech, Thought and Writing presentation (ST+WP).

In terms of the posited cline of narratorial interference (see Table 1), it is suggested that any movement right of DS or IT represents an apparent increase in freedom of the character's discourse, and any movement left an increase in narratorial control. Even in DS or IT though, the reporting clauses or inquit tags that narrators use around the

characters' speech or thought, often containing adverbial descriptions, can influence how this is received. This was touched on in section 2.3.1, but requires further clarification now that the modes of speech and thought presentation have been more fully introduced.

Table1: Leech and Short's cline of narratorial control

Narrator in control				Narrator not in control			
				Norm			
				↓			
N	NV	NRSA	NRSAP	IS	FIS	DS	FDS
	NI	NRTA	NRTAP	IT	FIT	DT	FDT
				↑			
				Norm			

In the Circe episode of *Ulysses*, for instance, there is a marked proliferation of intensifying and evaluative adverbs at points where emotional content is increased, such as when Bloom is facing his accusers, mostly women about whom he has reflected lustfully. These serve to indicate both the manner of Bloom's accusers as well as his reactions, for example: 'With a sinister smile', '[Bloom] quails expectantly', 'vindictively', 'violently', 'with sinister familiarity' and 'coldly' (Joyce, 1993: 443-6). The link between these adverbial assessments and the mental state of the user is often ambiguous, and they might appear to indicate assessments made from the viewpoint of the narrator, as can be seen here in the case of 'vindictively', 'with sinister familiarity' and 'coldly'. These ideas will be returned to and developed further in chapter three, but for now suffice it to say that techniques such as these are likely to help shape reader reception of the discourse that is being represented at such a point.

Leech and Short set the norms at different points for speech and thought owing to what they refer to as the 'semantics of reporting' (Leech and Short, 1981: 345). This describes the problems inherent in deriving meaning from the reported representation of a character's thoughts. Although DS claims to be a verbatim report of what someone else said, the direct perception of another's thought is not actually possible, so DT will always appear a little artificial. Cohn too has focused on the problems inherent in correlating speech and thought in this way, saying it 'oversimplifies the literary



problems by carrying too far the correspondence between spoken discourse and silent thought' (Cohn, 1978: 11). Fludernik takes this further by suggesting that 'although the same means of linguistic expression are available in the utterance and consciousness domains, their discourse effect is entirely incompatible' (Fludernik, 1993: 310-11).

Returning then to Leech and Short's model, this approach supports the idea of seeing all these representations as artifice, since the shifting norms they propose chime with ideas relating to the projection of consciousness, developed below. They suggest that with the verbal representation of thought the writer is effectively saying that this is what the character would have said had he made his thoughts explicit. Thoughts tend not to be verbally articulated, and cannot be reported verbatim, and therefore the norm for the depiction of what a character thought is placed at IT, with FIT a move into the active mind of the character, in the same way that FDS is a move away from narratorial influence into the apparently unadulterated speech of the character.

The idea of shifting towards character or narrative viewpoint suggests that at times we engage solely with the (written) consciousness of a character, while at others times this consciousness might shift towards that of the narrator. Reasons for this must then be assessed in terms of the relevance of the shift within the storyworld as a whole, and also for our image of that character. That is, we need to ascertain why the narrator needs to intervene at this point. It could simply be to link the represented speech or thought into the storyworld as a whole, or, as is often the case in *Ulysses*, it might also be to manipulate and distort the viewpoint of the character that we receive.

As has been touched on previously, Leech and Short discuss the idea of 'slipping', in which two modes of S+TP, one closer to, and one further from, narratorial control merge into one another with no clearly defined break between them. It is proposed that in this 'unobtrusive change from one mode to another' (Leech and Short, 1981: 340) subtle shifts from the narrator's viewpoint to that of a character can occur. When the narrator and a character's viewpoint are so closely aligned readers will tend to take on trust the views of that character. Leaska has suggested that 'the content of a narrator's utterance acts as a signal' in which the 'tone of his words will invariably reinforce the reader's sense of the particular consciousness through which the material is coming' (Leaska, 1970: 55).

Leaska's 1970 analysis of *To the Lighthouse* refers to slipping between fuzzy edged categories and describes how a reader gradually 'becomes sensitive to the effects of the shift, although he may not always be able to point to precisely where it occurred' (Leaska, 1970: 53). He then moves on to discuss difficulties in precisely identifying

viewpoint in modernist writing, and perhaps touches on the nub of the issue when he suggests that it is consciousness that provides the interpretative framework through which to reconcile and embrace the disparate and contradictory elements contained within it.

Because human experience is conceived of as an indefinable, continuous and fluid thing, it is important to remember that the impressions do not progress in a logical sequence; rather, they are ordered according to the emotional force of one experiencing consciousness in relation to another.

(ibid 107)

Fludernik, in her 1993 work *The Fictions of Language and the Languages of Fiction* proposes an elaborate model with over thirty modes, which, despite such a proliferation of modes, still contains a good deal of fuzziness between them. By the time of her 1996 work, *Towards a Natural Narratology*, she had, however, moved towards a model that left such a complex and relatively ineffective tool, in terms of its analytical value, behind, towards instead a model that recontextualised the whole idea of narrative. This was a model that focused on the primacy of consciousness within all narratives.

It is an idea that chimes with the thrust of this study, examining as it does the whole minds of characters. My contention is that this whole minds approach, based around the consciousness frames that we develop for characters, chimes most closely with the processes readers may use within their comprehension of a narrative. This idea is also central to Palmer's approach. It suggests that narrative primarily describes fictional mental functioning and I would suggest that a more holistic view, one which avoids where possible the fragmentation that current narratological tools can at times create, might more accurately capture the means through which readers engage with fictional works.

Returning now to Speech and Thought Presentation, the represented speech and thought of characters is one way in which viewpoint in fiction has traditionally been assessed, and it does provide many valuable insights. In more direct forms it is seen as conveying the unmediated viewpoint of a character, while more narrativised forms of speech report can include subjective elements that originate from the narrator. This can clearly colour the representation of what the characters supposedly said or thought. There may, for instance, be some disparity between characters' speech and their

thoughts and/or actions, as well as between the narrator's assessments of a situation. In such cases a sense of ironic distance can be generated. Even in direct forms, the surrounding narrative, including reporting clauses or inquit tags may do the same. Also, thought representations are generally based on a narratorial judgement that this is what the character would have said had they spoken aloud their (usually non-verbal) thoughts.

### **2.3.3 Locative dimensions to Point of View**

It is necessary to assess whose viewpoint we are receiving at any given point, and also the position from which this originates. In consistent first person narratives this viewpoint will shift little if at all, with the originating location of the viewpoint generally clear-cut, while in a novel such as *Ulysses* that encompasses multiple, diverse and often contradictory viewpoints, it will shift a great deal. None of these viewpoints will relate to the here and now of either author or reader, but to a specific here and now within the story. This is referred to as deictic zero point (e.g. Werth, 1999) and is the point whence all deictic or pointing words such as here, now, away from, towards, there, then, behind, next are oriented.

Although deictic zero point does not relate to the here and now of the reader, there is an important approach within cognitive science, which, in keeping with the central tenets of this field, understands the situatedness of this concept in embodied terms. That is, it sees perception as focused around our physical interaction with the world. Known as deictic shift theory (e.g. Duchan, Bruder and Hewitt, 1995; Segal, 1995; Zubin and Hewitt, 1995), it suggests that this is the point at which, cognitively, a reader enters a text. Subsequent deictic terms then position the reader's consciousness relative to this within the text world. Yet indications of it are not solely deictic, but spring from an understanding of linguistic content as showing a subjective engagement with the fictional world. It can therefore be distinguished from ideas such as Simpson's 'deictic centre point' or 'origo' (1993) and would better be described as 'subjective centre point'. This is the term I have chosen to employ throughout this thesis.

It strikes me as problematic to separate locative dimensions to point of view from the psychological elements developed in 3.4. In the more holistic approach to point of view taken here, this is therefore the approach that is taken. Fludernik describes the process understanding characters via such a 'subjective centre point', as I refer to it in this study, in the following fashion:

[by]y transferring her deictic centre to the coordinates of another's mentality, the reader indirectly participates in the fictional process and recuperates, or re-cognises characters' experientiality in a vicarious manner. [. . .] In passages of figuralisation [. . .], moreover, the reader is led to empathise with the projection of an intrafictional viewpoint whose experientiality is supplied by projection into the text.

(Fludernik, 1996: 374)

For full understanding of the subjective stance of a character and the relevance of this within the storyworld as a whole, deictic terms are still crucial, however. Deixis constitutes an aspect of the modality system of language, a system of terms that relate to both physical and psychological contexts, specifying motivations and constraints and positioning 'language with respect to the current context' (Werth, 1999: 157). As well as location in time and space, it incorporates all subjective assessments of the fictional world, and the possibility and permissibility of actions, all of which makes it a fundamental element in the development of any story. It relates both to locative dimensions to viewpoint as well as to psychological ones. For instance, in Dostoevsky's *Crime and Punishment* (1866) and *The Idiot* (1868), the main protagonists, Raskolnikov and Myshkin respectively, are either unaware of or resistant to the constraints of the society in which they live. In both characters, although perhaps more overtly in the case of Raskolnikov, locative elements are also inextricably tied up with their psychological state. The modality of all the other characters in these stories is, to varying degrees, at odds with that of the main protagonists. It is a combination of these dimensions that helps to create tension and fuel reader interest in the story. The narrator, meanwhile, remains neutral to any of the sets of modalised expressions, each expressing different facets of human behaviour and societal constraints, and so leaves readers to navigate their own route through the contrasting and conflicting viewpoints. This may help to explain Bakhtin's focus on Dostoevsky's writing as polyphonic and dialogic, with the many voices allowed to clash and intermingle freely, seemingly unconstrained by the narrator.

Dickens, by contrast, often expresses strident views via the modality his narrators adopt, especially through marked caricature and irony, directing readers towards a stance towards the characters that appears to mirror his own attitudes towards societal codes and norms. As *Ulysses* progresses it is towards this style it increasingly shifts, with an ever more prominent, parodic and controlling narrator manipulating the

viewpoint that readers receive. That said, much of the overt narrative input is so biased, mocking and downright strange at times that it is unlikely to control the assessments readers make, although it will inevitably colour these to some extent. It simply becomes another one of many viewpoints onto a scene from which to draw information about a character's engaged and situated mental functioning. This is its value; although no longer to be trusted as an authoritative source, its value is instead in providing yet another voice among many, from the interplay of which readers can interpret what is happening in the novel.

Assessing the whole minds of the characters will form the basis for later analysis of the novel. This will support the idea that the impression we as readers receive is influenced by all indications of mental functioning, including those contained within the narrative, the context and reader's own, experiential, real world knowledge. An assessment of minds in their entirety, including all of the objects with which they interact, will be shown, in the analyses I provide in chapters three and four, to be more valuable than focusing on discrete aspects of focalisation, speech, thought or psychology, although some of these tools may still prove useful en route.

#### **2.3.4 Psychological Dimensions to Point of View**

Although a simple assessment of viewpoint can be defined by locative deictic elements that point explicitly to the direction from which the fictional world is being observed, other sections of text represent simply a subjective viewpoint, as has been seen in the brief discussion of character and author modality in the previous section. I will suggest, as the current study progresses, that what is key here is that locative, explicitly thought-based and more subtle psychological elements relating to point of view are all indicators of character consciousness and cause readers to understand the text at this point as such. Consciousness is understood as a first person phenomenon, since we cannot know for certain that another smells coffee or sees the colour yellow as we do; at such points, therefore, readers must project their own frame for consciousness into the text in order to comprehend it. The idea of 'projection' here does not reflect some mystical ability but simply reflects a need to apply one's own frame for consciousness to the text in order to comprehend the subjective mental functioning of others.

This also reflects the idea of 'theory of mind', as is used to understand the mental functioning of individuals encountered in real life. This can only ever be assessed from a first person viewpoint. Studies have shown that even if telling or being told, apparently objectively, that another person is angry or sad, for example, the areas of the

brain most linked to the expression of the emotions being described will be activated in order to feel these feelings. This is true for those with normal mental functioning, but for those with conditions such as Asperger's syndrome and autism, which can cause 'mind blindness', this is not generally the case.

Any reference to, or reflection on another's subjectively mediated experience, must trigger a subjective engagement on the part of the individual. Ideas relating to frames and theory of mind will be developed in more detail below, but for now suffice it to say that in the course of reading readers must orientate their cognitive stance with that of the character at points where subjectivity of any kind is mentioned. The consciousness of each character will also then be tracked through the novel via this process, with readers maintaining an awareness of a 'continued consciousness' even when the character is not present in a scene.

Traditionally, sections of text that provide a psychological point of view (Uspensky, 1973) have been assessed through the presence of modal elements and other linguistic indicators of a subjective stance to the current situational context (e.g. Simpson, 1993). Explicitly tracking psychological point of view using these linguistic indicators can be problematic, and *Ulysses* has consistently been cited by critics as a novel that is experimental in its manipulation of viewpoint. Approaches are needed that can deal with the complexity of such texts, and yet maintain a degree of linguistic rigour and cognitive salience in order to say something valuable about the effects generated by the complex interplay of narrative and character viewpoint.

Wiebe has suggested that a consciousness reading from a specific viewpoint will be generated in decreasing order of probability in the following contexts:

- previous presentation of consciousness by means of free indirect discourse
- immediate preceding descriptions of 'subjective state' [. . .]
- postactive subjectivity (after an intervening passage of objective narrative or dialogue, or a paragraph boundary) and [. . .]
- agency on the part of a new character.

(Wiebe, 1990, cited in Fludernik, 1993: 451)

In her 1993 work *The Fictions of Language and the Languages of Fiction*, Fludernik suggests a further list of textual features that can trigger a consciousness reading. These

are: exclamations, discourse markers, inconsistent syntax, adverbial deixis, hesitation, epistemics, epithets and designation, typographical signals, projection, intensifiers, interjection, left and right dislocation, subjective evaluation, incomplete sentences, WH-element preposing, the past progressive, dialectal morphology and syntax, lexical anomalies, phonetic indications of register, that-topicalisation, subject complement preposing, prepositional phrase preposing and root transformations. These indications of consciousness clearly relate to the notion of subjective centre point that has been touched on above and which will be discussed further in section four; this idea is central to the creation of a consciousness frame for understanding a text in terms of characters' subjective engagement, proposed by Palmer and explored more fully from chapter three onwards.

Later in the same work, Fludernik suggests that any of the indicators of subjectivity cited above, found in any of the four contexts cited by Wiebe, will lead to a reader projecting his or her frame for a consciousness reading into the text, abstracting out from generalised experiences stored in the memory. A reader will feel, or experience, the fictional world from this subjective viewpoint at such points, rather than feeling that they are being told a story. This foreshadows the approach she was to take in her 1996 work *Towards a Natural Narratology* in which she posits interacting consciousnesses as central to the whole notion of narrative. In this work, Fludernik describes how sections of discourse trigger a reader's 'experiencing frame', encouraging them to subjectively enter into the text at any such point, while narrated sections of texts trigger a reader's 'viewing frame'.

Joyce's writing often seems to draw on pre-existing expectations that have been set up through the novel, only to then undermine them. For instance, when Gerty MacDowell is first introduced in the Nausicaa episode of *Ulysses*, we might be surprised by the initially conventional description of feminine beauty.

**12.** Gerty MacDowell, who was seated near her companions, lost in thought, gazing away far into the distance was in very truth as fair a specimen of winsome Irish girlhood as one could wish to see. She was pronounced beautiful by all who know her though, as folks often said, she was more a Giltrap than a MacDowell. Her figure was slight and graceful, inclining even to fragility, but those iron jelloids she had been taking of late had done her a world of good much better than the Widow Welch's

female pill and she was much better of those discharges she used to get and that tired feeling.

(Joyce, 1993: 333)

This extract is presented subjectively, with agency on the part of a new character encouraging a subjective reading. This is reinforced by the subjective evaluation (as fair a specimen), intensifiers (in very truth) and designation (pronounced beautiful) it contains. This then shifts into free indirect thought, starting with the adverbial deixis of 'those iron jelloids', use of the past progressive with 'she had been taking' and the evaluative 'world of good', continuing with the evaluative 'much better' and the adverbial deixis of 'those discharges' and 'that tired feeling'.

Both the narrative and represented thought of Gerty is presented subjectively, encouraging readers to project themselves into two slightly contrastive viewpoints. Indeed, throughout the novel, readers are forced to develop their own assessments based on information coming from a diverse range of subjective viewpoints. It could be argued that the initial section is provided by a narrator setting up Gerty in terms of a romantic heroine, which is then contrasted with her more earthy reality. It might equally be that Gerty is narrating her own life in the style of bad romance literature that she is unable to sustain when her thoughts shift into her medical issues and the day-to-day, mundane facets of her reality, issues which would never be raised in such literature.

Either way, though, the fact that this contrast exists is crucial to readers' interpretation of the text. Whatever mode it is placed on, or whether sections of it spring from an external narrator, or from Gerty herself, the key thing is the effect upon the reader. By providing this contrastive mirror each facet of viewpoint is refracted within the other, in a way that will deepen readers' understanding of Gerty's situation. It will help to explain her inability to reconcile the unrealistic heroines of romance literature with her day-to-day reality. Understanding of her situation may thereby be increased; both her need to escape into such writing, but also the fact that she is able to distinguish reality from this fantasy world, enabling a more empathetic response to her a normal, flawed individual.

The analysis of Nausicaa, in Chapter Four develops this idea and shows clearly how readers must use the whole range of subjectivity markers in the text to develop a full picture of what is going on in the episode. By this episode, almost half way through the novel, readers will presumably not expect the flowery and flattering description found in the opening three lines to last, so the appearance of 'though' after the description of Gerty



being ‘pronounced beautiful’ might not come as too much of a surprise. The frame specific for reading *Ulysses* will presumably contain an expectation that conventional experiential frames will not be sufficient for its comprehension, and that scripts that seem to be set up will soon be disrupted. Pre-existing frame-based knowledge must still form the basis for doing so, but with a further expectation developed; that of the need for constantly evolving modifications during the reading of the novel. Such ideas would presumably be relevant to a good many novels, but are highly marked in Joyce’s writing.

This idea will be further developed in Chapter Three, in terms of the notion of ‘internal encyclopaedias’, which has already been briefly touched on. This is really a metaphorical way of talking about cognitive frames, or all the knowledge that individuals store, which they are able to access in order to comprehend new but related situations. Readers will bring their own ‘internal’ or ‘mental’ encyclopaedias to bear on the text, which in the current study will be referred to consistently as ‘internal encyclopaedias’ and they will also develop a ‘storyworld’ or ‘fictional encyclopaedia’ that is specific to the fictional narrative at hand. In this study these will henceforth only be referred to as ‘fictional encyclopaedias’, so that the ‘internal/fictional encyclopaedia distinction will be made clear. In addition, and as a further confusion, fictional characters in the storyworld will each possess their own (fictional) internal encyclopaedia for the fictional world, developed as the novel develops, and this will tend to be more limited than that of the reader.

Through the stream of linguistic information that constantly constructs the world through language, Fairclough (1989, 2001), building on the work of Foucault (1970), suggests that individuals can be subject positioned in a way that conforms to the dominant discourses of the time. For instance, someone may be positioned by an advertisement such that they see themselves as the main character in it, and therefore in need of the objects this character is surrounded by, which are the products being sold. Also, in relations of power, police and doctors will position themselves in a certain way, while suspects and patients will adopt another, determined by the discourses to which they have been exposed and the expectations of behaviour that these have imposed onto them.

I suggest that in *Ulysses* Joyce construct worlds through language as these are experienced from many different viewpoints and, through the often subjective and no less trustworthy stance adopted by the narrative, encourages readers to break free of the imposed ideologies that are potentially generated by the discourses they contain. All can be doubted and seen to be no more valid than any other, and even the final breakdown of

formalised narrative into the free consciousness of Molly still provides no singular, valid viewpoint; all is representative of the clash and intermingling of many discourses, as described by Bakhtin in his discussions of dialogism in the novel. The point which readers seem to be encouraged to take from the novel, then, is to trust no viewpoint onto the world, as objective reality is always mediated by the subjective angle from which it is perceived. This mutability of viewpoints also serves to refract the multiple viewpoints in a way that not only defers meaning, but is able to deepen our understanding of characters through presenting them as complex and multi-faceted.

Joyce's writing has been described as having the ability to capture the essence of situations, character, relationships and location more clearly than might more objective description. I would suggest that this is via the same process through which an evocative, subjectively mediated description of a landscape will conjure up a complete picture in listeners, as they are subjectively able to project their consciousness into this landscape in order to vicariously 'feel it' first hand. It will give a sense of what it feels like to be there, based on the projection of experiential frames into the situation, and even though each individual impression might be different, and each far removed from the thing itself, it still feels more convincing and more real than would an objective and detailed description of features. This would apply even to looking at a map or an aerial photo, both of which head towards the iconic end of the continuum of possible semiotic representations of this landscape. Indeed, to continue this parallel, a subjectively framed and composed photograph would more effectively allow viewers to feel the essence of this landscape, as would even a painting that misses out features and includes others not actually present.

This sense of subjectively capturing the essence rather than an objective and detailed impression of the city is impossible to escape from in *Ulysses*. The penultimate episode, Ithaca, purports to objectively present the external world through a series of questions followed by overly detailed and precise descriptions of the external world, including such elements as a full description of the passage of water from cloud to tap as he turns the latter. During the episode we hear that:

**13.** Was the narration otherwise unaltered by modifications?

Absolutely.

(Joyce, 1993: 687)

Even here, the impression of objectivity breaks down at points, as a need for a more subjective, evocative and less clear-cut engagement with the world reasserts itself.

15. What spectacle confronted them when they, first the host, then the guest, emerged silently, doubly dark, from obscurity by a passage from the rear of the house into the penumbra of the garden?

The heaventree of stars hung with humid nightblue fruit.

(ibid 651)

## 2.4 Subjective Centre Point

The techniques for showing consciousness are best understood in terms of representation rather than presentation, with the apparently realistic portrayal of consciousness dependant on marked stylistic features, carefully worked and reworked in order to produce this effect. The primary effect, I have suggested, is to trigger an engagement with the text, at any point where subjectivity is indicated, in terms of consciousness. The point at which readers cognitively ‘enter’ the text, to understand it as a subjective, experiencing consciousness, I describe as ‘subjective centre point’. This builds on ideas contained within deictic shift theory, briefly touched on in section one. Here it was seen how understanding the situatedness of deictic central point in embodied terms, with perceptions seen to be focused around our physical interaction with the world, suggests that readers cognitively enter a text at this point. Subsequent deictic terms then position the reader’s consciousness relative to this within the text world.

I have used the term ‘subjective centre point’ here though because some of the indicators of consciousness cited above e.g. hesitations, incomplete sentences, dialectal morphology and syntax etc, as well as Wiebe’s four contexts, could not be described as deictic, since they do not ‘point’ to anything, but instead simply ‘indicate’ subjectivity i.e. trigger the projection of a consciousness frame. To see the point at which readers ‘enter’ the text as subjective central point therefore strikes me as more appropriate. Rather than ‘subsequent deictic terms’ maintaining a locative understanding within the storyworld, it seems appropriate to describe subsequent indicators of subjectivity that position a reader’s consciousness relative to subjective centre point within the storyworld. This contrasts with approaches such as Simpson’s (1993) notion of *origo* or deictic centre i.e. the idea takes into account rather than aspects of the storyworld too are merely ‘deictic’ indications of a subjective involvement with the fictional world.

## 2.5 Summary

In this chapter, some models and ideas that have been applied to viewpoint in novels have been discussed. Each of these has been seen to be valuable in discussing the effects generated by the interplay of viewpoint in fictional texts. It appears, however, that a more overarching, holistic approach that looks at viewpoint in terms of consciousness may provide a fuller, simpler and perhaps more cognitively salient methodology.

This is based on the idea that elements within both the speech and thought of characters, and also the narrative, trigger a reader to project his or her consciousness frame into the text, understanding the text through the information derived from all the experiencing consciousnesses present. There may or may not be an objective narrative viewpoint present, which would enable the text to also be understood via a viewing frame. When present, such narrators can perform a linking function within storyworld comprehension, although indicators of what I have termed ‘subjective centre point’ may still be found within this.

Subjective centre point takes into account the fact that not all indicators of mental functioning are deictic; for instance, saying a person ‘fled’ or ‘hurried’ also suggests elements of mental functioning, and with the first example potentially a micro-narrative in itself, but neither would conventionally be seen either as representative of a viewpoint, or as deictic. Information seen as subjective and therefore triggering a consciousness frame is then processed within a continuing consciousness frame for each character, providing information for an embedded narrative for each.

In Chapter Two, then, we have already looked briefly at some examples relating to viewpoint in *Ulysses*. We now move on in Chapter Three to look at the Nausicaa episode in more detail, applying Palmer’s ideas as a stand-alone analytical tool. In so doing it will be possible to assess the value of Palmer’s approach and to identify those points where it may fall down and require further input based more closely around traditional narratological and stylistic approaches,. This is in order to paint as full a picture as possible of characters’ interactions in the novel and how these relate to the storyworld as a whole. This is moving towards a more holistic approach to viewpoint in the novel, in which no indicator of consciousness is ignored as all can be relevant to the interpretations we build.

# Chapter Three

## Palmer's Subframes of the Continuing Consciousness Frame

---

### 3.1 Introduction

In the course of reading any novel, readers must bring together all the possible ways in which a fictional world might be understood into the most coherent picture possible i.e. one that will provide the most convincing understanding of it for that reader. As was introduced in Chapter One, Palmer suggests that for characters this information comes from 'continuing consciousness frames', developed for each character and reactivated at each reference to this character's consciousness. From this, information is obtained in order to build an 'embedded narrative' for that character that is as complete as possible. Any indication of consciousness in the text can trigger the reader to apply such a consciousness frame and these textual triggers I have termed subjective centre point i.e. they are the point at which the reader enters the text to understand it subjectively as opposed to applying a slightly more distance 'viewing frame' to it.

Characters are tracked through a text via this projection of 'continuing consciousness frames' into the text, from the first subjective indication of each character to the last. A continuing consciousness frame describes the mental frames or schema that maintain an awareness of a character's consciousness as we read, just as when a person leaves a room we do not consider that person to no longer exist. If only mentioned briefly, however, it is likely that the available information about the character will be very sparse and will decay and become hard to retrieve at a subsequent mention of this character several chapters later. Doing so may still be relevant to a complete interpretation of the fictional world, as is often the case in *Ulysses*, with its multitude of minor characters briefly encountered and then returned to in later episodes.

Palmer's term 'embedded narratives' therefore describes the representations we build for each character. Each contains a character's perceptual, conceptual and ideological viewpoints, and future plans, and is treated as a sub-narrative embedded

within the fictional text. The term captures not simply an awareness of each character's consciousness, or even just the content, but also the context of each consciousness and how this interacts with both the embedded narratives of other characters and with the narrative itself. This makes them central to a reader's understanding of what is happening in a novel.

In the chapter that follows three subframes that Palmer suggests can be found within continuing consciousness frames are described in some detail. This is followed by an analysis of *Circe* in terms of the thought-action continuum, the first of these subframes, followed by a look at intermentality in the novel. Doubly embedded narratives are then looked at in terms of some examples of this subframe found in *Ulysses* and this then leads into an assessment of Bloom and Molly as an intermental unit. All these analyses apply Palmer's ideas as stand-alone tools, in order to assess their analytical value.

### **3.2 The Three Subframes of Continuing Consciousness Frames**

The continuing consciousness frames that readers draw from in order to build embedded narratives can include three major subframes identified by Palmer. Each can be crucial to the impressions we develop for a character, yet Palmer suggests they have often been ignored when looking at character consciousness in fiction. They are, as briefly introduced in chapter one:

- The relationship between thought and action
- Intermental or shared thinking
- Doubly embedded narratives.

Menakem Perry has proposed that most information a reader derives about a text is 'not explicitly written in it; rather it is the reader himself who supplies it by the mere fact of choosing frames' (Perry, M. 1979: 45). Palmer suggests that 'we strongly prefer to read a text for maximum cognitive payoff', which makes readers 'very creative in constructing coherent and continuous fictional consciousnesses from what is often a bare minimum of information' (Palmer, 2004: 176). This means that as well as the bottom-up references, a good deal of top-down, inferencing input derives from the reader. Palmer's ideas regarding the importance of what has often been considered to be peripheral input about fictional minds, in the absence of standard indications of consciousness, particularly apply to what Palmer terms behaviourist novels. Such novels focus more

conventionally on plot and action, rather than the representation of thought, so superficially appear to contain less input about the characters' minds. Palmer's model shows that this is not the case to the degree that might have initially been thought, demonstrating this with extracts from such works as Jane Austen's *Emma*, George Eliot's *Middlemarch* and Evelyn Waugh's *Vile Bodies*.

Generally, this suggests *Ulysses* is not the kind of novel which Palmer's ideas were initially designed to illuminate, since it contains a great deal of direct access to characters' mental functioning. It is ultimately, however, an approach intended to extend our knowledge of characters' viewpoints and their mental functioning in all novels. As this chapter will show, the approach is still of value when used to look in detail at character viewpoint in 'consciousness' novels such as *Ulysses*.

### **3.2.1 The Thought-Action Subframe**

The first subframe of the continuing consciousness frame captures the relationship between thought and action and reflects the idea that consciousness is central to all narratives, however action and plot-based they may appear. According to Palmer, narratives develop largely based on the mental processes that prompt characters to act, which he suggests may not be fully brought out by analyses based purely on the access that we appear to have, as readers, to characters' thoughts and feelings. In reality, we also use the more subtle indications that are present to assess the mental state of characters, just as we do with real people, in the real world.

As has been seen, characters and their actions constitute the perceptual figures of the fictional world; it therefore seems sensible to suggest that the motivation for all action within the novel can be found within characters' mental processes, since it is these that most strongly, and subjectively, draw a reader's focus. As Palmer suggests, although such things as decision making, desire and regret are mental events, it is these that 'provide the causal network behind the physical events' (Palmer, 2004: 211). He subcategorises the thought-action subframe into further sub-subframes, including the decoding of action statements, a thought-action continuum and indicative description.

Palmer illustrates his ideas about the thought-action subframe with the following extract from *Vile Bodies*.

Adam undressed very quickly and got into bed; Nina more slowly arranging her clothes on the chair and fingering the ornaments on the chimney piece with less than her usual self possession. At last she put out the light.

Palmer suggests this passage consists mostly of what he terms significant action i.e. there is sufficient contextual information for readers to infer why Adam is acting quickly and Nina more slowly. They are about to go to bed together for the first time and he is eager while she is nervous. Palmer's continuum between thought and action can also help explain how the working of fictional minds can be shown in such examples, as will be shown below; in this extract, for instance, the phrase 'with less than her usual self possession' would be placed roughly midway between thought and action on this continuum, as it describes both Nina's behaviour and her state of mind.

Palmer uses a selection of speech tag adverbials to show his proposed continuum in action, since these can be seen both as describing the manner with which speech acts are performed and also as contextual thought report, providing information about the functioning of characters' minds. He suggests these be labelled A, M and T to indicate whether they should be placed at the thought or action end of the continuum (A and T) or in the middle (M). This is not in the same way that terms such as active or manner verbs are generally used within linguistic theory, but simply indicates that, based on an arguably subjective assessment of the adverb, it seems to either describe the way something is said, in the case of those assessed as being towards the action end of the continuum, or the thoughts that lay behind this, as is seen towards the thought end of the continuum. These latter examples therefore indicate an assessment of what the character is thinking and therefore some degree of subjective judgement on the part of the narrator.

Palmer provides the following examples, which he suggests are taken from the thought end of the continuum, and indicate that an accompanying state of mind (listed first) is being indicated.

Triumph: 'said Lottie triumphantly' (Waugh, 1996: 34)

Desperation: 'said Jane's father desperately' (ibid 49)

Anger or annoyance: 'said the stranger crossly' (ibid 86)

Bitterness: 'said Father Rothschild bitterly' (ibid 87)

Anxiety: 'asked the barmaid anxiously' (ibid 142)

Thoughtfulness: 'repeated Mr Benfleet thoughtfully' (ibid 27)

Gentleness: 'said Father Rothschild gently' (ibid)

The following examples of Palmer's are all placed towards the middle of the continuum:



Wishing to give encouragement: 'said Adam encouragingly' (ibid 72)  
Absentmindedness: 'said the Colonel dreamily' (ibid 184)  
Negative feelings: 'he said rather stiffly' (ibid 163)  
Lack of concern: said Mr Isaacs airily' (ibid 123)

Palmer then provides examples that he suggests lay at the action end of the continuum, in which the adverbial primarily appears to relate to the manner of speaking.

'said the General hospitably' (ibid 188)  
'said Miss Runcible rather faintly' (ibid 131)  
'said the matron archly' (ibid 156)  
'he hinted darkly' (ibid 20)  
'she asked plaintively' (ibid 79)  
'said Adam in no particular way' (ibid 27)

Palmer states that these contain more narratorial judgement and, also, that they require more work on the part of the reader. Although our real world knowledge seems to tell us what a dark or arch way of speaking is, in terms of how it sounds, it actually tells us a good deal less about the content of a character's consciousness. This must be inferred from the context, which has implications for how other characters who are present perceive the character's words. Palmer suggests that 'These adverbs need not simply be reports of the speaking characters' minds, they can also be read as reports of the listening characters' minds' (Palmer, 2004: 214).

Palmer uses the term 'indicative description' to describe a further sub-subframe. This takes into account narrative accounts of actions that indicate an underlying mental state. These, he suggests, tend to occur around the middle of the thought-action continuum like the example from *Vile Bodies*, above. They can be hard to distinguish from thought report, as can be seen in Palmer's following example, taken from *Emma*: 'everybody had a burst of admiration on first arriving' (Austen, 1996: 215). Admiration here could apply equally to behaviour or to a state of mind; it could also imply either that the people are genuinely admiring or that they are simply behaving this way out of a false politeness.

In such cases, Palmer suggests that the *opposite thought test* be applied to these action descriptions. This asks whether the indicated state of mind actually occurs in the

fictional world being described, since indicative descriptions simply indicate and do not conclusively establish the state of mind that might normally be associated with the characters' mental states. As such, readers are forced to decipher exactly what is meant by the narrator's input and they can form a useful tool for generating irony. Such mismatches could also be understood in Gricean terms i.e. in terms of the flouting of conversational maxims. Such an approach would examine how different ways in which the same proposition could be expressed can generate specific implicatures, based on an aspectual engagement with the subject matter of the proposition, and how this can lead readers to infer an ironic interpretation, for example. Next though we will look in more detail at Palmer's thought action continuum in terms of the Circe episode of *Ulysses*.

### **3.2.2 The Thought-Action Continuum in Circe**

Although Circe is presented as the script of a play, there is also a clear narrative vs. speech and thought dichotomy. The chapter was presumably written to be read as part of the novel as a whole, and not performed, and can, despite its dramatic form, therefore be taken to be coherent with the rest of the fictional world of *Ulysses*. As Palmer's ideas are designed to assess character's engaged mental functioning within fictional worlds as a whole, I therefore feel that there is no great problem in treating it simply as another episode of *Ulysses*, without the need to differentiate its style as that of drama. It seems to me to just represent yet another of the multiple styles through which *Ulysses* is presented.

The literary critic MacCabe (2003: 127) has suggested that the many interwoven and fleeting viewpoints to be found in Circe allow for the breakdown of the multiple discourses that have positioned Bloom throughout the novel. In terms of the dialogism of the novel already discussed, it is yet another way in which a mirror is held up within the text that allows the multiple viewpoints it contains to be refracted and seen in terms of one another. In this episode, Bloom is, on the whole, given the relative freedom of free direct speech and thought, the latter of which in particular will throw his consciousness into stark relief. Bloom is the main perceptual focus of the episode, and the narrative can be presumed to be presenting his viewpoint, with any information it presents read as relevant to an interpretation of Bloom's mental state.

It is imagined characters' speech that provides the main source of information about mental functioning in this episode, with most represented using free direct speech (FDS) or direct speech (DS) with bracketed narrative adverbials often added e.g. 'MRS YELVERTON BARRY (*severely*)' (Joyce, 1993: 444). In the narration generally, but especially in that around Bloom's trial, many evaluative adverbs enter the narrative, and

although most accompany speech they are also found within straightforward description of action events that at the same time indicate an accompanying state of mind. These include ‘Indignantly’, ‘Scornfully’ and ‘incoherently’ (ibid 436-7). That said, all these are simply figments of Bloom’s imagination within the prolonged hallucination that makes up most of this episode, so the way in which they appear actually represents facets of Bloom’s psyche.

Many of these adverbs lie towards the thought end of Palmer’s proposed thought-action continuum. Such a proliferation of intensifying and evaluative adverbs, which Prince describes as ‘attributive discourse’ (Prince, 1987: 7), tends to occur at points where emotional content is increased; here, for instance, it is most often seen when Bloom is facing his imagined accusers, most of whom are women about whom he has reflected lustfully. All such indications of a subjective stance, representing subjective centre point, will also trigger a consciousness reading, with readers projecting a consciousness frame into the narrative in order to understand it; in *Circe* the narrative position is aligned with the viewpoint of Bloom, as the episode is primarily an at times comic psychological portrayal of Bloom himself.

These adverbials are used to indicate both how Bloom imagines his accusers’ manner to be towards him, and also how he imagines he might react e.g. ‘With a sinister smile’, ‘[Bloom] quails expectantly’, ‘vindictively’, ‘violently’, ‘with sinister familiarity’ and ‘coldly’ (Joyce, 1993: 443-6). All of these reactions reinforce the sense that Bloom sees, or at least fantasises himself, as victim. This sense is reinforced by the masochistic acts that he submits to later in the episode.

As discussed earlier, when a narrator seems to be using adverbs towards the action end of the thought-action continuum within reporting clauses, this can increase processing difficulty for readers. This may be because it is hindering readers’ ability to project a consciousness frame into the text. Even though these characters are simply figments of Bloom’s imagination, when we project a consciousness frame into the text at subjective centre point in order to feel what a violent tone of voice might mean, we might still be expected to empathise to some extent with the person apparently using this tone. But in this instance, it is likely that readers will empathise with the person who is imagining this tone being used towards them which in this case is Bloom, the sole consciousness present at this point.

It will generally be understood within the whole context of why the person is using it, and whether it is fair or justified, and this will potentially affect the embedded narrative drawn for any characters present. Here, as a facet of Bloom’s fantasies, it will

be integrated and understood in terms of Bloom's imagined sense of persecution by, and alienation from, his fellow Dubliners.

The following is a selection of adverbs used around Bloom's trial (ibid 433-448) with those used to describe how Bloom fantasises the speech of others, and Bloom's imagined responses listed separately. They are placed on Palmer's continuum using bracketed A, M or T to indicate whether they lie closer to the action or thought ends of the continuum or around the middle. As touched on above, this is not the same as describing action verbs, for instance, and the approach is not as empirical. It is simply an indication of how sections of narrative, which are generally disregarded when looking at consciousness in the novel, can provide a subjective centre point. This clarifies how non-standard indicators of consciousness can enable our understanding of a scene to be understood. This is via the continuing consciousness frames (here Bloom's continuing consciousness frame) that are developed for it, with the most relevant information from these then feeding into the embedded narrative for those characters (here Bloom's embedded narrative), rather than simply triggering a narrative 'viewing frame' as might be expected.

In terms of the adverbials used to describe Bloom's speech, I would say there are three from the action end of the continuum, these being 'privately and confidentially', 'indistinctly' and 'incoherently', two that are towards the middle, these being 'with quiet feeling' and 'expectantly' and four from the thought end of the continuum, these being 'desperately', 'forlornly', 'impassionedly', and 'plausibly'. For the imagined characters present, there is a far higher percentage of adverbials that Palmer would suggest lie at the thought end of the continuum, and which therefore suggest a judgement by Bloom within his hallucination of how these imagined characters' assertions would position him. I would say that this is towards a negative interpretation of their vindictive and bullying stance that affirms his own position as victim and outsider. There are six in total from the thought end of the continuum, these being 'Sternly', 'indignantly', 'excitedly', 'scornfully', 'derisively' and 'vindictively', two from the middle of the continuum, these being 'severely' and 'coldly' with only one from the action end, this being 'resonantly'.

The subjective descriptions of these imagined characters' speech, contained within narrative descriptions, indicates an accompanying state of mind in twice as many examples as it does Bloom's. This suggests that Bloom sees the attitudes of his imaginary accusers as: stern, indignant, excited, scornful, derisive and vindictive, as opposed to Bloom's examples which indicate he positions himself as desperate, forlorn and impassioned. This mediation of the categorical statements of the characters seems to

represent a sense of Bloom's alienation from those around him, and from a consensus view that is both scornful and dismissive. We therefore receive an unfavourable view of Bloom's accusers as malicious, within Bloom's fantasies, with Bloom positioned as victim.

The effect is further enhanced by the choice of words taken from the middle part of the continuum, which Palmer suggests simply indicate rather than confirm an accompanying mental state. Here they suggest severity and coldness on the part of Bloom's accusers, and nervous expectancy leading to a state of forlornness from Bloom. Finally, we also find adverbial descriptions from the action end of the continuum, with an increased degree of narratorial judgement, of which there are five times as many around the speech of Bloom than around his imaginary accusers. These, Palmer suggests, require more work on the part of the reader, and this may partly explain an increased focus on Bloom's dialogue in the episode, as noted by MacCabe and others.

The only one of such adverbials from the middle section of Palmer's continuum that is used to describe the speech of the accusers is 'resonantly', suggesting confidence and dismissiveness on the part of the accusers. The effect is further increased by the character Georges Fottrell's (the clerk of the court in Bloom's hallucination) dismissive FDS immediately preceding Bloom's defence: 'The accused will now make a bogus statement'. Despite this assertion by George Fottrell, the narrative adverbials around Bloom's speech seem to suggest the opposite, the final one in this section being 'plausibly'. Readers are therefore further aligned with Bloom's hallucinated point of view, with the imaginary accusers accepted as both spiteful and vindictive.

Superficially, this is something that might be expected, as it would appear to be the norm that what a character is fantasising about presents a viewpoint that readers might sympathise with. This is not necessarily the case, however, with many characters in fiction presenting fantasies or reflections that generate repulsion for their viewpoint. This is not the case here, and I feel that by treating the varying subjective nature of narrative adverbials as each indicative of subjective centre point, and thereby triggering a consciousness reading, the means through which this sympathy is generated can be more clearly shown.

The increasingly positive presentation of Bloom's viewpoint foreshadows the following section in which Bloom escapes and is lauded and made Lord Mayor of Dublin. If the episode can be seen as reflecting a hallucinatory journey through Bloom's psyche, as many commentators have suggested (e.g. Attridge, 1988; MacCabe, 2003; Kenner, 1978; Ellmann, 1982), this may reflect his need to overcompensate and boost his

self-worth to resist the innumerable discourses that have attempted to position him through the negatively expressed imposition of their judgements. MacCabe (2003, 132) has suggested that it is in this episode that the discourses that have imprisoned Bloom throughout the novel are brought to the fore and then discarded by Bloom.

This reflects Sunderland's (2004) idea of ideology carried by discourse and the sense that in *Ulysses* Joyce attempts to undermine all viewpoints and show all to be untrustworthy, forcing readers to make their own assessments of them in order to come anywhere close to comprehending the storyworld as a whole. As we have seen in the Circe episode, it is at least partially through the content of the narrative, which has often been disregarded in such analyses, that this effect can be achieved, through helping to fuel sympathy for Bloom's own hallucination of himself as victim and of the accusatory inhabitants of Dubliners as shallow, petty and vindictive. Even in the narrative, subjective centre point may be found, and the content of the narrative at such points used to help explain the effects of the varying viewpoints (or imagined viewpoints) found within the text.

### **3.2.3 Intermental Thought**

The second subframe of the continuing consciousness frame that Palmer proposes is that of 'intermental thought'. This describes instances of characters working together as a single mental unit; that is, two or more characters thinking the same thing. It contrasts with individual, or private, thought, which Palmer refers to as 'intramental'. Palmer suggests that it is not possible for two people to converse without at least some intermental communication taking place. Palmer describes this as 'one of the most interesting and significant ways in which the fictional mind extends beyond the fictional skin' (Palmer, 2004: 2).

In the most extreme cases, Palmer refers to intermental groups as a single 'intermental mind' as in the case of a very strongly bonded couple, or twins, for instance. Palmer's examples include the army in Evelyn Waugh's *Men at Arms*, the town in William Faulkner's *A Rose for Emily* and in George Eliot's *Middlemarch*, the group of friends in Donna Tartt's *The Secret History*; the Marchioness de Merteuil and the Viscount de Valmont in Laclos' *Les Liaisons Dangereuses* and Kitty and Levin in Tolstoy's *Anna Karenina*. In the last named he cites the scene in which 'these characters write out only the initial letters of the words that they wish to use but who nevertheless understand each other perfectly' (Palmer, 2005: 427).

Palmer suggests that the notion is a fundamentally important component of narratives, and that much of the mental functioning that occurs in novels is done by groups, friends, families, couples and other intermental units. Often this is not brought out by traditional narratological tools such as focalization, characterization, S+TP or viewpoint analysis and, as with information from the thought-action continuum, such 'hidden' input regarding the mental functioning of characters might well be disregarded. This means that analysts are missing out on important input regarding characters' fictional minds, which could actually be crucial to the overall pictures that readers will develop. A great deal of the subject matter of all novels consists of the formation, subsequent development and actual or potential breakdown of intermental systems. Even in novels in which consciousness appears less central, Palmer suggests that 'narrative fiction is, in essence, the presentation of fictional mental functioning' (Palmer, 2004: 5). This chimes with Fludernik's (1996) view that experientiality is central to narrative, and that how characters experience events and how these impinge on their own situation is fundamental to all narrative fiction. This has been discussed in Chapters Two and Three in terms of readers projecting their own subjectively experienced frames for consciousness into the text in order to understand and then to track characters' subjective responses to, and interaction with the storyworld.

The notion of intermental thought reflects a need to take 'both internal and external views' (Damasio, 2000: 82) when studying human consciousness. This suggests that we should not focus solely on a single character's intramental viewpoint, but on the interaction of this with the viewpoints of others. There is an increasing realisation in contemporary studies of the mind that cognition is best understood in terms of situated cognition. This constitutes a move away from solely analysing what goes on inside the skull to also examine the social and physical context of mental functioning. Social psychologists now routinely discuss minds not only in terms of individuals but also in terms of groups of people working as intermental units. Palmer suggests that such interaction can in some instances prove central to understanding plot in narrative fiction; for instance, in the case of joint actions, it should be the case that 'their embedded narratives overlap during the extent of their joint purpose before diverging again' (Palmer, 2004: 168). If this overlap fails to take place, it might suggest to readers that the action is likely to fail, or that one character is misleading the other about the purposes of the action, or if they do not afterwards diverge it might suggest that the action has drawn them closer, or that their plan has gone awry and they need to remain intermentally bonded in order to get through the resulting repercussions.

The broad notion of intermentality describes group, joint or shared thought that is also referred to as situated, socially distributed or extended cognition and intersubjectivity. It is used to describe problem solving by two or more people, including groups functioning as what Palmer term intermental units. Palmer uses Wertsch's example (1991: 9-10) to exemplify the general idea in terms of the smallest intermental unit that comprises two people, called a dyad. He describes a parent and child trying to find a lost shoe. By careful questioning of the child the parent is able to determine the location of the shoe, yet alone neither of them knew where it was. Thus it was the intermental unit that located it. The idea of intermental units embraces both large groups such as the church and political parties and small ones such as family or work colleagues. It tends to describe units which are well defined and long lasting and in which intermental thought is successful.

The representation of intermental thought can also include what Palmer calls the 'expression of consensus' style of thought report. Here a viewpoint described within the narrative reflects the shared opinion of an entire group or community, which at this point comes to represent a single intermental unit. Palmer has discussed how in *Middlemarch*, the town itself can be seen as a single intermental unit, or what he calls 'the Middlemarch mind'. It is an idea that is closely related to Bakhtin's notion of 'the common view' (Bakhtin, 1981: 301-2), Leech and Short's 'communal point of view' (Leech and Short, 1981: 350) and McHale's 'idiom of the group' (McHale, 1978: 270). The external discourses relating to Bloom in the novel could be seen as representative of a consensus intermental view of Bloom; one which captures the attitudes of Dublin inhabitants towards him; something that is particularly marked in the *Circe*, *Sirens* and *Cyclops* episodes.

Building on the ideas about *Circe* developed in the previous section, which looked at input from the thought-action continuum; this episode will now be investigated again in the light of Palmer's ideas about the consensus of opinion as a facet of intermental thought. The degree to which these discourses can be seen as representative of a consensus intermental viewpoint in the episode will also be assessed.

### **3.2.4 Consensus of Opinion Intermental Thought in *Circe***

Much of *Circe* is a hallucinatory episode from within Bloom's consciousness, but for the sake of this analysis it is presumed that where clear addresser/addressee discourse is taking place it can be treated as speech, even though it is all a figment of Bloom's imagination. This is because the way this is expressed within his imaginings, as has been



shown, reflects Bloom's attitudes to the world around him and his position within it. Likewise, the fact it is presented as a play-script is not relevant to this analysis, since we are looking at it holistically, in terms of the input about fictional minds it provides, and how this relates to the entire storyworld. Specifically, here, this means how it provides information from our continuing consciousness frame for Bloom to feed into our embedded narrative for him.

To readers, however, initially it may appear unclear whether what is going on is real or imagined, but the breaking of alethic restraints will favour the latter interpretation, with the fact that Bloom is the main perceptual focus supporting a reading of this as an at times comedic portrayal of his psyche. As Palmer suggests, identity is situated in others' attitudes towards us at least as much as in our own attitudes, so even if this episode does represent Bloom's fantasies, including those about how others see him, it is still representative of a perceived intermental viewpoint. This viewpoint is crucial to the embedded narrative developed for Bloom, and therefore readers' assessment of him within the entire storyworld as a whole.

One way in which the intermentality of the accusers is suggested via a consensus viewpoint is through the fact that many are grouped together, and speak as one, which suggests that to Bloom they also think as one. The jurors, for instance, are Martin Cunningham, Simon Dedalus, Jack Power, Lenehan and others of Bloom's peers encountered through the novel and also 'the featureless face of a Nameless One' (Joyce, 1993:444), who we might presume is the narrator of Cyclops. These are referred to as 'The Jurors' and their input is presented simultaneously. We find:

1. (*All their heads turned to his voice*) Really?

(ibid 445)

2. (*All their heads lowered in assent*) Most of us thought as much

(ibid)

Other groups are also represented as a single entity, speaking as one, such as 'The Sluts and Ragamuffins', 'The Loiterers' and 'The Torchbearers'. 'All' are also represented once Bloom becomes mayor, with 'God save Leopold the First!' (ibid 455), followed by 'The Peers' with 'I do become your liege man of life and limb to earthly worship' (ibid 456). There are also narrative references such as: *General Laughter*' (ibid 347), *Renewed laughter*' (ibid 348) and *He is howled down*' (ibid 439) during his trial. Such alignment of comments all suggest a consensus opinion. These negative assessments are replaced,

once he becomes mayor, with references such as, upon meeting and talking with the dignitaries of the city, '*They nod vigorously in agreement*' (ibid 452), his wishes are announced as being 'carried unanimously' (ibid 453) and upon speaking to the crowd there is '*prolonged applause*' (ibid).

Despite the relative paucity of sustained narrative input and the preponderance of what is presented as dialogue, Palmer's approach therefore helps shows how the city of Dublin is perceived as presenting a united front in its condemnation of him, and functions as a single intermental unit in this respect. This is how Bloom perceives the city and its inhabitants. This latter interpretation is supported by the fact that he then goes on to perceive these same inhabitants as lauding and praising him. The most likely explanation for this shift is that he needs to live out this fantasy in order to counter the alienation he feels both from his peers and from all the other inhabitants of Dublin, whom, as we have seen, he perceives as a single, homogeneous intermental entity. That these consensus views of Bloom are real to him means that, in terms of his situated identity, they are highly relevant. We now move on to look at Palmer's third subframe, that of doubly embedded narratives.

### **3.2.5 Doubly-Embedded Narratives**

The third subframe Palmer terms doubly embedded narrative. This term describes the thoughts and perceptions of characters regarding other characters' thoughts and motivations. In terms of theory of mind, doubly embedded narratives reflect the limited fictional encyclopaedias of characters being projected in an attempt to assess/guess at what other characters might be thinking and feeling (contrasted with the more complete fictional encyclopaedias of readers). A straightforward and playful example can be found in the Ithaca episode of *Ulysses*:

3. What, reduced to their simplest reciprocal form, were Bloom's thoughts about Stephen's thoughts about Bloom about Stephen's thoughts about Bloom's thoughts about Stephen?

He thought that he thought that he was a jew whereas he knew that he knew that that he knew he was not.

(Joyce, 1993: 634)

Here the characters' embedded thoughts about each other, as mediated by the narrator, are presented in a playful way through the multiple embedding of clauses. The technique can also be used to create irony by expressing mismatches between different characters' perceptions about each other, to a reader potentially aware of all fictional viewpoints, or alternatively to simply demonstrate a complete lack of understanding of each other.

An example can be found in the opening pages of the novel. Buck Mulligan has presumed that Stephen's questioning him about his mother implies that he has been feeling guilt about refusing to pray for her on her deathbed, and he launches into a tirade at him about it. He then feels he has overstated things and inadvertently also insulted the memory of Stephen's mother. This is something that readers may go along with as he apologises, until their fictional encyclopaedias require updating when Stephen points out that this is not the case:

4. –I am not thinking of the offence to my mother.

–Of what, then? Buck Mulligan asked.

–Of the offence to me, Stephen answered.

(Joyce, 1993: 9)

It is not clear whether Stephen is being defensive here, not wishing his real feelings to be exposed, or deliberately contrary, but at the very least it means that we cannot presume Mulligan's presumption about what Stephen is thinking to be correct. This triggering of subjective centre point, leading to readers' understanding this within their consciousness frame, generates an early inference that Stephen is a complex and contrary character, with Mulligan rather more straightforward. This will then colour the embedded narrative readers start to construct for these characters.

Many examples of doubly embedded narratives can be found within Bloom's reflections about Molly, with a particularly high number occurring in *Laestrygonians*, and also in Molly's reflections in *Penelope* about Bloom. For example, Bloom thinks to himself in *Laestrygonians*.

5. She didn't like it because I sprained my ankle first day she wore choir picnic at the Sugarloaf.

6. Thing like that spoils the effect of a night for her.

(Joyce, 1993: 204)

Molly, meanwhile, thinks about Bloom in the following way in Penelope:

7. if his nose bleeds youd think it was O tragic and that  
dyinglooking one off the south circular when he sprained his foot at  
the choir party at the sugarloaf Mountain the day I wore that dress
8. no hed never have the courage with a married woman thats why he wants me
9. that was why I liked him because I saw he understood or felt what a woman  
is and I knew I could always get round him

(Joyce, 1993: 931-2)

Such doubly embedded narratives for Molly throughout the novel and for Bloom in Penelope help to develop readers' embedded narratives both for the characters and also help us to understand to what degree they could be considered as an intermental unit. This idea will be developed further in the following section.

### **3.2.6 Bloom and Molly as an Intermental Unit**

Examples of intermental units might be presumed to be found among couples who have been together for a long time and who work well on joint activities such as problem solving, planning and decision making. Palmer suggests that 'the notion of intermental thinking is obviously essential to analyses of fictional close relationships such as friendship, family ties, and, especially, marriage' (Palmer, 2004: 163). He moves on to propose that:

These relationships may be regarded as intermental systems in the sense that the reader may have the expectation that the thinking of the characters who make up the relationship will be shared on a regular basis, although it is often the role of the narrator to frustrate that expectation. It could be plausibly argued that a large amount of the subject matter of novels is the formation and breakdown of intermental systems.

(ibid 163-4)

In *Ulysses* an example that might be expected to illustrate Palmer's ideas is that between Bloom and Molly, as a long married couple who have lived through many difficult situations and who have both successfully raised and also lost a child together. In order to assess to what degree this conforms to or diverges from Palmer's notion of intermentality we will now examine both characters' perceptions of the scene in Calypso in which Bloom is first encountered, cooking breakfast and taking Molly's to her in bed, and also Bloom and Molly's reflections on the day that Bloom first proposed to Molly, on Howth Hill, an event described in both the Laestrygonians episode, by Bloom, and in the Penelope episode, by Molly. Based on this, it seems that there is a failure of these characters to function as an intermental unit, but Palmer suggests that it is as interesting to look at 'the negative group dynamics of conflict and fragmentation as in the positive dynamics of group solidarity and joint identification' (Palmer, 2004: 219-20).

When readers first meet Bloom in the novel, in the Calypso episode, he is preparing breakfast for himself and for Molly. We are presented with Bloom's assessments of Molly's likes and dislikes, within which Bloom appears confident in the embedded narrative he has constructed for his wife. He thinks to himself:

**10.** Another slice of bread and butter : three, four : right. She didn't like her plate full. Right.

(Joyce, 1993: 53)

At this point neither Molly nor the fact he is also making breakfast for someone else has been mentioned, but readers will presumably fill in this gap top-down from their own encyclopaedias. Extract **5** does not provide an example of intermental thought but is instead an example of doubly-embedded narrative. It does give the initial impression of some mental proximity and at least that Bloom feels he can anticipate his wife's likes and dislikes.

The process continues as Bloom stands outside the bedroom, thinking to himself: 'She might like something tasty. Thin bread and butter she likes in the morning' (ibid 54). He then waits outside the door of the bedroom and although she only answers with 'Mn' he thinks to himself: 'No. She did not want anything' (ibid). This is based on Bloom's knowledge of his wife, and the doubly embedded narrative he creates for her is based only on her 'Mn', since Molly's thoughts are not explicitly expressed. It is also the case, however, that Bloom could not have reached the decision he does regarding making breakfast for Molly i.e. not making it, without her input. Likewise, Molly would not have

been aware of this possibility without Bloom mentioning it, so for this purpose they have converged mentally, albeit briefly, and certainly not enough for this to be taken as evidence of them being an intermental unit. This helps fuel an impression of Bloom as the one who worries about things and tries to do things to please Molly, who is perhaps rather unengaged and uninterested. Of the two of them, at this point it is him who appears to be making the most effort in the relationship.

Following this, ambiguity of reference, requiring readers to make an assessment of its relevance can be found. It revolves around the presence of a female cat in the kitchen about which Bloom imagines a doubly-embedded narrative, which, it transpires, could apply equally to Molly:

11. She understands what we say better than we understand them. She understands all she wants to.

(ibid)

This appears to be a quite appropriate inference when seen in the light of Molly's later soliloquy, as well as the novel as a whole. Despite the fact that Molly shows keen awareness and understanding of Bloom's actions, thoughts and impulses, seen in both Molly's FDT in Penelope, and also Bloom's reflections on her behaviour throughout the novel, when he takes up her breakfast and she asks him what 'metempsychosis' means she chooses to ignore the overly detailed attempts at explanations that Bloom provides. Appropriately, given the ambiguity with the cat, 'metempsychosis' has connotations of the passage of a person's soul through an animal, so those readers who have this knowledge in their internal encyclopaedias will presumably use it to understand Bloom's reflections on the cat's behaviour as possibly referring to Molly. It provides an early example of how viewpoints are shown to distort objective reality in the novel; Bloom is reflecting on Molly and as a result of this projects his rather resentful reflections about her onto what is, in reality, just a cat.

The explanation Bloom gives for metempsychosis is 'It's Greek, from the Greek. That means the transmigration of souls.' To this Molly replies '-O, rocks! [. . .] Tell us in plain words' (ibid 62). As he attempts to explain the word more clearly she does not answer him, but 'Her spoon ceased to stir up the sugar. She gazed straight before her, inhaling through her arched nostrils' (ibid 63). Through this action description within the narrative we are given a sense of Molly's mental state, reflecting the relationship between thought and action: we have a sense of her being bored and stirring her tea incessantly,

not even looking at Bloom, and seeming to ignore what he is saying. This important input about her mental functioning, relevant to the whole trajectory of the novel, is therefore shown only through external narration of her observable actions. When she does speak it is because she has smelt the burning kidney: ‘–There’s a smell of burn [. . .] Did you leave anything on the fire?’ (ibid). This helps create an impression of her as someone who tends to focus on the more immediate and physical aspects of life, by contrast to Bloom’s incessant and wordy reflections, fantasies and projections.

The events are later reflected on within Molly’s thoughts in Penelope, as she reflects on her own embedded narrative for Bloom and his attempts to explain ‘metempsychosis’ with:

12. [H]e came out with some jawbreakers about the incarnation he never can explain a thing simply the way a body can understand then he goes and burns the bottom out of the pan all for his kidney

(ibid 705)

Bloom’s failure to explain metempsychosis effectively to Molly is a signal from the outset that there has been a breakdown of the intermental unit that one might expect to exist between Bloom and Molly. The divergence in their viewpoints is reinforced by Bloom’s reflections throughout the novel and its trajectory reaches the end of its arc in Molly’s reflections in Penelope seen in example 7. This immediately precedes her deciding that she does still love Bloom.

Indeed, there are no clear-cut examples of intermental thought between them in the whole novel, with only some borderline examples to be found, which are discussed below; instead doubly embedded narratives and narrative descriptions including those from the thought-action subframe are used to show that the other character only thinks they know what the other is thinking. There is also evidence, however, that Molly understands quite accurately, and often manipulates what Bloom is thinking, whereas Bloom only seems to understand Molly in terms of her physical needs. A sense of breakdown is further indicated by Bloom’s excessive wordiness and attention to detail, in marked contrast to Molly’s more down to earth focus on what is most immediate and relevant, and in the novel as a whole it is the contrasting ways in which they see the world that is most apparent.

This sense of emotional distance is further fuelled by the fact that both have letters in the post that they do not want the other to see. Bloom’s is from Mrs. Marion, a female

friend, while Molly's is from Blazes Boylan with whom she has a sexual assignation that afternoon. Bloom sees Molly hide the letter, as 'halfway his backward eye saw her glance at the letter and tuck it under the pillow' (ibid 59), suggesting that he is able to guess quite accurately at what she is up to, and in Penelope we also discover that Molly knows that Bloom had been corresponding with a woman, saying 'the day before yesterday he was scribbling something a letter when I came into the front room [. . .] as if something told me and he covered it up with the blottingpaper pretending to be thinking about business' (ibid 691). On the face of it both seem to be distanced from one another, either having affairs or at least chasing women in Bloom's case, and not functioning effectively as an intermental unit.

Unlike in the case of Bloom and Gerty, however, Bloom and Molly's doubly embedded narratives for each other seem to be broadly accurate and they can each accurately guess at what the other is up to, and to an extent know each other's likes and dislikes and understand their actions and the motivations for these. As seen in the exchange before breakfast, with minimal (or no) words Bloom is able to ascertain Molly's desires. They have been together for many years, so must have had some common grounds before; and, indeed, later, in Penelope, Molly reflects on their son's death years before with 'we were never the same since' (ibid 728).

In terms of the classical schema that the novel follows, Stephen represents Ulysses's lost son Nestor, the son whom he discovers at the end of his travels and brings home, followed by Ulysses triumphing over his rival suitors for Penelope. In these terms it can be seen that, by bringing Stephen back to the house in Ithaca, Bloom has healed the void that the death of his and Molly's son, Rudy, created eleven years before, and since which Bloom has refused to have penetrative sex with Molly. Molly reflects on Stephen's visit that 'he could easily have slept in there on the sofa in the other room I suppose he was as shy as a boy he was so young' (ibid), and immediately after this begins to think more affectionately about Bloom and of their life together. The trajectory of the novel shows how the breakdown of Bloom and Molly's relationship is resolved, if only mentally and temporarily, after Molly's infidelity with Boylan and Stephen's visit, when she thinks affectionately about Bloom in the closing lines of the novel.

**13.** How he kissed me under the Moorish wall and I thought well him as another and then I asked him with my eyes to ask again and he asked me would I yes to say yes my mountain flower and first I put my arms around



him yes and drew him down to me so he could feel my breasts all perfume  
yes and his heart was going like mad and yes I said yes I will Yes.

(ibid 732)

Examples of intermental thought in terms of current and ongoing mental functioning between Bloom and Molly are also not to be found in the novel; the only example is found within Bloom's FDT in *Laestrygonians* 'Can be rude too. Blurt out what I was thinking' (Joyce, 1993: 147). This is the only clear example and it is expressed from Bloom's subjective viewpoint. It is also presumably about Molly saying things that have been triggered by an action or behaviour that is likely to trigger a similar vein of thought in both of them.

Other than this the closest example I could find was in extract 8, with 'and then I asked him with my eyes to ask again and he asked me would I yes [. . .]'. This is again only remembered though, expressed from a single viewpoint, and dates from when they were first together. Although it suggests that at least within Molly's recollections they would think the same thing at times then, the romantically standardised as well as passionate nature of the exchange makes the remembered intermentality implied less significant. To feel that one feels the same thing as a partner is the norm for those in the early stages of love. That Molly is reflecting on it now, though, creates the impression that she feels this unity again, and that she perhaps yearns for it to return, suggesting a sense of loss on her part. The fact it is only remembered, and that Bloom is asleep by this point, means it cannot be considered intermental in Palmer's sense of the term, and should instead simply be seen as an indicator of past mental closeness and possible intermentality at an earlier stage of their relationship, when it would be a remembered absence of intermentality that would perhaps strike readers as unusual. Its relevance at this point may be that Molly wants to regain it and this seems to be the direction towards which the closing lines of the novel tend.

Bloom too reflects on this moment, in the *Laestrygonians* episode, where pointedly he remembers it for its sexually charged nature rather than for his proposal. The divergence of their memories in regard to the start of their relationship shows that, even at this time, there was a disparity in what each thinks the other is thinking. Although indicated only through external assessment, Bloom's remembered perceptions of Molly reflect his perceptions of her inner state at the time, and this doubly embedded narrative will comprise part of his own embedded narrative for her. Bloom saw Molly as softly

yielding as she 'laughed, warmfolded' 'she kissed me. I was kissed'. 'All yielding she tossed my hair' (ibid 167-8), while Molly describes this as far more calculated behaviour, throwing an ironic light onto Bloom's doubly embedded narrative for her. She reflects on 'the day I got him to propose to me' (ibid 731) because 'I knew I could always get around him and I gave him all the pleasure I could leading him on until he asked me to say yes and I wouldn't answer first only looked out over the sea and sky I was thinking of so many things he didn't know of [. . .]'

While Bloom's memories are of her lustfully focused on him with 'her stretched neck, beating, woman's breasts in her blouse of nun's veiling, fat nipples upright', Molly lists, over 22 lines, all the things that, pointedly, he 'didn't know of' including childhood memories of bustling Mediterranean markets, her father and his friends and previous lovers. Thus, Bloom's doubly embedded narrative for what Molly was feeling on that pivotal occasion in their lives has been distorted and romanticised away from Molly's more pragmatic and broader feelings at the time, and her remembered extended intramental thoughts at that time. Molly's doubly embedded narrative for what Bloom was thinking and feeling seems quite accurate, since she knew she could get him to propose to her, and that he would be driven by lust to propose, and in this way she knew she could always get around him. Yet, as discussed above, the novel ends with this distance being temporarily resolved as Molly remembers how she thought 'as well him as another' and she finally 'drew him down to me so he could feel my breasts all perfume yes and his heart was going like mad and yes I said yes I will Yes' (ibid 732)

Notice that doubly-embedded narratives seem to show more clearly how Molly has always had a good idea of what Bloom is thinking and how he will react, whereas to Bloom her inner world is something of a mystery, although he is aware of her more basic likes and dislikes. This supports the inferred relevance of the cat reference, and to metempsychosis, with Bloom's perceptions shifting from thinking about Molly to thinking about the cat with: She understands what we say better than we understand them. She understands all she wants to' (ibid 54).

This can now be seen to foreshadow how Bloom's incessant reflections and fetishistic fantasies divert his attention away from what is going on around him, whereas Molly is able to focus on real situations and deal with normal emotions by just focusing on what she feels and thinks is important, which in her monologue tend to be such things as family, friends, her past, her future and her happiness. This actually allows her feelings and reflections to be far broader, more encompassing and exciting than Bloom's, which are largely based on books he's read and ideas that he often only partly understands.

So although intermental thought in its strict sense is not found in the depiction of Bloom and Molly's relationship, in itself this is relevant, for it helps to suggest the distance that exists between them. Doubly embedded narratives and embedded narratives, along with action descriptions indicating mental functioning, are instead the norm. These all suggest that they know each other well, but on different levels, with Bloom aware of Molly's basic needs but not understanding her deeper needs and impulses, while she is able to understand him sufficiently to often be able to manipulate him.

Thus, the actions and the represented thought of Bloom and Molly indicate both their emotional divergence and also, through Molly's thoughts, how this is at least temporarily resolved, when both are curled up in bed together so that the physical distance between them has also receded. This interpretation is supported by the Homeric links to Odysseus's return to Ithaca, and Penelope. Using information derived from action indications and doubly embedded narrative in this episode will enable readers to see how these two characters' extended or social minds operate. This is seen in terms of a general lack of intermental thought in what is a long standing relationship, and the way in which their doubly embedded narratives for each other diverge. Fuller embedded narratives for each character as well as how they interact can therefore be developed based on this input, derived from continuing consciousness frames projected into the text for each.

### **3.3 Summary**

In this chapter the three subframes of the continuing consciousness frame, which Palmer suggests form the precursors of the embedded narratives we develop for characters as we read a novel, have been discussed in some detail. Such frames and subframes are triggered by any indication of consciousness within a text, something which I have described as subjective centre point.

These ideas have then been applied as stand alone analytical tools to selected sections of *Ulysses*, with particular focus on the Circe episode and also on how the notions of intermental units and doubly embedded narratives could help clarify the nature of Bloom and Molly's relationship in the novel. As a stand-alone tool, Palmer's approach has been shown to provide some valuable insights about the way in which we understand fictional minds in the novel, in perhaps a subtler way than one obtained by focusing solely on discrete and explicitly subjective elements such as speech and thought presentation in the novel, either in terms of the style used or its content. It provides further information to help understand how readers may track characters and develop opinions about the storyworld these characters inhabit. This foreshadows the

approach that will be taken in Chapter Four, which will deepen the insights provided by Palmer alone by using it in tandem with other stylistic tools, primarily Leech and Short's Speech and Thought Presentation model.

# Chapter Four

## Fictional Minds in Nausicaa: the application of Palmer alongside other approaches to fictional consciousness

---

### 4.1 Introduction

In the preceding chapters, I've explained how Palmer's embedded narratives contain all of a character's perceptual, conceptual and ideological viewpoints, and that these should be considered as sub-narratives embedded within the fictional text. This makes them central to a reader's understanding of what is happening in a novel. The information used to build them comes to readers from the storyworld via the projection of a consciousness frame into the text. This then helps readers to maintain a continued awareness of a character whether or not the text explicitly primes this character into the storyworld at any given point, within what Palmer describes as a continuing consciousness frame for that character. The process of entering the text at any indications of subjective engagement with the fictional world, in order to understand it, is at a point that I describe as subjective centre point.

This consciousness frame is therefore projected into the text at any indication of a character's subjective engagement with the fictional world, via textual indicators of an aspectual viewpoint. It can be triggered by subjectivity markers found in a context where one would expect a conscious engagement to be found, and Palmer's insights have shown that this can come from indications of mental functioning within narration that have often been assumed to be objective. This idea is further developed in terms of a thought-action continuum in which some indications are more action-based while other clearly indicate mental functioning. Indications of mental functioning can also be found within an intermental viewpoint shared by two or more characters and within characters' assessment of other characters' mental worlds, termed doubly embedded narratives by Palmer.

Within this paradigm, it is suggested that an objective narrator is central in linking all these facets of character into the storyworld, but in *Ulysses* the narrator frequently fails either to explicitly link characters' consciousnesses, or to show how these tie into either an episode or to the novel as a whole. As the novel progresses the narrator also betrays an increasingly subjective viewpoint towards the characters. This is demonstrated in the Nausicaa episode, for instance, where viewpoints frequently bleed into one another, with some subjectively mediated information regarding Gerty often at odds with other representations of this. This will require that readers draw inferences based on all the contrastive positions in order to understand the most relevant 'point', both about individual presentations of fictional consciousness, and also about how these relate to the storyworld as a whole. These, at times irreconcilable, viewpoints can be seen as representing different facets of Gerty's psyche and the contrasting content can be seen as mirroring each other, dialogically extending and deepening readers' understanding of a character.

In this chapter, viewpoint in the Nausicaa episode will first be examined in some linguistic detail, and Palmer's ideas relating to continuing consciousness frames and embedded narratives will be explicitly related to the points developed in this analysis, in order to show how this 'whole minds' approach can extend our textual understanding of what is happening in the episode. As I will show in the analyses of this chapter, this is especially true if Palmer's ideas are applied in tandem with other approaches to fictional viewpoint.

#### **4.2 Gerty MacDowell and Bloom in Nausicaa**

The Nausicaa episode is set on the beach at Sandymount Bay, where, in the Proteus episode, Stephen Dedalus had walked earlier that day. It opens with three girl-friends, Cissy Caffrey, Edy Boardman and the initially unnamed Gerty MacDowell sitting on rocks by the beach. Cissy and Edy attentively look after Cissy's young, twin brothers, Tommy and Jacky Caffrey, and a baby, while Gerty, when introduced, is 'lost in thought, gazing far away into the distance' (Joyce, 1993: 333). From this point on we are given what appears to be a close-up view of her inner world. This includes her recasting Bloom into a romantic hero in one of the romance novels that she loves to read, as he watches her and masturbates. As she leaves the beach, following her friends back home, we discover that she is crippled, and the episode ends with a shift back into Bloom's consciousness in which his perceptions are shown to be in marked contrast to the

inferences that both Gerty and apparently the narrator, had drawn regarding his actions and intentions.

Many commentators (e.g. Kenner, 1978; Lawrence, 1981; Benstock and Benstock, 1982; Stanzel, 1984) have noted a parodic effect in the episode, generated by using a sophisticated narrator to present Gerty's unsophisticated and naïve perceptions. Yet the narration is not consistent; at times we hear a voice representing traditional Dublin values, at others the language of romance novels or popular magazines, while at others still it appears to be sympathetically aligned with Gerty. Lawrence has argued that in *Nausicaa* Joyce simply parodies Gerty's 'sentimental mind by parodying the second-rate fiction that has nurtured it' (1981: 120). In general terms, I would agree with this; Gerty's mind can be seen as having been influenced by the discourses and accompanying ideologies contained in such fiction, but the presentation of Gerty's character also appears more subtle and multifaceted than this comment might suggest. Senn has argued that the techniques employed in the episode are complex and that '[n]ot even the style of Gerty's half is as monotonous or uniform as critics have assumed' (Senn, 1977: 305) while Cohn (1978: 121) describes the narrative as 'infected' to such a degree by Gerty MacDowell's idiom that it becomes difficult to differentiate between her viewpoint and the narrator's, the sole common denominator being a sentimental, kitsch viewpoint on the world.

In this thesis, it is in situated mental functioning and how this is tracked that we are interested. Although the objective narrative can perform a linking function in situating this information about fictional minds within the main storyworld, the narrative of *Ulysses* is increasingly seen, after the first six chapters, as intrusive and subjective. The viewpoint of the narrator becomes simply another fictional mind with its content no more valid or trustworthy in terms of linking character viewpoint into the storyworld; it just provides yet another contrastive viewpoint to further splinter and refract all others. There is no reason, it would seem, to privilege the narratorial position, and talk of it being infected or otherwise. It is one viewpoint onto the fictional world among many, all of which at times overlap and even bleed into one another. It is the overall effect of these many outlooks and ways of seeing and describing the world that help to 'flesh-out' and develop the characters, and deepen readers' understanding of their position within the storyworld as a whole.

Irony is one effect of the interplay of viewpoints expressed by the narrator and the characters. At times this is quite clear cut; at others the close interweaving of equally valid but contrastive viewpoints means that it is less so. Although the narrative position is at times subtly differentiated from the main character, it also, at times, makes use of her

idiom to show contrastive facets of her world-view. This demonstrates, for instance, the gulf between Gerty's basic nature and how she would like to be perceived, with the narrative using excessively complimentary hyperbole to support an ironic interpretation. This is not consistent throughout the episode, however, with such ambiguity adding further to the complexity involved in drawing a single, clear-cut picture of Gerty, or, to use Palmer's terms, in developing a clear-cut embedded narrative for her.

In order to assess the multiple viewpoints of Nausicaa using a traditional narratological/stylistic tool, Leech and Short's (1981) model for speech and thought presentation will first be used to describe the speech and thought of the characters and how these interweave with the narrative viewpoint. The boundaries between the modes will be seen to be fuzzy, with viewpoints at times hard to differentiate and slipping occurring between them, which foreshadows how the 'whole mind' approach of Palmer that follows in section 4.4 is able to extend the insights afforded by application of the speech categories alone.

### **4.3 The Interplay of Narrative and Speech and Thought Presentation**

Senn describes Nausicaa as a 'close-up of Gerty's mind' (Senn, 1977: 305), and it contains the first sustained focus on a female consciousness in the novel. It is carried out in an idiosyncratically punctuated, form, typical for thought representation in *Ulysses*. More generally, though, FDT is used (an extreme example being Molly's soliloquy), but in Nausicaa it is represented largely in FIT e.g. 'She knew right well, no-one better, what made squinty Edy say that because of him cooling in his attentions when it was simply a lovers' quarrel' (Joyce, 1993 454). In terms of Leech and Short's proposed cline of narratorial control, as discussed in Chapter Two, Gerty's thoughts will appear more controlled, therefore, by the guiding hand of the narrator than Bloom's, Stephen's and Molly's, all of which are generally afforded the freedom of FDT e.g. Bloom in the same episode, 'Did me good all the same. Off colour after Kiernan's, Dignam's. For this relief much thanks.' (ibid 485).

In Nausicaa the technique of FIT is able to present clashing ideological stances towards the same situation, whether Gerty's romanticised perceptions of Bloom's sexual act or the worth of traditional values versus romantic dreams of escape. Hence, it creates an ironic effect based on 'a double significance which arises from the contrast in values associated with two different points of view' (Leech and Short, 1981: 278). This is the essence of the refractive mirror generated within a dialogic approach to characterisation, found throughout *Ulysses*.



Since FIT is presented primarily from the deictic orientation of the narrator, and does not claim to be a faithful account of the thoughts of the character, this means that the character's presented thoughts can easily be juxtaposed with starkly contrastive ones that represent a differing viewpoint on, or a contrastive facet of, Gerty's own point of view. The subjective content of the narration will trigger a conscious engagement, and this subjective mediation is easily able to show a different take on what Gerty has previously been shown to be thinking or feeling at any given point. There does appear to be a pronounced inconsistency between the shallow and sentimental view of the world expressed by the narrator and the reality of Gerty's fictional world, both in terms of her actions and the content of her FIT. This also holds true for the doubly embedded narrative Bloom develops for Gerty and Gerty for Bloom, presumably leaving readers unsure over which, if any, of these viewpoints is the most reliable, in the process deepening and extending readers' understanding of the characters.

The narrator consistently sets up descriptions overstating Gerty's attributes, creating an ironic effect, subtly enhanced through the lexical choices made; these hyperbolic descriptions of Gerty are then contrasted with the content of her FIT. In extract **1**, Gerty is introduced with a question, setting up the expectation that a detailed description will follow. The narrator confidently sets out to answer this, yet there is a pronounced sense of things implied but left unsaid, and as was seen in Chapter Two, there is marked subjectivity evident within the narrative position from the outset.

**1. i) But who was Gerty?**

**ii)** Gerty MacDowell who was seated near her companions, lost in thought, gazing away into the distance was in very truth as fair a specimen of winsome Irish girlhood as one could wish to see. **iii)** She was pronounced beautiful by all who knew her though, as folks often said, she was more a Giltrap than a MacDowell. **iv)** Her figure was slight and graceful, inclining even to fragility but those iron jelloids she had been taking of late had done her a world of good much better than the Widow Welch's female pills and she was much better of those discharges she used to get and that tired feeling.

(Joyce, 1993: 333)

The narrative reads like the overblown descriptions found in romance literature and not how people would really, and believably, be described. This inference is strengthened

when in sentence **iii)** we find ‘though [. . .] she was more a Giltrap’ after the description of Gerty as being ‘pronounced beautiful’. Concessive ‘though’ here suggests that being a Giltrap is perhaps not something wholly to be desired, introducing another point of view that contrasts with what has previously been asserted or implied. Also in **iii)** ‘All who knew her’ and ‘folks’ are examples of what Palmer would call small intermental units expressing the shared viewpoint of a group, with the first of these contrasted with the content of the second.

There appears to be a more obvious shift towards Gerty’s viewpoint, using FIT along with markers of subjectivity, with ‘but those iron jelloids she had been taking of late’ in sentence **iv)** that employs the progressive aspect to describe Gerty’s actions as she might remember them herself. This interpretation finds support in the use of distal deixis in the demonstrative pronouns originating from Gerty’s viewpoint—‘*those* iron jelloids’, ‘*those* discharges’ and ‘*that* tired feeling’ and the presence of subjective judgements.

As with concessive ‘though’ in the preceding sentence, the use of adversative ‘but’ here gives the impression that what follows contrasts with what has just been presented. The lack of punctuation gives the impression of an instant, defensive retort to the use of ‘inclining even to fragility’, as if the narrative is representing both Gerty’s awareness of her perceived flaws and also how she is trying to gloss over them; in so doing the narrative position perhaps increases our focus on these flaws that are then highlighted further within Gerty’s FIT. Hence, they seem to be in stark contrast to the overblown ‘romance’ descriptions of her first introduction.

This effect can again be seen in extract **2**, which shifts from external narration to a short section of Gerty’s FIT in sentence **ii)** beginning with the idiomatic ‘the very it’.

**2. i)** She wore a coquettish little love of a hat of wideleaved nigger straw contrast trimmed with an underbrim of eggblue chenille and at the side a butterfly bow to tone. **ii)** All Tuesday week afternoon she was hunting to match that chenille but at last she found what she wanted at Clery’s summer sales, the very it, slightly shopsoiled but you would never notice, seven fingers two and a penny. **iii)** She did it up all by herself and what joy was hers when she tried it on then, smiling at the lovely reflection which the mirror gave back to her!

(ibid 335)

The hyperbole and precious tone adopted in sentence **i**) is quite different to Gerty's idiom seen in sentence **ii**). This employs a syntactic structure more akin to that of speech alongside colloquialisms such as 'the very it' and 'seven fingers two and a penny'. Sentence **ii**) is increasingly reflected through Gerty's consciousness before her FIT appears, with 'hunting' here an example of what Palmer calls contextual thought report (Palmer, 2004: 210). This is part of the thought-action subframe and describes how a single word can be important for characterisation even though it is contained within a narrative report of action. Here, the contrast seems to show the gap between Gerty's fashion-conscious descriptions of the clothes, as might be found in the magazines she reads, and the real-world effort she went into in tracking them down.

Likewise the subjective proximal deixis in 'All Tuesday week afternoon', 'that chenille' and 'at last' gives the impression that some of Gerty's perceptions are found within the narrative report; we are given a sense of Gerty's focused search and the importance she places on getting her outfit right. There seems to be a gradation here, from a wholly external point of view to a glimpse of Gerty's viewpoint, with the reader perhaps unsure whether they are receiving Gerty or the narrator's impressions at any given point. This is then followed by a clear shift into Gerty's point of view, which tends to align narrator and character viewpoint, making hers the primary perceptual focus. This reinforces the fact that what we are being given throughout, despite the at times contrastive lexis, style and attitudes shown, is a picture of Gerty that shows potentially all of the complex and varied facets of her personality.

For instance, the idealised narrative tone, describing effortless grace in sentence **i**) is subtly contrasted by the shift in focus towards the conscious efforts Gerty has taken to look like this. This continues in sentence **ii**) by Gerty's FIT in which we hear that the bow is 'slightly shopsoiled'. It is perfectly reasonable that the bow would be shopsoiled, but this does contrast with the overblown input seen in **i**) that has set up too high an expectation for Gerty, like the images and descriptions found in the magazines she devours. In sentence **iii**) we move into narrative reflected through Gerty's consciousness using the child-like 'She did it up all by herself' which contrasts with the use of 'coquettish' in sentence **i**). Overall we get the impression that Gerty goes to great lengths to look the way she does, and that looking good is one of her great pleasures, but that this pleasure is perhaps rather more down to earth and falls short of the idealised, yet rather naïve expectations of her generated by the adverts and discourses of romance to which she is exposed.

There is a regular progression from seemingly external narration that captures other, often contrastive viewpoints, towards the presentation of an internal state and then back to external narration, as seen in the following extract. This continues from extract 1, beginning with a shift from Gerty's FIT back to external narration.

**3. i)** The waxen pallor of her face was almost spiritual in its ivory purity though her rosebud mouth was a genuine cupid's bow, Greekly perfect. **ii)** Her hands were of finely veined alabaster with tapering fingers and as white as lemon juice and queen of ointments could make them though it was not true she used to wear kid gloves in bed or take a milk footbath either. **iii)** Bertha Supple told that once to Edy Boardman, a deliberate lie, when she was black out at daggers drawn with Gerty (the girl chums did of course have their little tiffs from time to time like the rest of mortals) and she told her not let on whatever she did that it was her that told her or she'd never speak to her again. **iv)** No. **v)** Honour where honour is due. **vi)** There was an innate refinement, a languid queenly hauteur about Gerty which was unmistakably evidenced in her delicate hands and higharched instep.

(Joyce, 1993: 333)

An ironic effect is developed from the outset by the narrator's hyperbolic description of Gerty as 'almost spiritual', contrasted with the unhealthy sounding 'waxen pallor'. This is followed by concessive 'though' introducing the prissy yet sexualised description of Gerty's mouth and lips. Although unaware of Bloom's presence at this point, this reference may trigger a reader's stored frame or schema for him, recalling his visit to the museum to ogle the naked statues of Greek goddesses. It might also perhaps trigger a sense that Bloom's fantasies constitute yet another point of view to be found within the narrative viewpoint, an idea that will be returned to below.

This irony continues in **ii)** with the juxtaposition of 'Her hands were of finely veined alabaster [. . .] as white as lemon juice and queen of ointments could make them'. Overblown, idealised descriptions such as those found in romance literature are here juxtaposed with the language of advertising, aimed at selling products on the basis of attaining such unattainable ideals, indicating the lengths that Gerty goes to in order to improve her appearance. As well as its links to Greek statues, this might also hint at a certain sickliness in Gerty.

Halfway through sentence ii) we move into Gerty's FIT, with the standard written syntax and precious lexical choices of the narrator disappearing. Again concessive 'though' is used to introduce this, followed by a pronounced loss of punctuation and a syntactic structure more reminiscent of speech. This includes the multiple embedding of clauses such as 'and she told her not let on whatever she did that it was her that told her or she'd never speak to her again', subjective lexis such as the externally evaluative 'a deliberate lie' and colloquialisms such as 'black out with daggers drawn'. It reads as a retort to the viewpoint expressed from the more external, narrative position, that have been touching on the means—lemon juice and queen of ointments—through which she achieves her pale skin, and readers may further infer that she is here making a virtue out of necessity; the earlier reference to iron jelloids suggesting she is pale because she is anaemic. Gerty protests that she does not go as far as some think in trying to improve her appearance, and in so doing may well increase the impression that she does. All the time, it is apparent that Gerty is a complex individual, her psyche made up of her aspects of her situation, her conflicts, the ideologies to which she has been exposed, her desire for decorum and a tendency to behave indecorously; all these facets of her personality are shown to interweave and vie with each other within her thoughts, with none ever achieving dominance.

A reading that sees the gap between aspects of the idealised, naïve descriptions of Gerty, as might be seen in romance literature, and the representations of her more earthy, or day-to-day, thoughts and feelings will be further heightened for those readers whose internal encyclopaedias contain an awareness of the relevant Homeric parallel. As has been discussed, readers' internal encyclopaedias contain all of their world knowledge, which they might potentially bring to bear on comprehending the book, and they will use relevant elements of this to develop a fictional encyclopaedia for the text in hand. The relevant knowledge here would be that Nausicaa was the King of Phaeacia's daughter whom Ulysses saw as Goddess-like and pure, although she was secretly eager for Ulysses to remain in her father's kingdom and to marry her. So while Ulysses saw Nausicaa as an idealised paragon of abstracted and highly spiritual feminine values, her desires were actually a good deal more pragmatic and earthy.

This knowledge will help readers to link elements of the text with Homer's tale in order to assess which interpretation is most relevant. Certainly, one element that is being parodied, through paralleling the viewpoint in the episode that is most abstracted and idealised, with Ulysses' misconceptions, are the unreal discourses of femininity expressed via romance novels and women's magazines, which at the time that *Ulysses* was written

were most likely to come from a male perspective. Bloom himself is an advertising canvasser, so this adds credence to the idea that some of the viewpoints expressed within the narrative regarding Gerty may be a product of Bloom's own fantasies, as Joyce himself is on record as suggesting with 'Nothing happened between them. [. . .] It all took place in Bloom's imagination; (Power, A, 2000: 32). Gerty also seems to reflect on the 'Halcyon Days' in her FIT, and this reference later reappears solely within the representation of Bloom's internalised fantasies in Circe.

In sentence **iii)** the narrative input interrupts Gerty's FIT, adding to the complexity of a section that also contains embedded NRTAP and FIS, to express the view that such 'tiffs' are perfectly normal, although they are in marked contrast to the idealised descriptions of Gerty previously given. This kind of parenthesised narration occurs frequently in the early part of the episode, largely when Gerty's reflections might suggest that she is surly or argumentative, while a more idealised view of her-one that conforms to the idealising discourses to which she has been exposed-makes apologies for her behaviour or feelings in terms of such discourses. It is also used to lend support to complementary descriptions, such as 'Her shoes were the newest thing in footwear (Edy Boardman prided herself that she was very *petite* but she never had a foot like Gerty MacDowell [. . .])' (Joyce, 1993: 335). Again, by pre-empting a reader's possible reactions through overstatement, the representations of her psyche within the narrative seems to highlight the disparity between her attributes or behaviour and the ideals to which she feels compelled to aspire. By not making the disparity explicit this obscures which of these stances to take, and so leads readers to draw inferences from the refracted interplay of both, rather than privileging either.

The narrative returns in **iv)** and **v)** with 'No. Honour where honour is due', creating a sense of this being an ongoing dialogue between discourses, each representing different ideological viewpoints. The continuation of this in **vi)** gives the impression of Gerty attempting to stay focused on this idealised description against the undermining counter-current of reality. It redirects us to an external assessment of Gerty, as do the parenthesised 'asides'; both give the impression of someone trying to positively influence how Gerty is seen while also questioning how accurate this impression actually is. There is always an ideology at play when a narrator reports or evaluates a story, but in *Nausicaa* it is not obvious what this ideology is; instead a complex, heteroglossic interplay of potential ideological stances is generated through the complex dialogic nature of the writing.

The juxtaposition of such descriptions with FIT will increase the ironic effect generated by the gulf between these descriptions and Gerty's reality, which clearly does not reflect 'an innate refinement, a languid queenly hauteur'. Derisory comments about her companions and female cyclists 'showing off what they do not have' (ibid 342) contrast starkly with the 'innate refinement' (ibid) that the external narration describes her as possessing, while the final focus on her 'delicate hands' and 'arched instep' is on features that have been brought out by hard work on her part—in the case of her hands—and the purchase of a particular pair of shoes for her feet. This hardly supports the assertion that she has 'innate refinement'. Both are things she has focused on to give herself a greater sense of self-belief, and one modelled on the ideologies contained in advertising, magazines and romance writing. Her 'languid, queenly hauteur' is an aspiration that the discourse presents ironically by suggesting she has such virtues and then undermining this; the veracity of either viewpoint is then undermined when, within Bloom's FDT, we later discover that she is lame.

The values of Gerty's community are also exposed and questioned in the episode, by overstating the worth of the attitudes that would have her slaving in the house, while at the same time exposing the clash of these with her real desires.

4. A sterling good daughter was Gerty just like a second mother in the house, a ministering angel too with a little heart worth its weight in gold. And when her mother had those raging splitting headaches who was it rubbed on the menthol cone on her forehead but Gerty though she didn't like her mother taking pinches of snuff and that was the only thing they ever had words about, taking snuff. Everyone thought the world of her for her gentle ways.

(ibid 339)

The narrator, through the use of colloquial lexis such as 'a sterling good daughter' and 'a ministering angel' adopts a tone presumably reminiscent of older members of Gerty's social group in order to present how Gerty is exploited by her family, who perhaps don't consider it likely that she will marry. Against such assessments, constituting the discourses of her community, Gerty's fantasies of a dreamhusband therefore form a silent rebellion. Again, through the dialogic refraction of contrasting discourses, a fuller picture can be achieved.

The use of 'Everyone' in the final sentence supports this interpretation; that this constitutes an intermental viewpoint, one that represents the voice of tradition and further elements of the socially constructed facets of Gerty's identity. This in turn is at odds with other aspects of her identity, as is seen in her represented thought. For instance, it runs counter to Gerty's romantic fantasies of escape in which she will be 'wild, untrammelled, free' (ibid 337). This would suggest that it is the pressure of these traditional expectations that in part helps push her towards believing the false promises contained within romance novels and advertising.

The clash between different facets of Gerty's personality can be seen in extract 5, in which there is a shift from IT shifting into FIT in sentence i), then into narrative in sentence ii) that captures Gerty's point of view in the evaluative '*exasperating* little brats', reminiscent of Gerty's earlier thoughts about the twins. It then shifts back into Gerty's FIT in iii).

5. i) [S]he thought and thought could she work a ruched tea cosy with embroidered floral design for him as a present or a clock but they had a clock she noticed [. . .] the day she went there about the flowers for the forty hours' adoration because it was hard to know what sort of a present to give or perhaps an album of illuminated views of Dublin or some place.

ii) The exasperating little brats of twins began to quarrel again and Jacky threw the ball out towards the sea and they both ran after it. iii) Little monkeys common as ditchwater. Someone ought to take them out and give them a good hiding from themselves to keep them in their places, the both of them

(ibid 343)

The aspectual perspective of the narrator who tells the story and the character who sees it, to use a traditional definition of focalised narrative, are extremely close here, and combine with an interweaving of at times contrary and at others complimentary viewpoints. The narration is unstable, shifting with Gerty's own shifts in perception rather than providing an integrated and consistent viewpoint, explicitly linking her thoughts into the scene. Often the narration appears to apologise for, or explain away, something she has thought about or done, in a manner that she might want to herself; supporting the idea that it is simply one way among many of representing Gerty's own psyche.



Stanzel, among others, has suggested (1984: 192-3) that the narrative of *Ulysses* is ‘contaminated’ by the idiom of the characters. It seems that tension is created through the intrusion of multiple and contrastive points of view within the narrative, representing varied facets of Gerty’s own psyche, which also capture the varied viewpoints and discourses to which she has been exposed, rather than a simple one way contamination of the narrative viewpoint by Gerty’s own. The idea of ‘contamination’ perhaps reflects a stance that affords too much primacy to the narrative position, while ignoring the many indications of mental functioning expressed within this. This was my contention when earlier work on *Ulysses* was discussed in Chapter Two, and as this study will show, much subtler and, in my view, more accurate analyses can be achieved by taking a fuller, more holistic approach to potentially all indications of consciousness in the text rather than modelling elements of the discourse around clearly defined modes and paradigms. Anything that can be seen as subjective centre point will trigger understanding in terms of a consciousness frame, which is then sustained for that character within a continuing consciousness frame that will provide information for the embedded narrative that is developed for them.

Gerty’s FIT reveries are broken by ‘the pealing anthem of the organ’ from a Catholic temperance service, the narrator shifts to a floating position, able to see in detail the events in the service, while Gerty can only hear it. This sudden spatial shift may be distracting to the reader, disrupting the steady progression of events and with any explicit relevance it may have left unexplained by the narrator, especially as the external narration shifts into Gerty’s subjective viewpoint at several points within the same sentence. In the following example the two styles are co-ordinated using ‘and’ adding to the subtlety of the shift for the reader as one would not normally expect two such different points of view to be found in co-ordinated clauses within the same sentence:

6. Father Conroy got up and settled it all right and she could see the gentleman winding his watch and listening to the works and she swung her leg more in and out in time.

(Joyce, 1993: 345)

Extract 7 provides an even more complex example of shifting points of view:

7. i) [. . .]Father Conroy handed the thurible to Canon O’Hanlon and he put in the incense and censed the blessed sacrament and Cissy Caffrey caught

the two twins and // **ii**) she was itching to give them a ringing good clip on the ear but she didn't because she thought he might be watching but // **iii**) she never made a bigger mistake in all her life because Gerty could see without looking that he never took his eyes off her and // **iv**) then Canon O'Hanlon handed the thurible back to Father Conroy [. . .]

(ibid 344)

The shifts have been marked up in the above example; again these all occur in co-ordinated clauses within a single sentence. It starts with external narration, with a series of co-ordinated clauses describing the service, then another describing the scene on the beach followed by a shift to a subjective viewpoint with Cissy's NI and FIT in **ii**). The narrative then returns with 'she didn't' followed by Cissy's IT. In **iii**) there is a shift back into narrative that also seems aligned with Gerty's viewpoint, contained in the NRTAP that follows ('see' here does not represent visual perception but Gerty's impression, guessed at 'without looking').

The analysis of the opening clause of **iii**) as the narrative aligned with Gerty's viewpoint is more convincing than analysing it simply as Gerty's viewpoint, despite the fact it seem to express this, since only the omniscient narrator is aware of Cissy's desire to clip the children's ears and the fact that she has restrained herself because she thinks Bloom might be watching. This is supported by the fact that the final 'her' in **iii**) must relate to Gerty. As in the case of 'he' in **ii**) this represents a shift in viewpoint, since these pronouns would generally be understood as relating anaphorically to Canon O'Hanlon and Cissy respectively, and not to Bloom and Gerty as they actually do. Finally we shift back into objectively narrated description of the service in **iv**).

This shift in viewpoint and registers within neatly co-ordinated clauses in a single sentence, with Gerty's contrastive spatial and ideological reflections breaking up a single narrative clause that describes the Catholic service make for a complex reading process. If the main narrative clause is looked at alone, giving: 'Father Conroy handed the thurible to Canon O'Hanlon and he put in the incense and censed the blessed sacrament and [. . .] then Canon O'Hanlon handed the thurible back to Father Conroy [. . .]', it also appears very mundane, showing the gulf between neatly ordered and constrained ritual and the energy of day-to-day life seen in the richness imbued by the subjective elements that break up the clause.

Similar shifts occur throughout the text, with Gerty's earthy apprehensions embedded within dull, objective narrative descriptions of the service in which the

‘spiritualised ‘body of Christ’ is given, as opposed to Gerty’s physical giving of her body (at least visually) to Bloom. There is also a section that can be placed solely in Gerty’s consciousness. In this she is imagining what is going on in the service and this subjective presentation provides a more vibrant and animated version of events than that given by the narrator.

It opens with ‘Gerty could picture the whole scene in the church, the stained glass windows lighted up, the candles, the flowers [. . .]’ (ibid 342). Her imaginary descriptions of the service focus on a visual description of the participants, their clothes, the music and the superficial process of the service, reflecting her own viewpoint on the world, with no sense of either the deep attraction or revulsion seen in Stephen Dedalus’s reactions to Catholicism in *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, for instance. Indeed, she appears to take the Catholic faith very lightly and is perfectly prepared to ignore its proscriptions if these run counter to her own urges since ‘love laughs at locksmiths’ (ibid 337).

The modal auxiliary ‘will’, backshifted to ‘would’ to fit the temporal deictic parameters of the narrator, is frequently found in Gerty’s FIT where it seems expressive of her unrealistic hopes and dreams for the future. The quantity of this increases markedly once Gerty becomes aware of Bloom and begins to fantasise about him.

8. Would the day ever come when she could call herself his little wife to be.

(ibid 336)

9. Then they could talk about her till they went blue in the face [. . .] She would care for him with creature comforts too [. . .]

(ibid 337)

Central to her expectations for the future is the vision of a ‘dreamhusband’ whom she will blindly follow, with such ‘dreams’ not expressed as vague desires but as a fundamental part of her reality, as seen in the following example.

10. She would follow, her dream of love, the dictates of her heart that told her he was her all in all, the only man in the world for her to love was the master guide. Nothing else mattered. Come what might she would be wild, untrammelled, free.

(ibid)

This creates a tension between what Gerty thinks she will do when what she is sure will happen does happen, that is, when she finds her ‘dreamhusband’, when all the evidence found in the episode suggests that this is unlikely ever to happen. The irony conveyed in the closing clause of extract **10** is especially stark; we can see that Gerty is unlikely to ever be any of those things, and is here seeing reality in an exaggerated way that now appears to match the hyperbolic commentary of the narrative.

The ironic distance between viewpoints is made more explicit through Bloom’s impressions expressed in FDT. These show much of the content of the narrative to have been unreliable and to have misrepresented what has been going on. The last impression we have of Gerty is that she feels love for Bloom—or at least love for the vision of him she has conjured up via the language of the controlling discourses of her life—and is close to tears as she limps away. This is the view we receive as mediated by the narrative and it persists until we enter Bloom’s consciousness, when we become aware that much of what has been presented is false, at least as regards Bloom’s motivations and thoughts, so it must also raise the question: how accurate were they regarding Gerty?

The narrative, for instance, describes Gerty’s ‘young, guileless eyes’ (ibid 350), yet we already know that she is regularly thinking up stratagems to attract a man or to upstage her friends. Fludernik has suggested that Bloom’s FDT now ‘serves to unmask the lies spawned by the clichés in the first part of the episode’ (Fludernik, 1986a: 33). This is perhaps the case, but it also seems that these clichés are just one facet of Gerty’s inner world, and, as we have seen, these are often refracted by contrastive elements that reflect other aspects of her psyche.

Demarcation between the narrator and Gerty’s viewpoint is shown at times, however, for instance when the narrative states that ‘a bat flew forth’ (ibid 347) while Gerty’s FIT reflects that ‘something queer was flying about through the air, a soft thing to and fro, dark’ (Joyce, 1993: 349). But the narrative then shifts to seemingly report Gerty’s thoughts with ‘Should a girl tell? No, a thousand times no. That was their secret, only theirs [. . .]’ (ibid 350), moving on to talk of only the bat knowing what had gone on ‘and little bats don’t tell’ (ibid). We know that Gerty is unaware that it is a bat that is flying about, so these reflections are perhaps not Gerty’s but expressive of the viewpoint of the narrator, or perhaps of Bloom, who is also shown to be aware that it is a bat.

The narration describing Bloom and Gerty’s final exchange of looks, expressive of Gerty’s doubly-embedded narrative for how she imagines Bloom to feel, describes how ‘Their souls met in a last lingering glance and the eyes that reached her heart, full of a strange shining, hung enraptured on her sweet flowerlike face’ (ibid 351). This filtering of

the situation through the language of romance literature appears particularly ridiculous and comedic in the light of Bloom's thoughts that follow.

11. Hot little devil all the same. Wouldn't mind. Curiosity like a nun or a negress or a girl with glasses.

(ibid 351)

12. Still you have got to get rid of it someway. They don't care. Complimented perhaps.

(ibid)

A question posed by Palmer is apposite here: 'Where is [. . .] identity situated, in [a person's] own views about [him/her]self or in the views of others?' (Palmer, 2004: 168). Palmer suggests that first-person eyewitness accounts are seen as more trustworthy than third-person narratives. This would suggest that Bloom's first person account will be seen as more trustworthy when reached than the preceding narrativised account of Gerty's world view. The glib and idealised, third person presentation of romantic impulses that are wholly inadequate to express the complexity of real sexual feeling is explicitly undermined through Bloom's trustworthy FDT. It provides yet another dialogic mirror to all the other discourses and ideologies that populate Nausicaa.

In this episode, textual features suggest a divergence of viewpoints at least as much as they are seen to converge and overlap, and it seems that perhaps Joyce was aware of and manipulating this expectation and its affects in order to initially create the impression of alignment between the viewpoint of Gerty and of the narrator. This would demonstrate, finally, the input of the latter, expressive of advertising and romance writing, to be both misleading and manipulative. It also captures the tension between deeper, earthier feelings, dealing with reality, escapism and imposed expectations and images, and how psyches can be both manipulated and limited by a combination of any of these. It shows the struggle to assess who a person really 'is' through all the discourses and experiences that are expressed through them, and yet do not, finally, describe them.

Discovering that she is crippled is the final irony that can be attributed to the clash of the idealised discourses contained in the narrative and the reality of her life, prior to any further reinterpretation of the episode based on Bloom's thoughts. This is something that the narrator seems to find hard to express, tailing off into 'because, because, Gerty MacDowell was . . . .' (Joyce, 1993: 351) before Bloom's FDT takes over: 'Tight boots?

No. She's lame! O!' (ibid). That Gerty is lame has only been touched on previously in Gerty's FIT, with 'but for that one shortcoming she knew she need fear no competition and that was an accident coming down Dalkey hill and she always tried to conceal it' (ibid 348). Gerty must struggle to reconcile a crippled heroine with the romanticised viewpoint seen within the narrative. She cannot be 'cured' by the products advertised in magazines and will never fit the idealised heroine of romance literature, diminishing her worth within the discourses that she employs to frame her own life.

As we have seen, during the course of the episode there is a good deal of subjectivity to be found within narrative descriptions, which will feed into consciousness frames for the characters. This at times does unexpected things that are hard to attribute to any character; for instance, prior to Bloom being named, it seems to have been misrepresenting his thoughts. Bloom is talked of by the narrator as though presenting his own thoughts with 'a brute. At it again?' (ibid) and 'An utter cad he had been. He of all men!' (ibid); he seems to be being judged by the standards of an idealised, romantic hero. Based on Bloom's character as it has been presented throughout the novel to this point, however, and his preoccupation with all things sexual, his behaviour isn't at all out of character. The shame is clearly something that he does not feel himself, and this is confirmed by his subsequent FDT, as seen in extracts **11** and **12**. This seems to support the idea that it is our assessment of the first person presentation of others' thoughts that provides the most trustworthy assessments of his or her personality. That said, this does open up the possibility that Bloom, on some level, aspires to be less obsessed with base actions and ideas, and feels some suppressed shame at his behaviour. This perhaps foreshadows his later trial, during his sustained hallucination in Circe, when he imagines himself tried for lascivious behaviour according to the mores of the day in front of a host of characters previously encountered in the novel (including Gerty, reappearing as a prostitute).

The apparent shame also appears to represent a consensus, intermental viewpoint of the residents of Dublin, later to be made explicit in Circe; it is how others feel he *should* feel. This is something that he must be aware of, yet actively resists. It does, however, make up one further discourse to which he is exposed and which, therefore, has some bearing on his identity. As Palmer suggests, this 'situated identity' is still highly relevant to our complete identity. Once we have entered Bloom's consciousness and discovered that he feels no obvious shame at his actions, an ironic take on the consensus viewpoint expressed by the narrator is made possible, as readers assess the earlier perception of others' thoughts and motivations to be mostly, or perhaps wholly, false.

This seems to represent an ideological viewpoint that manipulates, while concomitantly glossing over, basic human impulses; it also reflects, among others, the discourses of advertising. It could be seen that the language of these discourses condones these impulses in terms acceptable to the majority, while condemning Bloom who follows such impulses without the need to couch them in twee, distancing terms. Yet these opinions must also affect Bloom's represented identity, and thus the embedded narrative readers will develop for him, and this is seen again and more clearly later, in the hallucinations of Circe. So again we see that by focusing on any indication of a subjective engagement with the storyworld, a fuller understanding of the complex and never fully reconcilable range of discourses that influence the characters can be developed.

In the section that follows, Palmer's ideas are incorporated more fully into this analysis via an examination of the clash between Gerty's McDowell's aspirations and dreams, seen in the embedded narrative she has constructed for herself, and the reality of her life, more fully seen in the embedded narrative that a reader will be able to construct for her using a wider range of information and inferences drawn from the diverse range of discourses represented in this episode. This approach shows how she consistently construes real events to attempts to match them to her own embedded narrative, however far removed from the reality of the original events this might be.

#### **4.4 Continuing Consciousness Frames in Nausicaa**

In Nausicaa, various contrastive descriptions of Gerty's actions, and how she appears to respond to Bloom's gaze, and also her thoughts about him in terms of a long-term goal of marriage to a 'dreamhusband', have been seen. I have argued that it is through attempting to reconcile these contrasts that a richer image of the character is created. Palmer would describe elements of these contrasts as clashes between the microstructural level that describes immediate thoughts, feelings and actions, and the macrostructural level that describes long term plans and goals. Here, the long-term goal appears to be fantasy based on the discourses Gerty uses for escapism, primarily focused on marriage to a 'dreamhusband', one who matches the description of a romantic hero. These certainly do not gel with the more immediate elements that are seen in the episode. We also encounter Bloom's persistent fantasies, mainly sexual, throughout the novel, which seem to take place at the level of immediate gratification, with little in the way of long-term goals and plans expressed. An inference can be drawn, however, in order to interpret these macrostructurally, in Palmer's terms; seeing these as coping strategies to help deal with the distance between him and Molly, and the unresolved pain he feels at the death of their

son eleven years previously as well as his sense of isolation from the other inhabitants of Dublin.

Throughout the episode we are given the impression at times that Gerty is naïve and innocent and ‘led astray’ by Bloom. However, this contrasts with the closing sentence of the episode, which is ‘left hanging’ for the reader to fill in the missing word or words.

13. [. . .] she was as quick as anything about a thing like that, was Gerty MacDowell, and she noticed at once that the foreign gentleman that was sitting on the rocks looking was

*Cuckoo*

*Cuckoo*

*Cuckoo*

(Joyce, 1993: 365)

It is hard to say, ultimately, from which viewpoint much of Gerty’s input comes, but it does appear, based on this, that Gerty may have been fully aware of what she and Bloom were doing but could only allow herself to go along with it as a fantasy based around the discourses of romance literature, to which she clings. This has also been hinted at earlier, primarily by her at times indecorous actions, which clash with the decorous way in which she is at times described, and also by some of her thoughts. Her complex and irreconcilable take on the world, reflecting the complexity of all human life and the human condition, perhaps serves to foreshadow her next appearance in the novel, in *Circe*, where she appears as a prostitute. Admittedly, this is within Bloom’s own fantasy, but it does trigger an engagement with her situation in terms of where lines are drawn and what leads a character to one way of living or another. It is this dialogic complexity at the heart of the novel that enables it to so richly capture character, and the fullness of life’s experiences.

The narrativised version of her reflections on Bloom, for instance, suggest she is appalled by overt sexuality.

14. From everything in the least indelicate her finebred nature instinctively recoiled. She loathed that sort of person [. . .] with no respect for a girl’s honour, degrading the sex [. . .]’

(Joyce, 1993: 348)



This sensibility is somewhat undermined by her behaviour, reflecting a clash between how she feels she should behave and how she is drawn to behave. The inference I have taken from this is that only by expressing her actions through the discourses of romance writing can she condone her own behaviour, in terms of the mores of the society in which she lives. This also enables her to break free of the controlling discourses of Catholicism, which also enter into the episode at times.

Bloom is also well aware of the style of romance writing, which Molly is described as enjoying, and Joyce is on record as having replied, when asked by Arthur Power what really happened between Bloom and Gerty on the beach 'Nothing [. . .] it all took place in Bloom's imagination' (cited in Attridge, 1990: 206). Joyce was famously disingenuous, but this does at least raise the possibility that some of Gerty's thoughts and feelings, and even actions, as presented throughout the episode, capture elements of Bloom's projected fantasy, and that Gerty is naïve and innocent and that it is only Bloom sees her as sexually uninhibited. Again this interpretation could be supported by her later reappearance, within Bloom's hallucination in *Circe*, as a prostitute.

Attridge (1988), for instance, has suggested that the narrative reflects Bloom's need to fantasise over a naïve, emotionally and physically crippled young woman in order to become aroused at the exact time he knows his strong and earthy wife is cuckolding him. Her obsession with advertisements might be a fantasy that reflects Bloom's ability to manipulate through the adverts he writes. I would concur to some degree, as at points throughout *Nausicaa* there is textual evidence to support this position, making Bloom's fantasies just another facet of the narrative that surrounds and attempts to position Gerty (while at the same time undermining any such clear-cut positioning). Finally, all such positions are irreconcilable though, and it is through their dialogic interplay and refraction, one with another, that some pending assessments are generated, and the richness of characterisation achieved.

It is certainly hard to simplistically reconcile a young woman who is presented as exposing herself to a man as he masturbates and who later appears to be well aware of what Bloom was doing from the outset, with the model of gentility that is also at times presented within the narrative. This will of course generate an ironic interpretation. Whether the narrative is seen as innocently portraying Gerty differently to how she actually is, or whether this is a deliberate attempt to parody Gerty, or whether this is simply being used to represent contrastive aspects of her psyche, the effect will be to generate an ironic interpretation of how viewpoints are presented in this episode, with a singular, clear-cut position denied, and any monologic sense of comprehension deferred.

Whether the narrative is seen as originating, to some degree, from a facet of Gerty herself, Bloom or from the discourses of advertising and mass market writing, will determine who is being parodied of course, and the fact that this seems to shift and is impossible to ascertain with any certainty supports the idea that all are being parodied in this episode. All are seen as unreliable in terms of any singular sense of understanding, leaving readers to assess which are the most valid inferences to take from this episode in terms of the storyworld as a whole, using their own encyclopaedic knowledge (Werth, 1999; Palmer 2004) to do so. As has been discussed, such encyclopaedic knowledge is contained in what has been described as internal encyclopaedias that readers will bring to the reading process, which contain potentially all of the information and understanding that they possess. The text will then narrow down the most relevant of this information into one specific for comprehension of the text in hand, described as a fictional encyclopaedia.

When Gerty's thoughts are presented in an unnarrativised direct form these do not tend to chime with the embedded narrative that might be generated if only based on narrative input. This can be clearly seen in the contrast between the narrative description of extract **15** and the free direct thought of **16**.

**15.** There was an innate refinement, a languid queenly *hauteur* about Gerty [. . .] Gerty MacDowell might easily have held her own beside any lady in the land [. . .]

(Joyce, 1993: 333)

**16.** Little monkeys common as ditchwater. Someone ought to take them and give them a good hiding for themselves to keep them in their places, the both of them.

(ibid 343)

As has been seen, the thought-action subframe of the continuing consciousness frame can provide information for readers to help them construct embedded narratives. This is because the words chosen to describe an action indicate, to varying degrees, the thought processes that lie behind it. To reiterate Palmer's own example here, if we say that a group of people 'hid behind a curtain' this gives a good deal more information about the mental processes going on within this group, as well as any associated actions (e.g. here that somebody was also looking for them), than simply saying that they 'stood

behind a curtain', at the very least a sense of intent. In Palmer's terms, then, the choice of 'hid' lies closer to the 'thought' end of the thought-action continuum he proposes than does 'stood'.

One element of Palmer's use of speech tag adverbials that exemplify a proposed continuum between thought and action, are narrative descriptions of actions that appear to indicate an underlying mental state. These Palmer describes as 'indicative descriptions'. He suggests that they tend to be placed around the middle of his proposed continuum. Such indicative descriptions simply indicate and do not conclusively establish the state of mind that normally might be associated with the characters' mental states, and they are often associated with heavily ironic narrators. As such, if seen to be based solely on narrative description, readers are forced to decipher exactly what is meant by the narrator's input, with mismatches here generating irony, as well as potentially generating higher level and often irreconcilable inconsistencies. In such cases, readers will be forced to input best-fit inferences into the embedded narrative for the character, which will lie somewhere between the two, ultimately irreconcilable viewpoints being presented. Possible reasons for such irreconcilability can then feed into readers' 'fictional encyclopaedias' in terms of understanding the 'point' of the novel as whole.

In the case of Gerty, for instance, ambiguity exists between the ways in which her actions are described, often using descriptions lying towards the action end of the continuum, which nevertheless suggest an underlying mental state. These do not seem to reflect the whole picture of what Gerty is feeling. In extract **17**, the indicative description contained in the external narration of the first sentence suggests that Gerty's reaction to the mocking words of one of the other girls, Edy Boardman, is relaxed and carefree.

**17.** [S]he glanced up and broke out into a joyous little laugh which had in it all the freshness of a young May morning. **ii.** She knew right well, no-one better, what made squinty Edy say that because of him cooling in his attentions [. . .]

(Joyce, 1993: 334)

There is marked divergence here between the sweet presentation of Gerty, using the indicative description of 'a joyous little laugh' and Gerty's rather surly thoughts seen in the FIT that follows. This seems to capture the frustrations bubbling beneath, expressed using a colloquial idiom at odds with that of the initial description.

Palmer suggests that a significant function of indicative description in the novel is that 'it can be an inaccurate indicator of actual states of mind' (Palmer, 2004: 172). Here it seems to be used to help capture the ongoing tension between Gerty's real drives and desires and the distancing discourses that attempt to manipulate and reposition these. Her laugh, far from being free and joyous as the narrator suggests, appears to be sneering and dismissive of Edy, given the thoughts that follow, such that the confident assertions about the joyousness and innocence of Gerty's 'little laugh' are undermined.

We can also see the thought/action subframe in action in extract **18**.

**18.** [A]nd she wasn't ashamed and he wasn't either to look in that immodest way like that because he couldn't resist the sight of the wondrous revealment half offered like those skirt dancers behaving so immodest before gentlemen looking and he kept on looking, looking.

(Joyce, 1993: 350)

Bloom here is described as looking at Gerty, and she at him, in 'an immodest way', indicating the sexual attraction that is present, contrasting with the description of her as a prim and well behaved young woman and showing the tension between these different facets of her psyche. Gerty also guesses at Bloom's feelings here, and all this information will be accreted into the continuing consciousness frame and ultimately the embedded narrative for her via the doubly-embedded narrative subframe. All of this will then, ultimately, be contained within a reader's fictional encyclopaedia for *Ulysses*.

Also associated with the thought-action continuum are what Palmer calls *cue-reason* words, such as 'because' in extract **18**. Such words are said to trigger an expectation in the reader that the mental reasons behind a description of action are about to be made explicit. They include 'because', 'for', 'caused', 'so that' and 'in order to'. Here, at the start of Gerty's free indirect thought justification for her feelings, the use of 'because' in 'because he couldn't resist the sight of the wondrous revealment half offered' suggests a causal link clearly motivated by sexual desire. Even when explicit links to the motivations behind an action are provided, readers may still be forced to fill in the implicit reasons behind it, especially when, as is the case here, the cue-reason word only indicates circular reasoning.

It suggests a gulf between Gerty's desires and her justifications for these feelings that serves to underline the underlying sexual desire that generates these impulses. By contrast, in the narrativised presentations of Gerty's consciousness, circular reasoning

always leads back to her romanticised desire for a 'dreamhusband'. The real sexual arousal behind the fetishised descriptions, in which sexuality is neatly contained within the language of romance literature, can be seen in the following sentence of pure narrative: 'His hands and face were working and a tremor went over her' (ibid 349). Here, without any description of the inner workings of either Bloom or Gerty's mind, we are made fully aware of the sexual focus of both. This would not be deemed relevant if narrative descriptions were disregarded as sources of information about character consciousness.

So Palmer's continuum between thought and action, as indicated by the speech tag adverbials used, can range from those which quite straightforwardly indicate an accompanying state of mind, to those that contain a higher degree of narratorial judgement. In *Nausicaa*, for instance, this is apparent in the unusual adverbial descriptions used to describe the manner of Gerty's response, which at best gives only an implicit idea of her feelings. Examples include '-Let him! She said with a pert toss of her head and a piquant tilt of her nose' (ibid 338) and '-What? replied Gerty with a smile reinforced by the whitest of teeth' (ibid 345).

In both of these cases the accompanying state of mind is to some degree obfuscated by the speech tag adverbials chosen. For instance, a smile 'reinforced' by the whitest of teeth sounds more like a tag-line for an advert for toothpaste or tooth whitener. Again this captures a sense of the discourses within which the narrative attempts to constrain Gerty, and it is expressed in a style akin to the one through which, at times, Bloom sees the world as he tries to think of new advertising tag lines. Again, the encyclopaedic knowledge of the reader is important here, in order to trigger this inference, both a real world one i.e. the reader's internal encyclopaedia that they would bring to bear on any reading process, and also the fictional encyclopaedia developed specifically for *Ulysses*.

Both also provide examples of Palmer's 'indicative description', as the narrative describes Gerty in terms that mirror the language of poor quality fiction, with its inappropriate choice of adjectives (pert, piquant) and also that of advertising. The second example gives little sense of what Gerty is thinking or feeling, while the first is so inappropriately modified by the adjective chosen that it is hard to take seriously the mental states—whether haughty, angry or dismissive—indicated by the narrative. Palmer suggests that when 'indicative descriptions' of mental states by the narrator diverge from what readers assess to be the real mental state of the character this will inevitably generate irony. Readers have their processing of the text blocked, and find that the only way to understand it is as being ironic. Here the irony might seem relevant to how readers

see Gerty, but also to how the battling discourses within the narrative are viewed. The irony here seems to foreground the block that these discourses and the ideologies they carry represent for Gerty.

It is not of course possible to speculate on how much of this could be gleaned from a reader's faster online processing of the text. This could perhaps provide an interesting line of future, empirically based, psychonarratological research (For a full discussion of this approach, see Bortolussi and Dixon, 2003). Different readers will of course bring their own internal encyclopaedias to bear on any novel, and this will clearly affect how a specific effect is interpreted. The approach taken here simply opens up the text and suggests ways in which any indication of consciousness may affect the interpretations that readers draw.

The dynamic interplay of viewpoints seen in *Nausicaa* has been seen to be crucial to readers', admittedly varying, interpretations of the events depicted. In section 4.5 the clash is examined between the idealised and simplistic discourses of romance and advertising that suffuse the episode, and Gerty's reality, in terms of how these may colour the embedded narrative that a reader is able to construct for her.

#### **4.5 Gerty's Embedded Narrative**

As has been seen, any of the information that relates to Gerty in the text can be stored in readers' fictional encyclopaedias, and specifically within the embedded narrative that readers will build for her character. Readers tend to not only have greater access to the whole context of the fictional world than the characters, but also develop fictional encyclopaedias using any of the content of their own internal encyclopaedias. This text-driven process narrows down the most relevant information to use from the huge glut of information available.

The information to do so, at any indication of a subjective stance within a text, will derive from a frame for consciousness projected into the text at subjective centre point, to follow the workings of the characters' mind. How individual consciousness frames used by each reader will interpret the information available in the text will depend on the reader's own experiential knowledge frames, and this will of course lead to specific biases in interpretation. The approaches used in the current study investigate the textual features available and possible inferences that might be derived from these, although it cannot pin down exactly which inference readers will draw. Indeed, as touched on above, an empirical testing of the results suggested by this approach would be an interesting future direction for this research to take.

Gerty's primary goal in the novel will probably be understood as to find a 'dreamhusband', as this is something that is often presented within her free indirect thought. To be successful in this she feels she must be perceived in the idealised way that women are presented in the women's magazines and romance novels she reads, and her feelings are often expressed within the narrative in these terms. A need for a 'dreamhusband' seems to steer Gerty's mental focus towards the discourses of advertising and romance literature. The inference here might be that at such points her fantasies make her vulnerable to such discourses. They appear to offer a means of attaining this goal, or at the very least, vicariously satisfying it via projection into the viewpoint of a romantic heroine.

It is clear that although Gerty may not wholly perceive herself in this manner, these discourses do still infiltrate her viewpoint, and will constitute a facet of her identity. Even as she appears to abandon herself wholly to Bloom's gaze and her own sexual desires, her feelings are presented in the kind of distanced and precious language that might be found within examples of bad romance literature.

19. i. [A]nd she wasn't ashamed and he wasn't either to look in that immodest way like that because he couldn't resist the sight of the wondrous revealment half offered like those skirt dancers behaving so immodest before gentlemen looking and he kept on looking, looking. ii. She would fain have cried to him chokingly, held out her snowy slender arms to him to come, to feel his lips laid on her white brow, the cry of a young girl's love, a little strangled cry, wrung from her, that cry that has rung through the ages.

(Joyce, 1993: 350)

Sentence i. begins in narration of internal state, moving into Gerty's free indirect thought, with the increasingly subjective 'that immodest way like that' in which the proximal deictic use of 'that' indicates that Gerty's viewpoint is both the deictic and subjective centre. Clearly these two will normally overlap, although, as can be seen from this analysis it is possible for indications of subjectivity to be found in sections of text with few or no deictic elements present. This can be even more marked in some novels; Golding's *Pincher Martin* (2005), for instance, provides multiple examples of this, presumably to help generate an intensely subjective, but also a displaced sense of the consciousness of the main character.

In extract **19** it is hard to be certain whether sentence **ii** is a mocking, narrativised expression of Gerty's feelings, or her own free indirect thought. As with the rest of the episode, it is often hard to say definitively whether we are receiving a narrator's interpretation of events, or Gerty's own fantasies channelled through the language of the discourses to which she has been exposed, which is then expressed within narrative descriptions that simply represent certain aspects of her psyche. Indeed, it seems that no-one in this episode, including the narrator and Bloom, are free from these all pervasive ideologies, which colour every viewpoint expressed: understanding this will impact on the overall fictional encyclopaedia that readers will develop. It is in this way that Joyce's writing is able to undermine and question multiple ideologies.

To make the situation match her goal to find a 'dreamhusband', Gerty's strong sexual feelings are also re-construed within the strictures of her Catholic faith. One might expect her religious beliefs to condemn her hypothesised actions, but she thinks to herself: 'Besides there was absolution as long as you didn't do the other thing before being married and there ought to be women priests that would understand without your telling out [ . . . ]' (Joyce, 1993: 348). This supports the inference that she can be far earthier than some of the prim narrative representations of her. These descriptions frequently recast her real desires into the language of romance literature: 'If she saw that magic look in his eyes there would be no holding back for her. Love laughs at locksmiths' (ibid). Such examples perhaps reflect the way she feels she needs to be in order to find her 'dreamhusband'.

It is also possible to interpret this as Bloom fantasising a naïve version of his earthy wife, who is at this time cuckolding him. In terms of readers bringing other fictional encyclopaedias they have to bear on a text (in a manner reflective of Bakhtin's notion of intertextuality), it should be remembered that in Homer's tale *The Odyssey*, which provides the explicit template for *Ulysses*, Odysseus, or Ulysses, perceived Nausicaa as god-like and pure when in fact her primary aim was to ensure he remained on her father's island and marry her. The Homeric parallels also support an interpretation that at least some elements of the narrative might take the viewpoint of Bloom regarding Gerty, or at least present a voyeuristic and fantasy-based male viewpoint onto the situation. In reality, it seems to me that these multiple viewpoints all feed into one another to develop a broad, complex view of the characters involved, and their interrelationships.

So, it has been seen that desire for a romanticised and idealised husband, reflecting Nausicaa wanting Odysseus to marry her, is as an important facet of Gerty's embedded



narrative. This seems to trigger the idealised way in which Bloom is described throughout the episode.

**20.** Here was that of which she had so often dreamed.

(Joyce, 1993: 348)

**21.** [s]he would make the great sacrifice. Her every effort would be to share his thoughts. Dearer than the whole world would she be to him and gild his days with happiness.

(ibid)

Bloom is described ‘as a quiet gravefaced gentleman’ (ibid 345) with ‘quiet intellectual eyes’ (ibid 342), the narrative reporting that ‘The very heart of the girlwoman went out to him, her dreamhusband’ (ibid). Gerty imagines Bloom in a way that would make him suitable candidate for her ‘dreamhusband’. She generates a doubly embedded narrative as she guesses at his thoughts and impulses to make him fit this role. Considering that he is masturbating while looking at her, it is especially ironic that she perceives his internal state in the following manner:

**22.** He was in deep mourning, she could see that, and the story of a haunting sorrow was on his face.

(Joyce, 1993: 342)

**23.** Passionate nature though he was Gerty could see that he had enormous control over himself [ . . . ] selfcontrol expressed in every line of his distinguishedlooking figure’

(ibid 343)

While Gerty’s primary aim is to find a dreamhusband, Bloom’s appears simply to be to obtain sexual release; a clash that will help generate an amusingly ironic understanding of the events described.

Gerty’s perceptions about Bloom are also far removed from the embedded narrative readers will most likely have developed for him. Indeed, from the instant readers discover that it is Bloom who is watching Gerty, trust in her perceptions of this stranger with his

‘dark eyes and pale intellectual face [. . .] the image of Martin Harvey, the matinee idol’ (Joyce, 1993: 342) is likely to be destroyed.

This distortion of reality is seen more clearly once we enter Bloom’s free direct thought. Gerty’s apparent perceptions of Bloom as a potential ‘dreamhusband’, with lofty motives, desires and ideals, now comes up against the real content of Bloom’s consciousness i.e. the clash between the embedded and doubly embedded narratives each has created for the other is made explicit. Extract **24** shows Gerty’s perceptions, while **25** shows Bloom’s.

**24.** Then mayhap he would embrace her gently, like a real man, crushing her soft body to him, and love her, his ownest girlie, for herself alone.

(ibid 342)

**25.** A defect is ten times worse in a woman. But makes them polite. Glad I didn’t know it when she was on show. Hot little devil all the same. Wouldn’t mind.

(ibid 351)

In Bakhtin’s terms, this would be understood as clashing voices. Within Palmer’s approach, it can be described as two continuing consciousness frames, containing contrasting goals, each clashing with the other.

As has been demonstrated, Gerty’s viewpoint is not presented with any obvious consistency. A see-saw tension is developed between the idealised, delusional aspirations and reader’s more complete embedded narrative for Gerty’s reality. As discussed earlier, it is possible that at least some of the narrative input reflects Bloom’s covert fantasy. This is also suggested by Joyce’s comments to Arthur Power. Bloom might be deliberately seeing her as a powerless victim of the discourses of romance writing and advertising, and considering that Bloom writes advertisements for a living, this interpretation could certainly be argued for. It would give him power over Gerty, as opposed to his relationship with his wife, and it also parallels the Ulysses of Homer’s fantasised perceptions of Nausicaa. Without clear-cut narrative input, however, it is largely down to readers’ top-down processing strategies to steer a course through all of these ambiguities of interpretation.

Such clashes of viewpoint also provide one of the great pleasures in reading. Wales (1992), for instance, describes how the playful aspect of *Ulysses* should not be

discounted. To Wales, part of the pleasure in reading the novel comes from what she describes, using Barthes' terminology, as 'jouissance', which captures a sense of reading as a form of joyous play. Bolton has described play as imaginatively developed in a space neither wholly reality nor wholly imaginative, in which it 'can be used to experiment with diverse circumstance, emotions, beliefs, capabilities, tasks, to try out perspectives and activities different from the child's own' (Bolton and Heathcote, 1995: 220). Palmer also talks of the similarities between play and reading novels. It is perspective that is crucial to both, since in both different perspectives are continuously tried out and assessed. While reading novels:

[readers] enter the minds of characters necessarily in order to follow the plot. But it is more than that: we do it because it is enjoyable and because it is good for us. In finding out more about the minds of other, we find out more about ourselves.

(Palmer, 2004: 147)

This strikes me as a particularly clear and powerful way of understanding why we chose to read fiction, and helps to explain why readers will persist with, and derive pleasure from steering a course through the complexities of viewpoint to be found in a novel such as *Ulysses*.

#### **4.6 The interwoven viewpoints of Nausicaa: a summary**

In Nausicaa, shifts between different voices, or viewpoints, are often hard to pin down. This does not seem like a one way 'contamination' of the narrative position, but a constantly shifting dialogue, mostly internalised, between Gerty's more basic feelings and impulses and the at times contradictory discourses to which she has been exposed. Through this process, different facets of her psyche, and multiple influences on it, are expressed. These include the traditional values of her social group, romance literature, advertising and mass market magazines. It is also possible that Bloom's fantasies appear within the narrative at times, further increasing the complexity of character representation to be found here.

In order to assess the episode in terms of the speech and thought presentation categories, these were first applied, and it was suggested that more holistic input about fictional mental functioning, based around Palmer's approach, might be able to extend and develop the insights that were afforded by this. In Nausicaa, input about fictional

minds comes from all three subframes of the continuing consciousness frame i.e. the thought-action subframes, intermental thought and doubly embedded narratives. The effect of the interplay of continuing consciousness frames and the primary goals of the characters each contains was then developed, in terms of how these might affect readers' embedded narratives and the overall fictional encyclopaedias that they develop. The marked inconsistencies contained in multiple viewpoints within the episode would lead to the requirement to accrete valid information about Gerty from whatever viewpoint this is expressed, not trusting input from any singular viewpoint. The subjective stance shown throughout might also help to generate a powerful engagement with the essence of the situations described, more so than would a singular, monologic and clear-cut presentation.

Readers' online processing of the narrative may not pick up these inconsistencies consciously, and readers' unconscious processing of them is hard to ascertain without further empirical research. Taking the holistic approach detailed in the current study, it is clear, however, that some elements of these inconsistencies will need to be incorporated into broadly coherent fictional encyclopaedias in order to build as full a picture as possible about what is happening in this complex episode. This is because they are central to the full pictures that readers must build of characters; pictures based on a subjective interaction with the characters' fictional minds.

Such an embodied approach is both cognitively convincing, and it shows up the complex interactions to be found in a novel such as *Ulysses* in a clearer and more complete way. It is an approach that is not only able to fully incorporate nuances and uncertainties, but which welcomes them within its analytical framework. At present this approach might be said to be more eclectic than truly holistic, but the principle is there: to not ignore any evidence of fictional mental functioning that readers might use to develop a picture of the fictional world and the characters that people it. In the final chapter, the results of the application of this approach will be brought together and summarised, and some implications for future research will be highlighted.

# Chapter Five

## Applying Palmer's 'Embedded Narratives' and 'Intermental Thought' to issues of Point of View in *Ulysses*: conclusions and implications

---

### 5.1 Introduction

Over the course of the preceding chapters, Palmer's approach has been applied to a selection of extracts and situations from Joyce's *Ulysses*. Palmer developed his approach to look at non-standard sources of information about mental functioning in what he termed 'behaviourist novels'. These are novels that seem to provide less information to readers about the inner workings of characters' minds. *Ulysses* is clearly not such a novel, but Palmer's notion of embedded narratives is meant to be able to provide a 'concrete expression of the ideological viewpoint and total world view of fictional characters' (Palmer, 2004: 187). A novel like *Ulysses*, therefore, renowned as it is for being anything but 'concrete' in its representation of viewpoint, has provided a thorough testing ground for his approach. It has shown that even in a prototypical example of 'consciousness writing'-one that has normally been analysed in terms of the represented thought of characters-elements that deepen readers' engagement with characters through activating subjective judgements come from sources outside of this. These sources would generally be ignored in such analyses.

Many subjective impressions of characters clearly do come through the representation of their discourse, however, both internal and verbalised, and the metalanguage that was chosen to discuss this alongside Palmer was Leech and Short's 'Speech and Thought Presentation model' (1981), which has been further developed subsequently (See Semino, Short and Culpeper, 1997; Simpson, 1997; Short, Semino and Wynne, 1997, Semino, Short, 2004), but the most relevant approach to adopt for this study was considered to be the original approach, since it keeps the categories to a minimum and allows for a degree of blurring between them. This was felt to be appropriate given the more holistic and less compartmentalised nature of this study.

## 5.2 Summary of the Research

In Chapter One some approaches to *Ulysses* were looked at. These focused on the complexity of viewpoint in the novel and some of the problems that this may create for readers. Approaches to fictional point of view were introduced, alongside Leech and Short's speech and thought presentation model, and the whole minds approach of Palmer. This was followed by the close application of Palmer's ideas. Palmer argues that 'narrative fiction is, in essence, the presentation of fictional mental functioning' (Palmer, 2004: 5), and this chimes with Fludernik's (1996) view that experientiality is central to narrative, and that how characters experience events, and how these impinge on their own situation, is fundamental to all narrative fiction.

This was followed in chapter two by an analysis of the Nausicaa episode of *Ulysses*. This was in terms of the dialogic interplay of discourses, leading to a polyphonic and ideologically heteroglossic narrative, containing multiple 'voices', to use Bakhtin's own terms. Palmer's notion of 'embedded narrative' is in some ways comparable with Bakhtin's of voice, but is extended to include all aspects of a character. Both show modality on the part of a character within the storyworld as a whole, and so constituted a useful lead in to the holistic approach adopted in this study. The idea of clashing voices was returned to throughout the study, as it proved an effective means of showing the contrastive viewpoints and ideologies shown up by my analysis. They are part of a dialogic engagement that deepens subjective engagement with characters, bringing them to life and capturing the complexity of real minds by allowing the countless voices and ideologies that intermingle within and between each character to come to the fore.

This was followed up by a discussion of traditional approaches to point of view and also to speech and thought presentation in the novel, since this is a central aspect of the representation of character. It was applied alongside Palmer where applicable in this study, to develop as full a picture of the fictional world as possible. It was argued that the overarching, more holistic approach provided by this study might provide a fuller, simpler and perhaps more cognitively salient methodology, one that could pinpoint the reasons for some of the effects noted by a range of commentators on the novel over the years.

In Chapter Three a selection of episodes were analysed, in the process of developing and clarifying these ideas. The three subframes of the continuing consciousness frame were demonstrated through close analysis of various episodes or aspects of *Ulysses*. As a stand-alone tool, Palmer's approach was shown to provide

valuable insights about the way in which we understand fictional minds in the novel, in perhaps a subtler way than is obtained by focusing solely on discrete and explicitly subjective elements, such as speech and thought presentation. It showed how a full and complex depiction of characters' mental lives was generated, and the means through which readers could track characters and develop opinions about the storyworld that these characters inhabit.

In Chapter Four, the insights provided by Palmer alone were deepened by the application of further stylistic tools within an analysis of the Nausicaa episode. In this episode, many viewpoints bleed into one another, with each often contradicting the others. Readers must draw inferences based on all of the contrastive positions it represents, and this dialogic representation may deepen and enliven responses to the characters contained within it. These contrasts are primarily between Gerty's more hidden feelings and impulses, and, often expressed from the narrative position, the contradictory discourses to which she has been exposed such as the values of her social group, romance literature, advertising and mass market magazines.

It also supports a recurrent theme of the novel, which is the need to distrust any singular viewpoint, and to encourage readers to find their own way through a maze of viewpoints. These clashes of viewpoint might also be seen as helping to provide pleasure in reading; Wales (1992), for instance, talks about this playful aspect of *Ulysses*. To Wales, part of the pleasure in reading *Ulysses* derives from what she describes in terms of Barthes' 'jouissance', or sense of reading as joyous play. Bolton describes play as imaginatively developed in a space neither wholly reality nor wholly imaginative. Here it 'can be used to experiment with diverse circumstance, emotions, beliefs, capabilities, tasks, to try out perspectives and activities different from the child's own' (Bolton, 1995: 220). Palmer too talks of the similarities between play and reading novels, with perspective crucial to both, since in both different perspectives are tried out and assessed.

### **5.3 Conclusions and Implications for Further Study**

The more inclusive approach taken by this research was shown to be capable of extending and developing the insights afforded by established stylistic methodologies. In terms of this approach, it can be presumed that interplay of continuing consciousness frames will affect readers' embedded narratives and therefore the overall fictional encyclopaedias that they develop. The subjective stance shown throughout might also help to generate a more 'felt' sense of the essence and complexity of situations encountered, rather than any singular, monologic and clear-cut interpretations. This reflects the elusiveness of

viewpoints, as has been noted by many previous commentators, and also how the overall effect this generates is reason enough for their existence. There is no need to compartmentalise them entirely; it is vital to accept the fuzzy-edged nature of every viewpoint encountered. This creates the dialogic interplay of discourses, which deepens and extends reader engagement with the novel and the characters that people it.

The primary value of this study has been to show how subtle indications of consciousness that have previously been ignored when examining viewpoint in the novel might be crucial to the overall impression that readers build. It has also elucidated the process through which the glut of information contained in readers' pre-existing internal encyclopaedias is narrowed down by the text itself. This is through a text-driven process that uses only the most relevant information in order to construct a fictional encyclopaedia, specific to the text in hand. In terms of a subjective engagement with the text, this is through triggering frames for understanding consciousness at any textual cue indicating a subjective engagement with the storyworld, at what I describe as subjective centre point. This is maintained for each character and reactivated at every subsequent indication of his or her consciousness, to form a continuing consciousness frame. The information from this, alongside other information about the character and their context in the storyworld, is then used to develop embedded narratives for each character, constituting subframes of the overall fictional encyclopaedia that readers must develop to comprehend a novel.

In the light of this research, it has become clear that there would be many worthwhile directions for future research that take a broadly similar approach to my own. Although my approach has taken into account *potentially any* indication of subjective engagement on the part of a character, a lot has been left out. Although aiming towards a more holistic approach, at present it could perhaps be described more accurately as eclectic. It owes something to Banfield (1982) 'empty centre' paradigm, which talked of the 'unspeakable sentences' found where markers of subjectivity were present yet no reflector characters appeared to be, and also to Fludernik's (1993) response to this, which created a proliferation of categories to assess subjectivity. By contrast, my own approach has looked at any marker of subjectivity as relevant to a holistic interpretation of what is going on, based on inferencing strategies derived from the relevance of each, and how they interrelate. Thus, close linguistic analysis was combined with a broader, more literary interpretation of this data; an aim for further research would be to increase how rigorously purely linguistic ideas can be applied to a text, based on this approach.



The idea that a wide variety of textual indicators can trigger readers to process a text from a subjective point of view seems convincing to me, based on my own reading and research; it is in keeping with the notion of embodiment that is a key idea within cognitive science. This field of study also provides the idea that knowledge is stored in continuing consciousness frames, with each containing embedded subframes pending incorporation into an embedded narrative for each character. That this is itself a subframe of a larger frame for the storyworld as a whole i.e. a fictional encyclopaedia, is also convincing in terms of current thinking in this field. Therefore, the application of ideas deriving from frame/schema theory and, indeed, generally from the cognitive field e.g. ideas relating to textual priming, would seem to me to be an apposite way of strengthening the available evidence. Likewise, ideas deriving from the field of psychonarratology, such as the work of Bortolussi and Dixon (2003) might provide stronger, empirical evidence for these ideas, based on reader responses to indications of consciousness and to tracking characters through the novel.

Any indication of consciousness is relevant to this approach and therefore the more holistic the approach taken-i.e. the broader the toolkit used for analysing consciousness-the better. As mentioned above, the approach taken in this thesis has been more eclectic than truly holistic, but it has taken a new look at less obvious indications of consciousness alongside speech and thought presentation, the latter of which is well established and relatively clear-cut. That said, more recent methodologies within the field of speech and thought presentation incorporate further complexity into this model, so an incorporation of these later ideas might well prove worthwhile, at the very least to ascertain whether they do have any value within this approach.

There are further frameworks that take a broadly cognitive approach to texts. These would also provide potential for further, perhaps more truly holistic, approaches. Although I have distinguished my idea of subjective centre point from Simpson's idea of a deictic centre, or 'origo', I do feel that his approach to modality in terms of assessing subjectivity in the novel could prove highly rewarding within this holistic approach, and could provide further clarity and linguistic rigour within it. Simpson's approach is able to specify levels of subjective engagement, and might perhaps provide a continuum via which subtle distinctions in how readers receive the input of different characters might be signposted.

Likewise, incorporating the ideas contained in this study within research using the elegant and convincing 'Text Worlds' model of text and discourse, as developed by Werth (1999), and subsequently by Gavins (2001, 2003), might well prove rewarding.

The ideas suggested by Text Worlds theory, which proposes a series of nested subworlds contained within an overarching text world, offers a promising development for this approach if conflated with it, reflecting as it does a similar idea of continuing consciousness frames and embedded narratives nested within readers' overarching fictional encyclopaedias.

At the level this study reaches, it is clear that the mismatches and inconsistencies it sheds light on show one way in which complexity for readers is increased. It is clear that elements of these inconsistencies will need to be incorporated into broadly coherent fictional encyclopaedias in order to build as full a picture as possible about what is happening in *Ulysses*. It already shows, therefore, how subtle indications of subjective engagement might be able to colour and extend the information from which the encyclopaedias required for comprehension of the novel are built. Incorporating this within analyses based on the ideas outlined above may now enable an approach that is more truly holistic, and also more linguistically rigorous, to be developed.

## Bibliography

- Attridge, D. (1988) *Peculiar Language: Literature As Difference From The Renaissance To James Joyce*, New York: Cornell University Press
- Attridge, D. (ed.), (1990) *The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Austen, J. (2000) *Emma*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1984) *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*, Emerson, C. (Trans. and Ed.) Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press
- Bal, M. S. (1997) (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.) *Narratology: Introduction to the Theory of Narrative*, Toronto, Buffalo, London: Toronto University Press
- Banfield, A. (1982) *Unspeakable Sentences*, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul
- Benstock, S., Benstock L., (1982) *Who's He When He's At Home: A James Joyce Directory*, Chicago: University of Illinois Press
- Bersani, L. (1990) *The Culture of Redemption*, Yale: Yale University Press
- Bolton, G. and Heathcote, D. (1995) *Drama for Learning: Dorothy Heathcote's Mantle of the Expert Approach to Education (Dimensions of Drama Series)*, New Hampshire: Heinemann
- Bortolussi, M. and Dixon, P. (2003) *Psychonarratology: Foundations for the Empirical Study of Literary Response*, Cambridge: CUP
- Bradbury, M. (1993) *The Modern British Novel*, London: Secker and Warburg
- Brannigan, J. (1992) *New Historicism and Cultural Materialism*, London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Cohn, D. (1978) *Transparent Minds: Narrative Modes for Presenting Consciousness in Fiction*, NJ: Princeton University Press
- Coyle, J. (2000) *James Joyce: Ulysses, A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man: A Reader's Guide To Essential Criticism*, Cambridge: Icon Books Ltd
- Damasio, A. (2000) *The Feeling of What Happens: Body, Emotion and the Making of Consciousness*, London: Heinemann
- Deming, R.H. (ed.) (1970) *James Joyce: The Critical Heritage*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul
- Doležel, L. (1998) *Heterocosmica: Fiction and Possible Worlds*, London: The John Hopkins University Press

- Dostoevsky, F. (1996) *The Idiot*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Dostoevsky, F. (2000) *Crime and Punishment*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Duchan, J. Bruder, G. and Hewitt, L. (Eds.) *Deixis in Narrative: A Cognitive Science Perspective*, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates
- Ehrlich, S. (1990) *Point of View: A Linguistic Analysis of Literary Style*, London: Routledge
- Eliot, G. (1993) *Middlemarch*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Ellmann, R. (1972) *Ulysses on the Liffey*, London: Faber and Faber
- Ellmann, R. (1982) *James Joyce*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Emmott, C. (1997) *Narrative Comprehension: A Discourse Perspective*, Oxford: OUP
- Fairclough, N. (1989, 2001) *Language and Power*, London: Longman.
- Faulkner, W. (1990) *A Rose for Emily*, Indiana, Perfection Learning
- Fludernik, M. (1986a) Narrative and its Development in *Ulysses*, *Journal of Narrative Techniques*, 16.1: 15-40
- Fludernik, M. (1986b) The Dialogic Imagination Of Joyce: Form and Function of Dialogue in *Ulysses* in *Style* 20.1 (1986): 42-57
- Fludernik, M. (1993) *The Fictions of Language and the Language of Fiction*, Oxon, Routledge
- Fludernik, M. (1996) *Towards a Natural Narratology*, London: Routledge
- Foucault, M. (1970) *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*, London: Vintage
- Gavins, J. (2001) *Text World Theory: A Critical Exposition and Development in Relation to Absurd Prose Fiction*, Unpublished PhD thesis: Sheffield Hallam University
- Gavins, J. (2003) *Cognitive Poetics in Practice*, London: Routledge
- Golding, W. (2005) *Pincher Martin*, London: Faber and Faber
- Hardy, T (1978) *Far From The Madding Crowd*, London: Pan Books Ltd
- Homer (1992) *The Odyssey*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Iser, W. (1978) *The Act of Reading : A Theory of Aesthetic Response*, Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press
- Jameson, F. (1981) *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act*, London: Methuen
- Joyce, J. (1922/1993) *Ulysses*, Oxford: OUP
- Joyce, J (1992) *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, Herts: Wordsworth
- Kenner, H. (1978) *Joyce's Voices*, Berkeley: University of California Press
- Kenner, H. (1980) *Ulysses*, London: George Allen and Unwin

- Lawrence, K. (1981) *The Odyssey of Style in Ulysses*, Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Leaska, Mitchell A. (1970) *Virginia Woolf's Lighthouse; A Study in Critical Method*, New York: Columbia University Press
- Leslie, S. (1922) *Quarterly Review* cited in Deming (ed.) (1970)
- Leech, G., Short, M. (1981) *Style in Fiction*, Harlow: Pearson
- Lewis, W (1993) *Time and Western Man*, Berkeley, Gingko Press
- MacCabe, C. (2003) (2<sup>nd</sup> Edition), *James Joyce and the Revolution of the Word* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
- McHale, B. (1978) Free Indirect Discourse: A Survey of Recent Accounts, in *Journal For Descriptive Poetics and the Theory of Literature* 3: 249-287
- McHale, B. (1983) Unspeakable Sentences, Unnatural Acts: Linguistics and Poetics Revisited, in *Poetics Today*, 4, No. 1: 17-45
- Murry, J.M. (1922) Review of *Ulysses*, *Nation* and *Athenaeum* in Deming (ed.) (1970) OED Online, <http://www.oed.co.uk>
- Palmer, A. (2004) *Fictional Minds*, Lincoln, Nebraska and London: University of Nebraska Press
- Palmer, A. (2005) Intermental Thought in the Novel: The Middlemarch Mind, *Style* 39.4, 427-39
- Pascal, R. (1977) *The Dual Voice: Free Indirect Speech and its Functioning in the Nineteenth Century European Novel*, Manchester, Manchester University Press
- Pearce, L. (1994) *Reading Dialogics*, London: Edward Arnold
- Perry, M. (1979) (Ed.) *Evidence and Argumentation in Linguistics*. Berlin: de Gruyter.
- Power, A. (2000) *Conversations with James Joyce*, Dublin: Lilliput Press
- Prince, A. (1987) Planes and Copying, *Linguistic Inquiry* 18.3: 491-510.
- Rimmon-Kenan, S. (1983) *Narrative Fiction: Contemporary Poetics*, London and New York: Methuen
- Segal, E. (1995) Narrative Comprehension and the Role of Deictic Shift Theory in Duchan, Bruder and Hewitt (1995): 3-17
- Semino, E., Short, M. and Culpeper, J. (1997) Using a Corpus to Test a Model of Speech and Thought Presentation, *Poetics*, 25, 17-43
- Semino, E. and Short, M. (2004) *Corpus Stylistics: Speech, Writing and Thought Presentation in a Corpus of English Writing*, London: Routledge

- Senn, F (Ed. Riquelme, J.P.) (1977, 1984) *Joyce's Dislocations: Essays on Reading as Translation*, Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press
- Short, M., Semino, E. and Wynne, M. (1997) A (Free Direct) Reply to Paul Simpson's Discourse, *Journal of Literary Semantics*. 26:3. 219-28
- Simpson, P. (1993) *Language, Ideology and Point Of View*, London: Routledge
- Simpson, P. (1997) *Language through Literature: An Introduction*, London: Routledge
- Stanzel, F.K. (1984) *A Theory of Narrative*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press
- Stockwell, P. (2002) *Cognitive Poetics*, London: Routledge
- Sunderland, J. (2004) *Gendered Discourses*, London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Uspensky, B (1973) *A Poetics of Composition*, Zavarin, V. and Wittig S. (Trans.). Berkeley: University of California Press
- Wales, K. (1989) The "Oxen of the Sun" in "Ulysses": Joyce and Anglo-Saxon, *James Joyce Quarterly*, 26: 319-332
- Wales, K. (1992) *The Language of James Joyce*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
- Waugh, E. (1996) *Vile Bodies*, Harmondsworth: Penguin
- Wiebe, J. (1990) Identifying Subjective Characters in Narrative, *Proc. 13th International Conference on Computational Linguistics (COLING-90)*: 401-408.
- Werth, P. (1999) *Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse*, Harlow: Pearson
- Wertsch, J. V. (1991) *Voices of the Mind: A Sociocultural Approach to Mediated Action*, Cambridge, MA.: Harvard University Press
- Woolf, V. (1973) *To the Lighthouse*, Harmondsworth: Penguin
- Zubin, D. , Hewitt, L. (1995) The Deictic Center: A Theory of Deixis in Narrative in Duchan et al. (1995): 129-55.